



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
**Historical Resources Board**

DATE ISSUED: February 12, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-012

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board  
Agenda of February 26, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 –Manzanita Cottage**

APPLICANT: Kevin and Melissa Steel represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 7991-7993 Prospect Place, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of Manzanita Cottage located at 7991 Prospect Place; and the building located at 7993 Prospect Place as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate Manzanita Cottage located at 7991 Prospect Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criterion A. The designation excludes the rear residence identified as 7993 Prospect Place. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource at 7991 Prospect Place reflects a special element of La Jolla's historical, social, economic, aesthetic and architectural development and retains integrity to the 1910 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the house embodies the character defining features of Beach Cottage architecture, is one of a finite and limited number of beach cottages remaining which reflect the early development history of La Jolla, and retains integrity for that association.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource consists of two single family residences located on a single parcel on the north side of Prospect Place in the La Jolla Park subdivision.

The 7991 and 7993 Prospect Place buildings are located on APN 350-121-3900. The property at 7991 Prospect Place was photographed in the 2003 La Jolla Reconnaissance Survey and given a Status Code of 7R, "Identified in Reconnaissance Level Survey: Not Evaluated," however was identified as 7987

Prospect Place located on APN 350-121-3500. Both the 7991 and 7993 Prospect Place structures were identified as “Manzanita” and “Shamisal” respectively in a 1955 listing of early La Jolla Cottages compiled by Howard Randolph.

The historic name of the 7991 Prospect Place structure, Manzanita Cottage, has been identified consistent with the Board’s adopted naming policy and reflects the historical name established by the original owner, subsequent owners, or community.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource located at 7991 Prospect Place is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion A, but not HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

*CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City’s, a community’s or a neighborhood’s historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.*

The village of La Jolla began in the 1880s during the “boom” period of San Diego’s history as a small coastal community. One of the first land tracts in the area was La Jolla Park, which was developed in 1887 by Frank Botsford and was the first subdivision to have identified lots and streets. The first permanent residence in La Jolla was constructed that same year. Historian Patricia Schaechlin described La Jolla’s early history as follows: “In 1888, the land collapse left a scraggly collection of cottages, few residents, no improvements and little hope.... La Jolla experienced a steady growth in the first two decades of the twentieth century, a time when the community became a village. It grew from a 350 population, some one hundred houses, to a village and a popular resort with a commercial base of tourism large enough to support its permanent residents.”

Beach Cottages were the dominant housing type in La Jolla during this early period through the 1930’s. The Beach Cottage style was ideal for use as a summer or winter retreat or, even though lacking in many modern conveniences, they could be and were used as permanent residences. Early beach cottages were characterized (in part) as smaller dwellings, typically one story, with a low pitched roof and exposed rafters; wood siding; a small front porch and garden area; and an orientation toward any available beach or coastal view. Originally known by name, the cottages were not given proper addresses until 1913. By the 1920s, the population had increased to over 2,500 people and the tourism industry was firmly established. Hotels were constructed in increasing numbers, and as the famous and wealthy began to vacation there, the cottages were no longer seen as suitable accommodations. Increased population, tourism and wealth, coupled with shifting architectural preferences, caused Beach Cottages to fall out of favor through the late 1920s and 1930s. In the following decades, many of these early cottages were relocated to less desirable inland lots.

In the 1970s through the 1980s and 1990s, the cottages were demolished, rather than relocated. The shrinking number of cottages dating to La Jolla’s early development can be tracked through prior histories and surveys. A 1955 history of La Jolla by Howard Randolph identified approximately 466 beach cottages on 25 streets that dated from the 1890’s to the 1920’s. Both

structures on the subject property were identified in the 1955 Randolph survey. In 1977, a survey of historic resources in La Jolla was conducted by Pat Schaechlin. The survey identified approximately 1,976 structures from the early history of La Jolla, only 1,119 of which still remained at the time of the survey. A 1987 survey of the beach cottages identified in the Schaechlin survey found 36 individual cottages remaining, a number reduced by one with the demolition of the Green Dragon Colony in 1992. The structures on the subject property were not identified in the 1977 or 1987 listing of cottages and would not be counted among the 35.

### 7991 Prospect Place Residence

The building at 7991 Prospect Place exhibits a majority of the character defining features that relate to the exterior appearance of early La Jolla Beach Cottages, which include:

- Small to medium sized residences
- One to one and one-half stories, occasionally two stories
- Low, sloping roof, hipped or gabled, sometimes with dormers
- Exposed roof structure, with beams and rafters visible
- Exterior proportions balanced rather than symmetrical in arrangement
- Modest front porch
- Front stoop
- Focus on a garden, even if small
- Partial width front porch
- Wood shingles, horizontal siding or stucco exteriors
- Brick or stone exterior chimneys

The features that the building does not exhibit are limited, and include use of double hung windows and asymmetrical "L" shaped porches.

Known modifications to the 7991 Prospect Place structure include a 100 square foot addition at the northwest elevation, and a 96 square foot addition adjacent to the front porch at the southwest corner of the structure. These additions are believed to have occurred sometime between 1926 and 1949. With an original construction date of 1910, this cottage was built within the 1880s-1930s period of significance for early La Jolla Beach Cottage development. These modifications to the structure do not greatly impact the building's character defining features critical to its La Jolla Beach Cottage appearance – chief among these the building retains its small scale, modest front porch, wood shingles and brick chimney. Despite the modifications noted, the cottage retains integrity of location, setting, workmanship, feeling and association to this early period of development in La Jolla.

As noted previously, the known additions to the 7991 Prospect Place structure were built between 1926-1949. At this time there is not enough evidence to determine whether the additions were made within the 1880s-1930s La Jolla Beach Cottage development period for which the structure has been found historically significant. As such, staff finds it would be prudent to not exclude these additions from a designation under Criterion A at this time.

### 7993 Prospect Place Residence

The building identified as 7993 Prospect Place and located at the north end of the property was also built in 1910 and identified in the 1955 Randolph survey. However, significant

modifications to this structure have critically impacted its integrity of design, setting and feeling such that it no longer reflects the character defining features of the early La Jolla Beach Cottages. Sometime between 1965-1974, the original front porch along the north elevation was enclosed and added to. Also during this period, a new porch was added to the building's south elevation, thereby reorienting the building's primary entry. These modifications have significantly impacted the building's circulation and relationship to its immediate surroundings. The building does not retain sufficient integrity of design, setting, materials or feeling to embody the character defining features of Beach Cottage architecture, effectively or accurately reflecting a special element of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social, economic, aesthetic and architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation of this building under HRB Criterion A.

Significance Statement: Given the scarcity of early Beach Cottages in La Jolla as documented in the report and previous surveys, staff finds that the building at 7991 Prospect Place, which embodies the character defining features of Beach Cottage architecture and retains integrity to its 1910 date of construction, reflects a special element of La Jolla's historical, cultural, social, economic, aesthetic and architectural development. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion A. Staff recommends the designation of the property exclude the 7993 Prospect Place structure at the rear of the property.

*CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.*

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 7991-7993 Prospect Place did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

#### 7991 Prospect Place Residence

The building located at 7991 Prospect Place is a one story Craftsman style residence constructed in 1910 of single-wall construction on a wood pier foundation. The building exhibits an irregular plan form and a low-pitch gabled roof of composition shingle laid over the original wood shingle. The roof retains its original skip sheathing and wide eave overhang with exposed rafters. The building is clad in unpainted wood shingle. The primary elevation is marked by a modest front porch with gabled roof supported by simple wood columns. Immediately adjacent to the

porch is an exterior brick chimney flanked by a pair of casement windows with leaded diamond panes. Fenestration mainly consists of divided light and single light wood casement windows.

Sometime between 1926-1949, the 7991 Prospect Place residence was subject to two additions. A 100 square foot porch was added along the north (rear) elevation and subsequently enclosed. At the front elevation, a 96 square foot addition was placed to the left of the front porch. These additions generally exhibit wood shingle cladding and fenestration to match the original structure. The gabled projection at the east end of the front elevation seems to appear in all available Sanborn maps, however is not clearly seen in the Building Record. In addition, minor inconsistencies appear related to the front porch – some of its wood cladding appears less weathered and of a slightly different texture than the rest of the building, and its footprint appears smaller in the Sanborn maps than in the Building Record.

As a result of modifications and other uncertainties related to the primary elevation, the building at 7991 Prospect Place does not retain sufficient integrity of design and materials to embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction, and therefore staff does not recommend designation of this building under HRB Criterion C.

#### 7993 Prospect Place Residence

The building located at 7993 Prospect Place is a one story Craftsman style residence constructed in 1910 of single-wall construction on a wood pier foundation. The building exhibits an irregular plan form and a low-pitch side gabled roof of composition shingle. The roof features wide eave overhang with exposed rafters. The building's exterior is of wood shingle, and an interior brick chimney is visible above the primary roof ridge. Fenestration generally consists of a variety of wood casement and awning windows.

Modifications to the structure have significantly impacted the building's integrity of design, setting and feeling, as detailed in the Criterion A discussion. These modifications affecting the original front porch at the north and addition of a new porch at the south have significantly impacted the building's character defining features such that the building does not retain sufficient integrity to embody the distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation of this building under HRB Criterion C.

*CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.*

Research into the construction of the property at 7991-7993 Prospect Place failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

*CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.*

The property at 7991-7993 Prospect Place has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

*CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.*

The property at 7991-7993 Prospect Place is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

#### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that Manzanita Cottage located at 7991 Prospect Place be designated with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criterion A as a resource reflects a special element of La Jolla's historical, social, economic, aesthetic and architectural development. The designation excludes the rear residence identified as 7993 Prospect Place. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek  
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco  
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 2/26/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/26/2015, to consider the historical designation of **Manzanita Cottage** (owned by Kevin N. and Melissa A. Steel, 7870 Torrey Lane, San Diego, CA 92037) located at **7991 Prospect Place, San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: **350-121-39-00**, further described as PAR 1 DOC11-0690432 IN in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of Manzanita Cottage on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A as a special element of La Jolla's historical, social, economic, aesthetic and architectural development and retains integrity to the 1910 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the house embodies the character defining features of Beach Cottage architecture, is one of a finite and limited number of beach cottages remaining which reflect the early development history of La Jolla, and retains integrity for that association. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear residence identified as 7993 Prospect Place.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN LEMMO, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND  
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
HEATHER FERBERT,  
Deputy City Attorney