



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 12, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-017

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of March 26, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – 6752-6762 Tyrian Street**

APPLICANT: F M R E LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 6752-6762 Tyrian Street, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The subject property is a two-story Tudor Revival style single-family residence and a one-story Tudor Revival style single-family residence (formerly a garage) built in 1926 on the west side of Tyrian Street where it intersects Bonair Place in the Hyman's Addition of the La Jolla Community.

The building is located on APN 351-393-01-00. The property was identified in the 2003 La Jolla Reconnaissance Survey and given a Status Code of 7R, "Identified in Reconnaissance Level Survey: Not evaluated."

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Technical Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or La Jolla's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a two-story single-family residence identified as 6752 Tyrian Street and a one-story single-family residence identified as 6762 Tyrian Street built in 1926 in the Tudor Revival style. The 6762 Tyrian Street structure was originally constructed as an associated garage to the primary residence on the property and since converted into a dwelling unit. The buildings are of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation with floor joists.

The 6752 Tyrian Street residence exhibits an irregular plan form and asymmetrical façades. It features a high-pitched gabled roof sheathed in composition shingle and presents enclosed eaves with minimal overhang. The building is clad in a medium sand finish stucco. Fenestration throughout consists primarily of non-historic vinyl double hung and slider windows. The primary (east) elevation is characterized by the dominant cross-gabled roof with gabled dormer, and a modest recessed, arched entry with wood front door. At the center of the north-facing gable is a stucco chimney.

The 6762 Tyrian Street building exhibits a square-shaped plan and generally reflects the style of the primary residence with matching stucco and a composition shingle roof formed by a pair of high-pitched gables with minimal eave overhang. A shed addition exists along the west elevation. Fenestration consists generally of aluminum slider windows.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and brick or stone veneer, depending upon the subtype. Decorative half-timbering is present on about half of examples. Fenestration is typically characterized by tall, narrow windows, usually appearing in multiple groups and with

multi-pane glazing. Relatively uncommon before World War I, widespread adoption of masonry veneering techniques in the 1920s accompanied a dramatic rise in the style's popularity as even the most modest examples began to closely mimic the brick and stone veneers of their English prototypes.

Alterations to the subject property have negatively affected integrity and character defining features. The fenestration of the 6752 Tyrian Street building is made up almost entirely of non-historic vinyl double hung and slider windows. Two windows on the south side elevation appear to be replacement metal slider windows. A single wood 2 over 2 divided light window remains visible in the front gable of the primary façade. A non-historic sand finish stucco has been applied to both buildings and notably covers the only modest application of brick veneer on the chimney of the primary residence. The 6752 Tyrian Street building has been subject to two additions according to the Building Record – only one of these additions could be roughly identified at the west (rear) elevation upon staff's field check. The 6762 Tyrian Street structure was originally the associated garage to the primary residence on the property and has been radically modified with its 1945 conversion to a dwelling unit, non-original fenestration and shed addition to the west.

While the cumulative effect of these modifications to the property has greatly impacted the building's character defining features and integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling, it is critical to also note that these modifications are made even more impactful on a property that was stylistically very reserved to begin with. The original 6752 Tyrian Street residence and associated garage conspicuously lacks architectural detailing that would make it highly representative or a valuable example of the Tudor Revival style, such as tall, narrow divided light windows, prominent chimney with decorative chimney pots, or decorative half-timbering. The subject house lacks all these elements, and what small amount of embellishment seen in the brick veneer accent at the chimney has been concealed by the non-historic stucco finish.

In part as a result of significant loss of integrity, the property does not embody the distinctive characteristics of the Tudor Revival style sufficient to convey the historic significance of that style. The building is not a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials nor does it exemplify high craftsmanship and design. The property does not embody the distinctive characteristics of a rare or unique building type or method of construction. Finally, the building's age and physical features do not exemplify or reflect the era when its style, type or method of construction became popular. Therefore staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street was built by the original owner and occupant, Paul J. Davidson. The architect or designer (if one was obtained) could not be identified. Paul J. Davidson has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is not recommended that the property located at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street be designated under any HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachment:

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover