

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 14, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-024

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of May 28, 2015

SUBJECT: ITEM #8 – Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford House

APPLICANT: Silverado Trust 09-27-06 represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O'Dea

LOCATION: 2040 Dale Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford House

located at 2040 Dale Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford House located at 2040 Dale Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1908 under HRB Criterion C. The designation is limited to APN 539-156-12-01, and excludes the modified rear detached garage and the second unit rear addition at the southwest corner of the structure. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1908 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low pitch gabled roof form with wide, flared eave overhang and exposed rafters; wood clapboard and shingle siding; simple frieze detailing and decorative trusses in gable ends; and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one story single-family residence built in 1908 in the Craftsman style, and located on the west side of Dale Street, just south of Hawthorn Street in the Seaman and Choate's Addition of the Greater Golden Hill Community.

The building is located on APN 539-156-12-01, as shown on the Parcel Map provided in Attachment 2. The property is part of a condominiumized parcel which includes two other residences under separate ownership located to the north: 2044 Dale Street (APN 539-156-12-02), and 2921 Hawthorn Street (APN 539-156-12-03) as shown in the Condominium Plan in Attachment 3. The proposed designation does not include APN 539-156-12-02 or APN 539-156-12-03, and is limited only to the subject property identified as 2040 Dale Street (APN 539-156-12-01). The buildings on the other parcels will be subject to review for potential significance under SDMC Section 143.0212. The property was located within the boundary of the Draft 2011 Greater Golden Hill Survey, but was not identified in the survey as a potentially significant resource.

The historic name of the resource, the Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Allen Hazard and Janet O'Dea, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one-story Craftsman style single family residence built in 1908 of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. The low-pitched gabled roof is sheathed in composition shingle to simulate the original shingle roof it replaced, and features wide, flared eave overhang with exposed rafters. Austere, decorative trusses are placed in the primary gables. A simple frieze wraps around the building – separating the first story of horizontal wood clapboard siding and the gable ends above clad in wood shingle.

A modest front entry porch is set back around the north corner of the primary elevation and leads to the primary wood entry door believed to be original but modified with a non-historic bottle glass window. Fenestration consists primarily of wood double hung windows – elaborated at the primary elevation with a 30-lite fixed wood attic window and a pair of 24-over-1 wood double hung windows flanking a 1-over-1 double hung window in the front bay. At the rear of the property is a detached one-story garage.

Modifications have been fairly limited and are generally the result of the building's conversion to a duplex which is believed to have occurred in the 1950s. This conversion added a second, rear unit by essentially expanding the rear, southwest corner of the structure. This alteration is plainly evident at the rear of the south (side) elevation where the continuous line of exposed rafters terminates and transitions to a more simplified roof-wall junction. At this same elevation, as a result of the duplex conversion, one window was removed, and one window was altered and replaced with an aluminum sliding window. An interior brick chimney was also removed as part

of the conversion. Finally, two non-historic windows at the rear end of the north (side) elevation have been placed within existing window openings which retain their original wood trim. The modifications do not notably impact the building's composition, massing, scale or significant decorative or architectural elements. Therefore, there is no significant effect on the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling, and the building remains eligible under HRB Criterion C. The rear detached one-story garage no longer resembles the original one-and-a-half-story accessory structure visible in the historic photographs, and is therefore not recommend by staff to be included any designation.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The limited modifications allow the property to continue to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a low pitch gabled roof form with wide, flared eave overhang and exposed rafters; wood clapboard and shingle siding; simple frieze detailing and decorative trusses in gable ends; and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford House located at 2040 Dale Street be designated with a period of significance of 1908 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The designation is limited to APN 539-156-12-01, and excludes the modified rear detached garage and the second unit rear addition at the southwest corner of the structure. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical

Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Camille Pekarek Associate Planner Kelley Stanco

Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Assessor's Parcel Map
- 3. Condominium Plan
- 4. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 5/28/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/28/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford House** (owned by Silverado Trust 09-27-06, 607 Flying Cloud Drive, Imperial, CA 92251) located at **2040 Dale Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **539-156-12-01**, further described as PAR 1 US I PER DOC07-0216824&UND INT IN in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Lizzie and Gerald de Stafford House on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1908 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low pitch gabled roof form with wide, flared eave overhang and exposed rafters; wood clapboard and shingle siding; simple frieze detailing and decorative trusses in gable ends; and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the modified rear detached garage, and the second unit rear addition at the southwest corner of the structure.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A	
	BY:
	JOHN LEMMO, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,	
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:
	HEATHER FERBERT,
	Deputy City Attorney

SHEET 3 OF 5 SHEETS DALE / HAWTHORN CONDOMINIUM PLAN N 89°00'01" W 140.17 N 00°59'59" | 40.00' HAWTHORN STREET 30.00' (AS DEDICATED TO PUBLIC USE) 8 N 89°00'01"W 100.19 114.98 55.35 0.00 APN 539-156-12-03 APN 539-156-12-02 UNIT 3 UNIT 2 2921 HAWTHORN ST. 2044 DALE ST. L.V.B. 280.10 L.V.B. 281.82 75.01 40.00' N 00°58'29° N 89°00'05"W 10.20 AS DEDICATED N 58°18'07"W 16.79' -N.88°51'40'E N 00°58'11" E S N 00°58'11" E N 09°31'43"E APN 539-156-12-01 12.74 UNIT 1 N 89°29'23"W 2040 DALE ST. L.V.B. 280.66 7.00' 100.20 N 89°00'15"W N 89°01'49" W 40.00 PLOT PLAN 2/15/07 J-1562 PREPARED BY: SITE DESIGN ASSOCIATES, INC. 1018 BROADWAY SUITE "A" EL CAJON, CALIFORNIA 92021 (619) 442-8467 FAX (619) 442-8417