



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 9, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-031

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of July 23, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #8 – 4394 42nd Street**

APPLICANT: Ellen Springall represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 4394 42nd Street, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 4394 42nd Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 4394 42nd Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The building is a one-story Craftsman style single-family residence built in 1926 at the southwest corner of 42nd Street and Meade Avenue in the Wilshire Place Subdivision of the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The building is located on APN 454-734-23-00. The property was identified in the 1996 Mid-City Survey and given a Status Code of 5S3, “Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation.”

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4394 42nd Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Kensington-Talmadge's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4394 42nd Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a one-story Craftsman style single-family residence constructed in 1926 of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. The building's plan form is generally rectangular with a partial width front porch. The low-pitched, front gabled roof is sheathed in rolled composition and exhibits wide eave overhang with exposed rafters and projecting beams. The building is clad in horizontal wood lap siding. Decorative features are generally limited – rafter tails, fascia boards, window trim, and attic vents are all modestly executed, with the small exception of the wood trim at the porch columns. Fenestration consists primarily of 1 over 1 single hung vinyl windows appearing singly or in pairs. At the southwest corner of the property is a detached single car garage oriented toward the north, from which vehicular access was originally provided.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frames and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

A number of modifications have occurred to the property. At the north (side) elevation, a non-historic "pop-out" garden window has been added. At the west (rear) elevation, non-historic vinyl sliding doors have been added. Additional modifications are not noted in the historic report and include the wholesale replacement of the original wood double hung windows with vinyl single hung windows in existing openings, non-historic brick cladding applied to the chimney at

the north elevation, and non-historic brick applied to the porch floor and front walkway. The only original windows remaining are two 8-light fixed windows flanking the chimney. It is not known whether the original wood double hung windows at the primary elevation at least were divided light, as seen in the windows flanking the chimney, or single light. Furthermore, it is believed by staff that the decorative wood trim surrounding the front door is uncharacteristic of the Craftsman style and not original to the subject building.

While the building does retain its basic Craftsman character, the cumulative effect of the alterations to the property has negatively impacted the building's more critical character defining features and integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling. In addition, a property as modest and lacking in detail as the subject property is more greatly affected by this loss of integrity. In part as a result of notable loss of integrity, the property does not embody the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style sufficient to convey the historic significance of that style. The building is not a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials nor does it exemplify high craftsmanship and design. The property does not embody the distinctive characteristics of a rare or unique building type or method of construction. Finally, the building's age and physical features do not exemplify or reflect the era when its style, type or method of construction became popular. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 4394 42nd Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4394 42nd Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4394 42nd Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is not recommended that the property located at 4394 42nd Street be designated under any HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Associate Planner



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

CP/ks

Attachment(s):

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover