



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: July 9, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-033

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of July 23, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2**

APPLICANT: Kevin J. Conners represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4653 Biona Drive, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2 located at 4653 Biona Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2 located at 4653 Biona Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 324 square foot rear addition and detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a combination roof with a clay tile-clad front gable and flat roof with parapet; medium-heavy sand stucco cladding; clay tile vents; central entry porch and courtyard; arched window and door openings; and multi-lite windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a one story single family home located on APN 465-345-06-00 in the residential area of Kensington. The property was located within the boundary of the 1996 Mid-City Survey, but was not identified in the survey for unknown reasons.

The historic name of the resource, the Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the owner/builders who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4653 Biona Drive did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Kensington's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4653 Biona Drive did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property located at 4653 Biona Drive was constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic style and features a combination roof with a clay tile-clad front gable and flat roof with parapet; medium-heavy sand stucco cladding over wood frame construction; a simple decorative recess in the stucco at the gable end; clay tile vents; a central entry porch and courtyard enclosed by a low stucco wall; arched window and door openings; and a variety of multi-lite wood frame and sash windows, including 8-lite casement, 6-over-1 double hung and 1-over-1 double hung.

Modifications include construction of a rear addition in 1972; replacement of the roof with a historically appropriate single barrel clay tile; a window modification at the kitchen; addition of decorative tile and brick over the concrete porch floor; and alteration of the detached garage. The modifications have not significantly impacted integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling to the extent that the building no longer retains integrity to its original Spanish Eclectic design and 1926 period of significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2 continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a combination roof with a clay tile-clad front gable roof and flat roof with parapet; medium-heavy sand stucco cladding; clay tile vents; central entry porch and courtyard; arched window and door openings; and multi-lite windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 4653 Biona Drive was designed and built by Lewis H. Dodge. Dodge has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4653 Biona Drive has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4653 Biona Drive is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2 located at 4653 Biona Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains integrity. The designation excludes the 324 square foot rear addition and detached garage. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 7/23/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 7/23/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **LEWIS AND ANNIE DODGE SPEC HOUSE #2** (owned by Kevin J. Conners, 4653 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4653 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **465-345-06-00**, further described as BLK E LOT 6 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a combination roof with a clay tile-clad front gable roof and flat roof with parapet; medium-heavy sand stucco cladding; clay tile vents; central entry porch and courtyard; arched window and door openings; and multi-lite windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 324 square foot rear addition and detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
INGA LINTVEDT,
Deputy City Attorney