

# THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	September 10, 2015	REPORT NO. HRB-15-043
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of September 24, 2015	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #11 – Estelle and William McKenna Spec House #1	
APPLICANT:	Steve Wilt and Angela Michaels represented by Heritage Architecture & Plan	nning
LOCATION:	3315 Elliot Street, 92106, Peninsula Comm	unity, Council District 2
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Estelle and #1, located at 3315 Elliot Street as a historic	1

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Estelle and William McKenna Spec House #1 located at 3315 Elliot Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 228 square foot rear addition. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits low-pitched cross-gabled, clay tile roofs with narrow eaves; smooth stucco finish; decorative inset panels; clay tile vents; and focal window at the main facade.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a one story single family home located on APN 450-102-11-00 in a residential area of Point Loma.

The historic name of the resource, the Estelle and William McKenna Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the owner/builders who constructed the house as a speculation house.

## ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Heritage Architecture & Planning, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one story Spanish Eclectic style single family residence built in 1933 of standard wood frame construction on a raised floor foundation. The exterior walls have a smooth stucco finish. There is a combination of low-pitched, s-tile, cross-gabled roofs and flat roof. Horizontal terra cotta vents are located at narrow eaves with exposed rafter tails. Vertical terra cotta vents and coved eaves are found on gable ends. Fenestration consists of replacement wood, fixed/double hung, multi-lite windows on primary east and south facades, and replacement vinyl fixed/sliders at the west and north facades. The primary facade faces east and is asymmetrical. This elevation exhibits the main gabled roof with a decorative panel above its focal window. The primary entry is accessed through a low courtyard wall with a stepped brick top and wrought iron gate. A brick walkway and steps lead to the entry. The entry features wrought iron railing and a canvas awning above. The south facing wood paneled entry door has a unique recessed stucco panel above. On the rear of the south elevation there is a stucco clad chimney centered on the gable end of roof. The concrete driveway along the south of parcel is used to access the detached garage at the rear. The roof of the garage is flat with a tile, partial gable over the main garage door. The exterior finish on the garage is a smooth stucco finish matching the main house. The rear west facing elevation shows brick paving and steps leading to the rear entry door. The windows on both sides of the door have metal security grilles, similar to other windows around the house. The enclosed porch addition is located to the left of the elevation. The north elevation shows a stucco clad chimney with brick detailing at the top. The orientation of terra cotta vents located under the eaves and gable end are consistent with other elevations. Most of the fenestration on this elevation has metal security grilles.

Modifications include enclosed rear porch in 1978, metal security grilles, courtyard walls, altered entry walkway and steps, and replacement wood and vinyl windows replaced by the Quieter Home Program. The modifications have not significantly impacted integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling to the extent that the building no longer retains integrity to its original Spanish Eclectic design and 1933 period of significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The Estelle and William McKenna Spec House #1 continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including low-pitched, cross-gabled, clay tile roofs with narrow eaves; smooth stucco finish; decorative inset panels; clay tile vents; and focal window at the main facade. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

## **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Estelle and William McKenna Spec House #1 located at 3315 Elliot Street be designated with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains integrity. The designation excludes the 228 square foot rear addition. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

ellev Stanco

Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

Joseph P. Castro, RA Associate Planner

JPC/ks

Attachments:

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

## RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 9/24/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/24/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Estelle and William McKenna Spec House #1** (owned by Steve Wilt and Angela Michaels, 3315 Elliott Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3315 Elliott Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92106**, APN: **450-102-11-00**, further described as BLK B LOT 12 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Estelle and William McKenna Spec House #1 on the following findings:

1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1933 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits low-pitched cross-gabled, clay tile roofs with narrow eaves; smooth stucco finish; decorative inset panels; clay tile vents; and focal window at the main facade. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 228 square foot rear addition.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: COR

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney