



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 10, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-044

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 24, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Lewis and Annie Dodge/Dodge Construction Company House**

APPLICANT: Thomas & Susan Polakiewicz represented by Paul & Sarai Johnson

LOCATION: 4649 Biona Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Dodge Construction Company House located at 4649 Biona Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Dodge Construction Company House located at Biona Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criteria C & D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Tudor Revival and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features two adjacent steeply-pitched front façade gables with stucco wall cladding over wood frame construction; decorative louvered attic vent; faux half timbering; decorative chimney with chimney pots; recessed arched entry; and groups of tall narrow casement windows and leaded diamond panes.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of proposed Master Builder Lewis Henry Dodge of Dodge Construction Company and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Lewis Dodge's career as a builder peaked while residing in San Diego. His contribution to local residential homes reaches further than construction and into the promotion of building quality and attractive neighborhoods in Sunset Cliffs and Kensington -Talmadge. The subject resource retains good integrity to its original design and is representative of Lewis' earlier work in the Tudor Revival style.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is located on APN 465-345-07-00. The property was identified in the Mid-City Survey of 1996 and given a Status Code of 5D2, "Contributor to a district that is eligible for local listing or designation."

The historic name of the resource, the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Dodge Construction Company House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Lewis Henry Dodge, who constructed the house as a personal residence and is a proposed Master Builder.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Johnson & Johnson Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria B, C, D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D, but not HRB Criterion B. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4649 Biona did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. The property was rented for 6 years to Dean B. Johnson, a tenant that was locally as well as internationally accomplished in the maritime, shipping, and fishing industry. However at this time there is not enough evidence of his contributions towards the local San Diego community and economy, specifically. If such evidence is presented in the future, reconsideration of the property's designation under Criterion B could occur. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property at 4649 Biona Drive is a one story single family residence constructed in 1926 in the Tudor Revival style and features wood frame construction with stucco wall cladding and faux half timbering. The entrance features a small protruding gable roof porch with a recessed arched doorway. The front façade includes two steeply pitched front façade gable roofs, with the smaller gable over the main arch entryway. The roof is made of composition shingle and has a chimney capped with decorative pots. Its windows are wood-framed diamond-pane leaded glass, with 4 over 1 double hung windows on the North and South sides of the house. The detached garage on the property's South side is decorated in the same half timbering design but is constructed of woodlap siding.

Modifications include a 1990 rear expansion of a bedroom and addition of a bathroom. These alternations neither add nor take away from the home as it was completed in a historically appropriate finish. The property was originally built with a wood shingle roof; however, the residence now has a composition shingle roof, which is an acceptable replacement material.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and veneer, depending upon the subtype, and tall wood windows. Decorative half-timbering is present on only about half of the examples.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Tudor Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including steeply pitched gable roofs; wood frame construction with stucco wall cladding and decorative faux half-timbering; chimney with decorative pots; diamond-pane leaded-glass wood frame and double hung windows. Furthermore, the property retains integrity to its 1926 period of significance. Therefore staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 4649 Biona Drive was built and lived in by proposed Master Builder Lewis Henry Dodge in 1926. He was a third generation learned carpenter and builder, first apprenticing his father then later working as a professional builder from 1891 until his death in 1934. Arriving in San Diego in 1923 with his son Edward Lewis Dodge, they established their construction company that later produced over 42 residences in the Tudor, Dutch Colonial, English, Mission, and Spanish Colonial Revival styles.

Presently, three residences built by Lewis Henry Dodge and Dodge Construction Company have been designated by the Board as historical resources: John and Amy Ballinger House (HRB Site #592), Lewis Dodge Spec House #1 (HRB #631), and Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #1 (HRB Site #1111). Additionally, a Spanish Eclectic residence in the Kensington-Talmadge community was designed and built by Lewis, on the same street as the subject resource with the name of Lewis and Annie Dodge Spec House #2 (HRB Site #1184). The subject resource was built by Lewis in 1926 in the Tudor Revival style and reflects his earlier work in San Diego, before his style changed to Spanish and Colonial architecture. Although the historically designated homes Lewis built are predominantly in the Spanish and Colonial style, the subject resource as a Tudor Revival is a rare and excellent example that encapsulates Lewis' career journey, as the proposed Master Builder himself resided within the home as his Dodge Construction Company flourished.

Dodge Construction Company was recognized as a building company of high quality and craftsmanship in the San Diego Union and Evening Tribune newspapers as well as by developer John P. Mills Organization. His company was chosen to represent the newly developed Sunset Cliffs subdivision, by building a showcase home for W.S. Mills, the sales manager for the John P. Mills Organization. Lewis's showcase home was featured in the 1926 celebration of "Better

Homes” week in the newspapers. The “Better Homes” section of the newspaper was inspired by the Better Homes Movement, a national drive to build better quality affordable homes with progressive design features. It was driven by the ideology of providing good design and quality construction for all social and economic levels. On May 10, 1925, Kensington Park put an advertisement of the newly designed homes to be expected within the neighborhood. Three of the five homes within the article were built by the Dodge Construction Company; two Spanish styled and one Dutch Colonial home, all located on Biona Drive. Dodge Construction Company was cited many times in the “Better Homes” section of the newspaper for his work in Kensington and Sunset Cliffs.

Significance Statement: Lewis Dodge’s career as a builder peaked while residing in San Diego. His contribution to local residential homes reaches further than construction and into the promotion of building quality and attractive neighborhoods in Sunset Cliffs and Kensington - Talmadge. The subject resource retains good integrity to its original design and is representative of Lewis’ earlier work in the Tudor Revival style. Therefore staff recommends that the Board establish Lewis Henry Dodge of Dodge Construction Company as a Master Builder and designate subject property under HRB Criterion D as a good example of the notable work of proposed Master Builder Lewis Henry Dodge.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Dodge Construction Company House located at 4649 Biona Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Tudor Revival architecture; and Criterion D as the work of proposed Master Builder Lewis Henry Dodge. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jane Kang
Planning Intern



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JK/ks

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 9/24/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 9/24/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Lewis and Annie Dodge/Dodge Construction Company House** (owned by Thomas E. and Susan S. Polakiewicz, 4649 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4649 Biona Drive, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **465-345-07-00**, further described as BLK E LOT 7 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Dodge Construction Company House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Tudor and retains integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features two adjacent steeply-pitched front façade gables with stucco wall cladding over wood frame construction; decorative louvered attic vents; faux half timbering; decorative chimney with chimney pots; recessed arched entry, and groups of tall narrow casement windows and leaded diamond panes. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of proposed Master Builder Lewis Henry Dodge. Lewis Dodge's career as a builder peaked while residing in San Diego. His contribution to local residential homes reaches further than construction and into the promotion of building quality and attractive neighborhoods in Sunset Cliffs and Kensington-Talmadge. Dodge Construction Company was recognized for its high quality craftsmanship, featured in the "Better Homes" section of the San Diego Union and Evening Tribune newspapers. It was chosen to represent the Sunset Cliffs subdivision with a showcase home for the developer John P. Mills Organization. The subject resource retains good integrity to its original design and is representative of Lewis' earlier work in the Tudor revival style. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney