



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 15, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-045

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of October 22, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Adolphus Hatcher House**

APPLICANT: Hill-Sachs Family Trust represented by Johnson & Johnson

LOCATION: 4407 Georgia Street, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Adolphus Hatcher House located at 4407 Georgia Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Adolphus Hatcher House located at 4407 Georgia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 170 square foot rear bedroom addition. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a rectangular form with wood shingle siding; a low-pitched gable roof; partial-width cobblestone front porch; multi-light wood framed windows; overhanging eaves; exposed rafter tails; and a capped brick chimney.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject house is a one-story single family Craftsman residence constructed in 1910 in the University Heights Subdivision of the Greater North Park Community.

The building is located on APN 445-213-05-00. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Adolphus Hatcher House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Adolphus Hatcher, who constructed the house as his personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Johnson & Johnson, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, B, & C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criteria A & B. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4407 Georgia St. did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Greater North Park Community's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. The applicant's report states that through the use of a Craftsman design, cobblestone porch and Canary Island date palms, the property is significant as an example of the aesthetic and landscape development of the University Heights community from 1904 to 1910. However, there is no evidence that the subject property influenced this early aesthetic of University Heights, and does not convey it to any greater extent than other homes of the period. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4407 Georgia St. did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Owners and residents Claude and Clara Chandler, who occupied the house from 1921-1962 were committed to civic and community service and were politically active while living within the residence. However, their contributions do not rise to the level of historic significance. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one story, single family residence built in 1910 in the Craftsman architectural style. It is constructed on two approximately 25' x 140' lots sloped towards the rear of the home, dropping in elevation by three feet. The house is a rectangular form with a low-pitched gable roof and partial width cobblestone front porch capped with concrete. It features wide overhanging eaves, exposed rafter tails, wood shingle siding, wood-framed windows, and a capped brick chimney. Its front elevation has two 9 over 3 fixed windows, three 6 over 1 double hung windows in the center, and a small 12 lite fixed window on its upper front façade. The sides of the house have wood framed 1 over 1 double hung windows and a wood louvered attic vent on the North elevation.

Modifications were done in the rear of the house between 1921 and 1950 when an additional bedroom was made, partially enveloping the original open back porch. This rear alteration, although older than 45 years old, neither detracts from nor contributes to the significance of the

resource; therefore it is excluded from designation. The residence also at one point included a 16' x 16' garage constructed after 1921, but this was demolished sometime after 1956. After 1968, a spark arrester cap was also placed on top of the chimney.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman architecture style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including its rectangular form with wood shingle siding; a low-pitched gable roof; partial-width cobblestone front porch; multi-light wood framed windows; overhanging eaves; exposed rafter tails; and a capped brick chimney. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C. Designation excludes the 170 square foot rear bedroom alteration.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Adolphus Hatcher House located at 4407 Georgia St. be designated with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 170 square foot rear bedroom addition. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jane Kang
Planning Intern



Kelley Stancio
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JK/ks

- Attachments:
1. Draft Resolution
 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/22/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/22/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Adolphus Hatcher House** (owned by Hill-Sachs Family Trust 07-15-13, 4407 Georgia Street, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **4407 Georgia Street, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **445-213-05-00**, further described as BLK 76 LOT 7 LOT 6 & W 100 FT LOT 7 & N 3 FT OF E 40 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Adolphus Hatcher House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Tudor and retains integrity from its 1910 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a rectangular form with wood shingle siding; a low-pitched gable roof; partial-width cobblestone front porch; multi-light wood framed windows; overhanging eaves; exposed rafter tails; and a capped brick chimney. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 170 square foot rear bedroom addition.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney