

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 12, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-050

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of November 20, 2015

SUBJECT: ITEM #7 – 705 6th Avenue

APPLICANT: HPE 705 6th Avenue LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 705 6th Avenue, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 705 6th Avenue as a

historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

For the reasons specified in this report, the property located at 705 6th Avenue does not meet the established criteria for historic designation and therefore should not be designated as a historic resource.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. This property is located in the East Village community at a corner lot in close proximity to the Gaslamp Historic District.

The building is located on APN 535-101-0300. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Technical Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 705 6th Avenue did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or downtown's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 705 6th Avenue did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in 1927, the building is One Part Commercial Block building. The building was designed by John S. Siebert and constructed by the firm of Storm and Butts. The building is located at the corner of G Street and Sixth Street. Originally envisioned as a five-story building with terra cotta tile and a clay tile roof, the building was built as a one story and constructed of variegated brick. The building features eleven bay sections with three on the west façade and seven along the south side. The main entrance is located at the corner and features an angled bay. Decorative tile is located above the storefronts at the parapet and at the bulkhead under the storefront windows.

The variegated brick at the exterior is laid in a stacked pattern on the columns and a rowlock pattern at the parapet. The use of variegated brick was common in the 1910s and the 1920s throughout California. The term variegated refers to the use of colored bricks and not a method or type of construction. The number of buildings in San Diego from this time period that used variegated brick is low, but the type and method of the brick construction is not uncommon with many buildings still in existence.

The One-Part Commercial Block building was identified by Richard Longstreth as a "one story, simple box with a decorated façade." Other sources define the type as "single story buildings, usually simple boxes with decorative facades, which house either a single store or many units. Facades that face the street have large windows and recessed entryways. These modest buildings have Mission style details such as simple stucco molding, flat roof surfaces and raised parapets."

There have been a number of modifications to this building which have negatively impacted its integrity. Sometime between 1966 and 1972 the building at 717-725 Sixth Avenue was demolished and the area was used as a parking lot. In 1999, a new two story-stucco building was constructed and the subject property was renovated to accommodate a restaurant. While the new construction is part of the restaurant, it appears as a separate building on the exterior while the

north wall of the subject building was removed creating a connection between the two buildings. As part of the renovation, five bays were removed and the areas were recessed slightly and stuccoed. The remaining bays had the three part transom windows covered and the bays with entrance doors had them removed. Tile was added in the location where the doors were removed. Mechanical screening was also added to the rooftop. Due to the extensive modifications to the building that have resulted in loss of integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling related to the building's original One-Part Commercial Block construction, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Designed by John S. Siebert, an established Master Architect, and Arnold B. Stoton. Siebert was established as a master with the designation of HRB Site #189, the Eagles Hall at 733 8th Avenue and HRB Site #412, the Veteran's War Memorial Building at 3325 Zoo Drive.

Given the number of modifications that have happened to the building and the limited amount of historic material remaining on the building, the building has lost integrity of design, materials, workmanship, feeling and association and no longer represents the notable work of Master Architect John S. Siebert. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 705 6th Avenue has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 705 6th Avenue is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the

Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted, staff's field check and professional opinion, it is recommended that the building located at 705 6th Avenue not be designated under any HRB Criteria for the reasons specified in this report.

Jodie Brown, AICP

Senior Planner

Kelley Stanco

Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/ks

Attachment:

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover