



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 12, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-052

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of November 20, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec House #2**

APPLICANT: Charles and Beverley Freedman represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 1809 West Montecito Way, Uptown Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec House #2 located at 1809 West Montecito Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec House #2 located at 1809 West Montecito Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913-1914 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 1,022 square foot attached rear addition and detached garage constructed in 1992. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low-pitch front gable roof; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails and decorative brackets; vertical wood slat vents in the gable ends; alternating wide and narrow wood lap siding at the ground floor and wood shingle siding at the upper floor, all over wood frame construction; a centered, low-pitch front gable entry porch with a small balcony above featuring simple wood railing; and fenestration consisting of large picture windows with 8-lite uppers, 1-over-1 wood frame and sash double hung windows and single lite wood frame casement windows.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Nathan Rigdon and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is an outstanding example of an early residential house designed and built in 1913-1914 by Master Builder Nathan Rigdon. The distinct Craftsman design utilizing a front gabled porch with balcony above, varied wood exterior siding and detailing, and skilled carpentry work distinguish this house as an example of Rigdon's notable work.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is located on APN 443-431-14-00 in the residential subdivision of Mission Hills. The property was previously reviewed and considered by the Historical Resources Board in September 2004. At that time, staff recommended against designation due to modifications that occurred in 1990 resulting in the addition of enhanced Craftsman features and elements not present on the home historically. The Board voted 8-2-1 in favor of the staff recommendation against designation. Since that time, the current owners who purchased the property in 2014 have undertaken efforts in consultation with the City's Historical Resources staff to restore the home based on historic photographs. A new report has been prepared by Legacy 106, Inc. to evaluate the house in its restored condition.

The historic name of the resource, the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House # 2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Master Builder Nathan Rigdon and his wife Hattie, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc. which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 1809 West Montecito Way did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or Mission Hill's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 1809 West Montecito Way did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building located at 1809 West Montecito Way is a two story Craftsman style home constructed circa 1913-1914, and features a low-pitch front gable roof with asphalt shingles; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails and decorative brackets; vertical wood slat vents in

the gable ends; alternating wide and narrow wood lap siding at the ground floor and wood shingle siding at the upper floor, all over wood frame construction; a centered, low-pitch front gable entry porch; and a concrete foundation with sub-floor. The entry porch, which is accessed by a series of concrete steps, is flanked by large picture windows with 8-lite uppers. Above the porch, a small balcony with simple wood railing is accessed by a 10-lite French door. Remaining windows on the house are primarily 1-over-1 wood frame and sash double hung windows and single lite wood frame casement windows.

Modifications include a 1,022 square foot rear addition and new garage that were constructed in 1992. Around the same time, the home was modified to add additional Craftsman detailing and features. These elements can be seen in the transitional photos, and included modification of all of the rafter tails on the house from the original vertical cut profile to a new tapered profile with a horizontal cut at the bottom; replacement of the two original long, thin roof brackets with four shorter, thicker brackets; addition of a horizontal beam between the brackets; extension of the porch to the right and addition of a trellis above; addition of a trellis over the open porch to the left; and replacement of several original window glazings with stained glass. Working with the Design Assistance Subcommittee and historic resources staff, the current owners undertook restoration work that included removal of the rafter extensions; removal of the added center brackets and horizontal beam; and removal of the trellises to the left and right of the entry porch. Modifications which remain include the shorter, thicker roof brackets; the porch extension to the right; the stained glass windows; and the non-original fascia between the original rafter tails. The restoration work completed has significantly improved the building's integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling. Overall, the building retains sufficient integrity to be eligible under HRB Criterion C, despite the remaining modifications.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Significance Statement: The subject property continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a low-pitch front gable roof; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails and decorative brackets; vertical wood slat vents in the gable ends; alternating wide and narrow wood lap siding at the ground floor and wood shingle siding at the upper floor, all over wood frame construction; a centered, low-pitch front gable entry porch with a small balcony above featuring simple wood railing; and fenestration consisting of large picture windows with 8-lite uppers, 1-over-1 wood frame and sash double hung windows and single lite wood frame casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant has also recommended that the subject property be designated under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of established Master Builder Nathan Rigdon. Rigdon was established as a Master by the HRB in May 2005 with the designation of the Carl H. Heilbron/Nathan Rigdon House (HRB Site #711) under Criteria B, C, and D.

Nathan Rigdon was born in Harford County Maryland in 1867. It is unclear when he arrived in San Diego; however by 1909 he was noted on permit listings in the Daily Transcript. The 1910 census listed him as a “builder and speculator.” He was responsible for the design and construction of houses as well as commercial and apartment buildings throughout the City; however a significant portion of his work was in Mission Hills, especially along West Lewis Street and Fort Stockton Drive. He designed houses in several styles including many in his own version of the Prairie style, which is sometimes called the Nathan Rigdon Box or Mission Hills Box. Rigdon also planned buildings in the Craftsman style. Characteristic of Nathan Rigdon’s designs in Mission Hills are the conspicuous front entry porches with integrated second floor balconies – many of his houses are easily identified by this signature element.

Significance Statement: The subject property is an outstanding example of an early residential house designed and built in 1913-1914 by Master Builder Nathan Rigdon. The distinct Craftsman design utilizing a front gabled porch with balcony above, varied wood exterior siding and detailing, and skilled carpentry work distinguish this house as an example of Rigdon’s notable work. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 1809 West Montecito Way has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 1809 West Montecito Way is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec House #2 located at 1809 West Montecito Way be designated with a period of significance of 1913-1914 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Craftsman architecture, and Criterion D as an example of the notable work of Master Builder Nathan Rigdon. The designation excludes the 1,022 square foot attached rear addition and detached garage constructed in 1992. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. Design Assistance Subcommittee Meeting Minutes of March 4, 2015
3. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/20/2015

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/20/2015, to consider the historical designation of the **Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec House #2** (owned by Charles and Beverley Freedman, 1809 West Montecito Way, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1809 West Montecito Way, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **443-431-14-00**, further described as BLK 12 LOT 10 N 100 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec House #2 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Craftsman architecture and retains integrity to its 1913-1914 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low-pitch front gable roof; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails and decorative brackets; vertical wood slat vents in the gable ends; alternating wide and narrow wood lap siding at the ground floor and wood shingle siding at the upper floor, all over wood frame construction; a centered, low-pitch front gable entry porch with a small balcony above featuring simple wood railing; and fenestration consisting of large picture windows with 8-lite uppers, 1-over-1 wood frame and sash double hung windows and single lite wood frame casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Builder Nathan Rigdon and retains integrity to its original design. Specifically, the resource is an outstanding example of an early residential house designed and built in 1913-1914 by Master Builder Nathan Rigdon. The distinct Craftsman design utilizing a front gabled porch with balcony above, varied wood exterior siding and detailing, and skilled carpentry work distinguish this house as an example of Rigdon's notable work. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1,022 square foot attached rear addition and detached garage constructed in 1992.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
CORRINE NEUFFER,
Deputy City Attorney

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

Wednesday, March 5, 2015, at 4:00 PM
5th Floor Large Conference Room
City Operations Building, Development Services Department
1222 First Avenue, San Diego, CA

MEETING NOTES

1. ATTENDANCE 4:05PM

Subcommittee Members	Gail Garbini; Tom Larimer; Ann Woods
Recusals	
City Staff	
Guests	HRB Jodie Brown
Item 3A	Chuck Freedman, Kiley Wallace, Ron May,
Item 3B	Nathan Cadieux, JT Barr, Rachel Smith, Neal Singer
Other	Bruce Coons, SOHO

2. Public Comment (on matters not on the agenda)

3. Project Reviews

▪ **ITEM 3A:**

Listings:

Address: 1809 West Montecito Way

Historic Name:

Significance:

Mills Act Status: N/A

PTS #: N/A

Project Contact: Charles Freedman; Kiley Wallace

Treatment: Rehabilitation

Project Scope: Restoration of the property based on historic photos and photos prior to a 1991 remodel

Existing Square Feet: 2876

Additional Square Feet: 0

Total Proposed Square Feet: 2876

Prior DAS Review: N/A

Staff Presentation: The applicant would like to receive feedback on the restoration of their property prior to submitting for historic designation. They have historic photos which will help guide the restoration work.

Applicant Presentation: When this was in front of the Historical Resources Board Nathan Rigdon was not declared a master architect. We have found historic photos that show that some of the work noted in the staff report was not correct. Kiley has identified 5 areas of concern and we would like to have these items identified in order of priority for restoration. The house was built in 1914 and in 2001 the owner added a number of Craftsman elements that did not exist on the house. We would like to know if we need to do all of the items or some of the items.

Public Comment:

Name	Comments
Bruce Coons	I would recommend that you remove the trellis.

Q&A:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
Who was the builder?	Nathan Rigdon
On the rafter tails, they actually added them in?	They were originally straight cut and now they are angled.
I would think the pergolas need to go	
The rafters ends, brackets and cross member should go	
I would also recommend that they paint some of the elements: like the balcony railing (that was originally dark color) this would be a secondary item.	
The change to the second floor stain glass would be a secondary item.	What about the elongation of the porch? There is a ghost on the porch that makes it visible. (There will be comments on it from the HRB)
What is the material of that wall?	We are not sure.
So there were knee braces?	Yes, but they were light weight and there were only 2 originally.
So the eaves were boxed?	No, there was a ridge board added to that area.
I believe that the smaller porch is a character-defining feature. However, it could be a secondary issue to address. I think it is either one way or another removing the trellis and porch or leaving it in place.	We could remove the trellis without impacting the wall.
Are all the other windows original?	Yes, with the exception of the stained glass window.

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Garbini	The pergola, rafter ends, brackets and cross member should be priorities for the restoration work.

Staff Comment:

None

Recommended Modifications:

None

Consensus:

- Consistent with the Standards
- Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted
- Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review
- Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative
- Inconsistent with the Standards

▪ **ITEM 3B:**Listings: HRB Site #425; NRAddress:Historic Name: Naval Training Center Historic DistrictSignificance:Mills Act Status: N/APTS #: N/AProject Contact: Nathan Cadieux; Chris BittnerTreatment: RehabilitationProject Scope: Various improvements to the landscape and hardscape at the north end of NTC. The areas include the parking lot between Bldg. #1 and Barracke #14; the parking lots and landscape area south of Bldg. #194; the west courtyard of Bldg. #1 along Truxton Road and improvements along Sims Road.Existing Square Feet: 0Additional Square Feet: 0Total Proposed Square Feet: 0Prior DAS Review: N/AStaff Presentation: The applicant would like to make a number of changes to the north end of NTC. The changes would include modifications to the landscape, hardscape and lighting in the area.Applicant Presentation: We are making some place-making improvements to NTC, to improve the area so people want to spend time there. There are number of buildings without a front door; essentially building 1 has no front door, so we would like to invite the people in. The main parking is really in front of Ace Hardware and then they walk to the other areas. We wanted to make the area in front of Moment Cycle more inviting.