


CITY OF SAN DIEGO
M E M O R A N D U M

DATE: February 20, 2015
TO: Historical Resources Board and Interested Parties
FROM: Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner 
SUBJECT: **ITEM 6 – 3127 McKinley Street**

The property was previously docketed for review by the Historical Resources Board on January 22, 2015 at which time staff recommended against designation due to a lack of integrity resulting from modifications to the distinctive decorative stucco finish (Attachment 1). The item was not heard, and was continued by the Board for 30 days at the request of the applicant. Since the January hearing, the property owner has undertaken work to restore the stucco to the original appearance, which is still ongoing.

The work included grinding down the existing stucco and applying a new top coat of stucco to match the stucco texture seen in the historic photographs. The applicant has provided an Addendum to the original report (Attachment 2) documenting the restoration work. Staff advised the applicant that in order for staff to consider revising the staff recommendation to support designation, the stucco would need to be restored to accurately reflect the appearance seen in the historic photographs, and that all work must be completed by Wednesday, February 18th. As of the morning of February 20th, the work is not yet complete and is ongoing. The restoration of the textured finish is not yet complete on the main façade, and the application of a color coat and top coat of paint has not occurred.

While the restoration work completed thus far is promising, staff is not comfortable revising the staff recommendation with the restoration still underway and the finished product uncertain. Therefore, the staff recommendation to not designate under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity remains unchanged.

Additionally, while staff has supported designation of a property with only a partial restoration of siding material, staff has consistently required the front and driveway side elevations (which have a high degree of visibility) to be restored prior to designation. The applicant asserts that staff stated that only the front façade required restoration. Staff disagrees with this assertion, as it is not consistent with staff direction on siding restoration in the past. The lack of restoration along the driveway elevation would remain a concern for staff when evaluating the building's integrity and eligibility for designation.

Attachments: 1.) Staff Report No. HRB-15-006 (without attachments)
2.) Applicant's Addendum dated February 18, 2015 (under separate cover)



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 8, 2015 REPORT NO. HRB-15-006

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 22, 2015

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – 3127 McKinley Street**

APPLICANT: Justin Clapper represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 3127 McKinley Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 3127 McKinley Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 3127 McKinley Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a one story single family home located on APN 453-793-13-00 in the residential subdivision of Altadena. The property was identified in the 2004 Draft North Park Survey as a potential contributing resource to the potential Altadena Historic District. The property was not identified in the 2011 Draft North Park Survey.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc., which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff disagrees, and finds that the house is not eligible for designation under any HRB Criteria. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 3127 McKinley Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or North Park's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 3127 McKinley Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The property located at 3127 McKinley Street is a one story single family home constructed in 1928 in the Spanish Eclectic style, and features a flat roof with parapet; decoratively troweled stucco over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. A small, front-gabled projecting bay sits to the north end of the front façade and features two 3-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows under a raised, pointed stucco detail. To the right, the entry is recessed under a shed roof supported on a simple stucco column. Both the front-gable and shed roofs are clad in mortar-packed single-barrel clay tile. To the right of the entry is a fixed focal window with four upper lights flanked by 3-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows, all under a raised, pointed stucco detail. A stucco-clad chimney sits on the south, side façade - also flanked by 3-over-1 windows. Remaining fenestration consists of 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows.

Modifications include the application of non-historic stucco over the original decorative hand-troweled stucco; construction of an 80-square foot wood floor, enclosed porch at the rear sometime in the 1930s or 1940s; replacement of the original wood and glass entry door with the present solid wood entry door at an unknown date; the addition of decorative tile at the entry porch; the removal of the original scored concrete walkway, which was replaced with stone pavers; and the addition of cobble at the side porch. The most singularly significant of these modifications is the application of non-historic stucco. As seen in the historic photographs included in the applicant's report, the house originally featured highly decorative and distinctive hand-troweled stucco walls. The application of non-historic stucco has greatly diminished the profile, appearance and impact of this character-defining feature.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled,

cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

As originally designed and constructed, the house embodied the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic architecture. However, the modifications, in particular the alteration to the stucco that resulted in the loss of the distinctive hand-troweled finish, have significantly impacted the design, materials, workmanship and feeling of the original Spanish Eclectic design. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 3127 McKinley Street was built by Marvin W. Hamlet. Hamlet has not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer or Builder, and there is insufficient information to designate him as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 3127 McKinley Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 3127 McKinley Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 3127 McKinley Street not be designated under any HRB Criteria. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act

Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

KS

Attachment:

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

Addendum
for
Historical Resources Board Nomination of
The Marvin W. Hamlet Speculation House

3127 McKinley Street
San Diego, California 92116

Report Prepared By:

Legacy 106, Inc.
P.O. Box 15967
San Diego, California 92175

February 18, 2015

Purpose

To explain in detail the restoration work completed to remove non-historic stucco and replicate the original and distinctive hand troweled finish shown in circa 1935 historical photos (Figure 3 and Historic Nomination report Attachment D.1).

Stucco

The original hand troweled stucco finish seen on the subject resource had been removed on the front elevation by a past owner and replaced by an inappropriate Pueblo stucco finish. After discovery of a collection of 1930's-1940 historic photos of the property, the home's owner, Justin Clapper, has invested considerably in the restoration of the home's hand troweled stucco finish. This final work involved enlarging the historical photos and meeting with City staff and stucco craftsmen to accurately replicate this distinctive stucco surfacing. Sample boards were also provided to City staff and comments were incorporated into the final surfacing finish. The stucco, although unpainted and under construction in some photos, shows that the resulting hand-troweled stucco very closely matches the raised hand applied finish seen in 1930's historical photos. The stucco exterior has finally been replicated and restored to match the historical photos. The owner is committed to preserving and rehabilitating the home as needed.

Figure 1
3127 McKinley Street Front façade during restoration.
Raised hand troweled finish shown with red arrow.

Photo below by Kiley Wallace, February 2015



Figure 2
3127 McKinley Street Front façade during restoration.
Raised hand troweled finish shown with red arrow.
Photo below by Kiley Wallace, February 2015





Figure 3 and 4
3127 McKinley Street front
façade during restoration.
Raised hand troweled finish
shown with red arrow.
Photo above circa 1938.
Photo below left by Kiley Wallace,
February 2015.