

# Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 14, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-038

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of June 28, 2012

SUBJECT: ITEM #6 – James and Evangeline Walker Spec House #1

APPLICANT: Jane Dickinson represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 7450 High Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the James and Evangeline Walker Spec House

#1 located at 7450 High Avenue as a historical resource.

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the James and Evangeline Walker Spec House #1 located at 7450 High Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1940 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 96 square foot addition on the north end of the rear façade in 1949; the 192 square foot addition on the south side of the house constructed in 1961; and the garage, which was significantly expanded following the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of French Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a steeply pitched hipped roof; two narrow, front-facing gable dormers; clipped eaves with a simple cornice; an asymmetrical façade with off-center entry door; wood shingle siding over wood frame construction; a recessed entry door accented by a paneled surround; a wide brick chimney on the front façade; and fenestration consisting of 6-over-6 double hung, 4-over-4 double hung, 9-lite fixed and 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows.

#### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a one story single family home with finished attic designed and built by J.R. McNaught in 1940 in the residential subdivision of Center Addition to La Jolla Park.

The historic name of the resource, the James and Evangeline Walker Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owners who constructed the house as a speculative investment.

# **ANALYSIS**

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines* for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property located at 7450 High Avenue is a one story single family house with finished attic constructed in 1940 in the French Eclectic style and features a steeply pitched hipped roof with asphalt shingles; two narrow, front-facing gable dormers; clipped eaves with a simple cornice; an asymmetrical façade with off-center entry door; wood shingle siding over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The entry door is recessed slightly into the façade, and accented by a paneled surround. To the far right of the entry door, a wide brick chimney accents the front façade. Fenestration consists of 6-over-6 double hung, 4-over-4 double hung, 9-lite fixed and 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows, as well as two metal frame jalousie windows at the rear.

Modifications include finishing the attic space in 1941, which may have resulted in construction of the rear shed roof dormer; construction of a 96 square foot addition on the north end of the rear façade in 1949; construction of a 192 square foot addition on the south side of the house in 1961; and additions to the garage, including a shed in the 1940s and substantial remodeling and expansion in 1966. Lastly, at some point, the chimney below the eave line was painted white. The owners attempted to remove the paint, but were unable to remove it completely. In order to make the chimney appear more uniform, the chimney above the eave line was given a white paint treatment, although it was not painted completely and the original red brick remains readily apparent.

The modifications to the garage have significantly impacted the original 1940 building, and staff recommends that the garage be excluded from the designation. The addition to the house in 1949 was located at the rear, has a small footprint and is not readily visible. The addition in 1961 is located at the side of the house, but is setback 8 feet from the front façade and clearly reads as a new addition while still respecting the scale and character of the home. Staff recommends that these additions be excluded as well, as they were constructed outside the period of significance. In total, the additions do not significantly impair the building's integrity to the extent that it no longer embodies the distinctive characteristics of the style.

Popular largely between 1915 and 1945, French Eclectic was utilized most often in residential architecture and emerged from an increased knowledge of French architecture and an

appreciation for French culture. American soldiers, who had served in France during World War I, returned home with a first-hand familiarity with French domestic architecture, particularly from the Normandy and Brittany regions. French Eclectic architecture shows great variety in form and detailing but is united by the characteristic steeply pitched hipped roof with clipped eaves. The asymmetrical variant of the style is the most common subtype, and features an off-center doorway and asymmetrical façade. French Eclectic designs can exhibit any number of different siding types, and often feature dormers as well as double hung and casement windows. The subject house continues to convey the historic significance of the French Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style, including the distinctive steeply pitched hipped roof with clipped eaves; dormers; asymmetrical façade with off-center door; and double hung and casement windows, as detailed above. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

#### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the James and Evangeline Walker Spec House #1 located at 7450 High Avenue be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1940 under HRB Criterion C, as a resource the embodies the distinctive characteristics of the French Eclectic style and retains integrity to its date of construction. The designation excludes the 96 square foot addition on the north end of the rear façade in 1949; the 192 square foot addition on the south side of the house constructed in 1961; and the garage, which was significantly expanded following the period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner Cathy Winterrowd

Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachments: 1. Draft Resolution

2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 6/28/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/28/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **James and Evangeline Walker Spec House #1** located at **7450 High Avenue**, **San Diego**, **CA 92037**, APN: **350-652-14-00**, further described as BLK 15 LOTS 28 THRU 30 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

## NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the James and Evangeline Walker Spec House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of French Eclectic architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1940 date of construction and period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a steeply pitched hipped roof; two narrow, front-facing gable dormers; clipped eaves with a simple cornice; an asymmetrical façade with off-center entry door; wood shingle siding over wood frame construction; a recessed entry door accented by a paneled surround; a wide brick chimney on the front façade; and fenestration consisting of 6-over-6 double hung, 4-over-4 double hung, 9-lite fixed and 3-lite casement wood frame and sash windows This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.** The designation excludes the 96 square foot addition on the north end of the rear façade in 1949; the 192 square foot addition on the south side of the house constructed in 1961; and the garage, which was significantly expanded following the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A	
	BY:
	JOHN LEMMO, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED AS TO FORM AND	
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,	BY:
CITY ATTORNEY	KEITH BAUERLE
	Deputy City Attorney