



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 15, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-074

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of November 29, 2012

SUBJECT: **ITEM #10 – W. W. and Hazel Hummon House**

APPLICANT: Richard Park and Jennie Best represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 1031 Alexandria Drive, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the W. W. and Hazel Hummon House located at 1031 Alexandria Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the W. W. and Hazel Hummon House located at 1031 Alexandria Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the second floor enclosed balcony above the garage totaling about 279 square feet. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade; a combination of moderate-pitch gable, hipped and shed roofs sheathed in Mission clay tile with minimal eave overhang; smooth stucco exterior walls that flare out at the eaves; accented windows and entry; and fenestration consisting of multi-light and single-light wood fixed and casement windows, some of which are arched or contain decorative stained glass.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a two story Spanish Eclectic style residence built in 1928 on the east side of Alexandria Drive, between Piedmont Drive and Barcelona Drive in the Riviera Villas subdivision of the Peninsula Community.

The historic name of the resource, the W. W. and Hazel Hummon House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of W. W. and Hazel Hummon, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The historical report provides information regarding the early development of Point Loma starting with the whaling and fishing industries; the influence of United States military presence; and the growth of early twentieth century upscale neighborhoods. The report asserts that the subject property is significant under HRB Criterion A as a special element of Point Loma's historical and architectural development. The subject property was one of the first four homes built within the Riviera Villas subdivision and notes that it was the first constructed west of Santa Barbara Street and done in accordance with the "conditions, restrictions, and reservations" that were maintained for the construction of new homes. Aside from showing that the structure was among the first built in the subdivision, the applicant has not demonstrated how the subject property is unique among the other three original homes built within the subdivision. No comparative analysis with the other three original homes has been completed to demonstrate how the subject property would exemplify or reflect a special element of Riviera Villas' development to any greater extent than the other properties. Furthermore, the structure's location relative to Santa Barbara Street is not sufficient to distinguish this house from the others as a special element. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property is a two-story, Spanish Eclectic style single family residence constructed in 1928. The building is of standard wood frame construction on a concrete foundation and clad in its original smooth stucco. The overall building form is irregular and features a combination of moderate-pitch gable, hipped and shed roofs sheathed in Mission clay tile with minimal eave overhang. The exterior stucco walls flare out at the roof eaves. Fenestration consists of multi-light and single-light wood fixed and casement windows, some of which are arched windows or contain decorative stained glass. The arched openings for the original wood front door and the decorative stained glass window are accentuated by quoins.

The front-facing main gable features elaborate roof vents and a very large, arched wood window that is recessed. Other recessed openings exist for the heavy wood front door and a unique

projecting arched tripartite multi-light wood window with stucco scallops and decorative spiral columns. The attached two-car garage is characterized by arched openings and original sliding wood doors with decorative spindles and fixed glass panes. At the south elevation, an arched wing wall provides access to the rear of the property.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

There have been a few modifications to the structure over the years. First, the original driveway has been replaced with pavers. Second, the report states that sometime before 1953, the second floor balcony above the garage at the northwest corner of the structure was enclosed. It is not entirely clear whether this area was originally covered or completely open before this enclosure happened. It is staff's belief that this balcony was originally uncovered given the unusual window construction and since the eave style, with its large overhang and exposed rafter tails, does not match the eaves seen elsewhere on the structure. Furthermore, it appears the clay tiles on the roof over this balcony have only just been applied within the last year.

The limited modifications to the subject building do not alter its character defining features or significantly impair the integrity as it relates to the 1928 date of construction. The house continues to convey the historic significance of Spanish Eclectic architecture by embodying the character defining features of the style including the asymmetrical façade; Mission clay tile roof; smooth stucco exterior walls that flare out at the eaves; accented windows and front entry; and wood fixed and casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the W. W. and Hazel Hummon House located at 1031 Alexandria Drive be designated with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic style architecture. The designation excludes the second floor

enclosed balcony above the garage totaling about 279 square feet. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Camille Pekarek
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Assistant Deputy Director/HRB Liaison

CP/JB/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/29/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/29/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **W. W. and Hazel Hummon House** (owned by Richard H. Park & Jennie H. Best, 1031 Alexandria Drive, San Diego, CA 92107) located at **1031 Alexandria Drive, San Diego, CA 92107**, APN: **531-081-06-00**, further described as BLK 1 LOT 6 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **W. W. and Hazel Hummon House** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade; a combination of moderate-pitch gable, hipped and shed roofs sheathed in Mission clay tile with minimal eave overhang; smooth stucco exterior walls that flare out at the eaves; accented windows and entry; and fenestration consisting of multi-light and single-light wood fixed and casement windows, some of which are arched or contain decorative stained glass. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the second floor enclosed balcony above the garage totaling about 279 square feet.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney