

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JUNE 28, 2012
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>arrived at 1:15pm, left at 3:00PM</i>
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present <i>left at 2:30PM</i>
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR April 26, 2012, May 18, 2012, Special Meeting on Plaza de Panama, and May 24, 2012

Minutes for May 24, 2012 are not available at this time.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE APRIL 26, 2012 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 8-0-1

Motion Passes
(*Silvas*)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MAY 18, 2012, SPECIAL MEETING ON PLAZA DE PANAMA, MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 7-0-2

Motion Passes
(*Baksh, Marrone*)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Woods notified staff she would not be in attendance. Boardmembers Curry needs to leave today's meeting at 3:00pm, and Boardmember Silvas needs to leave at 2:30pm.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Our department's FY 2013 budget was approved by City Council a couple of weeks ago with 2 historical resources interns. We have already hired Camille Pekarek, a former student of Dr. Woods to fill one of the positions. She will be starting mid-July and will be introduced at the next meeting. Also, the reduced fees for Mills Act agreements, inspections and enforcement were approved and will be effective July 1, 2012.
- Historical resources staff met with consultants earlier this month to discuss a number of aspects of the City's preservation program. We reviewed the Board administrative procedures and announced new submittal requirements; Kelley demonstrated the search abilities of CHRID and discussed some of the posting limitations; we reviewed specific requirements of both the report guidelines and criteria guidelines, including formatting and attachments, the need for a discussion of alterations, defining a period of significance, the need to evaluate the significance of a resource within its context, and determining significance under Criterion D and for resources related to the recent past; and Jodie reviewed the City's Mills Act program.
- Submittal requirements for individual historic nominations will be changing as of July 1, 2012. Because the queue has been reduced to approximately 90 days, nominations will need to include the fee of \$1185 when the report is submitted. Staff will conduct a completeness check within 30 days and if the report meets the required guidelines, the nomination will be docketed for a hearing approximately 60 days later. In addition to the fee, the digital report must be no larger

than 10 MB so that it can be uploaded to the CHRID and it must be converted to a pdf from the original format and not scanned in order to meet disability access requirements.

- Jodie has been working through the 82 new Mills Act applications and will continue processing them over the next several months. Inspections of approximately 200 existing Mills Act properties will begin with new fiscal year.
- Balboa Park Plaza de Panama project will be heard by the City Council on Monday, July 9, 2012, at 2:00pm.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, July 11, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, August 13, 2012. There will be no Policy Subcommittee meeting in July. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, August 13, 2012.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 1 referral from Development Services and 4 individual homeowner nominations. There are 12 homeowner nominations in 2012 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 5 – JACOB BRONOWSKI HOUSE

ITEM 6 – JAMES AND EVANGELINE WALKER SPEC HOUSE #1

ITEM 7 – GEORGE HAWLEY INVESTMENT CO. / HURLBURT AND TIFAL SPEC HOUSE

ITEM 8 – BEN AND FRIEDA KAPLAN HOUSE

ITEM 9 – HANS AND MABEL HIRTE HOUSE

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke pulled Item 5 from the Consent Agenda

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 6, 7, 8, AND 9 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS TO ITEMS 6 AND 7

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – JACOB BRONOWSKI HOUSE

Applicant: Douglas A. Roberts Trust represented by Marie Lia

Location: 9438 La Jolla Farms Road, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 2-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 9438 La Jolla Farms Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Jacob Bronowski House located at 9438 La Jolla Farms Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1964-1974 under HRB Criterion B.

Report Number: HRB-12-037

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Paul Benton (*Diane Bayles Roberts, Missy McNally*)

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge has concerns with Criterion D and does not support designation under Criterion B.

Boardmember Larimer agrees with Staff of Criteria C and D, he is not sure about Criterion B.

Boardmember Bethke does not support designation under Criterion B.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini thinks the site planning of the home was to accentuate the views to the sea; arches were a playful non-structural tribute to the international style, and a characteristic of the style as was the use of plant material to soften the lines of the architecture.

Chair Lemmo is very supportive of designation under Criterion B, but the report does not include all of the information to support significance.

Boardmember Rivera is opposed to designation under Criterion B. Bronowski came to San Diego to retire; most of his earlier work was in Great Britain.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas does not think the report discusses the early history of "man" in La Jolla, needs to discuss early history.

Boardmember Curry stated that recent history is also important; San Diego history is our context, including science history. She supports designation under Criterion B.

Boardmember Berge appreciates Chair Lemmo's comments and will support designation under Criterion B.

Boardmember Bethke thinks the report needs additional analysis to establish significance.

Chair Lemmo agrees that the report alone does not fully establish the significance of Jacob Bronowski.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – JACOB BRONOWSKI HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 6-4-0

Motion Passes

(*Bethke, Larimer, Rivera, Silvas*)

ITEM 6 – JAMES AND EVANGELINE WALKER SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Jane Dickinson represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 7450 High Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7450 High Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the James and Evangeline Walker Spec House #1 located at 7450 High Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1940 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 96 square foot addition on the north end of the rear façade in 1949; the 192 square foot addition on the south side of the house constructed in 1961; and the garage, which was significantly expanded following the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-12-038

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS

ITEM 7 – MARY AND JULIA PICKETT SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Claire Merrin represented by Allan Hazard & Janet O'Dea

Location: 3665 Jackdaw Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3665 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mary and Julia Pickett Spec House #1 located at 3665 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-033

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS

ITEM 8 – BEN AND FRIEDA KAPLAN HOUSE

Applicant: Letzring Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 1225 Concord Street, 92106, Peninsula, Council District 2 (**1288 2-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1225 Concord Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ben and Frieda Kaplan House located at 1225 Concord Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1958 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-040

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 9 – HANS AND MABEL HIRTE HOUSE

Applicant: Joe Cordileone

Location: 2465 Curlew Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1289 1-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2465 Curlew Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Hans and Mabel Hirte House located at 2465 Curlew Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the smaller detached brick structure addressed at 427 West Laurel Street, as is not highly reflective of the Spanish Eclectic architecture for which the site is significant.

Report Number: HRB-12-016

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 – 2251 SAN JUAN ROAD

Applicant: Schick Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2251 San Juan Road, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2251 San Juan Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2251 San Juan Road under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-041

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Ron May

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge agrees with many of the comments made by the speakers. This is more of a naming policy issue. This property is representative of Master Designer Ralph Frank. It was called Monterey style at the time.

Boardmember Larimer wanted to know if the findings from the 2006 report are the same as the findings in the current report.

Boardmember Bethke asked what makes this home “notable”. It is odd that it is not significant under Criterion C, and only recommended by the consultant for designation under Criterion D. It seems rare to be nominating a piece of architecture significant just to the architect and not for the style.

Boardmember Curry commented that there are local expressions of architectural styles that may not specifically be in a book; finding that connection to a Master Designer can be made. This type of transitional style is important; it tells the story/history.

Boardmember Marrone supports connection to Master Designer; many 1930's homes have eclectic features.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation under Criterion D for Ralph Frank.

Boardmember Rivera is on the fence, has question on the style and integrity.

Boardmember Baksh can support designation under Criterion D for Ralph Frank.

Boardmembers Silvas and Curry left before the vote.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – DR. FRANKLIN AND LEONE LINDEMULDER/RALPH FRANK HOUSE UNDER CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE REPRESENTATIVE OF A MASTER DESIGNER RALPH FRANK AND THAT IT REPRESENTS HIS USE OF THE BLENDING OF THE COLONIAL REVIVAL STYLE AND THE MONTEREY REVIVAL STYLE AND ESPECIALLY EXEMPLIFIES HOW HE WAS ABLE TO FRESHLY EXPRESS THESE STYLISTIC INFLUENCES AND BLEND WITH THE EXISTING NEIGHBORHOOD, WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1935

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 7-1-0
(Larimer)

Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, July 26, 2012

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:05PM