

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 25, 2011 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-0-2
(*Baksh, Garbini*)

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Dan Soderberg – Hillcrest Neon Sign

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Vice-chair Silvas and Boardmember Curry notified staff they would not be in attendance.

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Letters regarding Item #7 – 1328 Virginia Way
- ✓ Letters regarding Item #8 – Harry and Leola Glover House and 4635 North Avenue
- ✓ Information regarding Item #19 – Beardsley National Register review
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Boardmember Woods received an unsolicited communication from SOHO with regards to Item 7; she had her name removed from their distribution list. Boardmember Berge made a comment about the stucco texture of Item #17 in front of the contractor.

• **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Pleased to announce that Jodie Brown had a healthy baby girl at 2:02 am on September 13th, weighing 8 lbs 1 oz, her name is Poppy. Jodie is doing fine and will be returning to work in January.
- Jennifer Feeley's last meeting

- The proposed Preservation Fund Expenditures was heard at LU&H on September 14th, the Committee agreed with the proposal and referred the item to the full Council with a recommendation to bring back possible expenditures related to replacement of stolen historic signs located in the public right of way or on public land. We will begin that process as soon as staffing and workload allow.
- The CHRID is live and can be accessed via the City's website at www.sandiego.gov/historic. The Register starting with designations in 2009 through present and surveyed properties from Barrio Logan are viewable. The database does not include all properties at this time, we will continue to upload designated and surveyed properties as time allows.
- The appeal of the historical designation of the Eric Lund and Anna M. Dahlander Lund House located at 1036 Madison Avenue was heard by the City Council on September 13th and was continued to October 25, 2011 with direction to the property owner to work with staff to address the Code violations.
- Staff will be conducting historic preservation training for community planning group members on October 27, 2011 at the MOC II Building located on Topaz Street in Kearny Mesa.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, October 5, 2011. The next Policy Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, October 10, 2011. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be on Monday, November 14, 2011.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 2 referrals from Development Services; 8 individual homeowner nominations; an amendment to a designated resource; review of a National Register nomination; proposed amendments to the HRB District Policy and the Municipal Code (LDC-Code Violations), and the ratification of HRB Subcommittee appointments. There are 7 homeowner nominations in 2010 and 22 homeowner nominations in 2011 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Item 5 – 2335 Juan Street, owner requested a continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT AN INDEFINITE CONTINUANCE OF ITEM 5 – 2335 JUAN STREET

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1

ITEM 9 – LOUIS H. AND CHARLOTTE L. QUAYLE HOUSE

ITEM 10 – EDWARD AND MABEL ROHDE HOUSE

ITEM 11 – NATHAN AND HATTIE RIGDON SPEC. HOUSE # 1

ITEM 13 – COMPOSITION OF THE HRB SUBCOMMITTEES

ITEM 15 – JOHN AND LOU ERNSTING HOUSE

ITEM 16 – NORMAN AND ELEANOR ROULETTE HOUSE

ITEM 17 – ALICE LEE/HAZEL WATERMAN HOUSE

ITEM 18 – W.J. CHADWICK SPEC HOUSE #1

ITEM 19 – JOHN R. AND FLORENCE PORTERFIELD BEARDSLEY HOUSE

Boardmember Bethke pulled Item 17 from the Consent Agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 6, 9, 10, 11, 13, 15, 16, 18, AND 19 THE CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATIONS TO ITEMS 16 AND 18.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A –NORTH PARK AND GREATER GOLDEN HILL HISTORIC SURVEYS

The historic consultant, Christy McAvoy with Historic Resources Group, updated the Board on the status of the North Park and Greater Golden Hill surveys. No action on the part of the Board was required.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 2335 JUAN STREET

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: Mikhail Family Trust represented by Paul and Sarai Johnson

Location: 2335 Juan Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2335 Juan Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2335 Juan Street under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff memo dated August 11, 2011, Staff memo dated April 14, 2011 and HRB-11-003

ITEM CONTINUED INDEFINITELY AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 6 –DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #1

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: Brian Daugherty & Cynthia Larson-Daugherty

Location: 3221 Homer Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-D**)

Description: Consider the Amendment of the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 (HRB Site #952) located at 3221 Homer Street to include Designation under HRB Criterion C.

Today's Action: Amend the designation of the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 (HRB Site #952) to include designation under HRB Criterion C or do not amend the designation to include designation under HRB Criterion C.

Staff Recommendation: Amend the designation of the David O. Dryden Spec. House #1 located at 3221 Homer Street to include designation under HRB Criterion C with a period of significance of 1915.

Report Number: HRB-11-051

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – 1328 VIRGINIA WAY

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: Nina and Francis A. Bottini Jr. represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1328 Virginia Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1328 Virginia Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1328 Virginia Way under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-11-052

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Tim Golba, Frances A. Bottini Jr., Nina Bottini, Stephanie Ammirati, Albert Chang, Natalie Castro

In Opposition: Courtney Coyle, Michael Khozan, John Eisenhart, Ione Stiegler, Alana Coons, Dan Soderberg, Bruce Coons, Dale Ballou May, Paul Johnson, Angeles Leira, Erik Hanson, Sarai Johnson, John Bolthouse, Cassidy Coan, Ron May

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge supports designation under Criterion C for the method and type of construction and designation under Criterion A because it reflects the historical, architectural, social economic and cultural development of La Jolla.

Boardmember Garbini commented that Windemere really does have a magic name that is related to Green Dragon Colony. The building is instantly recognizable; it is a beach cottage and it is unique for its single wall construction. She supports designation under both Criteria A and C.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation, the move of the home drastically effected the integrity under Criterion A; Criterion B is not applicable. Under Criterion C there really is a change in integrity for the building itself, it has lost something.

Boardmember Marrone supports designation under Criteria A and C, has a strong significance of early La Jolla beach cottage. Move does not diminish significance, portrays early La Jolla, single-wall construction and distinctive roof line remain. She agrees with Boardmember Berge.

Boardmember Baksh hopes the property can be restored but can't get past the integrity issue; he supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports designation under Criterion A as an important element in La Jolla's history and under Criterion D for its importance in understanding the career of Irving Gill.

Chair Lemmo really wants to designate it, but is bothered significantly by the integrity and was hoping to be convinced to find some way to designate it under Criterion A or perhaps C.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – WINDEMERE COTTAGE UNDER CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF THE LA JOLLA BEACH COTTAGE HISTORY; IN PARTICULAR THE RESOURCE REFLECTS HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL, SOCIAL ECONOMICAL AND CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT OF LA JOLLA: 1) BY REFLECTING FIRST THE EARLY WORK OF THE MASTER ARCHITECT IRVING J. GILL WITH THE FIRM OF FALKENHAM AND GILL AS DOCUMENTED IN THE SOUTHWEST BUILDING CONTRACTOR REPORT WE READ IN OUR REPORTS; 2) BY REFLECTING A RELATIVELY RARE EXAMPLE OF THE EARLY BOARD AND BATTEN, HIPPED ROOF, SINGLE WALL STYLE OF LA JOLLA BEACH COTTAGES THAT DATE FROM THE 1890S, THAT IS RELATIVELY RARE BASED ON THE EVIDENCE SUBMITTED IN THE REPORTS, AND THE LISTINGS AND SURVEYS OF BEACH COTTAGES; 3) BY REFLECTING THE SOCIAL ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF LA JOLLA AS A VACATION TOURIST RETREAT FOR BOTH THE ORIGINAL OWNERS OF THE WINDEMERE COTTAGE, THE VISITORS AND LATER RENTERS; 4) BY REFLECTING THE EARLY CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE COTTAGES DIRECT LINKS TO THE NOVELIST BEATRICE HARRADINE AND THE GREEN DRAGON COLONY AS REPORTED BY THE SAN FRANCISCO CHRONICLE AT THE TURN OF THE CENTURY IN 1901; 5) BY REFLECTING IN THE CHANGING SCENES IN LA JOLLA, SUCH AS THE LA JOLLA JOURNAL IN 1927 IDENTIFYING AND REFERRING TO “THE HISTORIC WINDEMERE COTTAGE” IN THE DISCUSSION OF THE OWNER WANTING TO BUILD MORE ON THE LOT, THIS IS THE YEAR THAT THE ACTUAL COTTAGE WAS MOVED, SO THIS IS THE FOLLOWING THROUGH OF WHAT HAPPENED TO EARLY BEACH COTTAGES WHEN OWNERS WANTED TO MOVE THE COTTAGE AND HAVE SOMETHING ELSE ON THE ORIGINAL LOT. PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE WOULD SPAN THIS FROM ITS CIRCA 1894 CONCEPT OF DESIGN TO THE ACTUAL CONSTRUCTION DATE OF 1895 THROUGH THE YEAR OF ITS RELOCATION IN 1927, ALL OF THIS IS REFLECTING THE HISTORY OF LA JOLLA BEACH COTTAGES. THE FINDINGS WOULD BE BASED ON WHAT HAS BEEN ITEMIZED, READ IN THE REPORTS AND SUBSTANTIATED EVIDENCE DELIVERED TODAY, THAT THIS WINDEMERE COTTAGE IS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT UNDER CRITERION A, RETAINS ENOUGH HISTORIC INTEGRITY TO CONVEY ITS PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE WHICH SPANS THE 1894-95 THROUGH THE 1927 DATE OF RELOCATION AND THIS IS SUPPORTED BY WHAT WE HAVE HAD BEFORE US IN REPORTS AND ORAL AND WRITTEN EVIDENCE.

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 4-3-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Bethke, Baksh)

Further Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke does not know that any of this has been analyzed in any of the reports that he read and cannot support designation under type of construction.

Chair Lemmo commented that page 202 of the Legacy 106 report provides a brief description.

Boardmember Berge added that page 64 of the Legacy 106 report includes a list of beach cottages.

Boardmember Garbini explained that single wall construction method is a period of architecture in San Diego; not something you see now.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – WINDEMERE COTTAGE UNDER CRITERION C AS A RELATIVELY RARE EXAMPLE OF TWO STORY SINGLE WALL CONSTRUCTION AND BOARD AND BATTEN WITH A HIPPED ROOF FLARING; THIS TYPE OF CONSTRUCTION AND METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION IS INDICATIVE OF THE EARLY BEACH COTTAGES IN LA JOLLA BUT MORE THAT IT IS RELATIVELY RARE TO HAVE SUCH AN EARLY COTTAGE STILL STANDING. WE ARE NOT LOOKING AT THE STYLE AS MUCH AS THE TYPE AND METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION. THE INTEGRITY IS THERE BASED ON THE FACT THAT THE REPORTS AND THE TESTIMONY AND THE BOARDMEMBERS THEMSELVES CAN LOOK AT THE EARLIEST PHOTOGRAPHS AND CAN STILL RECOGNIZE THE COTTAGE AS WE SEE IT TODAY. THESE FINDINGS WOULD BE BASED ON THE HISTORIC RESOURCE REPORTS THAT HAVE BEEN SUBMITTED, THE INFORMATION WE HAVE HEARD IN PUBLIC TESTIMONY TODAY THAT CAN BE SUBSTANTIATED AND OUR ANALYSIS. THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE IS BASED ON THE TIMEFRAME THAT IT WAS SITUATED WHERE IT IS AS A BEACH COTTAGE, FROM THE DATE OF CONSTRUCTION WHICH IS 1895 THROUGH 1926 WHEN IT STAYED RIGHT WHERE IT IS.

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 4-3-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Bethke, Baksh)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – WINDEMERE COTTAGE UNDER CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER IRVING J. GILL.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-2-0

Motion Fails

(Bethke, Baksh)

Chair Lemmo notified the Board that he had to leave early; Chair nominated Boardmember Garbini as the Chair Pro Tem to run the remainder of the meeting

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO NOMINATE BOARDMEMBER GARBINI AS THE CHAIR PRO TEM FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE MEETING

Seconded by Boardmember

Vote: 6-0-1

Motion Passes

(Garbini)

ITEM 8 – THE HARRY AND LEOLA GLOVER HOUSE AND 4635 NORTH AVENUE

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: John Kudela, not the property owner, represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 4635 and 4637 North Avenue, 92116, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4635 and 4637 North Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Harry and Leola Glover House, located at 4637 North Avenue, as a historical resource with a period of significance of c.1912 under HRB Criterion C; and do not designate the property located at 4635 North Avenue.

Report Number: HRB-11-053

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Dan Soderberg

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, John Kudela, Lloyd Nelson, Lorrie Webb, Christian Congden, Pam Clifford, Mike Shoecroft, Dan Ramirez

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Staff's recommendation on 4635 North Avenue, but disagrees with Staff's recommendation on 4637 North Avenue.

Boardmember Marrone requested the Deputy City Attorney to clarify whether or not the Board can take into consideration testimony regarding financial hardship.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Boardmember Baksh and Scott Moomjian that this property does not warrant designation.

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Pro Tem Garbini thinks that part of what makes us unique as a community is all aspects of historic preservation and all economic brackets i.e. neighborhoods, architecture. This very well may have been a Sears kit home which makes it very interesting. She supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – HARRY AND LEOLA GLOVER HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 3-3-0

Motion Fails

(Baksh, Woods, Bethke)

ITEM 9 – LOUIS H. AND CHARLOTTE L. QUAYLE HOUSE

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: Alan Edgerton and Craig Long represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4773 Panorama Drive, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4773 Panorama Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Louis H. and Charlotte L. Quayle House located at 4773 Panorama Drive as an historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the 446 sq. ft. addition at the southwest corner of the house.

Report Number: HRB-11-054

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 – EDWARD AND MABEL ROHDE HOUSE

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: Herrin Family Trust

Location: 3519 Dumas Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3519 Dumas Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Edward and Mabel Rohde House located at 3519 Dumas Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the 316 square foot rear lanai room and bathroom addition in 1959; the 94 square foot rear deck enclosure from c.1950s; the 333 square foot patio enclosure; and the 243 square foot sleeping porch enclosure.

Report Number: Staff memo dated September 8, 2011 and HRB-11-055

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 11 – NATHAN AND HATTIE RIGDON SPEC. HOUSE #1

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: Goltz Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4240 Arguello Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4240 Arguello Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Nathan and Hattie Rigdon Spec. House # 1 located at 4240 Arguello Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1917 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation includes portions of the interior and excludes the rear 216 sq. ft. addition and second story deck.

Report Number: HRB-11-056

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 12 – HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD DISTRICT POLICY

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider an amendment to the Historical Resources Board District Policy 4.1.

Today's Action: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board District Policy 4.1 or do not approve the amendment.

Staff Recommendation: Approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board District Policy 4.1.

Report Number: HRB-11-057

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge wants to refer this item back to Policy Subcommittee.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RETURN ITEM 12 – HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD DISTRICT POLICY TO THE POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE FOR FURTHER ANALYSIS

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 13 – COMPOSITION OF THE HRB SUBCOMMITTEES

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider ratifying appointments to the Policy, Design Assistance, and Archaeology Subcommittees

Today's Action: Ratify the appointments to the Policy, Design Assistance, and Archaeology Subcommittees or do not ratify any or all of the appointments

Staff Recommendation: Ratify the HRB Policy Subcommittee's appointments to the Policy, Design Assistance, and Archaeology Subcommittees.

Report Number: HRB-11-058

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 14 – LAND DEVELOPMENT CODE AMENDMENTS – CODE VIOLATIONS

Trailed from August 2011

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: City-wide

Description: Consider the proposed amendments to the San Diego Municipal Code related to issuance and collection of civil penalties for code violations impacting historical resources and designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the City Council approval of the proposed Municipal Code amendments; or do not recommend approval of the amendments.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council approval of the proposed Municipal Code amendments related to issuance and collection of civil penalties for code violations impacting historical resources and designated historical resources.

Report Number: HRB-11-059

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation, but is concerned with some of the issues raised in Barry Hagar's letter.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR PRO TEM GARBINI TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED MUNICIPAL CODE AMENDMENTS PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 15 – JOHN AND LOU ERNSTING HOUSE

Applicant: Alfred B. Price Jr. represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3415 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District (1268 6-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3415 Elliot Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Lou Ernsting House located at 3415 Elliott Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1962 storage shed.

Report Number: HRB-11-060

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 16 – NORMAN AND ELEANORE ROULETTE HOUSE

Applicant: Marc Anthony Gottuso

Location: 2574 Plum Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2574 Plum Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Norman and Eleanore Roulette House located at 2574 Plum Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 136 square foot bathroom addition.

Report Number: HRB-11-061

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 17 – ALICE LEE/HAZEL WATERMAN HOUSE

Applicant: Herzman Nieces Non-Execpt Trust represented by Paul and Sarai Johnson

Location: 3574 7th Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 2-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3574 7th Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alice Lee/Hazel Waterman House located at 3574 7th Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1905-1943 under HRB Criteria A, B, C and D. The designation excludes the additions at the 429 square feet additions at the North end and the 528 square feet two car garage.

Report Number: HRB-11-062

Staff Report by Jennifer Feeley

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Sarai Johnson, Paul Johnson

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Bethke is not opposed to designation; he supports designation under Criteria B and C, but is not sure about Criterion A. There are some integrity issues with the landscaping, “centrally designed space” is not evident.

Boardmember Woods mentioned that the landscaping is very much in flux and is being changed.

Boardmember Berge wants the name to include Irving J. Gill, Waterman was his assistant. She supports recognizing Waterman as a Master Architect, but the name has to include both Irving J. Gill and Hazel Wood Waterman. She also had questions about the integrity of the shared space.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff’s recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh also supports Staff’s recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 17 UNDER CRITERIA D RECOGNIZING THAT HAZEL WOOD WATERMAN IS A MASTER ARCHITECT AND THAT SHE ASSISTED IRVING J. GILL AS NOTED IN HER OWN JOURNALS. THEREFORE THE RESOURCE WOULD BE CALLED THE ALICE LEE/IRVING J. GILL/HAZEL WOOD WATERMAN HOUSE; THE FINDINGS ARE WITHIN THE HISTORIC RESOURCE REPORT AND THE STAFF’S REPORT. IT IS A REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF TWO MASTER ARCHITECTS; THE FINDINGS ARE WITHIN THE REPORTS

Seconded by Boardmember Baksh

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 17 – ALICE LEE/IRVING J. GILL/HAZEL WOOD WATERMAN HOUSE UNDER CRITERIA B AND C PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 18 – W.J. CHADWICK SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Rebecca Lesser and Joshua Kayman represented by Paul and Sarai Johnson

Location: 3134 Dale Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 **(1269 7-E)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3134 Dale Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the W.J. Chadwick Spec House #1 located at 3134 Dale Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-11-063

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 19 – JOHN R. AND FLORENCE PORTERFIELD BEARDSLEY HOUSE

Applicant: Bruce and Alana Coons

Location: 3130 Shadowlawn Street, 92110, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 **(1268 6-D)**

Description: Review the National Register Nomination of the John R. and Florence Porterfield Beardsley House

Today's Action: Review and make a recommendation on the National Register Nomination of the John R. and Florence Porterfield Beardsley House

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the Office of Historic Preservation the listing of the John R. and Florence Porterfield Beardsley House on the National Register

Report Number: HRB-11-064

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, October 27, 2011

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:05PM