

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

Wednesday, April 2, 2014, at 4:00 PM

5th Floor Large Conference Room

City Operations Building, Development Services Department

1222 First Avenue, San Diego, CA

MEETING NOTES

1. ATTENDANCE 4:05PM

Subcommittee Members	Alex Bethke (Chair); Gail Garbini; Linda Marrone; Ann Woods
City Staff	
	HRB Kelley Stanco; Jodie Brown
Guests	
	Item 3A Jack Carpenter
	Item 3B
	Other Bruce Coons, SOHO

2. Public Comment (on matters not on the agenda)

3. Project Reviews

▪ **ITEM 3A:**

Listings: HRB Site #1; National Register Historic Landmark District

Address:

Historic Name: Balboa Park Historic District

Significance:

Mills Act Status: N/A

PTS #: N/A

Project Contact: Jack Carpenter, Friends of Balboa Park

Treatment: Rehabilitation

Project Scope: This reconstruction project proposes to rebuild the balustrades on the south side of the Plaza de Panama (immediately south of the El Cid statue) in Balboa Park. The existing balustrades are a combination of concrete bases and end scrolls with wood rails and concrete balusters. The wood is severely deteriorated, and past restorations have failed. The Friends of Balboa Park are investigating the possibility of alternate materials, and staff is seeking the Subcommittee's input on whether the substitute materials would be consistent with the Standards.

Existing Square Feet: N/A

Additional Square Feet: N/A

Total Proposed Square Feet: N/A

Prior DAS Review: N/A

Staff Presentation: There are several repairs that need to be completed at Balboa Park. The balustrades on the south side of the Plaza de Panama are in a deteriorated state. The balustrades are currently wood and concrete. The Friends of Balboa Park would like to discuss the possibility of using concrete rather than wood as a replacement material.

Applicant Presentation: There is a north and a south balustrade that have been patched over time. The Friends of Balboa Park replaced a portion of the balustrade in 2001 with wood and it is already deteriorated. We would like to use alternate materials to help increase the life span of the balustrade.

Public Comment:

Name	Comments
Bruce Coons	The balustrades are similar to the construction of the original buildings and most have been replaced in-kind or with new materials. There is a precedent in the park. I don't think there is any issue with replacing the balustrades with concrete. If they do it in concrete it should be cast in one piece, so it has no joints with the same profile and texture.

Q&A:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
Usually material is replaced in-kind, but the precedent has already been set in the park. Would be nice if a piece of the original balustrade was saved to preserve.	
I agree with Gail and also believe that it is a good idea to save a portion of the balustrade.	
Can we stipulate that they preserve a portion of the original balustrade?	No.
They will usually document in photos and plans. Maybe we just recommend donating a portion.	

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Garbini	I don't have a problem with more durable material if the profile is matched.

Staff Comment:

None

Recommended Modifications:

Balustrade could be replicated in different material as long as the profile of the original is matched.

Consensus:

- ☐ Consistent with the Standards
- ☒ Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards

▪ **ITEM 3B:**Listings: HRB Site #278Address: 1620 State StreetHistoric Name: Ordway ResidenceSignificance: C (Architecture)Mills Act Status: NoPTS #: N/AProject Contact: Soheil NakshabTreatment: Rehabilitation

Project Scope: Construct a new building at the rear of the historic house. The new building will house 8 new apartments on a podium.

Existing Square Feet: 700Additional Square Feet: 12,000Total Proposed Square Feet: 12,700Prior DAS Review: Dec-12

Staff Presentation: The applicant would like to receive feedback from DAS on a proposed development at 1620 State Street. It is one of four properties in a row in Little Italy. The property to the left of the resource is a commercial property.

Applicant Presentation: Applicant was not present at the meeting and DAS chose to comment of the proposed project.

Public Comment:

Name	Comments
Bruce Coons	This is the best and last row of Victorian era house in Little Italy.

Q&A:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
It loses a lot when there are not similar buildings around.	
The proposed development seems a little large for the site.	
All of the glass creates a solarium look.	
Where would you park?	The building would sit on a podium, so you would park under the new construction.
The glass panels would create a mirrored look.	
Maybe a green wall should be considered?	

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Bethke	I am OK with the form, but it needs to have a design that softens the impact. The glass is a good idea, but framing it in white concrete has a big impact. The height is also a concern.
Marrone	The new construction needs to be as neutral as possible.
Garbini	Nothing has been done to reduce the overall mass of the building. It should be stepped back.

Staff Comment:

None

Recommended Modifications:

None

Consensus:

- ☐ Consistent with the Standards
- ☐ Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted
- ☒ Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards

4. Adjourned at 5:00PM PM

The next regularly-scheduled Subcommittee Meeting will be on May 7, 2014 at 4:00 PM.

For more information, please contact Jodie Brown at JDBrown@sanidiego.gov or 619.533.6300.