

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD**  
**MINUTES OF SPECIAL MEETING OF**  
**July 16, 2007**

COUNCIL CHAMBERS – 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Vacchi at 9:10 a.m.

Chairperson	Robert Vacchi	Present
Vice Chairperson	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	Donald Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Absent
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present (left 11:00 AM)
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Delores Johnson, Board Secretary  
Garry Papers, Deputy Director, Planning  
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner  
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner  
Jackie Dominguez, Clerical Assistant  
Tricia Olsen, Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**ITEM 2 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

• **ABSENCES**

Of those Boardmembers who may participate in this special meeting, only Mr. Silvas indicated that he would not be able to attend.

B. Other General Information

- **Contents of “Blue Folders”** – Additional letters submitted after July 12, 2007 by property owners and interested parties in support and opposition to the designation of the Mission Hills and Fort Stockton Line Historic Districts.

- **General Board Member Comments** - None.
- C. Conflict of Interest Declarations – None.
- D. Staff Report – No staff report was provided for this meeting.
- E. Requests for Continuances - None.

## **ACTION ITEMS**

### **ITEM 3 — MISSION HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT (2<sup>nd</sup> Hearing)**

Applicant: Janet O’Dea and Allen Hazard

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, defined by the properties fronting on Sunset Boulevard (inclusive of 1814 Sunset Blvd through 1898 Sunset Blvd) to the north; the homes fronting Sheridan Avenue to Lyndon Road (inclusive of 1801 Sheridan Ave through 1896 Lyndon Rd and 4107 Saint James Place) to the east and south; and the properties on the east side of Saint James Place to the west; Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Second hearing to consider the designation of the Mission Hills Geographic/Traditional Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today’s Action: Review the Mission Hills Geographic/Traditional Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; consider the designation of the district as a historical resource; and consider the classification of contributing and non-contributing resources within the district.

Staff Recommendation:

Staff recommends that the Board:

1. Designate the Mission Hills Historic District under:
  - a. HRB Criterion A as a special element of the City and neighborhood’s historical, cultural, landscaping and architectural development:
    - i. reflecting an association with San Diego Progressive Era civic politics, attracting many of San Diego’s leading citizens, including doctors, lawyers, businessmen, educators and artists.
    - ii. reflecting the influence of the 1908 Nolen Plan through the use of progressive planning techniques, including broad main streets, a hierarchy of road widths, respect for the natural topography, the first use of curvilinear streets in the City, and the protection of deep ravines for recreation and scenic enjoyment.
    - iii. reflecting a high concentration of quality design and construction, with a substantial number of individually significant structures.
  - b. HRB Criterion C, as it embodies distinctive characteristics of various styles, types and period(s) of construction:
    - i. The District’s period of significance, 1908-1942, represents two distinct architectural phases. The pre-World War I development reflects most strongly the cultural taste of the Progressive Era and its fascination with the Arts and Crafts. Its development between the wars is more closely associated with the Period Revival Styles, especially the Spanish Colonial Revival, popularized by the 1915 Panama-Pacific Exposition and includes the Minimal Traditional styles, which became popular and were used primarily as infill of the available lots that remained in the District after the Great Depression.

- c. HRB Criterion D, as it reflects the quality design and construction work of several established Master Architects and Builders including:
  - i. Emmor Brooke Weaver
  - ii. Henry Harms Preibisius
  - iii. Requa and Jackson
  - iv. Frank P. Allen
  - v. William F. Wahrenberger
  - vi. Nathan Rigdon
  - vii. Martin Melhorn
  - viii. H.J. Lang
  - ix. Charles Tifal
  - x. David O. Dryden
  - xi. Brawner & Hunter
  - xii. The Pacific Building Company

2. Designate the following 58 Contributing Resources under HRB Criterion F:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1808	Lyndon	443-612-08-00	5B	1870	Sheridan	443-611-20-00	5D3
1812	Lyndon	443-612-09-00	5D3	1875	Sheridan	443-612-04-00	5B
1819	Lyndon	443-650-24-00	5D3	1876	Sheridan	443-611-21-00	5D3
1820	Lyndon	443-612-10-00	5D3	1882	Sheridan	443-611-22-00	5D3
1831	Lyndon	443-650-25-00	5D3	1885	Sheridan	443-612-03-00	5D3
1833	Lyndon	443-620-10-00	5D3	1899	Sheridan	443-612-01-00	5B
1840	Lyndon	443-612-11-00	5B	1815	Sunset	443-611-12-00	5D3
1841	Lyndon	443-620-02-00	5B	1818	Sunset	443-432-20-00	5D3
1849	Lyndon	443-620-04-00	5B	1824	Sunset	443-432-18-00	5B
1850	Lyndon	443-612-13-00	5D3	1826	Sunset	443-432-17-00	5B
1853	Lyndon	443-620-05-00	5B	1829	Sunset	443-611-10-00	5B
1876	Lyndon	443-612-15-00	5D3	1830	Sunset	443-432-15-00	5D3
1877	Lyndon	443-620-17-00	5B	1835	Sunset	443-611-09-00	5B
1884	Lyndon	443-612-16-00	5D3	1836	Sunset	443-432-14-00	5B
1896	Lyndon	443-612-17-00	5D3	1845	Sunset	443-611-08-00	5B
4107	Saint James	443-611-24-00	5D3	1848	Sunset	443-432-13-00	5D3
1801	Sheridan	443-650-13-00	5B	1850	Sunset	443-432-12-00	5B
1807	Sheridan	443-650-15-00	5D3	1851	Sunset	443-611-07-00	5B
1815	Sheridan	443-650-17-00	5B	1863	Sunset	443-611-06-00	5B
1816	Sheridan	443-611-13-00	5B	1864	Sunset	443-432-11-00	5B
1824	Sheridan	443-611-14-00	5B	1870	Sunset	443-432-10-00	5B
1825	Sheridan	443-650-20-00	5D3	1871	Sunset	443-611-05-00	5B
1834	Sheridan	443-611-15-00	5D3	1875	Sunset	443-611-04-00	5B
1840	Sheridan	443-611-16-00	5B	1883	Sunset	443-611-03-00	5B
1845	Sheridan	443-612-07-00	5B	1889	Sunset	443-611-02-00	5B
1852	Sheridan	443-611-18-00	5B	1890	Sunset	443-432-07-00	5D3
1859	Sheridan	443-612-06-00	5D3	1895	Sunset	443-611-01-00	5B
1860	Sheridan	443-611-19-00	5B	1898	Sunset	443-432-05-00	5B
1867	Sheridan	443-612-05-00	5D3	Hitching Post in PROW at 1868 Lyndon			5D3

3. Establish the following 18 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1801	Lyndon	443-650-21-00	6Z	1819	Sheridan	443-650-18-00	6Z
1805	Lyndon	443-650-22-00	6L	1823	Sheridan	443-650-19-00	6Z
1811	Lyndon	443-650-23-00	6L	1844	Sheridan	443-611-17-00	6L
1845	Lyndon	443-620-03-00	6Z	1889	Sheridan	443-612-02-00	6L
1848	Lyndon	443-612-12-00	6Z	1890	Sheridan	443-611-23-00	6L
1855	Lyndon	443-620-06-00	6Z	1814	Sunset	443-432-23-00	6L
1868	Lyndon	443-612-14-00	6Z	1821	Sunset	443-611-11-00	6Z
1875	Lyndon	443-620-18-00	6Z	1874	Sunset	443-432-09-00	6Z
1811	Sheridan	443-650-16-00	6Z	1884	Sunset	443-432-08-00	6L

Report Numbers: HRB-07-030 and supplemental memo dated July 10, 2007  
 Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

**BOARD CLARIFYING QUESTIONS**

In response to Deputy City Attorney Greene’s comments that, pursuant to the San Diego Municipal Code and City Council Policy 700-46 the Board cannot limit the issuance of Mills Act contracts or the associated property tax reduction, Boardmember Harrison asked if the City Council then had to vote on the issuance of individual Mills Act contracts and consider the Board’s recommendations. Deputy City Attorney Greene responded that the recommendations go to HRB staff, and that there is no requirement that the Council vote in individual contracts. Boardmember Harrison asked if the issuance of Mills Act contracts is automatic, to which HRB staff responded that if a property is designated, it automatically qualifies for a contract, which staff enters into negotiations with the owner in accordance with Council Policy. Deputy City Attorney Greene noted that HRB staff is required to report to the Council every year on the number of active contracts. Boardmember Harrison inquired as to the fiscal impact of the Mills Act program. The most recent data available to staff shows a loss of \$300,000 to the General Fund. Boardmember Harrison stated that he sees several issues and questions before the Board: first, should the Board make recommendations to the Council regarding changes in the Mills Act policy? and second, should those recommendations include a fiscal impact statement? He also noted that he does believe that the Board should decide whether or not a property merits designation regardless of the Mills Act and any associated fiscal impact. Chair Vacchi stated that he believes it is a good idea to look at the fiscal impact, but feels that the Board should refer the issue to staff rather than including it in the discussion of the district designations. Deputy City Attorney Greene agreed, stating that it should be taken up separately as a policy matter. Boardmember Emme added that the Board should be vigilant in its designation of properties, and that the City should be able to deny renewal of the contracts after ten years.

Public Testimony Opened

In Favor: Allen Hazard and Bruce Coons (organized presentation); Janet O’Dea; Jaye Furlonger; Scott Sandel; Amie Schaeffer; Dale Ballou May; Ron May; Sara Raddatz; Alana Coons; Welton Jones; Betty Hauck; Mary Johnson; Pat Olafson; Kim Adler; James Fowler; Ellen Preston; Katherine Hon; A. Becker; Pam Engebretson; Carolyn Fossett; Mary Van Stee; Barry Hager; Rick Halpern; Judy Peterson; Edie McCormack; Michael Orr

Opposed: Sheldon Blake Zablou

Public Testimony Closed

## BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Eisenhart stated that Mission Hills is a valuable example of a social neighborhood and should be protected. Boardmember Emme disclosed that he used to live in Mission Hills. He wanted to correct the applicant's comment during public testimony that the City had not spent any money on the district effort, noting that a significant amount of staff time and work went into the processing of the district nomination, and likely totaled tens of thousands of dollars. He stated that he is concerned about the future expansion of the district, raising the question of what would happen if the process for establishing districts changes or if the district expansion is not supported by the property owners within the expansion area. He also noted that the results of the Uptown Survey, quoted by several speakers in favor, are preliminary findings only. Boardmember Emme felt that the area does need protection from inappropriate modifications. Finally, he agreed with many of Boardmember Harrison's earlier comments, and stated that the Board should be looking for quality, not quantity. Boardmember Berge stated that she supports the district, but would like to discuss the classification of four properties. In regard to 1884 Sunset Boulevard, she noted that the property was built by Morris Irvin, recently established as a Master Builder, and that the historic photograph presented by the applicant at the hearing clearly shows that the porch was an original element to the home. Staff noted that they had not seen the photograph prior to the hearing, and would support reclassification as a contributing resource given this new information. In regard to 1844 Sheridan Avenue, Boardmember Berge noted that this, too, was built by Irvin and should be reclassified as a contributor. She is undecided about the classification of 1819 Sheridan Avenue, and asked to hear from other Boardmembers. Boardmember Eisenhart stated that he had difficulty with this property as well, but defers to Bruce Coons' assessment that the property currently reflects the original design of a Mission Revival home. Finally, Boardmember Berge asked for Board input regarding the classification of 1805 Lyndon Road, which had an early porch enclosure. Boardmember Eisenhart responded that in his opinion, successful porch enclosures use fenestration to enclose the porch and leave the original framing intact. He draws the line at porch enclosures that result in the loss of the original framing and design. Boardmember Harrison stated that the modification occurred over 45 years ago and should be considered historic. After considering the reclassification, Boardmember Berge stated that she does not support reclassifying 1805 Lyndon Road, but would encourage all property owners of "6L" properties with porch enclosures to pursue restoration of the porch. Boardmember Emme felt that there are better examples of the style in the district. Boardmember Eisenhart requested that staff correct the DPR form to list 1845 Sunset Boulevard as Greek Revival. For the record, Boardmember Harrison stated that Mission Hills is obviously a historic district, but felt that he needed to raise the issue of fiscal impacts of the Mills Act and how the Board should address them.

## BOARD ACTION

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECLASSIFY 1884 SUNSET BOULEVARD FROM NON-CONTRIBUTING (6L) TO CONTRIBUTING (5D3).**

Second by Boardmember Eisenhart      Vote: 7-0-0

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECLASSIFY 1844 SHERIDAN AVENUE FROM NON-CONTRIBUTING (6L) TO CONTRIBUTING (5D3).

Second by Boardmember Burnett           Vote: 4-3(Vacchi, Emme, Eisenhart)-0

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EISENHART TO RECLASSIFY 1819 SHERIDAN AVENUE FROM NON-CONTRIBUTING (6Z) TO CONTRIBUTING (5D3).

Second by Boardmember Burnett           Vote: 5-2(Vacchi, Emme)-0

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BURNETT TO RECLASSIFY 1811 LYNDON ROAD FROM NON-CONTRIBUTING (6L) TO CONTRIBUTING (5D3).

Second by Boardmember Berge           Vote: 2(Burnett, Berge)-5-0

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BURNETT TO ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ACTIONS TAKEN BY THE BOARD.

Second by Boardmember McNeely       Vote: 7-0-0

#### **ITEM 4 — FORT STOCKTON LINE HISTORIC DISTRICT (2<sup>nd</sup> Hearing)**

Applicant: Barry Hager and Scott Sandel

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, defined by the properties fronting on West Lewis Street transitioning to Fort Stockton Drive between Stephens Street and Trias Street (including 4244 and 4247 Saint James Place, 4250 and 4251 Sierra Vista, 4249 Arden Way, 4390 and 4430 Witherby Street, and 4391, 4405 and 4435 Trias Street), as well as the properties on the southwest side of Pine Street between Witherby and Trias Streets;

Description: Second hearing to consider the designation of the Fort Stockton Line Geographic/Traditional Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Review the Fort Stockton Line Geographic/Traditional Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; consider the designation of the district as a historical resource; and consider the classification of contributing and non-contributing resources within the district.

Staff Recommendation:

Staff recommends that the Board:

1. Designate the Fort Stockton Line Historic District under:
  - a. HRB Criterion A as a special element of the City and neighborhood's historical, cultural, landscaping and architectural development:
    - i. reflecting the design and development of streetcar suburbs, incorporating subdivision design features which include wider streets and parkways on the main thoroughfare on which the streetcar ran; narrower side streets; and large, prominent homes in Craftsman, Prairie and Spanish Revival styles along the streetcar route. Although the physical remnants of the streetcar itself, including the tract and overhead wiring, are no longer extant, the influence of the streetcar on both the location and design of the subdivision is evident today, representing a distinct and significant era in suburban development in San Diego.

- ii. reflecting an association with San Diego Progressive Era civic politics, attracting many of San Diego’s leading citizens, including doctors, lawyers, businessmen, educators and artists.
- iii. reflecting a high concentration of quality design and construction, with a substantial number of individually significant structures.
- b. HRB Criterion C, as it embodies distinctive characteristics of various styles, types and period(s) of construction:
  - i. reflecting the evolution and development of architectural styles and trends in San Diego from the Craftsman and Prairie style (and to some extent the Mission Revival style) of the 1910’s, to the Spanish Revival architecture of the 1920s and 1930s.
- c. HRB Criterion D, as it reflects the quality design and construction work of several established Master Architects and Builders including:
  - i. Requa and Jackson
  - ii. Nathan Rigdon
  - iii. Martin Melhorn
  - iv. Alexander Schreiber
  - v. Henry Lang

2. Designate the following 79 Contributing Resources under HRB Criterion F:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
4249	Arden Way	44342201	5D3	2212	Fort Stockton Drive	44325012	5D3
1787	Fort Stockton Drive	44343224	5B	2220	Fort Stockton Drive	44325011	5D3
1797	Fort Stockton Drive	44343222	5B	2227	Fort Stockton Drive	44325103	5D3
1799	Fort Stockton Drive	44343221	5B	2235	Fort Stockton Drive	44325102	5D3
1800	Fort Stockton Drive	44343117	5B	2236	Fort Stockton Drive	44325009	5B
1802	Fort Stockton Drive	44343118	5B	2245	Fort Stockton Drive	44325101	5B
1804	Fort Stockton Drive	44343119	5D3	2252	Fort Stockton Drive	44325007	5B
1811	Fort Stockton Drive	44343216	5B	2255	Fort Stockton Drive	44306163	5B
1816	Fort Stockton Drive	44343120	5D3	2258	Fort Stockton Drive	44325006	5B
1830	Fort Stockton Drive	44343121	5D3	2260	Fort Stockton Drive	44325005	5B
1834	Fort Stockton Drive	44343109	5B	2265	Fort Stockton Drive	44306164	5B
1835	Fort Stockton Drive	44343226	5B	2271	Fort Stockton Drive	44306165	5B
1845	Fort Stockton Drive	44343227	5B	2276	Fort Stockton Drive	44325002	5D3
1854	Fort Stockton Drive	44343105	5B	2277	Fort Stockton Drive	44306166	5D3
1855	Fort Stockton Drive	44343228	5B	2285	Fort Stockton Drive	44306167	5B
1859	Fort Stockton Drive	44343229	5D3	2215	Pine Street	44325024	5B
1860	Fort Stockton Drive	44343103	5D3	2225	Pine Street	44325023	5D3
1866	Fort Stockton Drive	44343102	5B	2231	Pine Street	44325022	5D3
1867	Fort Stockton Drive	44343230	5D3	2271	Pine Street	44325017	5B
1883	Fort Stockton Drive	44343231	5D3	2281	Pine Street	44325016	5D3
1918	Fort Stockton Drive	44327023	5D3	4244	Saint James Place	44342223	5B
1920	Fort Stockton Drive	44327024	5D3	4247	Saint James Place	44343201	5B
2008	Fort Stockton Drive	44325042	5D3	4250	Sierra Vista	44327001	5D3
2019	Fort Stockton Drive	44325117	5D3	4391	Trias Street	44306168	5D3
2020	Fort Stockton Drive	44325041	5D3	4405	Trias Street	44325001	5B
2025	Fort Stockton Drive	44325116	5D3	4435	Trias Street	44325014	5B

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
2031	Fort Stockton Drive	44325115	5B	1705	West Lewis Street	44346211	5B
2035	Fort Stockton Drive	44325114	5D3	1706	West Lewis Street	44346115	5D3
2038	Fort Stockton Drive	44325040	5D3	1714	West Lewis Street	44346116	5D3
2107	Fort Stockton Drive	44325113	5D3	1720	West Lewis Street	44346117	5D3
2110	Fort Stockton Drive	44325050	5D3	1731	West Lewis Street	44346214	5D3
2115	Fort Stockton Drive	44325112	5D3	1732	West Lewis Street	44346119	5B
2121	Fort Stockton Drive	44325111	5D3	1744	West Lewis Street	44346120	5D3
2127	Fort Stockton Drive	44325110	5B	1752	West Lewis Street	44346121	5B
2138	Fort Stockton Drive	44325053	5D3	1753	West Lewis Street	44346201	5B
2139	Fort Stockton Drive	44325109	5D3	1760	West Lewis Street	44346122	5D3
2147	Fort Stockton Drive	44325108	5D3	1770	West Lewis Street	44346123	5D3
2151	Fort Stockton Drive	44325107	5D3	1778	West Lewis Street	44346124	5B
2154	Fort Stockton Drive	44325055	5B	4390	Witherby Street	44325106	5B
2206	Fort Stockton Drive	44325013	5B				

3. Establish the following 30 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code	St #	Street Name	APN	Status Code
1775	Fort Stockton Drive	44343225	6L	2244	Fort Stockton Drive	44325008	6Z
1801	Fort Stockton Drive	44343219	6L	2268	Fort Stockton Drive	44325004	6L
1846	Fort Stockton Drive	44343106	6Z	2274	Fort Stockton Drive	44325003	6Z
1887	Fort Stockton Drive	44343202	6L	2205	Pine Street	44325025	6Z
1913	Fort Stockton Drive	44342222	6L	2241	Pine Street	44325021	6Z
1914	Fort Stockton Drive	44327002	6L	2251	Pine Street	44325020	6Z
2005	Fort Stockton Drive	44325119	6Z	2255	Pine Street	44325019	6Z
2015	Fort Stockton Drive	44325118	6L	2265	Pine Street	44325018	6Z
2042	Fort Stockton Drive	44325039	6Z	2285	Pine Street	44325015	6L
2114	Fort Stockton Drive	44325051	6L	4251	Sierra Vista	44343101	6L
2124	Fort Stockton Drive	44325052	6L	1715	West Lewis Street	44346212	6L
2146	Fort Stockton Drive	44325054	6Z	1717	West Lewis Street	44346213	6L
2211	Fort Stockton Drive	44325105	6L	1728	West Lewis Street	44346118	6Z
2221	Fort Stockton Drive	44325104	6L	1739	West Lewis Street	44346203	6Z
2228	Fort Stockton Drive	44325010	6Z	4430	Witherby Street	44325026	6L

Report Numbers: HRB 07-031 and supplemental memo dated July 10, 2007  
 Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

Public Testimony Opened

Opposed: Fred Thomspson; Kevin Smart; Amy O’Regan

In Favor: Barry Hager and Scott Sandel (organized presentation); Bruce Coons; Leo Wilson; Amie Schaeffer; Dale Ballou May; Ron May; Donna Sevilla; Janet O’Dea; Pam Engebretson; Katherine Hon; Judy Peterson; Mary Johnson; Pat Olafson; Kim Adler; Julie Keeney; Carolyn Fossett; Sara Raddatz; A. Becker; Mary Van Stee; Tobi de Frates; Jason Pizzinat; Ann Garword



Public Testimony Closed

BOARD DISCUSSION

Boardmember Harrison inquired as to which property, other than 2015 Fort Stockton Drive, the applicant would like reclassified. The applicant responded that they would like the Board to consider reclassifying 2268 Fort Stockton Drive. Boardmember Berge stated that she felt the staff classification of 6L for 2268 Fort Stockton Drive is appropriate, and that the restorations should be completed first. Boardmember Emme agreed. Boardmember Harrison reiterated his prior comments regarding the need to understand the fiscal impacts of the Mills Act program.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BURNETT TO ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION, INCLUDING THE RECLASSIFICATION OF 2015 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE AS CONTRIBUTING (5D3)

Second by Boardmember Eisenhart      Vote: 6-0-0

The meeting was adjourned at 11:55 AM

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: July 26, 2007, 1:00 P.M.

LOCATION: City Administration Building  
12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Council Committee Room