

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 27, 2007
202 C Street, City Administration Building
Council Committee Room, 12th Floor
San Diego, CA**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson Jerry Schaefer at 1:06 p.m.

Chairperson	Otto Emme	Absent
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	John Eisenhart	Present
Boardmember	Donald Harrison	Absent
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present (arrived @ 2:15 p.m.)

Staff to the Board in Attendance: Jacqueline Dominguez, Interim Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Kelley Saunders, Senior Planner
Mike Tudury, Senior Planner
Ginger Weatherford, Intern
Tricia Olsen, Intern
Garry Papers, Deputy Director, Urban Form

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Marianne Greene, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1A - MINUTES OF MAY 24, 2007

Boardmember Burnett moved to approve the Minutes of May 24, 2007 as written. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge. The motion was approved 5-0-2. Boardmembers Marshall and Schaefer abstained.

ITEM 1B - MINUTES OF JULY 26, 2007

The Minutes of July 26, 2007 were not available for approval.

ITEM 1C - MINUTES OF AUGUST 23, 2007

Boardmember Berge requested a revision on page 9, last paragraph, first sentence, to insert the word "*document*" after environmental and the word "*economically*" before the word feasible, to clarify her comments. Boardmember Marshall noted some typographical errors. Boardmember

Berge moved to approve the Minutes of August 23, 2007 as revised. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Marshall. The motion was approved 6-0-1. Boardmember Burnett abstained.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **Absences:**

Chair Emme notified staff that he had to be out of town related to his military service and would not be able to attend the meeting. Boardmember Silvas advised staff he is attending the California Indian Awareness Conf. at Cal State San Bernardino and would arrive late to the meeting.

- **Other General Information:**

Contents of "Blue Folders" were copies of emails received on Item 15, the T. Claude Ryan House and copies of the May and August Minutes.

- **General Board Member Comments:**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **Conflict of Interest:**

Boardmember Marshall recused himself from Items 5 and 6. His firm has a business relationship with the applicants. Vice Chairperson Schaefer recused himself from Item 5. His firm has been consulting with the applicant on that project.

Ex Parte Communications:

None.

- **Failure to visit designation sites (including interiors proposed for designation)/invocation of waiver:**

Boardmember Burnett was unable to visit Item 15. Scott Moomjian addressed the Board to express concern that some Boardmembers may not have had an opportunity to visit the site and that there is a limited number of Boardmembers present at the hearing. Mr. Moomjian asked the Board to grant a site visit waiver for those Boardmembers who were unable to visit the site before considering Item 15 today. Vice Chairperson asked Ms. Winterrowd to read into the record the conditions for waivers of the site visit.

Boardmember Marshall noted that on Item 15, staff is recommending designation for association with T. Claude Ryan, rather than for architecture, which means that the

physical appearance of the building is less important. Mr. Marshall continued, if, on the other hand, the applicant wants to pursue designation under Criterion C, that may be a case where seeing the building in person is going to make a difference.

Boardmember Burnett said the report is put together well and provides photographic information which provides an understanding of the site. The information in the report is sufficient to for her to consider and act on the item.

Boardmember Marshall moved to grant Ms. Burnett a site visit waiver for Item 15. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge. The motion was approved 6-0-1. Boardmember Burnett abstained.

C. STAFF REPORT

Announcements:

- a. Another staff retirement is just around the corner. Mike Tudury will be leaving us after 20 years of service to the citizens of San Diego, about half of those years working directly with the Historical Resources Board. His last Board meeting will be October 25th we will be marking this very special occasion with a goodbye celebration. So plan on joining us to wish Mike a fond farewell next month.
- b. The Board currently has two vacancies and two other Board members, Ms. Burnett and Ms. McNeely, have reached their 8-year limit and cannot be reappointed. The Mayor's Director of Appointments wants everyone to know she is working to fill all of these positions as soon as possible and hopes we can be patient a little longer. She has also requested all Boardmembers to be especially diligent in attendance.
- c. The planned HRB Annual Retreat scheduled for earlier this month had to be rescheduled due to Boardmember conflicts and staffing vacancies. A new date and venue will be announced as soon as the retreat is rescheduled.
- d. Next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, October 3, 2007
- e. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, October 8, 2007.
- f. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, November 10.

Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes one referral from Development Services and one referral from CCDC, six individual homeowner nominations, a determination of consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, one development permit review, and an amendment to the Burlingame historic district. There remain 36 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2006 waiting to be reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation. At this point in time, it seems clear that all of these nominations will not be heard by the Board this calendar year.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA:

The following items are non-controversial with all parties agreeable to the Staff Recommendations, and the Board may wish to approve them on consent:

- ITEM 8 – THE PACIFIC BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #2 at 1517 Granada
- ITEM 9 – ELINOR MEADOWS APARTMENT BUILDING at 3065 Third Avenue
- ITEM 10 – JOHNSON RESIDENCE (Development Permit Review) at 1857 Viking Way
- ITEM 12 – GERTRUDE OSSENBURG HOUSE at 3614 Hyacinth Drive
- ITEM 13 – ADDIE MCGILL/DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC HOUSE #1 at 3503 Pershing Avenue
- ITEM 14 – FREDRIC AND MYRLE MURRAY SPEC HOUSE #1 at 909 Hayes Avenue

BOARD ACTION: Boardmember Berge moved to approve the items placed on the consent agenda, according to staff recommendation, including the Mills Act conditions. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Curry. The motion was approved 7-0-0.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Anne Garwood and Nancy Mars, of Elinor Meadows Apartment Building thanked the Board.

Other Issues Discussed and Resolved from the Consent Agenda:

None.

Requests for Withdrawals from the Consent Agenda:

Boardmember Berge requested Item 15 pulled from the consent agenda for discussion.

BOARD COMMENT: Boardmember Berge commended the consultant and property owners on Item #8, for their willingness to incorporate the conditions of the contract for the Mills Act within this reasonable period of time; this will be a notable example of a Master Architect's work. On Item #9 - Ms. Berge complimented the consultants for clearly and explicitly explaining the period of architecture in relationship to style. On Item #13 - Ms. Berge complimented the consultants for including in the report, information on the Master Builder, Dryden.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 777 BEECH STREET

Applicant: Peter Janopaul, referred from the City Centre Development Corporation

Location: 777 Beech Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the proposed project relative to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (the Standards)

Today's Action: Determination of consistency with Secretary of the Interior's Standards

Staff Recommendation: Find that the proposed 777 Beach Street project is consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent, historically designated El Cortez building, located at 702 Ash Street. The specific Standards for Rehabilitation that apply to the proposed new structure are Standards 2, 9 and 10.

Report Number: HRB-07-066

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

Open public testimony

In Favor: Michael Zucchet, Scott Maas.

In Opposition: Robert Otilie, Boyd and Rita Collier, Anne Porter, Barry and Debbie Bruins, Carol Marino, Stella Croker, Kathy Casey, Vern Miller, D. M. Coates and Robert Wood.

BOARD DISCUSSION: Boardmember Eisenhart stated that the proposed building respected the El Cortez in terms of height, mass and scale and is appropriate for an adjacent development. Prohibiting development on the site or limiting development to what was present in 1927 is not consistent with how the Board views other resources in terms of application of the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the Historic Resources Regulations. The reduction in mass from the previous proposal and the use of complimentary materials is an improvement. The project is consistent with the Standards, especially in regard to Standards 2 and 9. Boardmember Curry supported staff's recommendation. While she understands the community's concern, the project must be reviewed consistent with the Board's actions on projects City-wide; and the project is consistent with the Standards. Boardmember Berge stated that she is having difficulty gauging whether or not the project is compatible enough with the El Cortez. Boardmember Eisenhart responded that the project is an abstract representation of the El Cortez, picking up on the general form and fenestration rhythm, but utilizing a rounded form which reduces the massing in a deferential manner. Boardmember Silvas would like to see the project reduced by 4-5 floors. He expressed concern regarding the views from the north and Balboa Park.

BOARD ACTION: Boardmember Curry moved to support Staff recommendation on Item 5. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Eisenhart. The motion was approved 5-1-0. Boardmember Silvas was opposed. Boardmembers Marshall and Schaefer recused themselves earlier and Ms. Burnett served as Chair.

ITEM 6 – ISSAC LYON BUILDING, 1479 J STREET & ISSAC LYON RENTAL PROPERTY, 360 15th STREET (Continued from April 2007; May 2007)

Applicant: Kathleen Crawford on behalf of the estate of Kenneth Cummings, referred from the City Centre Development Corporation

Location: 1479 J Street & 360 15th Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Issac Lyon Building, located at 1479 J Street, and the Issac Lyon Rental Property, located at 360 15th Street, as historical resources.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Issac Lyon Building at 1479 J Street and the Issac Lyon Rental Property at 360 15th Street under HRB Criterion C as rare examples of Victorian commercial and residential vernacular architecture in downtown San Diego.

Report Number: HRB-07-025 and Supplemental Staff Memos dated April 19, 2007, May 8, 2007 and September 12, 2007

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

Open public testimony

In Favor: Bruce Coons

In Opposition: John Edwards and Jennifer Ayala.

BOARD DISCUSSION: Boardmember Eisenhart said the structural deficiencies are to be expected for the age of the buildings and many character defining features and materials remain. Boardmember Burnett strongly supported staff recommendation and encouraged the qualified professionals associated with this project to immediately rehabilitate this structure, as a valuable component to the community. Boardmember Curry was in agreement with the comments made by Bruce Coons and expressed support for staff recommendation for designation. Boardmember Berge said this is a very rare example, a survivor of the Victorian period in San Diego, and she is in full support of Staff recommendation. Boardmember Schaefer said he was in strong support of staff recommendation and especially maintaining the character-defining elements, even if it ends up only HABS mitigation, but if we don't designate them, we don't get any preservation element.

BOARD ACTION: Boardmember Eisenhart moved to designate both properties per staff recommendation. The motion as second by Boardmember Curry. The motion failed 5-1-1. Boardmember McNeely was opposed. Boardmember Marshall recused himself.

ITEM 7 – J. B. DRAPER SPEC HOUSE #1 (Continued from July 2007)

Applicant: Dr. Ray Brandes and Scott Moomjian, on behalf of Elsa D. Benedict, owner

Location: 3563 28th Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the J. B. Draper Spec House #1, located at 3563 28th Street, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the J. B. Draper Spec House #1, located at 3563 28th Street, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the Prairie style of architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-048 and Staff Memo dated September 13, 2007

Staff Report by Ginger Weatherford.

Open public testimony

In Favor: Paul Johnson gave a PowerPoint presentation in favor of designation.

In Opposition: None.

BOARD DISCUSSION: There was general discussion by Boardmembers regarding the applicant's PowerPoint and presentation of additional information regarding the rehabilitation of the entry porch piers. The Boardmembers thanked the applicants for conducting additional research and providing the Board with the information requested.

BOARD ACTION: Boardmember Eisenhart moved to designate Item 7, under Criterion C. Boardmember Curry seconded the motion. The motion was approved 7-0-0.

ITEM 8 – THE PACIFIC BUILDING COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #2 (Continued from July 2007)

Applicant: IS Architecture, on behalf of owners Frank and Robin D’Esti

Location: 1517 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Pacific Building Company Spec House #2, located at 1517 Granada Avenue, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Pacific Building Company Spec House #2 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Prairie architecture, and HRB Criterion D as the work of the Pacific Building Company, an established Master Builder.

Report Number: HRB-07-050 and Staff Memo dated September 13, 2007
Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

BOARD ACTION: Item #8 was approved on consent.

ITEM 9 – ELINOR MEADOWS APARTMENT BUILDING

Applicant: Sarai Johnson on behalf of the owners, Stone Meadows, LLC

Location: 3065 Third Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Elinor Meadows Apartment Building, located at 3065 Third Avenue, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Elinor Meadows Apartment Building, located at 3065 Third Avenue, as a historical resource based on HRB Criteria B for its association with Elinor Meadows an important person and HRB Criteria C as an excellent and iconic example of Craftsman style architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-067
Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

BOARD ACTION: Item #9 was approved on consent.

ITEM 10 – JOHNSON RESIDENCE

Applicant: Johnson Trust, owner

Location: 1857 Viking Way, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: The Historical Resources Board recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit related to the important archaeology site, as presented.

Report Number: HRB-07-068
Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

BOARD ACTION: Item #10 was approved on consent.

ITEM 11 – BURLINGAME HISTORIC DISTRICT AMENDMENT (1st HEARING)

Applicant: City of San Diego, City Planning & Community Investment, Historical Resources Section

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area (existing Burlingame Historic District boundaries), defined by the properties extending along San Marcos Street to the north, Kalmia Street to the south, 32nd Street to the east, and 30th Street to the west.

Description: First hearing to consider the proposed district amendment to change the Burlingame Historical District type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District.

Today's Action: Review the proposed amendment to the existing Burlingame Historical District to change the district type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District; take public testimony; provide direction to staff regarding the amendment, including the classification of all contributing and non-contributing resources; determine whether the proposed amendment is consistent with adopted HRB Policy 4.1 and Land Development Code (LDC) Section 123.0205, and direct staff to docket the Burlingame district amendment for a second HRB hearing for designation as a Geographic/Traditional Historical District.

Staff Recommendation:

1. Review the proposed district amendment to change the district type from a Voluntary/Traditional Historical District to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District and provide direction, based on adopted HRB District Policy 4.1 and consistent with LDC Section 123.0205: Amendment or Recision of Historical Resource Designation.
2. Review the proposed classification of the following 16 properties as Contributing Resources:

APN #	Street No.	Street Name	Status Code	Board Action
539-043-08	2404	32nd Street	5D1	n/a
539-032-09	2408	Capitan Avenue	5D1	n/a
539-041-11	2406	Dulzura Avenue	5D1	n/a
539-044-08	3171	Kalmia Street	5B	n/a
453-711-06	3010	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
453-711-07	3016	Laurel Street	5B	n/a
453-711-08	3024	Laurel Street	5B	n/a
453-713-22	3030	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
539-032-01	3031	Laurel Street	5D1	n/a
453-713-14	3134	Maple Street	5D1	n/a
453-722-13	3178	Maple Street	5D1	8/23/2007
539-031-05	2404	San Marcos Ave	5B	n/a
539-031-07	2424	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
539-032-03	2455	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
453-722-03	2625	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a
453-722-06	2653	San Marcos Ave	5D1	n/a

3. Review the proposed classification of the following 25 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

APN #	Street No.	Street Name	Status Code	Board Action
539-042-07	2405	Dulzura Avenue	6L	7/26/2007
539-033-04	3025	Kalmia Street	6L	n/a
539-033-05	3031	Kalmia Street	6Z	n/a
539-033-09	3061	Kalmia Street	6L	7/26/2007
539-044-09	3183	Kalmia Street	6Z	n/a
453-724-12	3106	Laurel Street	6Z	n/a
453-724-09	3124	Laurel Street	6L	1/25/2007
453-723-05	3176	Laurel Street	6Z	n/a
453-713-15	3124	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-724-01	3127	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-713-13	3144	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-722-18	3150	Maple Street	6Z	DEMO
453-724-04	3161	Maple Street	6Z	n/a
453-723-01	3175	Maple Street	6L	1/26/2006
453-723-03	3185	Maple Street	6L	n/a
453-722-11	3190	Maple Street	6Z	n/a
539-032-05	2433	San Marcos Ave	6L	1/25/2007
453-711-24	2532	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-01	2602	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-04	2624	San Marcos Ave	6L	n/a
453-721-05	2632	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-07	2654	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-08	2660	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-09	2672	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a
453-721-10	2680	San Marcos Ave	6Z	n/a

- Find that the proposed amendment is consistent with adopted HRB Policy 4.1 and LDC Section 123.0205, and direct staff to docket the Burlingame district amendment for a second HRB hearing to change the district type to a Geographic/Traditional Historical District and to designate the remaining contributing resources.

If the Board cannot find that the amendment is consistent with adopted HRB Policy 4.1 or LDC Section 123.0205, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Report Number: HRB-07-069

Staff Report given by Cathy Winterrowd.

Open public testimony

In Favor: Vickie Granowitz, Rick Hardy, Betty Baill, Steve Saars, Bruce Coons and Connie diGirolamo.

In Opposition: None.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

2404 32nd Street - Boardmembers Berge, Marshall and Eisenhart expressed concerns with modifications to the porch, which dominate the otherwise simple structure.

2406 Dulzura Avenue - Boardmember Berge expressed concerns with the aluminum, side windows on the corner lot not meeting the Secretary of Interior's standards. Vice Chair Schaefer said this property retains most of the character-defining features and he does not believe the windows effect the property as a contributor. Boardmember Marshall agreed with Schaefer that the windows are not enough to remove the property from the list. Eisenhart expressed concerns with the porch addition.

3178 Maple Street - Boardmember Marshall said the owners completed what we asked them to on the canopy and he believes the house is now more representative of the way it was originally constructed; he supports it on the contributing list. Owner, Penelope Olds, said she replaced the glass louver windows with wood frame windows that matched the original windows in the back of the house, which was her only point of reference.

2404 San Marcos Avenue - Boardmember Berge expressed concerns with the stucco on this corner home, the second story addition and the front door. Ms. Berge is not in favor of designation under status code 5B. Boardmeber Marshall also expressed concerns with the second story and the level of alteration. Mr. Marshall requested additional information on this property before designation.

2455 San Marcos Avenue - Boardmember Berge expressed concerns with what she believed to be a porch enclosure. Boardmember Eisenhart believed the additions may date to the 1930's and stated that review of Sanborn Maps would be helpful in understanding modifications to the property. Boardmember Marshall expressed concerns with the location of the front door and the dormers. Boardmembers Eisenhart, Marshall and Schaefer expressed concerns over the extensive wrought iron fencing.

3016 Laurel Street - Boardmember Berge questioned whether the stucco texture was appropriate for a potentially individually significant resource, and the use of status code 5B. Ms. Winterrowd said the status code for 5B would not result in the designation of the site as an individually significant resource; and that the 5B status code simply indicates that the site may be found to be individually significant, pending further analysis and review by the Board. The Board's action today would be limited to a contributing resource designation.

3061 Kalmia - Boardmember Marshall questioned the classification of the property as a non-contributor. Cathy Winterrowd responded that it was the whole form of the front of the house.

BOARD ACTION: Boardmember Berge moved that the property at **2404 32nd Street** be changed from the status code of 5D1 to 6L. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Marshall and approved 7-0-0.

By consensus, the Board agreed that the property on **2406 Dulzura Avenue** could be identified as a contributor, with rehabilitation needed through a Mills Act Agreement.

Boardmember Marshall moved that the property at **2404 San Marcos** be changed from status code of 5B to 6L, pending more information from Staff. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge and approved 6-1-0. Boardmember Eisenhart was opposed.

Boardmember Berge moved that the status designation on **2455 San Marcos** be changed from 5D1 to 6L, until additional information is provided. The motion was seconded by Boardmember McNeely and approved 6-1-0. Boardmember Eisenhart was opposed.

Boardmember Marshall moved to approve Staff Recommendation, with the revisions as voted upon and stated above. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Berge. The motion was approved 7-0-0.

ITEM 12 – GERTRUDE OSSENBERG HOUSE

Applicant: Linda Canada on behalf of the owners, Amber Eck-Duby and Jeff Duby

Location: 3614 Hyacinth Drive, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Gertrude Ossenburg House, located at 3614 Hyacinth Drive, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Gertrude Ossenburg House, located at 3614 Hyacinth Drive in Point Loma, as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the Spanish Eclectic architectural style, excluding the garage, shed and rear yard site work.

Report Number: HRB-07-070

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

BOARD ACTION: Item #12 was approved on consent.

ITEM 13 – ADDIE MCGILL/DAVID O. DRYDEN HOUSE SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Legacy 106, on behalf of owners Julia Cline and Eric Miersma

Location: 3503 Pershing Avenue, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Addie McGill/David O. Dryden House Spec House #1, located at 3503 Pershing Avenue, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Addie McGill/David O. Dryden House Spec House #1, located at 3503 Pershing Avenue, under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Craftsman bungalow architecture and HRB Criterion D as the work of Master Builder David O. Dryden.

Report Number: HRB-07-071

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

BOARD ACTION: Item #13 was approved on consent.

ITEM 14 – FREDRIC AND MYRLE MURRAY SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of owners Geoffrey Sheenan and Dr. Melissa Houser

Location: 909 Hayes Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Fredric and Myrle Murray Spec House #1, located at 909 Hayes Avenue, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Fredric and Myrle Murray Spec House #1 located at 909 Hayes Avenue as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic architecture.

Report Number: HRB-07-072

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

BOARD ACTION: Item #14 was approved on consent.

ITEM 15 – T. CLAUDE RYAN HOUSE

Applicant: Scott Moomjian on behalf of the owners

Location: 548 San Fernando Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Claude and Gladys Ryan House, located at 548 San Fernando Street, as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the T. Claude Ryan House, located at 548 San Fernando Street in Point Loma, under HRB Criterion B as the primary residence of historic person T. Claude Ryan.

Report Number: HRB-07-073

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

Open public testimony

In Favor: Scott Moomjian gave a PowerPoint presentation in favor of designation of Item 15.

In Opposition: None.

BOARD COMMENT: Boardmember Curry asked how long Mr. Ryan lived there and whether it was a productive time in his life. Ms. Curry added that the house is not visible from the street and is not as architecturally interesting as other properties on the street. She also noted that, despite the young age of the resource, the windows have been changed out. Boardmember Eisenhart supports the designation under Criterion B and is less enthusiastic about Criteria A and C. Boardmember Berge does not agree with designation under Criterion C and on Criterion B, and she questioned if the subject property is the place that most significantly represents his contribution. Boardmember Marshall was in favor of staff recommendation for designation under Criterion B, but is not sure about Criterion C, especially due to the recent remodel of the interior drafting room of Mr. Ryan. Boardmember Schaefer stated that Ryan is historically significant, but that the subject property was his last home and reflects primarily his last work and retirement. In the end, the integrity of the property is the most significant element, and has been compromised by the recent modifications.

The Vice Chair noted that Boardmember Silvas arrived at 2:20 p.m.

BOARD ACTION: Boardmember Silvas said that he was not able to visit the site, but read the report on Item 15 and believes he has sufficient information to participate in the item, according to the Board's criteria. Boardmember Berge moved to grant a waiver of the site visit to Boardmember Silvas. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Curry. The motion was approved 7-0-1. Boardmember Silvas abstained.

Boardmember Burnett moved to designate Item 15, per staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Boardmember Marshall. The motion failed 5-3-0. Boardmembers Berge, Curry and Schaefer were opposed.

Reminder: The next Historical Resources Board Meeting will be held on October 25, 2007 at the City Administration Building, 202 C Street, Council Committee Room, 12th Floor.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:05 p.m.

jd