



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 17, 2008 REPORT NO. HRB-08-064

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of September 25, 2008

SUBJECT: **ITEM #13 – 3020 DUMAS STREET**

APPLICANT: Ruth Alter on behalf of the owner, Carol Navigato

LOCATION: 3020 Dumas Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of 3020 Dumas Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the building at 3020 Dumas Street under any HRB criteria due to a loss of material integrity.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The one and two story Spanish Eclectic home was built in 1928. The home was built by John Gordon McGregor and his wife, Louise.

The home was built during the second phase (1920 to end of World War II) of development in Loma Portal, a residential subdivision located on Point Loma. As part of the Quieter Home Program, a Section 106 undertaking, a portion of Loma Portal has been identified as a potential National Register Historic District under Criteria B and C. The period of significance is 1910-1960 with three distinctive development periods: 1910-1920, 1920-1945, and 1945-1960. The



building at 3020 Dumas Street is located within the potential Loma Portal Historic District and has been identified as a contributing resource to this district under Criteria B.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Ruth Alter. The report states the resource was previously found eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as part of the Loma Portal Historic District. However, the subject property was not determined individually eligible. The historic district was determined to be the eligible resource, not the individual property. Therefore, the property is not eligible under Criterion E as it has not individually been determined eligible for the National Register or California Register. In addition, the report indicates that Criterion F applies to this property. Criterion F does not apply to an individual property, but a group of properties that constitute a historic district.

The consultant report provided a brief analysis of the property with respect to Criterion B and concluded that 3020 Dumas Street is not individually significant under this criterion. The consultant report concludes that the resource is individually significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff agrees that the property is not individually significant under Criterion B, but does not concur that the site is an individual significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The one and two story Spanish Eclectic home was built in 1928 and features multiple roof types. The gabled, hipped, and flat roofs are tiled and feature exposed rafter tails. A two story shouldered chimney along the east façade features a “bird house” chimney pot.

The focal point of home is the two story entry turret with two arched windows. One of these windows, features bottle glass, while the other is a leaded, stained glass window. The recessed arched entry door is original and is framed by a stucco surround. The entry door retains its heavy metal straps and upper grilled speakeasy.

A variety of fenestration can be found throughout the home. This includes multi-lite casements, fixed pane, and leaded glass. One of the focal windows in the south façade is a 24-lite leaded glass window with shield insets. Other windows include a pair of divided light casements with decorative metal balconettes. Windows along the east façade also have balconettes. While the leaded glass windows are original to the home, the other windows have been replaced as part of the Quieter Home Program.

Though the house reflects elements of the Spanish Eclectic style, modifications have reduced the material integrity of the resource so that it is not individually eligible. The most significant of these alterations is to the original stucco texture. The building has been re-stuccoed with a rough texture. This is an inappropriate modification to a Spanish Eclectic home and detracts from the architectural style. A primary character-defining feature of Spanish Eclectic architecture is typically a smooth stucco texture.

Along with a reduction in material integrity, when previously surveyed and evaluated by Ruth Alter in 2000 as part of the Quieter Home Program, 3020 Dumas Street was not considered to be individually eligible under Criterion C for the National Register of Historic Places. The building was "...constructed in a nondescript Spanish Eclectic style...it does not possess exceptionally high artistic values. It does not represent a significant, distinguishable entity..." (San Diego International Airport – Lindbergh Field, Quieter Home Program – Phase 1A, *Historic Resources Report for the Loma Portal Neighborhood*, May 2000) While the building was found eligible as a contributor to the Loma Portal Historic District, it was found eligible under Criterion B, for its association with significant people, not under Criteria C, for its architecture. Therefore, in addition to a lack of material integrity, the building has previously been found to not rise to the level of individual significance.

Based on modifications to the stucco wall texture and consistent with previous determinations, staff does not support the individual designation of 3020 Dumas Street under Criterion C.


CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, staff recommends that the Board not designate the residence at 3020 Dumas as an individual historic resource under any HRB Criteria due to a loss of integrity

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jennifer Hirsch
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

jh/cw

Attachment(s): Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover