



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 9, 2009 REPORT NO. HRB-09-029

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board  
Agenda of April 23, 2009

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #7**

APPLICANT: Mehrdad & Fereshten Soumekh, represented by Brian F. Smith & Associates

LOCATION: Not Permitted to List, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property listed above as a historical resource.

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya Site #7 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A and exclude from the designation the building located on the same parcel. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development associated with the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya site known to be of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people of San Diego.



**City Planning & Community Investment**  
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865  
Tel (619) 235-5200 • Fax (619) 533-5951

## BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification of a structure of 45 years or more, located in the La Jolla community, under San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The Modern Contemporary home located on the subject parcel was constructed in 1949 by Douglas S. McKellar and has since been significantly altered. There is no evidence to suggest that this building played a direct or significant role in La Jolla's development, or that it reflects an association with an event or person significant in history, and it was not designed or built by an established master. The building no longer retains sufficient integrity of materials, design, workmanship, and feeling and therefore does not qualify for designation.

The site is located in a culturally and archaeologically rich part of the La Jolla community known for its significance as a traditional cultural property and its association with the Kumeyaay people of San Diego.

## ANALYSIS

A cultural resources study was prepared by Brian F. Smith & Associates which concludes the property lies within an area of La Jolla with known significant cultural sensitivity associated with the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya site. Staff believes the property represents an important archaeological site and significant traditional cultural property and is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion A, as follows:

*CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.*

This property is located approximately one-half mile from the mapped boundaries of a regionally significant archaeological site known as the Spindrift Site, (CA-SDI-39/17,372, SDMM-W-1). This site encompasses a large habitation area known to its Kumeyaay inhabitants as *Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya* (place of many caves). The area is composed of several large midden areas, temporary camps, pottery and lithic scatters, various shell scatters, and burials found throughout multiple, consecutive layers representative of different cultural phases found in the San Diego region. The 20-acre knoll, historically known as the Richards Tract and the La Jolla Vista Tract, was originally investigated and recorded by Malcolm Rogers during the late 1920s, and by James Moriarty in the 1960s, and has been associated with occupations by groups from the La Jolla Complex and the Late Prehistoric Kumeyaay.

The HRB's first designation of a portion of the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya site was in 1999 (HRB #390). Other parcels within the area the site (HRB #638, #813, #818, #885 and #891) were designated between 2003 and 2008. Previously, the HRB considered whether to develop a policy of pre-designating the entire Spindrift area so that property owners would be informed before they embark on projects with the potential to adversely impact the significant site. Administrative issues associated with this approach resulted in a continuation of parcels being

considered on a case-by-case basis as projects are processed through the Development Services Department. In 2007, the Archaeology Subcommittee began reviewing the potential for creating an archaeological geographic historic district encompassing all the properties within the known and mapped boundaries of this significant archaeological and Native American site.

The archaeological fieldwork conducted at this property identified the presence of both intact and disturbed cultural deposits within the parcel. Although within close proximity to previously recorded site SDI-39/17,372, the subject site was assigned a new identification number (SDI-19,234). Previous parcel development disturbed portions of site SDI-19,234 closest to the current structure. However, the intact portion of the resource retains archaeological significance due to its research potential. The archaeological study included a survey of the parcel and subsurface excavation of shovel test pits and test units. No artifacts or ecofacts were encountered on the site surface. The subsurface recovery included six prehistoric artifacts and slightly more than 100 grams of marine shell. The artifacts included lithic production waste and a single ground stone tool. Modern refuse including plastic, glass and butchered bone fragments were recovered from the disturbed portion of the site. None of the trash was temporally or functionally diagnostic and could not be definitively ascribed to the historic period (at least 45 years old).

Subsurface excavations resulted in the recovery of artifacts and ecofacts that highlight lithic manufacturing and marine resource extraction and processing activities. This assemblage is common for coastal San Diego prehistoric sites. Although the portion of the site within the subject parcel that retains integrity is small (240 sq meters), it holds future research potential as an archaeological resource. Additionally, the significant nature of the larger site throughout this La Jolla neighborhood and a documented history of archaeological investigations that acknowledge the frequent discovery of sensitive cultural material within both intact and disturbed contexts, increase the importance of the site. Therefore, a data recovery, preservation and monitoring program has been recommended to reduce or minimize project impacts to the resource. The mitigation program was designed to specifically address issues of cultural significance and the potential discovery of human remains.

A summary of the archaeological site investigation was submitted to the San Diego Historical Resources Board to officially document the site investigation and treatment recommendations. In addition, correspondence from the Native American Monitor that worked on the project was provided. This correspondence notes the existence of an intact prehistoric shell lens that may be associated or a continuation of the Kumeyaay village site with the possibility of human remains existing on the site high.

HRB staff believes this site has significance as an important archaeological site due to its research potential and that it is associated with the larger significant traditional cultural property found in the neighborhood. Therefore, staff recommends the Board designate the site under Criterion A as the resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development associated with the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya site known to be of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people of San Diego.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the HRB designate the site under Criterion A as the resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development associated with the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya site known to be of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people of San Diego and do not designate the building located on the same premises under any HRB Criteria.



Cathy Winterrowd  
Senior Planner/Program Coordinator

### Attachments:

1. Draft Resolution
2. DPR 523L Continuation Sheet (Confidential – not for public distribution)
3. Letter from Red Tail Monitoring & Research, Inc.

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 4/23/2009

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/23/2009, to consider the historical designation of the **Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya Site #7** (owned by Mehrdad and Fereshten Soumekh, 6109 Plainview Road, Bethesda, MD 20817) located at *not permitted to list*, **San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: ....., further described as.... in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No.**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya Site #7** on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION A as the resource exemplifies special elements of the City's archaeological and cultural development associated with the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya site known to be of cultural significance to the Kumeyaay people of San Diego

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.** .

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN LEMMO, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND  
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
NINA FAIN  
Deputy City Attorney



Red Tail

Monitoring & Research, Inc.

---

**Memorandum of Record**

Re: [REDACTED] Test Project.

To Whom It May Concern,

2-24-09

The [REDACTED] Test Project was conducted by Brian F. Smith and Associates (BFSA) and Red Tail Monitoring & Research, Inc (Red Tail). All methodology was consistent with proper techniques for Archaeological Evaluation Testing.

Test pits were excavated throughout the visible soils on property. Kumeyaay prehistoric sites exist near the project APE. In the front yard, eastern side of property, deposits were recent. Materials collected represented recent historic activity associated with house, road and sidewalk development. In the backyard, western side of the property, an intact prehistoric shell lens was discovered. This lens appeared to be intact and has been deemed significant under CEQA. Data recovery of this material is necessary. This site may be associated or a continuation of the Kumeyaay Village of Spindrift. The possibility of Kumeyaay human remains on site is high.

Please feel free to contact me if there are any questions or concerns,

Thank you,

Clint Linton

(760) 803-5694

P.O. Box 507 Santa Ysabel, CA 92070

---