

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	June 18, 2010	REPORT NO. HRB-10-027
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of June 24, 2010	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #8 – Winslow R. Parsons S	pec House #1
APPLICANT:	Charles DiPietro; represented by Joh	nnson & Johnson Architecture
LOCATION:	3520 28th Street, Greater North Parl	k Community, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Wir located at 3520 28th Street as a hist	1

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Winslow R. Parsons Spec House #1 located at 3520 28th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1965 non-historic garage at the rear of the parcel. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Craftsman style architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a wide front gable roof line that is low pitched with deep overhangs and exposed rafter tails, a full-width front porch with wood and masonry columns, a combination of wood fixed, casement, double hung and hopper windows, and wood shingle siding.



City Planning & Community Investment 202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865 Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a one story single family residence located in a low-density residential neighborhood in the Park Villas Subdivision of North Park. The resource is surrounded by a mixture of Spanish Eclectic and Craftsman styled residences in close proximity to Balboa Park.

The historic name of the resource, the Winslow R. Parsons Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and includes the name of Winslow R. Parsons, who was the first owner of the house. Mr. Parsons never lived in the house and apparently constructed it as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research was prepared by Paul and Sarai Johnson of Johnson & Johnson Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, B, C, D, and F. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C but not HRB Criteria A, B, D, or F. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant's report states that the house is significant under HRB Criterion A largely related to the shift in San Diego's architectural development from downtown to neighborhoods around Balboa Park following the 1915 Exposition and the expansion of transportation and water development to North Park. The discussion of the resource's eligibility under HRB Criterion A does not address how the building reflects a special element of development, therefore staff cannot recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The consultant recommends designation under Criterion B for its association with a number of individuals who owned and lived in the house at 3520 28th Street, most notably Lynn E. and Ethel C. Boyd who lived in the house from 1923 until Ethel's passing in 1964. Lynn Boyd is credited with helping to bring the Santa Fe Railroad into San Diego between Fallbrook and National City. Both Lynn and Ethel Boyd were involved in civic and community service and have a lengthy association with the house. Although they were undoubtedly active citizens of San Diego, there is not sufficient evidence provided to conclude either is significant in local, state or National history. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion B.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The building at 3520 28th Street is a one story Craftsman style house built in 1916 with raised wood foundation with crawl space and continuous perimeter concrete footing. The house features a low pitched front facing gable roof with exposed rafter tails and gable overhangs supported by cantilevered timber beams and enlarged bardge board; a full-width front porch with wood and masonry columns; painted wood shingle siding with decorative pattern of alternating courses of long and short shingles; a combination of wood fixed, casement, double hung and hopper windows with the front fixed windows having minimally had the glazing replaced and possibly the upper divided lights; brick chimney; and original rear garage of similar style and construction.

Modifications to the house include replacement of front window glazing and possibly loss of divided lights, extension of the chimney with differentiated modern brick and a stucco coating added to the chimney base. A non-historic garage was added to the rear of the parcel in 1965 (see attached building permit) along with a 40 sq ft back door addition and carport (which has since been removed). At this same time, new concrete with brick border walks and driveway and raised brick planters were added at the front of the house. These modifications do not significantly detract from the resource or impair its ability to convey significance as a Craftsman style building with a 1916 period of significance. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C, excluding the 1965 non-historic garage at the rear of the parcel.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's report states that the property is significant under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of builder and craftsman Edward F. Bryans, who has not yet been established by the Board as a Master. The applicant's report provides a limited amount of research stating "Bryans built more than 158 quality homes, apartment complexes and commercial buildings in San Diego." Bryans lived in the vicinity of the house at 3520 28th Street, on Oregon (now Pershing), and built more than 18 houses in the immediate area between 1913 and 1919. Two houses built by Bryans, 4247 Arden Way and 3411 29th Street, have been designated by the HRB for their significant architecture and, in both cases, the nomination reports identify Bryans as the builder but do not provide sufficient analysis to establish him as a Master. Likewise, the consultant report for 3520 28th Street does not provide a clear analysis of his work and does not provide a compelling case for Master Builder status. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

Although the property at 3520 28th Street is located within a proposed historic district, the district has not yet been established by the HRB. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation

under HRB Criterion F. In the future, if the proposed district is established, this property will be evaluated for designation under Criterion F as a district contributor.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Winslow R. Parsons Spec House #1 located at 3520 28th Street be designated with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criterion C as a resource which embodies the character defining features of the Craftsman architectural style and retains integrity from its period of significance. The designation excludes the 1965 non-historic garage at the rear of the parcel. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Cathy Friternoh

Cathy Winterrowd Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

CW/cw

Attachments: 1965 Building Permit for Garage Draft Resolution Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

1				24-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1-1	01070	107				<u></u>		11.5442	-
		Building Permit Appli	cation	APPLICANT FILL	DISTR		27.5	34/-	ER PERMIT	R	4055	32	
	Τ	NAME (OR NAME OF BUSINESS)			JUB AD			inter al anno	3054				П
Curden		EUGENE A	SHOW		- á	5-	20	- 0	18	C	2/		
	N	MAILING ADDRESS (NUMBER) (STREET)			SIDE YARD (INT.)) SIDE	YARD (S	111		AV. REAR YAR		12 28
	ō	3520 3524	21	LEPHONE NUMBER	USE-ZON	2 IE		MAP NU			BLK.	20	2
		SAN BIEGO		1975 8530	K	- 2	-		-1728		2010/01/02	NO	NN
		NAME			B.L.S. CC	DDE		CENSUS	TRACT	VA	RIANCE NU	V BER	15
	ç	EUGENE .	in the	<u>[]</u>		2		LOWED	- 14		- de l		
1	ARCHITECT	ADDRESS (NUMBER)	51	STRPET)	LOT APE	50	SQ. LO	т	41.1%	AREA	80	4 SQ.	
	Š	CITY		TELEPHONE NUMBER	ENCRO	HMENT	PERMIT	VERAGE		COVERED	GRADE	1	
		SAN DIEGO		355-3585	PERMIT R						0	1.12	ž
		NAME	- 10		METER S	IZE	SERVICE	SIZE	CLEARANCE	CHE	CKED 34		
	~	ADDRESS (NUMBER)		STREET)	REMARK		<u> </u>					_	
	6	3520	64 -	31REE17	. ALMARK	ω,			all and a state of the state of				3
1	CONTRACTOR	CITY		The second second second	NO. OF Z		:AL	ari 2000 ya 1967	TITE OUNT	CTION	VERI	FIED BY	\square
Series of	8	SAN DIED		1	KEQUIRE		- 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10 - 10		<u></u>		1		1 E
		STATE LICENSE NUMBER CLAS	S. NG CH	M LICENS? NUMBER	REMARK	S							E
		LOT BLOCK SUBD	VISICIN	CAR	FIRE ZO	NE	TYPE OF	CONST.	OCCUP. GROU	P TO	TAL FLOOR	AREA	+
	NO		KR V	1. A.	3 1		J.	T-N J					
	CAN	JOB ADDRESS		SPECIAL INSPECTOR R.Q.D. FOR BUILDING AREA PLAN CHECKE									
	5 10	A low a second s			CONCRETE AMASONRY 4-80 10 Aman			7	- 1				
	2								RECEIPT NO.				
		WORK TO BE DONE					NO. CF	BLDGS.	PER/BLDG	· · · ·	TOTA	L	11
-		Pouti	S	1. A. 17 E		ILDING		1			1536	-	
	WORK	Icx2	4		BUIL	DING PE	RMIT				10	1	181
		PROPOSED USE	14 4 10 7			PLAN					10		-
1	POSED	COR TO	(AJE	NUMBER OF	2 CHEC	CK FEE						1.601	1
	PROP	NEW MOVE	ALTEI	R	3 OF 1	TOTAL				귀값	10		
		ADD L DEMOLISH	REPA		4 PLUS	ER FEE							
		RESIDENTIAL NON	-RESIDENTIAL	UNITS	PILIS								4
		I hereby acknowledge that I ha	ve read this a	application; that the inf	WAI	ER FEE							- 1
	1	formation given is correct; and that I am the owner, or the duly author- ized agent of the owner. I agree to comply with city and state laws reg- ulating construction; and in doing the work authorized thereby, no person will be employed in violation of the Labor Cade of the State of California			ATTEN			10	TAL FEES D		10		1
	٧				THIS PERMIT AUTHORIZES ONLY THE WORK NOTED INSPECTION DEPARTMENT			APPLICATION APPROVAL THIS PERMIT DOES NOT BECOME VALID UNTIL SIGNED BY THE DIRECTOR OF BUILDING IN- SPECTION, OR HIS DEPUTY, AND RESS ARE PAID, AND RECEIPT IS ACKNOWLEDGED IN SPACE PROVIDED. SIGNATURE OF DEPT. OF INSP. DEPUTY					
-		AGENT FOR											
	519												
	A												
				in in									
	A	looress		19 11	12			.10		n	0		
					18-34			DATE	UN	11	4ll	Lung	
		UNITY SANITATION DISTRICT	PRIVATE DIS	POSAL APPROVAL	and and	MILLION OF	10	6	0 1	- 1	100		
-	HE	ALTH BEPT. APPROVAL	a contraction of the other of the	HECK & APPROVED,	BAND	OF	a star	FORM	IN-288 (2-8	Automatic second to			
1			40 A	NUPERTOR	I OWIN P			1			1.035		

P	umbing and Gas PERMIT SEPARATE APPLICATION REQUIRED FOR EACH BUILDING.	PARCEL PERMIT NUMBER NUMBER	11468
	NAME (OR NAME OF BUSINESS) EUGENEA SHULAD	JOB ADDRESS 28 28 57 35 DE OFS 57 5.D	FEES
OWN.	MAILING ADDRESS (NUMBERI) 3530 3.8457. CITY SANDIEGO P75-8530	TYPE NO. BATHTUBS	AMOUNT
æ	HAME (IF NOT CONTRACTOR, SEE REVERSE SIDE) NO OF ITEM CHECKED ON REVERSE SIDE	DENTAL CUSPIDORS DISHWASHERS	
NTRACTOR	CITY TELEPHONE NUMBER	FLOOR DRAIN	
CONTR	SANDIEGO STATE LICENSE NUMBER CLASS NO. CITY LICENSE NUMBER	GARBAGE GRINDER GAS OUTLET (HSE)	
	HESIDENTIAL NO. OF	GAS OUTLET (TRAILER PARK) HOUSE SEWERS (NEW)	
ING	USE OF BLDG. THIN RESIDENTIAL LIVING UNITS:	INTERCEPTORS	
BUILDING	NEW CONSTRUCTION ADDITION TO EXISTING ALTERATION REPLACEMENT OF FIXTURES ONLY SEWERAGE DISPOSAL TO: NEW SEWER SEWER SEPTIC	LAWN SPRINKLER SYSTEM RECEPTORS	
th	I hereby acknowledge that I have read this application; that the formation given is correct; and that I am the owner, or the duly au-	SHOWER DRAINS SINKS-KITCHEN SINKS-OTHER	
regulating construction; and in doing the work authorized thereby, no person will be employed in violation of the Labor Code of the State of California relating to Workmen's Compensation Insurance. SIGNATURE (OWNER OR AGENT)		WASH BASINS	
AG	engen le Ahrer une 7 165	WASHING MACH. DRAIN WATER CLOSETS WATER HEATERS	
AD	DRE55:	WATER HEATERS	
NOTE: CONTRACTORS ARE AUTHORIZED TO CONSTRUCT ONLY WORK RECOGNIZED BY THE STATE CONTRACTORS LICENSE BOARD AS BEING WITHIN THEIR CLASSIFICATION.		GAS PIP+ ALTS : ISSUING PERMIT, GAS (NOT REFUNDABLE) ISSUING PERMIT, PLUMB(NOT REFUNDABLE)	200
	DR INSPECTION DEPT. USE ONLY.	ATTENTION SUB-TOTAL (SINGLE UNIT)	
	TYPE OF P.C. EASEMENT STREET	INSPECTION	an af transition of the second second
BI JC	UIL DING PERMIT AS HAS HAS HAS NOT EEN ISSUED AUTHORIZING STRUCTUAL WORK IN CONNECTION WITH THIS IN. SARGAR HILDING PERMIS HUMPER A 3322. RUILDING USE ZONE:	DEPARTMENT THIS PERMIT DOES NOT I UNTIL SIGNED BY THE BUILDING INSPECTION, ON AND PEES ARE PAID, A ACKNOWLEDGED IN SPACE SIGNATURE OF BEPT, OF IMPR. C	BECOME VALID DIRECTOR OF R HIS DEPUTY. NO RECEIPT IS PROVIDED.
	INSPECTOR	BAN DIEGO DATE - 9-65	-

.

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 6/24/2010

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/24/2010, to consider the historical designation of the **Winslow R. Parsons Spec House #1** (owned by Charles Dipietro, 3520 28th Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **3520 28th Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92104**, APN: **453-333-22-00**, further described as BLK 65 LOT 44/EXC ST/LOT 43 &/EXC ST/ in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Winslow R. Parsons Spec House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource which embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1916 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a wide front gable roof line that is low pitched with deep overhangs and exposed rafter tails, a full-width front porch with wood and masonry columns, a combination of wood fixed, casement, double hung and hopper windows, and wood shingle siding.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation excludes the 1965 non-historic garage at the rear of the parcel.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _

NINA FAIN Deputy City Attorney