



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 14, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-049

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of October 28, 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #6 – Henrietta Buckland House**

APPLICANT: Kevin, Kimberly & Frances Mathis represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 1522 Granada Avenue, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Henrietta Buckland House located at 1522 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Henrietta Buckland House located at 1522 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1911 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Prairie style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1911 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a hipped roof and hipped dormer; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails; wood lap siding; a full width porch with upper deck supported on large square posts; a brick chimney; and simple single pane and multi-lite wood frame and sash windows.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The house is a two story Prairie style home located in the South Park Addition and is surrounded by residential buildings and uses.

The historic name of the resource, the Henrietta Buckland House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and includes the name of Henrietta Buckland, who contracted with builder J.W. Stephens to construct the house as her personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The property located at 1522 Granada Avenue is a two story single family home built in 1911 in the Prairie style and features a hipped roof with asphalt shingles; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails; wood lap siding over wood framing; a brick chimney; and a concrete foundation. The front dormer is centered on the main façade and features a hipped roof, rafter tails, and three small 9-lite windows. The entry porch spans the full width of the front façade and is accessed toward the north end of the front façade via five tile covered entry steps. The porch and balcony above are supported by large square posts grouped in threes with decorative horizontal bracing. The balcony above features a wood railing with widely spaced and decoratively arranged balusters.

Fenestration consists of the original wood entry door with large central pane; a tri-partite window consisting of a fixed central pane with single-lite upper pane flanked by 1-over-1 double hung windows to the left of the entry door; a small leaded window to the right of the entry door; a pair of six-lite French doors at the balcony above; another tri-partite window configuration similar to the one found on the ground floor with casement windows instead of double-hung; and a large 1-over-1 double hung window. Remaining fenestration consists mainly of 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash windows. The garage at the rear is similar to the one seen in the historic photograph. While it is possible that it may have been enlarged or replaced at some point, there is no record of that in the permit history, and the Sanborn maps consistently show the same size garage from 1921 through 1956. Without documentation that the garage has been replaced, it will be presumed to be original and is included in the designation.

Modifications to the house include the addition of tile and wood hand rails at the entry steps, as well as painting of the brick chimney. When the report was initially submitted, the house was clad in asbestos shingles. Staff's position was that these shingles adversely impacted the integrity of the house, and asked the applicant to determine whether or not the original siding was intact

underneath. Examination proved that it was, and the applicant was asked to remove the non-historic asbestos shingle siding prior to proceeding with the nomination. The applicant agreed, and the restoration work is complete.

The Henrietta Buckland House at 1522 Granada Avenue exhibits the character defining features of the Prairie style and retains integrity to its 1911 date of construction. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

It should be noted that while the historic photos provided in the report reference “Dennis Charles Quayle, architect”, the applicant has not been able to confirm that Dennis Charles Quayle was the same person as Charles Quayle, who, together with his brother Edward have been established as Master Architects. Without evidence beyond the writing on the photograph, staff cannot confirm an association with one or more of the Quayle brothers and therefore cannot recommend designation under HRB Criterion D at this time.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Henrietta Buckland House located at 1522 Granada Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1911 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Prairie style and retains integrity to its period of significance. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachment(s): Draft Resolution
Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

DRAFT RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/28/10

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on **10/28/10**, to consider the historical designation of the **Henrietta Buckland House** (owned by Kevin, Kimberly & Frances Mathis) located at **1522 Granada Avenue, San Diego, CA 92102**, APN: **539-344-09-00**, further described as BLK 10 LOT 9 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **Henrietta Buckland House** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Prairie style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1911 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a hipped roof and hipped dormer; overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails; wood lap siding; a full width porch with upper deck supported on large square posts; a brick chimney; and simple single pane and multi-lite wood frame and sash windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: XXX

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney