



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 14, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-050

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of October 28, 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec. House #1**

APPLICANT: Thomas J. LePley represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

LOCATION: 4633 Edgeware Road, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District
3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec.
House #1 located at 4633 Edgeware Road as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec. House #1 located at 4633 Edgeware Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The second unit (4631 Edgeware Road) and garage located in the rear portion of the property were constructed in 1930 and are excluded from this designation due to substantial modifications. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style with Neoclassical influences. Specifically, the character defining features reflected in the design of the resource include the hipped or jerkin-head gables; the vertical attic slats in the gable apex; the symmetrical layout of the full height Classic portico with square fluted columns; the Craftsman style front door with beveled glass windows; and the paired tall and narrow casement windows.



BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located on the east side of Edgeware Road, one block south of Adams Avenue and one block east of the Kensington Community Park in a primarily single-family residential area within the Kensington Park Neighborhood of the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

The historic name of the resource, the William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec. House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the owners/builders, William and Mildred Schulenburg, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not under HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant's report states that the house is significant under HRB Criterion A as a resource that reflects the post World War I, 1922-1925 "Better Homes Movement" development. The information and analysis presented regarding the "Better Homes Movement" could be supportive of a district's eligibility under Criterion A if a significant portion of the district reflected the principles, styles and period of the "Better Homes Movement." However, there is no evidence that this particular building helped identify or represent the "Better Homes Movement" as an individual designation more than similar homes of the same style and architectural period. Therefore staff cannot recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Built in 1925, the one-story house embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style with Neoclassical influences. The house exhibits a full height porch with roof supported by Classical columns and includes traditional dentil detailing across the front. The jerkin-head hipped composition shingle roof extends moderately over the house with angle cut rafter tails and extended roof beams. Narrow horizontal clapboard siding surrounds the entire house. The central door exhibits a large opaque glass pane surrounded by ten small panes. The door is flanked by multi-lite, sidelight casement windows. The entry is flanked by a pair of multi-lite wood casement windows. Remaining fenestration consists of various wood-fixed windows

topped with rows of narrow panes and 1:1, wood double hung windows with flat wood surrounds.

No modifications to the front structure proposed to be designated (4633 Edgeware Road) appear to have occurred. There is a second unit located in the southeast corner of the property (4631 Edgeware Road) that was built in 1930 and is 774 square feet in size. This structure is an example of a Craftsman bungalow style of architecture with an existing front porch that was completely enclosed at an unspecified date. The enclosure of this porch has significantly impacted the overall integrity of this structure and staff has excluded this unit from the designation.

The architectural style of the garage at the northeast corner of the lot (directly behind 4633 Edgeware Road) matches the 1930 Craftsman style house. The garage measures 18 by 18-feet and is 324 square feet in size. It exhibits a low-pitched side gable roof with exposed rafter tails cut at a lesser angle than those on 4633 Edgeware Road. Single pane windows with flat surrounds illuminate the garage. There is a modern panel door leading into the garage from the back yard and it appears by the uneven gable and seam in the siding that the garage may have been extended. Because the garage was built at the same time as the rear unit in a different style than the main house, and because both the rear unit and garage have been modified, the garage shall be excluded from the designation as well.

The subject property embodies the character defining features of the Craftsman style with Neoclassical influences and retains integrity from its 1925 date of construction. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. Designation shall exclude the second unit and garage located in the rear portion of the property

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec. House #1 located at 4633 Edgeware Road with a period of significance of 1925 be designated under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the character defining features of the Craftsman style with Neoclassical influences and retains integrity. The second unit and garage constructed in 1930 and located in the rear portion of the property are excluded from this designation. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jeffrey E. Oakley
Associate Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JO/ks/cw

Attachment(s): Draft Resolution
Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

DRAFT RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 10/28/10

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on **10/28/10**, to consider the historical designation of the **William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec. House #1** (owned by Thomas Lepley) located at **4633 Edgeware Road, San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-664-11-00**, further described as BLK 23 LOT 10 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **William and Mildred Schulenburg Spec. House #1** on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style with Neoclassical influences. The house retains several character-defining features of the style and a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the character defining features reflected in the design of the resource include the hipped or jerkin-head gables; the vertical attic slats in the gable apex; the symmetrical layout of the full height Classic portico with square fluted columns; the Craftsman style front door with beveled glass windows; and the paired tall and narrow casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. This Designation shall exclude the second unit (4631 Edgeware Road) and garage; both constructed in 1930 and located in the rear portion of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: XXX

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney