



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 14, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-052

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board  
Agenda of October 28, 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – Julia French & George R. Metcalf House**

APPLICANT: Eli & Jaelyn Owre represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 3443 Elliott Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Julia French & George R. Metcalf House located at 3443 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Julia French & George R. Metcalf House located at 3443 Elliott Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the English Cottage Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource embodies character defining feature which include a steeply pitched side gable roof; open eaves and a narrow overhang, exposed rafters and decorative rake; narrow, rectangular diamond patterned windows; wood shiplap siding; and an arched front door with iron hinges.



City Planning & Community Investment  
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865  
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

## BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is located in a single family residential community and was constructed during the second phase of the Loma Portal development.

The historic name of the resource, the Julia French & George R. Metcalf House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of the first occupants, Julia French & George R. Metcalf, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

## ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

*CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property was built in 1920 and embodies the distinct characteristics of the English Cottage Eclectic style. The house features a steeply pitched side gabled roof, with an open eave with a narrow overhang and exposed rafters. Intricate detailing is found throughout the façades. Wood corbels support the decorative eave rake board which accentuates the side gable fascia.

The fenestration consists of elaborate diamond patterned windows in different shapes, styles and sizes. The windows are primarily wood framed, rectangular, multi-lite, fixed pane and casement styles. On the east and west elevation the upper level openings are covered with decorative window hoods. On the front façade the projecting fixed pane bay window is flanked by narrow casement style windows with diamond patterned transom sections that extend around the upper portion of the projection. Also a square shaped bay window projects out creating an interior sun room on the front façade. This appears to be part of the original design as shown in the 1921 Sanborn Map as an enclosed area. The original arched front door is decorated with iron hinge straps and a stained glass focal opening. The door is flanked by two narrow, rectangular multi-lite diamond patterned fixed openings.

At the entrance there is an enclosed porch area with a bench and is decorated with a tulip motif. A unique interior brick chimney is decorated with a double "X" motif and is located in the center of the roof. Located at the rear of the property is an original one car garage with a wood frame and doors is decorated with the identical tulip motif. A painted brick walkway and steps leads up to the front entryway.

Over time a few alterations have occurred to the original structure. In 1949 a second story was added. The second story projects out from the original roof plane on the rear of the structure. The rear of the house was also remodeled to provide ground floor access to the backyard through a sliding glass door. None of these alterations are visible from the public right of way. The owner provided information regarding the property's participation in the 2006 Quieter Home Program which led to the replacement of all the original rear windows, with vinyl double hung windows; the glazing on the picture bay window was replaced with laminated glass and interior storm windows were added to side facing openings. It appears that the roof on the square shaped bay window may have been altered by the addition of a ½" by 5" board, finishing the roof's edge. These alterations do not affect the overall integrity to the extent that the building is no longer eligible for designation.

The property embodies the distinctive characteristics of its original English Cottage Eclectic style with integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and feeling. Therefore staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

#### OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Julia French & George R. Metcalf House located at 3443 Elliott Street be designated with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



---

Terra King  
Planning Intern



---

Cathy Winterrowd  
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

TK/cw

Attachment(s): Draft Resolution  
Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

DRAFT RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A  
ADOPTED ON 10/28/10

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on **10/28/10**, to consider the historical designation of the **Julia French & George R. Metcalf House** (owned by Eli & Jaclyn Owre) located at **3443 Elliott Street, San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-102-02-00**, further described as BLK B LOT 2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **Julia French & George R. Metcalf House** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the English Cottage Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource embodies character defining feature which include a steeply pitched side gable roof; open eaves and a narrow overhang with exposed rafters and decorative rake; narrow, rectangular diamond patterned windows; wood shiplap siding; and an arched front door with iron hinges. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: XXX

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN LEMMO, Chair  
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND  
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,  
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_  
NINA FAIN  
Deputy City Attorney