



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: November 8, 2010 REPORT NO. HRB-10-053

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of November 19, 2010

SUBJECT: **ITEM #7 – Amendment to the Burlingame Historic District:
2405 Dulzura Ave**

APPLICANT: Peter Thomas and Katherine Hodges

LOCATION: 2405 Dulzura Avenue, North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the reclassification of the property located at 2405 Dulzura Avenue in the Burlingame Historic District from a Non-Contributing (6L) to a Contributing (5D1) resource and designation of the property under HRB Criterion F.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Reclassify the property located at 2405 Dulzura Avenue in the Burlingame Historic District from a Non-Contributing (6L) to a Contributing (5D1) resource and designate the property under HRB Criterion F. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource, as recently restored, conveys the significance of the designated Burlingame Historic District and was constructed within the district's 1912-1952 period of significance. Specifically, the resource conveys the district's significance under HRB Criterion C, as it embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic Architecture, including a flat roof; parapet; stucco walls; shed tile roofs; clay pipe vents; and wood frame and sash windows; and was constructed in 1924.



BACKGROUND

The Historical Resources Board designated the Burlingame Voluntary/Traditional Historic District on July 25, 2002. The District was designated with a period of significance of 1912-1952 under HRB Criterion A based on its unique development, architecture, site planning, and special scale and character derived from the curvilinear street pattern and rose-colored sidewalks; Criterion B for its association with historically significant individuals; Criterion C for its diverse mix of mostly pre-World War I through early post-World War II suburban residential architecture, with various architectural styles including Spanish Eclectic, Mission Revival, Spanish Colonial Revival, Craftsman, Prairie and Modern; and Criterion D for its association with Master Architects.

On November 29, 2007 the HRB amended the district type to a Geographic/Traditional Historic District, consistent with the requirements of the Board's adopted Historic District Policy. At this hearing, the Board reviewed all properties not previously volunteered by their owners for designation as well as all non-contributing properties, and took action to classify and designate all properties within the district as either contributing or non-contributing.

Contributing resources to a historic district are those that were constructed within the period of significance (1912-1952) and are good examples of architectural styles of the era. As part of the 2007 amendment process, contributing resources were given a California Historical Resource Status Code of 5D1.

In contrast, non-contributing resources to a historic district are sites that either were not built during the period of significance (1912-1952) or have undergone major modifications over time that have resulted in loss of historic fabric and integrity. As part of the 2007 amendment process, non-contributing resources were given a California Historical Resource Status Code of 6Z if built outside of the period of significance or heavily altered beyond possible restoration; or 6L if they were built within the period of significance and had modifications which could be reversed through restoration. The subject property at 2405 Dulzura Avenue was assigned a status code of 6L at the time of the district amendment.

ANALYSIS

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board to consider reclassifying the property located at 2405 Dulzura Avenue in the Burlingame Historic District from a Non-Contributing (6L) to a Contributing (5D1) resource and designate the property under HRB Criterion F. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The subject property located at 2405 Dulzura Avenue was classified as a non-contributor (6L) at the November 29, 2007 Historical Resources Board Hearing. This classification was a result of several modifications to the original structure. A major issue that led to a significant loss of integrity was the non-historic stone veneer around the front door and patio area. In addition, the structure had non-historic vinyl and aluminum windows and non-historic stucco texture for the Spanish Eclectic style and the period of significance of 1924.

In July of 2010, staff re-evaluated the property at the owner's request in order to prepare a restoration plan consistent with the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards. Since then the new owners have diligently begun the restoration process, reversing the alterations mentioned above.

The property is a one-story Spanish Eclectic style home built in 1924 and features a flat roof, parapet, and shed tile roofs over the entryway and side porch. On every elevation, clay pipe vents are present. As part of the restoration process, the non-historic stucco finish is being restored to the historically appropriate medium sand finish texture, which was found on a surviving sample of the original stucco underneath a board that was removed. Staff also approved the restoration plan for the windows, which was based on historic photos and evidence found in the surviving window frames once the non-historic windows were removed. Two original, small windows flanking the chimney that had been in-filled were discovered and will be restored as part of the restoration process. Generally, the fenestration throughout the house consists primarily of 1-over-1 double-hung and single pane casement wood frame and sash windows. On the front façade, the non-historic single, fixed pane window to the left of the entry has been removed and will be replaced with the historically appropriate fixed single pane flanked by narrower single panes, also fixed. The window to the right of the entry door was a single pane fixed window historically based on evidence in the window frame, and has been restored accordingly. On the Kalmia Street elevation, the single pane French doors and sidelites have been reconstructed. The tile roof overhang above was damaged and reconstructed using the original tiles. The restoration work has proceeded based on available documentation, both photographic and material, and with minimal speculation as to the appearance of the windows, per staff direction.

The restoration of the property with historically appropriate materials, finishes and details will result in a resource which reflects the architectural significance of the district. Therefore, Staff recommends reclassifying the property at 2405 Dulzura Avenue from a Non-Contributing (6L) to a Contributing (5D1) resource and designating the property under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 2405 Dulzura Avenue be designated as a contributing resource to the Burlingame

Historic District with a status code of 5D1 under HRB Criterion F. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/tk/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Historic Photos
2. DPR
3. Draft Resolution

**HISTORIC PHOTOS FOR
2405 DULZURA AVENUE**



1958: Photo shows original windows on interior side property line as 1:1 double hung



1949

Photo shows original windows on street side property line as 1:1 double hung and French doors as single pane with single pane sidelites.

PRIMARY RECORD

Other Listings _____
Review Code _____ Reviewer _____ Date _____

Page 1 of 2

* Resource Name or #: 2405 Dulzura Avenue, APN 539-042-07

P1. Other Identifier: _____

* P2. Location: Not for Publication Unrestricted a. County San Diego
b. USGS 7.5' Quad _____ Date _____ T _____; R _____; _____ 1/4 of _____ 1/4 of Sec _____; _____ B.M.
c. Address _____ City San Diego Zip 92104
d. UTM: (Give more than one for large and/or linear feature) Zone _____, _____ mE/ _____ mN
e. Other Locational Data: (e.g. parcel #, legal description, directions to resource, elevation, additional UTM's, etc. as app
Assessor's Parcel Number: 539-042-07; Legal Description: L7 BD TR1402/

* P3a. Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries.)
The house was constructed in 1924 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style and features a flat roof; shaped parapet; clay pipe vents; stucco walls over wood frame construction; and a concrete foundation. The house sits at the corner of Dulzura Avenue and Kalmia Street. The house fronts onto Dulzura Avenue and features an entry door with a stucco surround under a small shed clay tile roof. The entry door is centered and flanked by two large window openings: a large single pane, fixed wood frame window to the right and a tri-partite wood frame and sash window to the left consisting of a fixed central pane flanked by two narrower single lite fixed panes. The entry porch is accessed from the south and consists of a scored concrete pad enclosed by a low, shaped stucco wall. The Kalmia Street elevation features a stucco covered brick chimney flanked by two small single lite wood frame windows. To the right of the chimney, a small patio area is enclosed by a low stucco wall consistent with the entry. A pair of single lite wood frame French doors are flanked by single lite sidelites, all under a small shed tile roof. Other windows on the house are 1-over-1 double hung wood frame and sash and single lite wood frame and sash casement windows. Restoration work is ongoing and includes restoration and reconstruction of windows and stucco, as detailed in Section B.6.

* P3b. Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP2 Single family property

* P4. Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other (Isolates, etc.)

P5a. Photograph or Drawing (Photograph required for buildings, structures, and objects)



P5b. Description of Photo: (View, date, etc.)

View of the southwest corner.

Intersection of Kalmia and Dulzura

* P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources:

Prehistoric Historic Both

1924 San Diego Sewer Record

* P7. Owner and Address:

Peter Thomas & Katherine Hodges

2405 Dulzura Avenue

San Diego CA 92104

* P8. Recorded by: (Name, affiliation, address)

City of San Diego

City Planning & Community Investment

202 C Street MS 5A

San Diego CA 92101

* P9. Date Recorded: 11/8/2010

* P10. Survey Type: (Describe)

Burlingame Historic District

Intensive Survey

City of San Diego, 2001-2010

* P11. Report Citation: (Cite survey report/other sources or "none") Burlingame Historic District

Originally evaluated on 11/21/2001 as non-contributor due to alterations.

* Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record Artifact Record
 Photograph Record Other: (List) _____

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD

Page 2 of 2

* NRHP Status Code 5D1

* Resource Name or #: 2405 Dulzura Avenue, APN 539-042-07

B1. Historic Name: Burlingame Historic District Contributor

B2. Common Name _____

B3. Original Use: SF Residential

B4. Present Use: SF Residential

* B5. Architectural Style: Spanish Colonial Revival

* B6. Construction History: (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations.)

When evaluated in 2001, the house had alterations including replacement of the windows with vinyl; removal of two small fixed windows flanking the chimney; a historically inappropriate stucco texture; & a stone veneer. Recent restoration work has included removal of the stone veneer; replication of the original medium sand stucco finish; & replacement of vinyl windows with wood frame & sash windows in the original openings. Restoration was based on historic photos & investigation of the window frames to determine original configuration & operation.

* B7. Moved? No Yes Unknown Date _____ Original Location: _____

* B8. Related Features:

A detached garage original to the date of construction in located at the west end of the lot, fronting onto Kalmia Street. The house is located within the Burlingame Historic District.

B9a. Architect: Unknown

b. Builder: HW Farr

* B10. Significance: Theme Architecture Area San Diego

Period of Significance 1912-1952 Property Type Residential SF Applicable Criteria F

(Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as defined by theme, period, and geographic scope. Also address integrity.)

The Burlingame Historic District consists of some forty acres of land, originally developed in 1912, extending along San Marcos Street to the north, Kalmia Street to the south, 32nd Street to the east, and 30th Street to the west. The tract's architectural significance is expressed in its curvilinear street plan, which follows the area's natural contours. The original planners, Joseph McFadden and George Buxton, demarcated it with rose-colored sidewalks, the only such area in the City of San Diego to do so. Limited access to the tract at the time of its incorporation has left it with a quality of an integrated and separate development distinct from the surrounding community. The tract is a major example of an early twentieth century local experimental approach to real estate development utilizing a "team of specialists" to develop, market and deal exclusive real estate property. Its developers were extremely active in local real estate development during this time. Architectural control was maintained through the use of consulting architect, William H. Wheeler, and restrictive building covenants. Later on, these controls would be enforced through the watchdog efforts of Burlingame Women's Club, allegedly the earliest and oldest neighborhood organization in San Diego. Located within the tract is an eclectic mix of over two hundred unique and interesting houses, each a representation of pre-World War One suburban residential architecture; including Craftsman, Mission, Spanish Colonial and Pueblo Revivals, as well as Prairie School, Art Deco, Ranch, Colonial Revival and many other individual hybrid combinations of several styles.

B11. Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes): _____

* B12. References:

San Diego Water and Sewer Records

Historic photographs from the owner's private collection

McAlester & McAlester. "A Field Guide to American Houses". 1984.

B13. Remarks:

* B14. Evaluator: City San Diego Planning Staff

Date of Evaluation: 11/8/2010

(This space reserved for official comments.)

(Sketch map with north arrow required)



RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 11/19/2010

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/19/2010, to consider the historical designation of the **BURLINGAME HISTORIC DISTRICT CONTRIBUTOR** (owned by Katherine Hodges and Peter Thomas, 2405 Dulzura Avenue, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **2405 Dulzura Avenue, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **539-042-07-00**, further described as BLK D LOT 7 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 526-166**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Burlingame Historic District Contributor located at 2405 Dulzura Avenue on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION F as a resource that conveys the significance of the designated Burlingame Historic District and was constructed within the district's 1912-1952 period of significance. Specifically, the resource conveys the district's significance under HRB Criterion C, as it embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic Architecture, including a flat roof; parapet; stucco walls; shed tile roofs; clay pipe vents; and wood frame and sash windows; and was constructed in 1924. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the Burlingame District document, the DPR Forms, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 526-166**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
NINA FAIN
Deputy City Attorney