



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 11, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-017

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of March 24, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM #9 – 1856 Viking Way**

APPLICANT: Philip and Erin McConkey represented by Marie Burke Lia

LOCATION: 1856 Viking Way, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Paul and Charlotte Hutchinson Residence located at 1856 Viking Way as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 1856 Viking Way under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is a single-family residence constructed in the Spanish Eclectic style in 1931. The home is located in a low-density single family, residential community in the La Jolla Vista subdivision.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by K.A. Crawford for Marie Burke Lia, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff disagrees that the site is significant under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The house located at 1856 Viking Way was built in 1931 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The one and two story house has a stucco exterior, a low-pitched multi-level gable roof with red Spanish tile, exposed rafter tails, and a medium eave overhang. Exposed beam detailing is found on the underside of the second story portion of the structure, which cantilevers over the first floor. Clay attic vents are set in a triangular orientation beneath the gable-front roof planes. The structure has a concrete foundation with a partial basement, an asymmetrical façade, and an L-shaped floor plan. A large stucco wall surrounds the property; a wrought iron gate located on the front elevation gives access to the main entrance. The original fenestration consists primarily of wood framed, fixed and three-light casements, although a number of windows have been replaced with non-historic single light metal framed casements. On the front façade, there is a non-historic metal framed casement with a decorative swag relief above the opening. Decorative Spanish style metal grilles and operable wood shutters are present on some of the original windows. There are two chimneys, one is original, located on the front façade and the other was added as part of the rear addition. The alley accesses the two-car garage.

Revealed on the residential building record provided in the nomination report are a number of 1980's additions, which have substantially altered various character-defining elements of the structure's architectural integrity. In 1981, a significant first floor addition altered the front façade; a 14ft. X 12ft. area was constructed on the southeast corner, which modified the previous 7 ft. X 6.5ft. element. Originally, the garage was a detached two-car garage, however after several alterations the building is now one contiguous structure. In 1982, a maid's quarter and a side rear addition were added, which enclosed the space between the garage and the main structure. In the same year a pool was added at the rear of the property. Additionally in 1989, a bed and bath were constructed above the garage and 1982 addition. According to the 1926 SANBORN map updated in 1957, 1959, and 1962, the property has been significantly altered on the front and rear elevations. Moreover these modifications have public visibility on the east, south and north façades. A number of doors appear to have been replaced throughout the structure, including the front door, which was replaced with a non-historic wood door with a stain glass opening, not consistent with the Spanish Eclectic style. In addition, several windows were replaced, including the non-historic metal casement style windows with no divided lights on the front and north façades. Due to the expansion of the home, the Spanish tile roof appears to have been replaced with non-historic tile and the entire home appears to have been re-stuccoed to match the later additions. Cumulatively these alterations have negatively impacted the integrity of the original 1931 structure.

The modifications listed above are inconsistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the large addition, has altered the size and scale of the historic building, causing a loss of historic character and several of the alterations are visible to the public. Moreover, these alterations have negatively impacted the elements of integrity in relation to the design, materials, workmanship, and feeling. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

The nomination report provided information on Thomas Shepherd a master architect who is recognized for his prominent involvement in the architectural design of several Spanish style homes in La Jolla. The report mentioned that Shepherd might have designed the residence although the report does not supply any information that relates Shepherd to the design of the original structure. If perhaps, Thomas Sheppard designed the residence it no longer reflects the original design, due to several highly visible alterations and staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D.

OTHER CRITERIA


If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 1856 Viking Way not be designated under any HRB Criteria due to a cumulative loss of historic integrity. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Terra King
Planning Intern



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

TK/cw

Attachment: Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover