

# Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 12, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-028

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board

Agenda of April 26, 2012

SUBJECT: ITEM #10 – Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H. Salvers

Residence

APPLICANT: Owner represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 2626 Clove Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H.

Salyers Residence located at 2626 Clove Street as a historical resource.

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H. Salyers Residence located at 2626 Clove Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1937 under HRB Criteria C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- 1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Art Moderne and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1937 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features scored horizontal speed lines, asymmetrical façade, a flat roof with ledge, multi-paned casement windows, and a curved corner.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Charles H. Salyers and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource characterizes the Art Moderne style associated with Salyers. The smooth stucco with speed lines, curved walls, and horizontal balustrade is indicative of Salyers' use of the Art Moderne style.

## **BACKGROUND**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is located in the Loma Portal area of Point Loma in a predominantly single family neighborhood.

The historic name of the resource, the Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H. Salyers Residence has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Leslie and Isabel Smith who constructed the house as their personal residence and the name of Charles H. Salyers, a Master Architect.

# **ANALYSIS**

A historical resource research was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in 1937 in the Art Moderne architecture style, the house was built for Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith. The house features an asymmetrical façade with horizontal massing and a two tiered form. The first floor roofs with flat parapets serve as balcony areas accessed from the second floor. The second floor roof is a low pitched hip with plain coping and aluminum rain gutters. A two-story chimney with three horizontal bands is on the south elevation. The second story on each primary façade is set back onto a terrace that features metal pipe railings. Smooth stucco covers the exterior surface and features scored horizontal groove (speed) lines which help define the streamline "aerodynamic" trait of the style.

The front door is centrally located which is simply detailed with a round "porthole" window. A glass block window is located to the north. Each door with the exception of the front door feature a small built-in canopy called "fins." The front door is covered by the curvilinear second story porch.

A detached garage in a similar style is located on the south side of the house.

There have been few modifications to the house over the years. As part of the Quieter Home Program (QHP) the windows on the house were replaced. The steel casement windows on the first floor were replaced with dual pane, true divided light, aluminum casements and the wood windows on the second floor were replaced with the same material. The original plans indicate that the windows on the second floor were designed to be two-light casement windows, however when they were constructed they were made as three light casement windows. When the windows were replaced as part of QHP there appears to have been an issue with what was originally approved and what was actually installed. The windows that were installed were two-light casements contrary to what was original to the second floor of the house. The north side kitchen window was also replaced with a garden window. The property owners are in the process of installing an aluminum casement window to match the original design for this location. Regardless, of the modifications to the building the house continues to convey the historic significance of the Art Moderne style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style. Therefore, staff recommends designation under Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was designed by Charles H. Salyers, who served as development architectural designer for the Gibson City development. Born in 1900, Charles Salyers first arrived in San Diego at the age of nine. As a young man, he actively engaged in the local building industry, at which time he became skilled in the design and construction of private homes. In 1927, Salyers was hired as the development architectural designer for Gibson City, prior to becoming a licensed architect. This important commission provides insight into the early phase of his career, and demonstrates that he was already viewed as a skilled architectural designer. Seeking to advance his profession, he was granted an architect's license in 1932, and was thereafter recognized as a prolific residential designer. In 1935, he was selected to design the home of businessman Paul E. Stake which, to this day, serves as a rare and intriguing domestic interpretation of the Streamline Moderne style. It is for this home, HRB Site #356, that Salyers was established as a Master Architect.

Already an accomplished builder and architect, Salyers further expanded his repertoire through the pursuit of a career in public administration. In 1941, he was recruited by officials at the newly-founded County Surveyor's Office to serve as their first Chief Building Inspector. He relinquished his position in 1948, though, when Governor Earl Warren appointed him Chief of the State Division of Housing. After serving in this capacity for two years, he returned to his home in San Diego, where he proceeded to design and construct single-family homes.

Salyers retired from practice in 1966 – after a career that spanned nearly forty years – and spent his later years discreetly managing apartment complexes throughout the city. While he was no longer at the forefront of public affairs, he did earn a considerable degree of notoriety when, in an unprecedented move, he successfully relocated an entire apartment building from Point Loma to Golden Hill. He remained in San Diego until his death in 1974.

The subject house, designed by Salyers, is a notable example of his work in the Art Moderne style. As such, staff recommends designation of the subject property as under Criterion D.

# OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

## **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H. Salyers Residence located at 2626 Clove Street be designated with a period of significance of 1937 under HRB Criterion C as a Art Moderne style architecture and Criterion D as a notable example of Master Architect Charles H. Salyers. Specifically, the resource contains scored horizontal speed lines, asymmetrical façade, flat roof with ledge, multipaned casement windows, and a curved corner. Designation brings with it the responsibility of

maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner Cathy Winterrowd

Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

JB/cw

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 4/26/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/26/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H. Salyers Residence** located at **2626 Clove Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92106**, APN: **450-101-04-00**, further described as BLK A LOT 4 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

## NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Leslie R. and Isabel M. Smith/Charles H. Salyers Residence on the following findings:

- (1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of Art Moderne style architecture and retains a good level of integrity from its 1937 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features scored horizontal speed lines, asymmetrical façade, flat roof with ledge, multi-paned casement windows, and a curved corner. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.
- (2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Architect Charles Salyers and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource characterizes the Art Moderne style associated with Salyers. The smooth stucco with speed lines, curved walls, and horizontal balustrade is indicative of Salyers' use of the Art Moderne style. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A	
	BY:
	JOHN LEMMO, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED AS TO FORM AND	
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH	I, BY:
CITY ATTORNEY	KEITH BAUERLE
	Deputy City Attorney