



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 12, 2012 REPORT NO. HRB-12-030

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of April 26, 2012

SUBJECT: **ITEM #12 – Josh Delvalle House**

APPLICANT: Owner, represented by Marie Burke Lia

LOCATION: 1535 28th Street, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Josh Delvalle House located at 1535 28th Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Josh Delvalle House located at 1535 28th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 142 square foot first floor addition constructed in 2011. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Italianate architecture and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a flat roof; a prominent, dentiled cornice; lightly textured stucco walls; raised stucco columns with simple capitals at the building corners; a symmetrical front façade with a centered, rounded porch supported on two full and two half columns and topped by a decorative dentiled cornice with turned balustrade at the balcony level; a full-width porch and flared entry stair framed with the same turned balustrades; and fenestration consisting of 12-lite French doors, paired single lite casement windows under 8-lite uppers, a wood entry door with beveled glass inset, large fixed pane windows with 12-lite uppers, and 1-over-1 double hung windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The building is a two story house facing the east side of Balboa Park in the residential subdivision of South Park Addition.

The historic name of the resource, the Josh Delvalle House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the owner who constructed the house as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research report was prepared by Kathleen Crawford of the Office of Marie Burke Lia, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion A. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The applicant's report states that the subject property is significant under HRB Criterion A as a resource that exemplifies special elements of the City's historical development, reflecting streetcar suburb development in San Diego. However, there is no documentation in the report to indicate that the subject property reflects streetcar suburb development or development in the South Park Addition to any greater extent than other homes in the neighborhood. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject house located at 1535 28th Street is a two story single family home constructed in 1913 in the Italianate style, and features a flat roof; a prominent, dentiled cornice; lightly textured stucco walls over wood frame construction; raised stucco columns with simple capitals at the building corners; and a concrete foundation. The front façade is symmetrical and features a centered, rounded porch supported on two full and two half columns. The porch is topped by a decorative dentiled cornice and turned balustrade at the balcony level. The same turned balustrades frame the first full-width porch and flared entry stair. Fenestration on the front façade consists of 12-lite French doors at the second floor balcony flanked by paired single lite casement windows under 8-lite uppers, and a wood entry door with beveled glass inset flanked by large fixed pane windows with 12-lite uppers. Remaining fenestration consists of 1-over-1 double hung windows.

Modifications occurred primarily in 2011 and included restuccoing the house with a light sand finish; replacing the existing heavily deteriorated wood windows with custom-fabricated replicas; reconstruction of the heavily deteriorated balustrade; and construction of a 142 square foot addition at the rear. These improvements were reviewed by historic resources staff and determined to be consistent with the Standards.

The Josh Delvalle House continues to convey the historic significance of the Italianate style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Josh Delvalle House located at 1535 28th Street be designated under HRB Criterion C as a resource that conveys the historic significance of the Italianate style by embodying the characteristics associated with the style and retaining integrity to the 1913 date of construction. The designation excludes the 142 square foot first floor addition constructed in 2011. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

KS/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 4/26/2012

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/26/2012, to consider the historical designation of the **Josh Delvalle House** located at **1535 28th Street, San Diego, CA 92102**, APN: **539-344-02-00**, further described as BLK 10 LOT 2 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Josh Delvalle House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Italianate architecture and retains integrity to its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a flat roof; a prominent, dentiled cornice; lightly textured stucco walls; raised stucco columns with simple capitals at the building corners; a symmetrical front façade with a centered, rounded porch supported on two full and two half columns and topped by a decorative dentiled cornice with turned balustrade at the balcony level; a full-width porch and flared entry stair framed with the same turned balustrades; and fenestration consisting of 12-lite French doors, paired single lite casement windows under 8-lite uppers, a wood entry door with beveled glass inset, large fixed pane windows with 12-lite uppers, and 1-over-1 double hung windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**. The designation excludes the 142 square foot first floor addition constructed in 2011.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
JOHN LEMMO, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND
LEGALITY: JAN I. GOLDSMITH,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
KEITH BAUERLE
Deputy City Attorney