

CITY OF SAN DIEGO
M E M O R A N D U M

DATE: April 14, 2011
TO: Historical Resources Board
FROM: Jodie Brown, AICP, Senior Planner
SUBJECT: **ITEM 6 — 2335 Juan Street**

This item was continued from the January 28, 2011 Historical Resources Board hearing at the Board's recommendation to allow the applicant to request docketing on the Design Assistance Subcommittee's agenda to discuss alterations not in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. At this time, the applicant has failed to request to be placed on the Design Assistance Subcommittee's agenda. Additionally, no supplemental information has been provided to staff.

The recommendation from the Staff Report dated January 14, 2011 remains unchanged:

Do not designate the property located at 2335 Juan Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 14, 2011 REPORT NO. HRB-11-003

ATTENTION: Historical Resources Board
Agenda of January 28, 2011

SUBJECT: **ITEM #5 – 2235 Juan Street**

APPLICANT: Mikhail Family Trust; represented by Heritage Architecture and Planning

LOCATION: 2335 Juan Street; Uptown Community, Council District 2

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the 2335 Juan Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 2335 Juan Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The house at 2335 Juan Street is a single family home that was originally constructed in 1930 for Gordon Eby, the original property owner. The house was constructed in the Spanish Eclectic style.



City Planning & Community Investment
202 C Street, MS 5A • San Diego, CA 92101-3865
Tel (619) 235-5200 Fax (619) 533-5951

ANALYSIS

A historical resource research was prepared by Heritage Architecture and Planning, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff does not concur that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The two story Spanish Eclectic style house was constructed in 1930. The single family residence is located in the Mission Hills area above Old Town. The house is constructed with smooth stucco walls and a low-medium pitched hipped roof sheathed in clay tile that has shallow eaves. The central section of the house, where the front door is located, protrudes between each wing of the house. The front door is centrally located with a decorative frieze above a recessed six-paneled wood door. A tripartite window is located above the front door. The window features an exterior wrought iron curtain rod that originally held a curtain.

The left side of the main façade features an original pair of 3-light French doors on the first floor. The French doors are located behind the original wrought iron grilles. The second floor features a similar pair of French doors with a Juliette balcony. The balcony has a simple wrought iron railing. To the left of the French doors is a tripartite window.

The right side of the main façade features a pair of original French doors with a wrought iron grille on the first floor. To the right of the French doors is a non historic metal-clad slider window. The second floor features a pair of non historic metal-clad casement windows above the French doors. The area above the French doors is cantilevered with decorative corbels. To the right of the pair windows are two single casements on an addition.

The addition was completed in the 1960s and created a second story mass where there was originally an open deck. The deck was accessed by a door at the northeast corner with two windows overlooking the area. When the deck was enclosed the hipped roof was extended to cover the new addition. This new elevation consists of a non-historic metal-clad casement window and a non-historic wood door. The chimney that was clearly visible in the historic photo prior to the construction of the addition no longer has any visibility from the front of the house. Historically, the deck was accessed on the outside via concrete steps with a stuccoed balustrade. Based on the 1956 Sanborn map, it does not appear that the staircase connected to the garage. In its current configuration, not only does the staircase connect to the garage, the area below the staircase has been enclosed to create a room. This small room features a door and sliding windows on both sides.

The west (rear) elevation of the house consists of a number of large fixed, tripartite casement, and hopper windows. The windows are a mixture of metal-clad and wood. The chimney that is no longer visible from the front of the house is visible on this elevation. An addition of 686 sq. ft. was added to the rear of the house, which eliminated a porch at the southwest corner (shown

on the 1956 Sanborn). The addition has two-stories with a hipped roof. A small covered porch with arched columns is located on the first floor of the west side.

The southwest portion of the house features the two-story addition and the historic portion of the house is at the southeast corner. The new portion of the house protrudes approximately one foot. Based on the 1956 Sanborn map it appears that a rear porch area was eliminated to accommodate the rear addition. The addition that was originally constructed in the 1960s was remodeled in 2005 to reflect the original Spanish Eclectic design of the house.

Although it is not reflected in the 1945 historic photo or the 1956 Sanborn map, it appears that there may have been an open porch or a sleeping porch on the second floor at the southeast corner. The south side window has a recessed area above the window, which gives the appearance that the area was originally open. The recessed area has the look of a beam with corbels, typically found on balconies, which was stuccoed and enclosed with windows.

The two-story garage is located at the northwest corner of the property. The second level cantilevers over the parking bays with decorative corbels. The bays are separated by a square post with corbels. The hipped roof is sheathed with clay tiles to match the main house. The windows on the building are a mixture of aluminum single hung and sliders with a wood casement window on the rear. Metal sectional garage doors have replaced the original wood nine paneled tilt-up doors.

The property owner is also proposing to designate portions of the interior of the house, which includes: all of the original panel doors, decorative rafters, corbels and niches, the original tile and the interior stairway leading to the second floor, the entire shotgun hallway, including the sitting room on the west and the dining room. These areas contain many of the original elements of the house.

Staff has several concerns relating to the integrity of this residence. The property has had numerous modifications that have adversely impacted the historic character of the house. The open deck that was located on the north portion of the house was eliminated and enclosed for a second story addition. The addition altered the appearance of the house and was remodeled to match the historic characteristics of the house. The addition is seamless with the original portion of the house and provides no distinction contrary to the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The large addition at the rear, while not visible from the main façade, was also designed in a manner to emulate the house with no distinction between new and old.

The area between the main house and the garage was also enclosed with a first story addition and a connecting stairway. The addition creates a long, linear house contrary to the open space that was previously present and allowed views of the bay area beyond the house.

While it is not shown in the 1945 historic photo or the 1956 Sanborn, staff also has concerns about the second floor southeast (front) corner of the house. Based on the remaining evidence around the windows, it appears that this area may have originally been an open or a sleeping porch that was enclosed.

The house originally had two and three-light wood casement windows which have been removed and replaced with metal-clad and vinyl sliders and casement windows. The few remaining wood windows have also had muntins removed. In a number of instances the operation of the windows has also been altered (i.e. from casement to single hung). It appears that all of the windows feature heavy scarring in the surrounding stucco which leads to questions on whether the original opening was also altered. The decorative shutters that are present in the historic photo have also been removed from the house.

Additionally, the original 9-panel wood garage doors were replaced with metal sectional garage doors that significantly alter the appearance of the garage.

The consultant also contends that the residence was designed by Richard Requa. This contention is based on the design of the exterior of the home and the similarity of the interior stenciling to the Requa's 1935 remodel of the House of Hospitality in Balboa Park. There are no documents available to substantiate this claim. Given the number of alterations that have taken place on the house, if the property were designed by Requa, the original design intent has been significantly and negatively impacted.

Based on the numerous alterations, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended to not designate the house at 2335 Juan Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criterion. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.



Jodie Brown, AICP
Senior Planner



Cathy Winterrowd
Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

jb/cw

Attachment(s):

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover