

CITY OF SAN DIEGO
M E M O R A N D U M

DATE: February 17, 2011

TO: Historical Resources Board and Interested Parties

FROM: Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner/HRB Liaison

SUBJECT: **ITEM 11– AMENDMENT TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD GUIDELINES FOR THE APPLICATION OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD DESIGNATION CRITERIA; HRB AGENDA FOR FEBRUARY 24, 2011**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board as a result of recent discussions at a Board meeting related to the implementation of Criterion D. The issue is whether staff and Boardmembers were evaluating the work of a Master as a notable work of the Master or as representing the notable work of the Master. In reviewing the criterion language, it became clear that a resource designed or built by a Master should be evaluated as representing the notable work of that Master. Clarification through an amendment to the Historical Resources Board Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria is being proposed to address the issue. A revised ~~strikeout~~/underline version of the proposed clarification was presented to the HRB Policy Subcommittee on February 14, 2011 and is attached to this memo. The proposed amendment to the adopted designation guidelines reflects the Policy Subcommittee's recommendation.

Staff recommends that the HRB approve the proposed amendment to the Historical Resources Board Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria. If approved, the revised guidelines will be finalized without the ~~strikeout~~/underline format and will be posted to the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic.



Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
HRB Liaison

Attachment: Proposed Revisions to the Historical Resources Board Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria

CRITERION D:

Is representative of the notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

UNDERSTANDING CRITERION D

A resource associated with the work of a master refers to the technical or aesthetic achievements of a builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman. A master is a figure of generally recognized greatness in a field, a known craftsman of consummate skill, or an anonymous craftsman whose work is distinguishable from others by its characteristic style and quality.

APPLYING CRITERION D

A resource must express a particular phase in the development of the master's career, an aspect of his/her work, or a particular idea or theme in the craft. The work of an unidentified craftsman is eligible if it rises above the level of workmanship of the other properties encompassed by the historic context.

ASPECTS OF CRITERION D

Is the resource notable as the work of a master? Is the master a:

- Builder
- Designer
- Architect
- Engineer
- Landscape Architect
- Interior Designer
- Artist
- Craftsman

RESOURCES NOT ELIGIBLE UNDER CRITERION D

The property is not eligible under Criterion D simply because it was designed by a prominent architect, builder, etc. but rather must be the work of a master. Additionally, not all examples of a Master's work are eligible. Criterion D requires ~~that~~ the resource be representative of the a notable work of the Master, ~~and that must be clearly~~ demonstrated in the nomination.

HOW SIGNIFICANCE MAY BE ESTABLISHED

The work of a Master may be established by a combination of one or more of the following:

- The scope and excellence of their overall body of work, as it is understood.
- Quality of design and detailing excellence.

- The use of new or traditional materials in a new way resulting in a special or unique design expression.
- Special attention to work while under construction, basing much of the design refinements on field work and experience.
- Publication in trade journals and/or the popular press.
- Publication in scholarly journal articles or books.
- Being the subject of Master's thesis or Doctoral dissertations.
- Acknowledgement by design peers through formal awards and citations.
- Acknowledgement by the general public through formal awards, citations and commendations.
- Favorable reviews by professional architectural critics.

The association with the Master must be substantiated through one or more of the following:

- Construction drawing documentation.
- Specific written accounts describing the individual's association and work on the property.
- Archival information.
- Design and quality of detailing comparable with other works by the Master, supplemented by documented information establishing the Master's association with the property, and experts on the work of this Master agreeing that the resource in question is the work of this Master.

The Historical Resources Board has established well over 50 Master Architects and over 25 Master Builders. A complete list of all Masters is available by contacting Historical Resources staff. Examples include: