



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

**CONSOLIDATED PLAN ADVISORY BOARD
NOTES FOR WORKSHOP MEETING**

WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 11, 2013

SAN DIEGO CIVIC CONCOURSE
SILVER ROOM
202 'C' STREET
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT	BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT
William Moore, Council District 1, Chair Vicki Granowitz, Council District 3, Vice Chair Robert McNamara, Council District 6 Aaron Friberg, Council District 8	Not Applicable

STAFF PRESENT	ATTENDANCE SHEET
Amy Gowan, Assistant Deputy Director, Economic Development Ulysses Panganiban, Project Manager, CDBG Michele St. Bernard, Fair Housing & Stimulus Programs Connie Vestal, Account Clerk, CDBG Lydia Goularte, Fiscal Unit Project Manager, CDBG Sima Thakkar, HUD Programs Manager, Economic Development Elianna Barreiros, Policy Coordinator, CDBG Shirley Reid, Fiscal Analyst, CDBG	36 people signed the attendance sheet

Call to Order

- Chair Moore called the workshop meeting to order at 9:06 a.m. with four Board members present. Quorum was not achieved, and no actions were taken during the meeting.

Staff Announcements

- Sima Thakkar was introduced as the new HUD Programs Administration Program Manager. She will oversee the implementation of the City's HUD-funded programs covered by the Consolidated Plan. Ms. Thakkar brings extensive experience with HUD programs, including CDBG, HOME, HOPWA, and ESG.
- Eliana Barreiros provided an overview of HUD approvals, workshop agenda handouts, and pending funds for reprogramming for FY 2013. Ms. Barreiros announced that Ulysses Panganiban, CDBG Project Manager, had accepted a promotional position within the City and will no longer be with the CDBG program.
- Mr. Moore asked staff for an update on the reprogramming of funds discussed at the August 14, 2013 meeting. Staff had no update at the time but would continue to recommend that remaining Public Services funds be utilized to backfill the effects of sequestration on ESG and the homeless shelter programs. Staff will continue to look at potential City CIP projects to invest in.

Board Announcements

- Mr. Moore announced the official resignation of Board member Morrison. Quorum cannot be achieved with just the remaining four board members and, therefore, the Board does not have the power to review applications and make recommendations. The Interim Mayor does not have the power to appoint new board members. The CPAB is discussing with City Council members the possibility of appointing new members prior to the election of a new mayor.
- Ms. Granowitz asked if there were any potential candidates to be appointed to the Board. Mr. Moore responded that his understanding was that there were three candidate applications waiting for appointment decisions.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

- Sherry Brooks, of Civic San Diego, commented on prioritizing redevelopment funds. Ms. Brooks stated that \$78 million dollars was being paid by the former Redevelopment Agency to the CDBG program. Ms. Brooks requested that the funds be invested in capital projects in the project areas of the former Redevelopment Agency that they were originally intended for, as those areas did not have the resources required for many of the needed public projects. Mr. McNamara responded that he recently heard that the State was attempting to call back over \$3 million of FY 2012 redevelopment funds, which, if done successfully, would jeopardize the remaining former redevelopment funds.
- Ms. Gowan introduced Bill Fulton as the City's new Director of Planning. Mr. Fulton took the podium and introduced himself.

Discussion Items

- Item 5a – Draft Fiscal Year 2013 CAPER Staff Report: Staff provided an overview of the FY 2013 CAPER Report. The CAPER provides an evaluation on how funds were spent during the reporting period and the beneficiaries of the community development, social services, and housing activities undertaken. Staff outlined the FY 2013 expenditures of CDBG, HOME, ESG, and HOPWA. A breakdown of the progress towards achieving the Consolidated Plan Goals was given. Examples of some of the FY 2013 highlights were provided. The public was also informed of how to send comments via e-mail and how to comment via Survey Monkey.

The following persons commented on this item:

- Mr. McNamara asked staff why the “% Range of 5-Year Indicator Targets Met as of FY 2013” on slide 4 of the presentation varied so much between goals. Mr. Panganiban responded that some indicators were not measured numerically in the CAPER, resulting in the wide variances. Ms. Barreiros clarified further that each project within each goal has different proposed and actual outcomes. It is each of these outcomes that are factored into the “% Range of 5-Year Indicator Targets Met as of FY 2013,” creating a wide variance in percentages.
 - Mr. McNamara encouraged all sub-recipient agencies to review their respective project tables and the figures within to ensure correct reporting.
 - Ms. Granowitz felt the numbers reported on slide 4 of the presentation showing “% Range of 5-Year Indicator Targets Met as of FY 2013” were meaningless as listed. Ms. Barreiros responded that the numbers were displayed in a HUD-requested format.
 - Ms. Granowitz referred to page 3 of the CAPER Executive Summary questioning the reference to funds used for gang prevention and intervention services. Ms. Barreiros responded that the City is required to report on other programs that do not receive direct CDBG funds, but are used to “leverage” HUD funds. The gang services in question are an example of how HUD funds are being leveraged by the City.
 - Ms. Granowitz asked if the Density Bonus Program described in the CAPER was the same as the Density Bonus Program with the Planning Department. Ms. Barreiros replied that it was the same. Ms. Granowitz followed up by stating that the program “need[ed] more teeth”.
- Item 5b – Review and Discussion of Current Consolidated Plan Goals: Ms. Gowan referenced a flow chart and gave a review of the six phases of the Consolidated Planning process provided by HUD. Staff has been conducting Phase I over the past few months; however, not enough progress has been made to propose new goals or modify the

existing ones. Additionally, the City is in the final year of the current Consolidated Plan while trying to craft the new Consolidated Plan that will guide the next five (5) years; applications are being revised for the next fiscal year; and the scoring criteria are being reviewed and revised. Staff recommended continuing to utilize the existing goals with a reprioritization for FY 2015.

Ms. Barreiros reiterated that comments are always welcome from the public. Ms. Barreiros then provided an overview of economic events of the past decade in the United States with a focus on San Diego. She emphasized how poverty measures are set nationwide and do not reflect the cost of living differences that exist throughout the country. Ms. Barreiros then provided a brief overview of San Diego general economic characteristics on a geographic basis, including poverty levels.

Michele St. Bernard gave an update on the need for programs and services that provide homes within reach for the low-income populations of San Diego. Ms. St. Bernard provided a definition of affordable housing: when housing expenses plus utilities cost no more than 30–35 percent of total household income. Ms. St. Bernard discussed the Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA), which forecasts the needs for affordable housing within the region for low- and very low-income households over an 11-year time period. The 2010–2020 assessment projected the need for 38,680 units for very low- and low-income households. The City is currently meeting the need of about 23 percent of the very low-income and 20 percent of the low-income housing needs. At this rate the City will have a shortfall of an estimated 14,685 units over the assessment period.

Ms. St. Bernard also presented on 5,733 individuals or homeless persons identified by the Regional Taskforce on the Homeless within the City of San Diego during 2013. Of those, 3,115 were counted as unsheltered, with the remaining individuals temporarily sheltered through some means including emergency shelters and couch surfing. Ms. St. Bernard identified some of the funding sources for shelters.

Ms. St. Bernard reviewed the First-Time Homebuyer Program, stating a low-inventory combined with rising interest rates is pricing many potential homebuyers out of the market.

The following persons commented on this item:

- Mr. Moore asked what was the legal basis and HUD's position on reusing previous goals. Ms. Gowan responded that staff is corresponding with HUD and feels that reusing the goals is currently the most appropriate approach at this time.
- Mr. Moore asked if a timeline is established to reprioritize the goals and also asked if HUD will approve reusing the goals. Ms. Gowan responded that each

Council Office will be asked to reprioritize goals, and all of the responses would be aggregated.

- Mr. McNamara recommended that the CPAB use FY 2014 goals for FY 2015 applications. Mr. McNamara identified the goals and FY 2014 priorities for the record, "Goal 1, Priority 8; 2, 3A; 3, 3B; 4, 6A; 5, 6B; 6, 7; 7, 4; 8, 5A; 9, 1; 10, 2; 11, 9; 12, 6C; and 13, 5B."
- Public comment from Joe Zilvinskis, of Interfaith Shelter Network, echoed statements from Ms. St. Bernard's presentation, including "65 percent of the homeless population in San Diego remains unsheltered." Mr. Zilvinskis believes homelessness should be made a higher priority, as well as affordable housing. Additionally, Mr. Zilvinskis felt that, when there is a tie between applications, the homeless applications should not be scored lower.
- Public comment from Tara Jones, of National Women's Veterans Association of America, agreed with the comment from Mr. Zilvinskis in that homelessness is a major issue in San Diego. Ms. Jones commented that San Diego is home to the largest population of homeless female veterans in the United States. Ms. Jones stated that a recent report by the Department of Defense revealed that a large number of the victims of military sexual assaults contracted HIV as a result of their sexual assault.
- Mr. Moore followed up with a response on the process of ranking goals for FY 2013, saying that it was done in light of the progress made on the Consolidated Plan goals over the last five years. Goals that had less progress made were ranked higher, and those with more progress made were ranked lower. Mr. Moore did not feel that the rankings made last year are appropriate for this year. However, without quorum, no formal recommendation can be made by the CPAB.
- Ms. Granowitz spoke to the process of ranking goals for FY 2013, stating that job creation was ranked high because it attempted to solve a permanent problem, rather than provide more housing, which she said does not get at the root of the problem.

Ms. Gowan concluded with an overview of the information to be presented at the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services (PS&NS) Committee meeting on Wednesday September 18, 2013 at 1:00 p.m. Information will include: the new two-phase application process; a discussion on reviewing the scoring criteria; and staff thoughts on the goals. The presentation is meant to inform PS&NS and the public where CDBG stands and what the next steps will be.

- Next Meeting:
 - The next CPAB meeting will be held on October 9, 2013.

Additional Action Items

- No action was taken due to lack of quorum.

Adjournment

- Meeting adjourned 10:22 a.m.

REFERENCE ONLY