

---

## OFFICE OF THE INDEPENDENT BUDGET ANALYST REPORT

---

**Date Issued:** February 2, 2009

**IBA Report Number:** 09-06

**Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee Date:** February 4, 2009

**Item Number:** 3

---

# Library Attendance and Circulation Data

## OVERVIEW

The purpose of this report is to provide the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee with additional data and information on San Diego Library circulation and attendance to facilitate discussions at its upcoming Committee meeting.

During the First Quarter budget reduction process, our office raised issues regarding the approach and data used to determine the proposed library closures. Recommendations for the closures of seven branch libraries were described as being based on lower attendance figures, and proximity to other branches, with one branch designated for closure in each Council District, with the exception of Council District 8.

Because of this, the IBA requested information from the Library Department during the budget reduction process and analyzed circulation and attendance data for FY 2008. After consultation with various library professionals, including staff from professional public library associations and librarians from comparable library institutions, the IBA organized data in total, as well as on a per square footage and per visitor basis to provide for alternative comparisons of facility usage on both a system-wide and council district-specific basis.

The following tables have been provided for your reference:

1. Attendance – Citywide
2. Attendance – By Council District
3. Attendance per Square Foot – Citywide
4. Attendance per Square Foot – By Council District
5. Circulation – Citywide
6. Circulation – By Council District
7. Circulation per Square Foot – Citywide
8. Circulation per Square Foot – By Council District
9. Circulation per Visitor – Citywide
10. Circulation per Visitor – By Council District

## Branch Library Attendance

The table below illustrates total attendance at each of the 35 branch libraries for FY 2008, in descending order.

Table 1

<b>ATTENDANCE - ALL BRANCHES</b>		
<b>Council District</b>	<b>Facility</b>	<b>FY 2008</b>
		<b>Attendance</b>
5	Mira Mesa	289,600
1	La Jolla/Riford	274,961
1	Carmel Valley	267,801
5	Rancho Bernardo	266,814
2	Point Loma/Hervey	238,839
1	Rancho Penasquitos	235,428
2	Pacific Beach/Taylor	233,062
6	Mission Valley	230,074
3	City Heights/Weingart	218,710
6	Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	199,545
4	Valencia Park/Malcolm X	198,863
<i>1</i>	<i>University Community</i>	<i>193,596</i>
7	San Carlos	162,253
<i>4</i>	<i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i>	<i>161,166</i>
<i>5</i>	<i>Carmel Mountain</i>	<i>158,804</i>
3	North Park	156,200
7	College-Rolando	153,333
8	Otay Mesa-Nestor	149,288
1	North University Community	139,016
7	Tierrasanta	136,711
6	Linda Vista	136,034
4	Oak Park	133,378
4	Skyline Hills	130,183
6	North Clairemont	129,503
<i>3</i>	<i>University Heights</i>	<i>125,645</i>
2	Mission Hills	125,212
8	Logan Heights	109,916
<i>2</i>	<i>Ocean Beach</i>	<i>106,328</i>
6	Balboa	105,851
3	Kensington-Normal Heights	97,081
4	Paradise Hills	93,889
5	Scripps Miramar Ranch	93,540
<i>6</i>	<i>Clairemont</i>	<i>83,828</i>
<i>7</i>	<i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i>	<i>73,660</i>
8	San Ysidro	62,556
<b>AVERAGE BRANCH ATTENDANCE</b>		<b>162,019</b>
<b>TOTAL ATTENDANCE</b>		<b>5,670,668</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The table below shows total attendance at each of the 35 branch libraries broken out by council district, in descending order.

Table 2

<b>ATTENDANCE - BY DISTRICT</b>	
<b>Facility</b>	<b>FY 2008 Attendance</b>
<b>Council District 1</b>	
La Jolla/Riford	274,961
Carmel Valley	267,801
Rancho Penasquitos	235,428
<i>University Community</i>	<i>193,596</i>
North University Community	139,016
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,110,802</b>
<b>Council District 2</b>	
Point Loma/Hervey	238,839
Pacific Beach/Taylor	233,062
Mission Hills	125,212
<i>Ocean Beach</i>	<i>106,328</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>703,441</b>
<b>Council District 3</b>	
City Heights/Weingart	218,710
North Park	156,200
<i>University Heights</i>	<i>125,645</i>
Kensington-Normal Heights	97,081
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>597,636</b>
<b>Council Distict 4</b>	
Valencia Park/Malcolm X	198,863
<i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i>	<i>161,166</i>
Oak Park	133,378
Skyline Hills	130,183
Paradise Hills	93,889
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>717,479</b>
<b>Council Distict 5</b>	
Mira Mesa	289,600
Rancho Bernardo	266,814
<i>Carmel Mountain</i>	<i>158,804</i>
Scripps Miramar Ranch	93,540
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>808,758</b>
<b>Council Distict 6</b>	
Mission Valley	230,074
Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	199,545
Linda Vista	136,034
North Clairemont	129,503
Balboa	105,851
<i>Clairemont</i>	<i>83,828</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>884,835</b>
<b>Council Distict 7</b>	
San Carlos	162,253
College-Rolando	153,333
Tierrasanta	136,711
<i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i>	<i>73,660</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>525,957</b>
<b>Council Distict 8</b>	
Otay Mesa-Nestor	149,288
Logan Heights	109,916
San Ysidro	62,556
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>321,760</b>
<b>AVERAGE BRANCH ATTENDANCE</b>	<b>162,019</b>
<b>TOTAL ALL BRANCHES</b>	<b>5,670,668</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The table below illustrates attendance per square foot at all branch libraries, in descending order. Attendance per square foot is a metric used to equalize comparisons between small and larger facilities, which can greatly vary from 2,300 to 26,000 square feet, and provides an alternative view of the issue of attendance.

Table 3

<b>ATTENDANCE per sq. ft. - ALL BRANCHES</b>		
<b>Council District</b>	<b>Facility</b>	<b>Attendance per sq. ft.</b>
3	Kensington-Normal Heights	41.88
<b>3</b>	<b><i>University Heights</i></b>	<b>33.51</b>
2	Mission Hills	32.52
4	Skyline Hills	29.59
8	Logan Heights	27.71
4	Oak Park	25.65
6	North Clairemont	25.21
4	Paradise Hills	24.23
<b>2</b>	<b><i>Ocean Beach</i></b>	<b>23.22</b>
6	Balboa	20.79
1	Carmel Valley	20.52
<b>4</b>	<b><i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i></b>	<b>20.15</b>
7	San Carlos	19.79
3	North Park	19.53
<b>1</b>	<b><i>University Community</i></b>	<b>19.36</b>
<b>6</b>	<b><i>Clairemont</i></b>	<b>18.89</b>
2	Pacific Beach/Taylor	18.67
7	Tierrasanta	15.60
8	San Ysidro	15.30
3	City Heights/Weingart	14.73
5	Mira Mesa	14.28
6	Linda Vista	13.60
6	Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	12.77
<b>5</b>	<b><i>Carmel Mountain</i></b>	<b>12.12</b>
6	Mission Valley	11.64
5	Rancho Bernardo	11.63
1	Rancho Penasquitos	11.40
1	La Jolla/Riford	11.00
<b>7</b>	<b><i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i></b>	<b>10.68</b>
8	Otay Mesa-Nestor	9.95
7	College-Rolando	9.91
2	Point Loma/Hervey	9.23
1	North University Community	8.68
4	Valencia Park/Malcolm X	7.64
5	Scripps Miramar Ranch	4.31
<b>AVERAGE OF ALL BRANCHES</b>		<b>17.88</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The table below illustrates attendance per square foot at all branch libraries, broken out by council district.

Table 4

<b>ATTENDANCE per sq. ft. - BY DISTRICT</b>	
<b>Facility</b>	<b>Attendance per Sq. Ft.</b>
<b>Council District 1</b>	
Carmel Valley	20.52
<i>University Community</i>	<i>19.36</i>
Rancho Penasquitos	11.40
La Jolla/Riford	11.00
North University Community	8.68
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>13.11</b>
<b>Council District 2</b>	
Mission Hills	32.52
<i>Ocean Beach</i>	<i>23.22</i>
Pacific Beach/Taylor	18.67
Point Loma/Hervey	9.23
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>15.03</b>
<b>Council District 3</b>	
Kensington-Normal Heights	41.88
<i>University Heights</i>	<i>33.51</i>
North Park	19.53
City Heights/Weingart	14.73
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>20.67</b>
<b>Council Distict 4</b>	
Skyline Hills	29.59
Oak Park	25.65
Paradise Hills	24.23
<i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i>	<i>20.15</i>
Valencia Park/Malcolm X	7.64
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>15.10</b>
<b>Council Distict 5</b>	
Mira Mesa	14.28
<i>Carmel Mountain</i>	<i>12.12</i>
Rancho Bernardo	11.63
Scripps Miramar Ranch	4.31
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>10.36</b>
<b>Council Distict 6</b>	
North Clairemont	25.21
Balboa	20.79
<i>Clairemont</i>	<i>18.89</i>
Linda Vista	13.60
Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	12.77
Mission Valley	11.64
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>14.73</b>
<b>Council Distict 7</b>	
San Carlos	19.79
Tierrasanta	15.60
<i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i>	<i>10.68</i>
College-Rolando	9.91
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>13.37</b>
<b>Council Distict 8</b>	
Logan Heights	27.71
San Ysidro	15.30
Otay Mesa-Nestor	9.95
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>13.96</b>
<b>AVERAGE OF ALL BRANCHES</b>	<b>17.88</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

## Circulation

Circulation is defined as the number of library materials that are checked out by library patrons. Materials may include books, periodicals and various forms of media such as a DVDs, VHS tapes and audiocassettes. The table below shows circulation at all branch libraries, in descending order.

Table 5

<b>CIRCULATION - ALL BRANCHES</b>		
<b>Council District</b>	<b>Facility</b>	<b>FY 2008 Circulation</b>
1	Carmel Valley	433,217
5	Rancho Bernardo	364,197
1	Rancho Penasquitos	302,141
5	Mira Mesa	296,408
6	Mission Valley	282,850
1	La Jolla/Riford	271,464
2	Pacific Beach/Taylor	237,868
1	North University Community	233,780
2	Point Loma/Hervey	223,497
5	<i>Carmel Mountain</i>	<i>221,811</i>
1	<i>University Community</i>	<i>220,849</i>
5	Scripps Miramar Ranch	218,310
7	San Carlos	215,570
6	Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	202,885
3	North Park	192,002
6	Linda Vista	187,490
7	Tierrasanta	152,523
6	Balboa	144,309
7	College-Rolando	137,199
3	City Heights/Weingart	128,683
3	<i>University Heights</i>	<i>118,974</i>
6	North Clairemont	116,355
6	<i>Clairemont</i>	<i>112,409</i>
2	Mission Hills	112,113
8	Otay Mesa-Nestor	108,237
2	<i>Ocean Beach</i>	<i>101,799</i>
4	Valencia Park/Malcolm X	91,982
3	Kensington-Normal Heights	91,033
4	Oak Park	87,154
7	<i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i>	<i>82,145</i>
4	<i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i>	<i>65,822</i>
4	Skyline Hills	61,372
8	Logan Heights	55,844
4	Paradise Hills	52,750
8	San Ysidro	43,590
<b>AVERAGE CIRCULATION</b>		<b>170,532</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The table below illustrates total circulation by council district, in descending order within district.

Table 6

<b>CIRCULATION - BY DISTRICT</b>	
<b>Facility</b>	<b>FY 2008 Circulation</b>
<b>Council District 1</b>	
Carmel Valley	433,217
Rancho Penasquitos	302,141
La Jolla/Riford	271,464
North University Community	233,780
<i>University Community</i>	<i>220,849</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,461,451</b>
<b>Council District 2</b>	
Pacific Beach/Taylor	237,868
Point Loma/Hervey	223,497
Mission Hills	112,113
<i>Ocean Beach</i>	<i>101,799</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>675,277</b>
<b>Council District 3</b>	
North Park	192,002
City Heights/Weingart	128,683
<i>University Heights</i>	<i>118,974</i>
Kensington-Normal Heights	91,033
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>530,692</b>
<b>Council District 4</b>	
Valencia Park/Malcolm X	91,982
Oak Park	87,154
<i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i>	<i>65,822</i>
Skyline Hills	61,372
Paradise Hills	52,750
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>359,080</b>
<b>Council District 5</b>	
Rancho Bernardo	364,197
Mira Mesa	296,408
<i>Carmel Mountain</i>	<i>221,811</i>
Scripps Miramar Ranch	218,310
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,100,726</b>
<b>Council District 6</b>	
Mission Valley	282,850
Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	202,885
Linda Vista	187,490
Balboa	144,309
North Clairemont	116,355
<i>Clairemont</i>	<i>112,409</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,046,298</b>
<b>Council District 7</b>	
San Carlos	215,570
Tierrasanta	152,523
College-Rolando	137,199
<i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i>	<i>82,145</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>587,437</b>
<b>Council District 8</b>	
Otay Mesa-Nestor	108,237
Logan Heights	55,844
San Ysidro	43,590
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>207,671</b>
<b>AVERAGE CIRCULATION</b>	<b>170,532</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The table below illustrates another way to consider circulation – by calculating circulation per square foot to better compare small and larger libraries. This table shows total circulation per square foot at all branch libraries, in descending order. Using the order in Table 5 showing total circulation, the University Heights branch 21<sup>st</sup>, whereas on a per square footage basis, the same branch ranks third.

Table 7

<b>CIRCULATION per sq. ft. - ALL BRANCHES</b>		
<b>Council District</b>	<b>Facility</b>	<b>Circulation per Sq. Ft.</b>
3	Kensington-Normal Heights	39.27
1	Carmel Valley	33.20
<b>3</b>	<b><i>University Heights</i></b>	<b><i>31.73</i></b>
2	Mission Hills	29.12
6	Balboa	28.34
7	San Carlos	26.29
<b>6</b>	<b><i>Clairemont</i></b>	<b><i>25.33</i></b>
3	North Park	24.00
6	North Clairemont	22.65
<b>2</b>	<b><i>Ocean Beach</i></b>	<b><i>22.23</i></b>
<b>1</b>	<b><i>University Community</i></b>	<b><i>22.08</i></b>
2	Pacific Beach/Taylor	19.05
6	Linda Vista	18.75
7	Tierrasanta	17.40
<b>5</b>	<b><i>Carmel Mountain</i></b>	<b><i>16.93</i></b>
4	Oak Park	16.76
5	Rancho Bernardo	15.87
1	Rancho Penasquitos	14.63
5	Mira Mesa	14.62
1	North University Community	14.59
6	Mission Valley	14.31
8	Logan Heights	14.08
4	Skyline Hills	13.95
4	Paradise Hills	13.61
6	Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	12.98
<b>7</b>	<b><i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i></b>	<b><i>11.91</i></b>
1	La Jolla/Riford	10.86
8	San Ysidro	10.66
5	Scripps Miramar Ranch	10.06
7	College-Rolando	8.87
3	City Heights/Weingart	8.67
2	Point Loma/Hervey	8.63
<b>4</b>	<b><i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i></b>	<b><i>8.23</i></b>
8	Otay Mesa-Nestor	7.22
4	Valencia Park/Malcolm X	3.53
<b>AVERAGE CIRCULATION per sq. ft.</b>		<b>17.44</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The table below illustrates circulation per square foot by council district, in descending order within district.

Table 8

<b>CIRCULATION per sq. ft. - BY DISTRICT</b>	
<b>Facility</b>	<b>Circulation per Sq. Ft.</b>
<b>Council District 1</b>	
Carmel Valley	33.20
<i>University Community</i>	<i>22.08</i>
Rancho Penasquitos	14.63
North University Community	14.59
La Jolla/Riford	10.86
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>17.25</b>
<b>Council District 2</b>	
Mission Hills	29.12
<i>Ocean Beach</i>	<i>22.23</i>
Pacific Beach/Taylor	19.05
Point Loma/Hervey	8.63
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>14.43</b>
<b>Council District 3</b>	
Kensington-Normal Heights	39.27
<i>University Heights</i>	<i>31.73</i>
North Park	24.00
City Heights/Weingart	8.67
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>18.35</b>
<b>Council Distict 4</b>	
Oak Park	16.76
Skyline Hills	13.95
Paradise Hills	13.61
<i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i>	<i>8.23</i>
Valencia Park/Malcolm X	3.53
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>7.56</b>
<b>Council Distict 5</b>	
<i>Carmel Mountain</i>	<i>16.93</i>
Rancho Bernardo	15.87
Mira Mesa	14.62
Scripps Miramar Ranch	10.06
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>14.11</b>
<b>Council Distict 6</b>	
Balboa	28.34
<i>Clairemont</i>	<i>25.33</i>
North Clairemont	22.65
Linda Vista	18.75
Mission Valley	14.31
Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	12.98
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>17.42</b>
<b>Council Distict 7</b>	
San Carlos	26.29
Tierrasanta	17.40
<i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i>	<i>11.91</i>
College-Rolando	8.87
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>14.94</b>
<b>Council Distict 8</b>	
Logan Heights	14.08
San Ysidro	10.66
Otay Mesa-Nestor	7.22
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>9.01</b>
<b>AVERAGE CIRCULATION per sq. ft.</b>	<b>17.44</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The following table illustrates circulation per visitor at all branches, in descending order.

Table 9

<b>CIRCULATION PER VISITOR - ALL BRANCHES</b>		
<b>Council District</b>	<b>Facility</b>	<b>Circulation per Visitor</b>
5	Scripps Miramar Ranch	2.33
1	North University Community	1.68
1	Carmel Valley	1.62
<b>5</b>	<b><i>Carmel Mountain</i></b>	<b><i>1.40</i></b>
6	Linda Vista	1.38
5	Rancho Bernardo	1.36
6	Balboa	1.36
<b>6</b>	<b><i>Clairemont</i></b>	<b><i>1.34</i></b>
7	San Carlos	1.33
1	Rancho Penasquitos	1.28
6	Mission Valley	1.23
3	North Park	1.23
<b>1</b>	<b><i>University Community</i></b>	<b><i>1.14</i></b>
7	Tierrasanta	1.12
<b>7</b>	<b><i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i></b>	<b><i>1.12</i></b>
5	Mira Mesa	1.02
2	Pacific Beach/Taylor	1.02
6	Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	1.02
1	La Jolla/Riford	0.99
<b>2</b>	<b><i>Ocean Beach</i></b>	<b><i>0.96</i></b>
<b>3</b>	<b><i>University Heights</i></b>	<b><i>0.95</i></b>
3	Kensington-Normal Heights	0.94
2	Point Loma/Hervey	0.94
6	North Clairemont	0.90
2	Mission Hills	0.90
7	College-Rolando	0.89
8	Otay Mesa-Nestor	0.73
8	San Ysidro	0.70
4	Oak Park	0.65
3	City Heights/Weingart	0.59
4	Paradise Hills	0.56
8	Logan Heights	0.51
4	Skyline Hills	0.47
4	Valencia Park/Malcolm X	0.46
<b>4</b>	<b><i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i></b>	<b><i>0.41</i></b>
<b>AVERAGE CIRCULATION PER VISITOR</b>		<b>1.04</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

The table below illustrates circulation per visitor for branches by council district, in descending order.

Table 10

<b>CIRCULATION PER VISITOR - BY DISTRICT</b>	
<b>Facility</b>	<b>Circulation per Visitor</b>
<b>Council District 1</b>	
North University Community	1.68
Carmel Valley	1.62
Rancho Penasquitos	1.28
<i>University Community</i>	<i>1.14</i>
La Jolla/Riford	0.99
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1.32</b>
<b>Council District 2</b>	
Pacific Beach/Taylor	1.02
<i>Ocean Beach</i>	<i>0.96</i>
Point Loma/Hervey	0.94
Mission Hills	0.90
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>0.96</b>
<b>Council District 3</b>	
North Park	1.23
<i>University Heights</i>	<i>0.95</i>
Kensington-Normal Heights	0.94
City Heights/Weingart	0.59
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>0.89</b>
<b>Council District 4</b>	
Oak Park	0.65
Paradise Hills	0.56
Skyline Hills	0.47
Valencia Park/Malcolm X	0.46
<i>Mountain View/Beckwourth</i>	<i>0.41</i>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>0.50</b>
<b>Council District 5</b>	
Scripps Miramar Ranch	2.33
<i>Carmel Mountain</i>	<i>1.40</i>
Rancho Bernardo	1.36
Mira Mesa	1.02
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1.36</b>
<b>Council District 6</b>	
Linda Vista	1.38
Balboa	1.36
<i>Clairemont</i>	<i>1.34</i>
Mission Valley	1.23
Serra Mesa-Kearny Mesa	1.02
North Clairemont	0.90
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1.18</b>
<b>Council District 7</b>	
San Carlos	1.33
Tierrasanta	1.12
<i>Allied Gardens/Benjamin</i>	<i>1.12</i>
College-Rolando	0.89
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1.12</b>
<b>Council District 8</b>	
Otay Mesa-Nestor	0.73
San Ysidro	0.70
Logan Heights	0.51
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>0.65</b>
<b>AVERAGE CIRCULATION PER VISITOR</b>	<b>1.04</b>

Note: Italics/shading designate libraries previously slated for closure under Mayor's FY 2009 budget reduction proposal.

## CONCLUSION

The purpose of this informational report is to provide additional attendance and circulation data to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee. As shown in the tables provided above, not all libraries that were previously slated for closure had the lowest circulation or attendance figures. However, there were likely numerous other factors taken into consideration in making the recommendation for library closures that should be discussed with the Council if this recommendation should resurface.

**[SIGNED]**

---

Dominika Bukalova  
Research Analyst

**[SIGNED]**

---

APPROVED: Andrea Tevlin  
Independent Budget Analyst