



Facilities Condition Assessment Supplement

San Diego Civic Center Complex



Facilities Condition Assessment
Jones Lang LaSalle
San Diego, California

May 2009

Facilities Condition Assessment 2009 Supplemental Analysis
San Diego Civic Center Complex

San Diego Civic Center Complex Facilities Condition Assessment Supplement

Summary

In March of 2008, the CCDC contracted with AECOM for a comprehensive assessment of four City-owned buildings, as well as the leased Civic Center Plaza. A report of that assessment was presented in April of 2008 with findings that included \$92.6 million in current deficiencies across the four City-owned buildings. In addition to the current deficiencies, the assessment also found an additional \$1 million in life cycle capital renewal deficiencies for building systems that are anticipated to reach the end of their serviceable life in the next five years, bringing the total five-year need to \$93.6 million.

CCRP Facility Cost Index (FCI) Summary

Site Name	Age	Site	Total Permanent Square Feet	Facility Condition Cost	Total Cost w/Life Cycle	FCI w/Life Cycle
City Administrative Building	1963	4.3	188,926	\$ 37,007,842	\$ 37,523,887	50.3%
City Operations Building	1965	4.9	213,905	\$ 22,491,833	\$ 22,491,833	26.6%
Concourse	1963	3.6	158,119	\$ 26,907,134	\$ 27,229,737	51.4%
Evan Jones Parkade	1963	14.5	580,076	\$ 6,184,235	\$ 6,341,649	12.7%
			1,141,026	\$ 92,591,044	\$ 93,587,106	35.7%

The Facility Condition Index (FCI) is used throughout the facility condition assessment industry as a general indicator of a building's health. The FCI is calculated by dividing the Capital Needs Value by the Replacement Value. As a rule of thumb, an FCI below 10% is considered good. An FCI above 65% would suggest the building for replacement.

In May of 2009, the CCDC requested a supplemental review of that original assessment to identify those critical building repairs that should be anticipated over the next five- and ten-year periods. More specifically, the supplemental analysis was to address the cost of building repairs and life cycle system replacements that are prudent for the City to plan to address under two scenarios:

The **Gerding Edlen** scenario is a development alternative where the City would continue to operate the four buildings until a new City Hall was ready for occupancy. The scenario anticipated that three buildings, including the City Administrative Building, the City Operations Building, and the Evan Jones Parkade would operate for five years, while the Concourse, part of the early phased construction, would operate for two years. At the end of these periods, the buildings would be demolished.

The **Hold Steady** scenario is considered a non-development alternative where the City would continue to operate the buildings for a ten-year period, eight years for the Concourse, and then the buildings would be demolished for a replacement City Hall.

Under either of these scenarios, the City would plan to make minimal maintenance and capital investment in the buildings since the disposition plan is to demolish the buildings either in five or ten years. The purpose of the supplemental assessment was to identify

critical repairs or system replacements in each building necessary to provide for a safe work environment; specifically consider a number of special circumstances including, but not limited, to fire and life safety, hazardous materials, and seismic considerations; and consolidate the costs for these repairs into an estimate of probable cost for inclusion in the financial analysis of each alternative by Jones Lang LaSalle (JLL).

Approach

To accomplish the supplemental review, AECOM mobilized the team that conducted the original assessment, reviewed prior findings, and assembled a listing of unique deficiencies for each building from the assessment database. The team then toured each facility on May 7, 2009, to review previously identified deficiencies, understand any work in progress, and evaluate the priority of each deficiency in light of the two scenarios. The team concluded the building tours and incorporated their findings into this supplemental report.

Conclusion

The overall conclusion is that these buildings all have substantial need for individual deficiency repairs as well as system-wide capital renewal replacements. These buildings are approaching 50 years of a life cycle, and many of the existing systems have reached or exceeded their serviceable life. The maintenance staffs responsible for the buildings have made use of available resources to maintain the buildings in operational condition; however, many of these systems are beyond what can be maintained on a daily basis without near-term replacement. A summary of the analysis for the two scenarios suggests that the projected expenditures under a five-year Gerding Edlen scenario are **\$19.5 million**, and the projected expenditures under a ten-year Hold Steady scenario are **\$40.1 million**.

Minimum Expenditure Summary

Summary	Gerding Edlen		Hold Steady	
	5 Years	%	10 Years	%
City Administrative Building	\$ 12,082,954	33%	\$ 16,379,577	44%
Concourse	\$ 3,366,869	13%	\$ 13,299,312	49%
City Operations Building	\$ 3,212,887	14%	\$ 7,382,864	33%
Evan Jones Parkade	\$ 803,054	13%	\$ 3,030,654	49%
	\$ 19,465,765		\$ 40,092,407	

It should be noted that a minimum expenditure approach to maintaining these buildings over a five-year period, and especially a ten-year period will render these buildings in a condition that will force them to be demolished at the end of the pro forma period. The City Administrative Building and the Concourse have Facility Condition Index (FCI) values above 50 percent today. FCIs over 65 percent generally warrant building replacement, and a minimal expenditure approach will, in all likelihood, render these buildings in an FCI category above 65 percent within the next five to ten years. In addition, should the electrical or mechanical systems fail it could require the buildings to be vacated during repairs, disrupting City activities.

Facilities Condition Assessment 2009 Supplemental Analysis
San Diego Civic Center Complex

Deficiency Categories

For the supplemental analysis, the AECOM team identified unique deficiencies for each building and classified them according to 15 distinct categories. Then, within each category, the team evaluated each line item deficiency with consideration given to whether the deficiency was critical to occupant safety or to ongoing operation of the building. The team further reviewed each deficiency with respect to the likelihood that the building component might fail over the five- and ten-year timeframe, forcing the City to expend funds to make necessary repair or system replacements. A summary of findings follows:

Summary by Deficiency Category

Summary	Gerding Edlen		Hold Steady	
	5 Years		10 Years	
A Fire	\$ 6,726,030	35%	\$ 8,226,687	21%
B Life Safety	\$ 1,293,847	7%	\$ 1,308,460	3%
C Elevator	\$ 72,886	0%	\$ 92,322	0%
D Site	\$ 118,177	1%	\$ 118,177	0%
E Roofing	\$ 46,668	0%	\$ 2,182,945	5%
F Exterior	\$ 289,187	1%	\$ 3,022,115	8%
G Structural	\$ 94,768	0%	\$ 189,536	0%
I Interior	\$ 335,899	2%	\$ 4,272,641	11%
J Mechanical	\$ 2,745,256	14%	\$ 8,741,578	22%
K Electrical	\$ 6,760,336	35%	\$ 8,340,330	21%
L Plumbing	\$ 370,481	2%	\$ 2,285,370	6%
M Technology	\$ -	0%	\$ 201,924	1%
N Specialties	\$ -	0%	\$ -	0%
O ADA (Low Risk)	\$ 177,060	1%	\$ 482,069	1%
P ADA (High Risk)	\$ 435,170	2%	\$ 628,253	2%
	\$ 19,465,765		\$ 40,092,407	
Other Items Included in Full Condition Assessment Report				
Elevator - Work in Progress	\$ 294,784		\$ 294,784	
Civic Center Plaza	\$ 7,117,685		\$ 7,117,685	
Asbestos	\$ 11,346,066		\$ 11,346,066	
Excluded Deficiencies	\$ 61,484,429		\$ 40,857,787	
Reconciliation Check	\$ 99,708,729		\$ 99,708,729	

The deficiency categories have been organized into three major groups:

Fire, Life Safety, and Elevators: Fire deficiencies are related to items considered critical to preventing and containing a fire in the building and may include fire sprinklers, fire suppression systems, fire alarms, and fire walls or doors. Life safety deficiencies include repairs to emergency lighting and emergency exit signage as well as building hazards. Elevator deficiencies include components that are critical to vertical circulation, particularly in the high-rise City Administrative Building.

Building Systems: Deficiencies related to the building's core components, including roofing, mechanical or air conditioning and heating systems, and the electrical systems. It is important to note that many of these systems have reached the end of their serviceable life, and while they may be operating today, the continued viability is questionable over a five-year or ten-year period. These systems include the roof on the CAB and Concourse, the aluminum doors at the CAB plaza level, non fire rated interior doors at the CAB and Concourse, mechanical air handlers and controls, domestic water piping, plumbing fixtures, emergency lighting, electrical panel boards, disconnects, and transformers, and older energy inefficient T-8 lighting.

Americans with Disabilities Act of 1994: Deficiencies associated with accommodating individuals with disabilities. These deficiencies are a City risk management consideration, and while the building code may not require the City to address all of these issues, there is a potential for injury or law suit. They have been further grouped into two sets: those that might be considered low risk, primarily concerning need like building signage, and those that might be considered high risk, including door hardware, access clearances, and cross slope or tripping hazards.

Major Assumptions

In the course of developing the supplemental analysis, a number of major assumptions have been incorporated. Major assumptions are:

The original and supplemental assessment was limited to a visual assessment, without benefit of any destructive testing;

Architectural, mechanical, electrical, plumbing, and structural engineers participated in the visual assessments;

The buildings have limited availability of construction documents, so quantities are estimates based, in some cases, on rules of thumb;

The structural assessment was limited without detailed structural calculations from original construction documents. Because the buildings were built in accordance with code requirements in place at the time of construction, no seismic upgrades are legally required under either the five-year or ten-year scenarios, however significant or entire building renovation work could trigger a requirement to upgrade the structural system to meet modern, more stringent seismic protection requirements, and costs have not been included;

The Civic Center Plaza assessment data has been excluded;

Both the five-year and ten-year scenarios assume two-year and eight-year operational periods for the Concourse building. Under this minimum expenditure approach, it must be recognized that any significant systems failure may require closing the facility prior to even the short-term planned obsolescence date, necessitating early relocation of the current occupants;

The current work in progress to repair and upgrade the CAB and Parkade elevators will be completed, and no costs have been included;
The costs include provisions to address major fire and life safety needs. While the City has been granted a waiver for many years for a fire sprinkler in the 13-story CAB, the costs for both scenarios assumes sprinklers will be installed prior to 2011. The total cost of fire sprinkler upgrades when combined with the necessary spot asbestos abatement is estimated to be approximately \$5.1 million;
Removal of asbestos, other than spot abatement for sprinklers, is done at demolition;
Implementation of major system replacements may be disruptive depending upon phasing of repairs. As such, it is likely that building occupants may require temporary relocation during major repairs and sprinkler installations; and,
Cost estimates include soft costs (48 percent) for customary professional fees and contingency, and the costs are escalated three years from 2008 to 2011 at 6 percent.

Building Summaries by Deficiency Category

City Administrative Building

The Facility Condition index (FCI) for this building is **50.3%**. This facility currently serves the City administrative functions including the Council Chambers and Committee rooms used for public meetings, Office of the City Clerk, Department of City Planning and Community Investment, Financial Management, City Comptroller, department directors and the Mayor and City Council offices. The building also has several other City departments. The administration building is a thirteen story cast-in-place concrete building. While these floors are dedicated to mechanical functions, the main chillers and electrical service is from the central plant in the basement between the exhibition hall and this administrative building. The building was originally constructed in 1963, and as is often found, has a great deal of asbestos contained above the ceiling and in mechanical spaces. This material will have to be abated under any major renovation scenario, even if the building is demolished. While floors 6 and 7 have had the asbestos containing material abated, a significant amount is reported to remain on other floors. The majority of this building's mechanical systems, including the air handlers, controls and ducts have reached or significantly passed the end of their life. The roof, possibly the original roof, is well beyond its useful life. Almost all of the interior areas feature outdated and energy inefficient lighting, plenum air supply in the ceilings, and poor condition finishes on floors, walls, and ceilings. The elevators appear to be the original elevators and are reaching the end of their life; however, work is in progress currently to repair and upgrade the elevators. The exterior requires cleaning, and the building is only partially ADA compliant and will in many cases still not meet ADA provision under the pending revised ADA guidelines. The exterior windows are single pane aluminum windows that should be replaced. While the building is structurally sound, there are numerous cracks in the walls for the upper mechanical spaces.

The following table provides a categorical cost estimate summary for the building, assuming minimum expenditures to maintain operational status.

Facilities Condition Assessment 2009 Supplemental Analysis
San Diego Civic Center Complex

City Administrative Building			
Summary	Gerding Edlen		Hold Steady
	5 Years		10 Years
A Fire	\$	5,482,671	\$ 5,813,205
B Life Safety	\$	659,087	\$ 659,087
C Elevator	\$	-	\$ -
D Site	\$	118,177	\$ 118,177
E Roofing	\$	46,668	\$ 46,668
F Exterior	\$	69,120	\$ 389,232
G Structural	\$	94,768	\$ 94,768
I Interior	\$	-	\$ 947,324
J Mechanical	\$	1,348,958	\$ 2,941,029
K Electrical	\$	3,936,598	\$ 3,936,598
L Plumbing	\$	86,712	\$ 991,371
M Technology	\$	-	\$ 201,924
N Specialties	\$	-	\$ -
O ADA (Low Risk)	\$	42,105	\$ 42,105
P ADA (High Risk)	\$	198,089	\$ 198,089
		\$ 12,082,954	\$ 16,379,577
Other Items Included in Full Condition Assessment Report			
Elevator - Work in Progress	\$	294,784	\$ 294,784
Asbestos	\$	7,020,965	\$ 7,020,965
Excluded Deficiencies	\$	17,609,139	\$ 13,312,516
Reconciliation Check	\$	37,007,842	\$ 37,007,842

Concourse

The Facility Condition index (FCI) for this building is **51.4%**. This facility is currently underutilized, as there is a new San Diego Convention Center. The exhibition hall is two stories above grade with a basement which houses the central plant. It has three large ballrooms. Currently the building supports the Opera in the Copper and Silver rooms. Additionally, Plaza Hall contains the City print shop, and a small library is located in a portion of the lobby of Golden Hall. The library space is inadequate and is not served by restrooms without allowing entry into other portions of the building, which can pose a security risk. The mechanical systems are located on the roof with three undersized boilers, one of which is abandoned and one of which is in substantial disrepair. The building was originally constructed in 1963, and has a great deal of asbestos containing fireproofing above the ceiling in the catwalks over Golden Hall. This material will require abatement under any scenario, even if the building is demolished. The majority of this building's mechanical systems have reached or significantly passed the expected useful life of the equipment including the boilers, air handlers, and controls. The roof, possibly the original roof, is well beyond its useful life. Almost all of the interior areas feature outdated and energy inefficient lighting, and poor condition finish on floors, walls, and ceilings. The elevators appear to be the original elevators and are reaching the end of their life. The exterior is in need of cleaning, and the building is only partially ADA compliant and will in many cases still not meet ADA provision under the pending revised ADA guidelines.

The following table provides a categorical cost estimate summary for the building, assuming minimum expenditures to maintain operational status.

Facilities Condition Assessment 2009 Supplemental Analysis
San Diego Civic Center Complex

Concourse		Gerding Edlen		Hold Steady	
		2 Years		8 Years	
Summary					
A Fire	\$	151,249		\$	1,321,373
B Life Safety	\$	326,516		\$	341,129
C Elevator	\$	-		\$	19,436
D Site	\$	-		\$	-
E Roofing	\$	-		\$	2,111,263
F Exterior	\$	61,028		\$	248,265
G Structural	\$	-		\$	94,768
I Interior	\$	-		\$	796,919
J Mechanical	\$	362,015		\$	4,147,239
K Electrical	\$	2,325,260		\$	2,755,116
L Plumbing	\$	140,800		\$	965,713
M Technology	\$	-		\$	-
N Specialties	\$	-		\$	-
O ADA (Low Risk)	\$	-		\$	305,009
P ADA (High Risk)	\$	-		\$	193,083
		\$ 3,366,869		\$ 13,299,312	
Other Items Included in Full Condition Assessment Report					
Elevator - Work in Progress	\$	-		\$	-
Asbestos	\$	1,941,040		\$	1,941,040
Excluded Deficiencies	\$	21,599,224		\$	11,666,781
Reconciliation Check	\$	26,907,134		\$	26,907,134

City Operations Building

The Facility Condition index (FCI) for this building is **26.6%**. The Operations Building has a basement level, five stories above ground and a two story mechanical penthouse. This facility currently serves the City planning department functions as well as a fire station. The first floor has a secure fire arson investigation unit and the City's emergency command center is located in the sub basement. The basement is almost entirely storage and mechanical support, although the primary chillers, circulating pumps and electrical service is in the central plant located in the basement between the exhibition hall and the City Administrative Building. The building was originally constructed in 1965, and is reported to contain asbestos materials above the ceiling of the first floor and in some mechanical spaces. This material will have to be abated under any scenario, even if the building is demolished. The majority of this building's mechanical systems have reached or significantly passed the end of the typical useful life for equipment of this type and age. The exterior requires cleaning and the building is only partially ADA compliant, and will in many cases still not meet ADA provision under the pending revised ADA guidelines. While there have been some spot interior renovations, almost all of the interior areas are outdated. Old energy inefficient lighting should be replaced and poor condition finishes on floors, walls, and ceilings are in need of replacement or renovation. The elevators appear to be the original elevators and are reaching the end of their useful life. Should the COB continue to house a fire station and an emergency operations center, renovation of the COB could trigger the need for compliance with the "Essential Service Building" requirements as per the California Building Code. These requirements would likely entail a major structural retrofit of this building. It should be noted that renovation of the structural system to a condition compliant with current seismic codes or "Essential Service Building" requirements could require extensive and costly work. (Cost estimates for any such structural upgrades are not included in this report.)

The following table provides a categorical cost estimate summary for the building, assuming minimum expenditures to maintain operational status.

Facilities Condition Assessment 2009 Supplemental Analysis
San Diego Civic Center Complex

City Operations Building		Gerding Edlen		Hold Steady	
		5 Years		10 Years	
Summary					
A Fire	\$	1,018,791		\$	1,018,791
B Life Safety	\$	188,680		\$	188,680
C Elevator	\$	72,886		\$	72,886
D Site	\$	-		\$	-
E Roofing	\$	-		\$	-
F Exterior	\$	-		\$	146,564
G Structural	\$	-		\$	-
I Interior	\$	335,899		\$	2,405,676
J Mechanical	\$	1,034,282		\$	1,653,309
K Electrical	\$	68,077		\$	1,218,216
L Plumbing	\$	122,235		\$	306,705
M Technology	\$	-		\$	-
N Specialties	\$	-		\$	-
O ADA (Low Risk)	\$	134,955		\$	134,955
P ADA (High Risk)	\$	237,082		\$	237,082
		\$ 3,212,887		\$ 7,382,864	
Other Items Included in Full Condition Assessment Report					
Elevator - Work in Progress	\$	-		\$	-
Asbestos	\$	2,384,061		\$	2,384,061
Excluded Deficiencies	\$	16,894,885		\$	12,724,909
Reconciliation Check	\$	22,491,833		\$	22,491,833

Evan Jones Parkade

The Facility Condition index (FCI) for this building is **12.7%**. This facility provides parking for approximately 1,100 cars. The structure has eleven floors of cast in place concrete parking levels, plus roof parking. There is a mezzanine level that currently houses the Exhibition Center Plaza Hall City print shop, a terrace level used primarily for vehicular circulation with some parking, and a terrace intermediate level to transition vehicular circulation to the parking levels. This facility was constructed in 1963 and is all open air with limited or no mechanical service. Deficiencies observed in the walk through included water marks and discolored concrete around the exterior perimeter which should be pressure washed. The barrier walls in the elevator and stairwells had minor cracks which should be patched. The initial concrete mix for the barrier walls was not well vibrated. The concrete in these areas has a dimpled surface due to the air pockets that were created. The concrete stairs and stair columns at the first floor level had minor non-structural cracks in several locations and should be patched. Other stair wells had minor cracks which will need to be patched. The exterior façade concrete panels had minor cracks in several areas which will need to be patched. Two exterior ramps have major structural cracks and will need to be repaired with a crack injection system. The exterior is in need of substantial cleaning and painting, and there are several areas of concrete that require repair, for the most part non-structural in nature. The electrical service has had minimal upgrades and the fluorescent lighting will require replacement in a portion of the structure. The remainder of the electrical system is characterized by unsecured electrical panes, some with open buses, corroding electrical conduits, and a fire alarm and emergency exit system that is significantly beyond its serviceable life. The elevators serving the structure are the original elevators and are due for replacement.

The following table provides a categorical cost estimate summary for the building, assuming minimum expenditures to maintain operational status.

Facilities Condition Assessment 2009 Supplemental Analysis
San Diego Civic Center Complex

Evan Jones Parkade			
Summary	Gerding Edlen		Hold Steady
	5 Years		10 Years
A Fire	\$	73,318	\$ 73,318
B Life Safety	\$	119,564	\$ 119,564
C Elevator	\$	-	\$ -
D Site	\$	-	\$ -
E Roofing	\$	-	\$ 25,014
F Exterior	\$	159,038	\$ 2,238,054
G Structural	\$	-	\$ -
I Interior	\$	-	\$ 122,723
J Mechanical	\$	-	\$ -
K Electrical	\$	430,400	\$ 430,400
L Plumbing	\$	20,734	\$ 21,582
M Technology	\$	-	\$ -
N Specialties	\$	-	\$ -
O ADA (Low Risk)	\$	-	\$ -
P ADA (High Risk)	\$	-	\$ -
	\$	803,054	\$ 3,030,654
Other Items Included in Full Condition Assessment Report			
Elevator - Work in Progress	\$	-	\$ -
Asbestos	\$	-	\$ -
Excluded Deficiencies	\$	5,381,181	\$ 3,153,580
Reconciliation Check	\$	6,184,235	\$ 6,184,235