



Police Department Sworn and Civilian Staffing Challenges

Office of the Independent Budget Analyst

May 16, 2012

Overview



- At the May 2nd Budget Hearing, Public Safety & Neighborhood Services (PS&NS) Chair Emerald requested that the Office of the IBA provide a report at the May 16th, 2012 PS&NS meeting to evaluate the restoration of civilian positions in the Police Department.
- Based on issues raised at the hearing and the review and analysis of subsequent information provided to our office, this report reviews the sworn and civilian staffing challenges and priorities within the Police Department and provides recommendations for addressing these challenges in FY 2013 and beyond.

Accumulating Sworn Deficit



Accumulating Sworn Staffing Deficit Since FY 2008

Fiscal Year	Sworn Departures	Recruits ¹	Recruit Class	Deficit Since FY 2008
FY 2008	126	169	73 rd , 74 th , 75 th , 76 th	43
FY 2009	264	129	77 th , 78 th , 79 th , 80 th	(92)
FY 2010	67	91	81 st , 82 nd , 83 rd , 84 th	(68)
FY 2011 ²	70	13	85 th , 86 th , 87 th , 88 th	(125)
FY 2012 ³	97	84	89 th , 90 th , 91 st , 92 nd	(138)
FY 2013 ⁴	96	88	93 rd , 94 th , 95 th , 96 th	(146)

¹ Number of recruits successfully completing academy.

² 86th, 87th, and 88th academies were not held due to budget constraints.

³ Total sworn departures are projected for the remainder of the fiscal year based on current experience of monthly attrition of 8 sworn FTEs. Total recruits is based on actuals as of 5/7/12.

⁴ Sworn departures assumes monthly attrition of 8 sworn FTEs. The recruits projection assumes four 25 recruit academies with 11.9% attrition.

Budgeted Sworn Strength and Vacancies



Budgeted Sworn Strength and Vacancies at Beginning of Fiscal Year 2008-2013

Fiscal Year	Budgeted Sworn	Beginning Strength	Vacancies (Strength vs. Budgeted Sworn)	Assumed Vacancies in Vacancy Factor	Percentage Assumed Vacancies	Budget Available to Hire ¹
FY 2008	2127.75	1913	(214.75)	216	10%	(1.25)
FY 2009	2127.75	1955	(172.75)	159	7%	13.75
FY 2010 ²	2124.75	1887	(237.75)	157	7%	80.75
FY 2011	1991	1856	(135.00)	100	5%	35.00
FY 2012	1969.5	1817	(152.50)	111.5	6%	41.00
FY 2013 ³	1969.5	1829	(140.50)	127.5	6%	13.00

¹This number will fluctuate based on sworn attrition rates and the total number of academy recruits throughout the year.

²Budgeted sworn were reduced by 133.75 FTE during FY 2010 Mid-Year budget reductions.

³Sworn strength is projected based on current FY 2012 attrition experience of 8 sworn FTE per month.

Attrition Forecast for FY 2012



Attrition Forecast FY 2012

	FY 2012
Budgeted Sworn	1969.5
Filled Positions as of 5/7/12	1761
Recruits as of 5/7/12	84
Current FY Vacancies	124.5
Projected Remaining Departures ¹	16
Total Year-End Vacancies	140.5

¹ Projected departure in FY 2012 is based on current experience of monthly attrition of 8 sworn FTEs for the remainder of the fiscal year.

Attrition Forecast FY 2013-2016



Attrition Forecast FY 2013-2016

	FY 2013	FY 2014	FY 2015	FY 2016
Budgeted Sworn	1969.5	1969.5	1969.5	1969.5
Filled ¹	1829	1821	1813	1805
Beginning FY Vacancies	140.5	148	156	164
Projected Departures During FY ²	96	96	96	96
Total Vacancies During FY	236.5	244	252	260
New Recruits ³	88	88	88	88
Total Vacancies Remaining	148	156	164	172

¹ Includes recruits as of beginning of fiscal year.

² Projected departure FY 2013-2016 is based on assumed monthly attrition of 8 sworn FTEs during the fiscal year.

³ Projected new recruits FY 2013-2016 is based on the assumed conduct of four 25 recruit academies with academy attrition of 11.9%.

Budgeted Ability to Fill Forecast



Vacancy & Budgeted Ability to Fill Forecast FY 2012-2016

	FY 2012	FY 2013	FY 2014	FY 2015	FY 2016
Vacancies Remaining at FY End	140.5	148	156	164	172
Positions Frozen ¹	111.5	127.5	127.5	127.5	127.5
Additional Positions Able to Fill	29	20.5	28.5	36.5	44.5

¹Budgeted vacancy assumption.

Findings & Recommendations



- It may be feasible from a budgetary standpoint to increase the 4 academies for FY 2013 by up to 5 recruits per academy (from 25 to 30), while staying within budget.
- We recommend that Financial Management review the FY 2013 vacancy factor and determine if additional flexibility is needed for the May Revise to authorize an academy class size of 30 for FY 2013.

Findings & Recommendations



- Increasing academies further, by up to 35 per academy would more so advance the Department toward its budgeted staffing goals, but would require additional funding.
- We recommend that the Committee request the Mayor to consider addressing this issue in the May Revise and make recommendations for an increase in the size of academies in FY 2013, with the need for budget flexibility during the year to adjust to actual attrition trends.

Staffing Forecast for 30 Recruit Academies FY 2013-2016



Attrition Forecast FY 2013-2016, Assuming Four 30 Recruit Academies

	FY 2013	FY 2014	FY 2015	FY 2016
Budgeted Sworn	1969.5	1969.5	1969.5	1969.5
Filled ¹	1829	1839	1849	1859
Beginning FY Vacancies	140.5	130.5	120.5	110.5
Projected Departures During FY ²	96	96	96	96
Total Vacancies During FY	236.5	226.5	216.5	206.5
New Recruits ³	106	106	106	106
Total Vacancies Remaining	130.5	120.5	110.5	100.5

¹Includes recruits as of beginning of fiscal year.

²Projected departure FY 2013-2016 is based on assumed monthly attrition of 8 sworn FTEs during the fiscal year.

³Projected new recruits FY 2013-2016 is based on the assumed conduct of four 30 recruit academies with academy attrition of 11.9%.

Staffing Forecast for 35 Recruit Academies FY 2013-2016



Attrition Forecast FY 2013-2016, Assuming Four 35 Recruit Academies

	FY 2013	FY 2014	FY 2015	FY 2016
Budgeted Sworn	1969.5	1969.5	1969.5	1969.5
Filled ¹	1829	1856	1883	1910
Beginning FY Vacancies	140.5	113.5	86.5	59.5
Projected Departures During FY ²	96	96	96	96
Total Vacancies During FY	236.5	209.5	182.5	155.5
New Recruits ³	123	123	123	123
Total Vacancies Remaining	113.5	86.5	59.5	32.50

¹Includes recruits as of beginning of fiscal year.

²Projected departure FY 2013-2016 is based on assumed monthly attrition of 8 sworn FTEs during the fiscal year.

³Projected new recruits FY 2013-2016 is based on the assumed conduct of four 35 recruit academies with academy attrition of 11.9%.

Police Civilian Staffing



- Civilianization is a widespread practice, although there is no guideline for “best mix” of sworn and civilian staffing
- Budget constraints, priorities, & community needs determine what works
- Extensively used in San Diego for decades

Police Civilian Staffing



FY 2008 Sworn to Civilian Comparison ¹	
City	Ratio
Denver, Colorado	6.67
Indianapolis, Indiana	5.37
Dallas, Texas	5.15
Houston, Texas	4.14
<i>San Diego, California²</i>	3.46
Los Angeles, California	3.27
Portland, Oregon	3.07
Phoenix, Arizona	2.59
Austin, Texas	2.48
Las Vegas, Nevada	1.60
<i>Average</i>	3.78

¹ From IBA Review of FY 2009 Proposed Budget

² Excludes parking enforcement positions.

Police Civilian Staffing



- Current budget – 504.25 civilian positions, 62.25 or 12.3% are vacant
- Recent departures related to new retiree health options, only 27 vacancies as of January 2012
- Background checks for the April academy took precedent over civilians

Police Civilian Staffing



- Highest vacancies in Communications (21), Crime Lab (4), Property Room(3), Records (8)
- Experiencing impacts to operations
- Filling the 62.25 civilian positions is top priority along with increasing sworn strength

Police Civilian Staffing



- Department has authorization and budget to hire
- Timely background checks are a challenge
- Department conducting background clearances for departments, Mayor, Council board and commission nominations
- Developing certified lists, testing and interviewing takes time

Police Civilian Staffing



- Department continues to examine processes
- Continues to work with Personnel Department to make improvements
- If academy classes increase in FY 2013, need to ensure sworn hiring does not impact civilian hiring

Civilian Budget Reductions



POLICE CIVILIAN POSITIONS FY 2008 - FY 2012

Fiscal Year	Budgeted Positions ¹	Position Reductions	
		<i>Filled</i>	<i>Vacant</i>
2008	690.75	-	-
2009	690.75	-	(60.75)
2010	630.00	(83.00)	(42.00)
2011	505.00	(5.00)	(2.50)
2012	497.50	-	-
Total Reductions	(193.25)	(88.00)	(105.25)

¹ Budgeted Positions total excludes hourly FTE.

Civilian Budget Reductions



- Department faced significant cuts and difficult choices
- Maintaining sworn officer strength is a top priority
- Vacancies identified first to minimize layoffs (262.75 FTEs)
- After vacancies, department determined filled sworn positions were priority over filled PSO's, PIA's and PCCO's



Civilian Restoration Priorities

- Several Councilmembers have expressed concerns about PSO, PIA, PCCO reductions in budget priorities memos
- Department made operational changes to adjust to these civilian cuts that they believe are working very effectively
- Department's first civilian priorities for restoration: dispatchers, property management staff, records clerks, data entry clerks and lab assistants
- Even though they were vacant when eliminated, these restorations are higher priority than any PSO's, PIA's, and PCCO's from an operational perspective

Civilian Restoration Priorities



- B&FC requested IBA to examine revenue / operational impacts of restoring PCCO's in Permits and Licensing specifically
- Impact of replacing sworn with PCCO's:
 - 10 PCCO's vs. 6 sworn = \$14,000 increase
 - 8 PCCO's vs. 6 sworn = \$158,000 savings
 - 6 PCCO's vs. 6 sworn = \$330,000 savings
- Other operational factors impact number of PCCO's required, some efficiencies have been achieved with sworn
- Department does not feel it is cost effective or operationally desirable to change the current staffing

Next Steps Regarding Civilian Restorations



- Civilians make up 20.4% of department staffing compared to 24% in FY 2009
- Ratio still compares favorably at 3.91
- After increasing academy classes and filling existing civilian vacancies, their priorities are:
Communications, Property Management, Lab, Records, and Data Entry
- Restoration of other civilians including PSO's, PIA's, PCCO's will be addressed in Five-Year Plan
- Five-Year Plan to be presented to PS&NS in July 2012

Recommendations



- PS&NS request Mayor to consider in the May Revise increasing the four FY 2013 academy classes from 25 recruits up to 35 recruits
- Police Department report quarterly to PS&NS on sworn and civilian attrition, recruitment and staffing levels
- PS&NS discuss with Department timing and priorities for civilian restorations. If this is a Council priority for FY 2013, and funding is identified, recommend that Council consider restoring 3-5 civilians based on Department priorities