

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# **REPORT TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION**

DATE ISSUED:	September 22, 2011	REPORT NO. PC-11-074
ATTENTION:	Planning Commission, Agenda of Septe	ember 29, 2011
SUBJECT:	APPEAL OF THE AT&T MOBILITY - 1 NO. 198482; PROCESS 3	BONITA COVE - PROJECT
OWNER: APPLICANT:	City of San Diego AT&T Mobility	

### SUMMARY

**Issue(s):** Should the Planning Commission approve or deny an appeal of the Hearing Officer's decision to approve a new Wireless Communication Facility (WCF) located at 3181 Mission Boulevard within the Mission Bay Park Master Plan?

### **Staff Recommendation:**

- 1. **DENY** the appeal; and
- 2. **UPHOLD** the Hearing Officer's decision to **APPROVE** Coastal Development Permit No. 845258 and Neighborhood Use Permit No. 857966.

<u>Community Planning Group Recommendation</u>: AT&T presented the 30-foot tall clock tower design to both the Mission Beach Town Council (MBTC) and the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board (MBPPB). On March 9, 2011, the MBTC voted against the proposed clock tower project. The MBTC rejected the proposed location and requested that AT&T find another (better) location.

On March 15, 2011, the MBPPB also voted unanimously in opposition of the proposed project (Attachment 12). The MBPPB recommended a less intrusive location away from every day public activity such as park land at or around the Hyatt Islandia.

**Environmental Review:** This project is not pending an appeal of the environmental determination. The environmental exemption determination for this project was made on



April 22, 2011, and the opportunity to appeal that determination ended May 6, 2011 (Attachment 6).

**<u>Fiscal Impact Statement</u>**: None with this action. All costs associated with the processing of this project are paid from a deposit account maintained by the applicant.

Code Enforcement Impact: None with this action.

Housing Impact Statement: None with this action.

# **BACKGROUND**

The project is located at 3181 Mission Boulevard in the CC-4-5 zone within the Mission Bay Park Master Plan, Coastal Overlay Zone (Coastal Appealable), Coastal Height Limitation Overlay Zone, and Council District 2. On May 11, 2011, the Hearing Officer approved Coastal Development Permit (CDP) No. 845258 and Neighborhood Use Permit (NUP) No. 857966 for a new Wireless Communication Facility completely concealed inside a new 30-foot tall clock tower (Attachment 9).

Originally, staff reviewed a separate AT&T design for a faux palm tree (Attachment 10) located within the existing parking lot (design that was approved by the Mission Bay Park Recreation Council). Concerns were raised by City staff of the overall effectiveness to appropriately screen the 8-foot long antennas, the Tower Mounted Amplifiers (TMAs), Remote Radio Units (RRUs), Surge Suppressors, and conduits for each of these components. Staff determined that the combination of these components would be overwhelmingly visible on a faux palm tree and therefore not in compliance with the WCF regulations. Subsequently, both AT&T and Park & Recreation staff collaborated in an effort to achieve a complete concealment facility using design clements from the Mission Bay Park.

On July 6, 2011, a meeting was arranged with members from the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board, the Mission Beach Town Council, a representative of Council District 2 and other members of the community to discuss alternatives to the current location. AT&T was directed to pursue their project across the street at the Mission Beach Plunge, which already supports a roof top T-Mobile project. AT&T was concerned with the leasing viability at this location due to ongoing litigation and bankruptcy issues, but in the spirit of cooperation, AT&T contacted the Court Appointed Receiver to inquire about leasing space for their WCF and unfortunately, the request was summarily rejected with no explanation.

# **DISCUSSION**

# Project Description:

AT&T Mobility submitted this project in an effort to improve the existing network coverage as well as provide increased capacity to the surrounding area. The importance of this site is crucial to the AT&T network as it is in an area with a high concentration of visitors year round. The

search ring specifically identified the current coverage objective as "poor". It is anticipated that the proposed WCF at this location will adequately address and improve the coverage level to "Excellent". The proposed WCF will also include the implementation of LTE (Long Term Evolution) 4G technology.

The proposed AT&T Mobility project consists of twelve panel antennas completely concealed inside a new 30-foot tall clock tower. The uppermost portion of the clock tower will be constructed of Fiberglass Reinforced Panel (FRP) screens allowing the 8-foot long antennas to operate without any interference. Two air conditioning units will be located inside the open roof structure for cooling the associated interior equipment. The equipment associated with this WCF is located on the first floor and will not be visible to the public.

The Remote Radio Units (RRU's), Tower Mounted Amplifiers (TMA's), Surge Suppressors, and the GPS antennas are all located inside the tower to maintain a completely stealth design. The clock tower features elements reminiscent of other Mission Bay Park structures, including mosaic tiles, blue tiles, stucco trim and faux tile windows. There will be two clocks, one facing the west elevation and one facing the east elevation. The proposed landscaping surrounding the base of the clock tower will also help integrate the structure into the park setting, enhancing views of the facility from Mission Boulevard in all directions (Attachment 9).

# Appeal Issues:

On May 24, 2011, both the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board and the Mission Beach Town Council filed an appeal (Attachment 16) of the Hearing Officer's decision to approve the Coastal Development Permit and Neighborhood Use Permit applications. The appeal is based on the belief that there is a conflict with the City of San Diego's City Charter Section 55 Park & Recreation and Section 55.1 Mission Bay Park – Restrictions upon Commercial Development, with the approval of this Wireless Communication Facility.

The appellant argues that the Mission Bay Park Master Plan (MBPMP) does not grant authority to construct a Wireless Communication Facility on dedicated lease areas. Additionally, the proposed location of the 30-foot clock tower causes an unwanted obstruction that blocks views and disrupts enjoyment of the park land for the public to play sports, relax with family and friends and other types of family activities.

Moreover, the appellant also argues that the City of San Diego City Charter Section 55 and Section 55.1 includes restrictions that prohibit any changes in land use or purpose without a vote from the qualified electors. Finally, the appeal goes on to say that the findings from the Hearing Officer disregarded recommendations from the Mission Beach Community and the Mission Bay Park Committee.

## Staff Response:

Consistent with the MBPMP, the proposed development of a WCF would be beneficial to the citizens of San Diego and visitors. As identified in the Master Plan, the continued rise of the

population has resulted in new demands, such as the need for improved wireless communications.

The design of the facility lends itself to becoming a community landmark supporting a clock on the west and east elevations and providing wireless services to both residents and visitors. The overall design of the tower incorporates elements at the pedestrian level as well as overall in terms of the bulk and scale. Again, the MBPMP does not prohibit Wireless Communication Facilities. Instead, the MBPMP acknowledges potential changes and carefully requires land use components to minimize adverse impacts on adjacent areas. Per LDC 141.0420, the WCF has been designed to minimize visibility through the use of architecture, landscape and siting solutions.

In reference to the dedicated lease areas, this section of the MBPMP does not prohibit the lease of a WCF. On page 51 of the MBPMP, the City Charter currently imposes a maximum of 25 percent of land area in Mission Bay Park to be devoted for commercial and non-profit lease. At present, leases total about 404.42 acres, or about 21.4 percent of the total land area of 1887.74 acres. In sum, the proposed AT&T WCF is approximately 235 square feet, resulting in .0005394 of an acre, far below the maximum total amount of 25% in total. The proposed AT&T WCF would result in significantly less than 1%, which would still be within the City Charter mandate.

Additionally, the City Attorney's Office has opined in a November 9, 2001 Memorandum of Law that a facility that is designed and sited so as not to detract from or interfere with the park or its uses, does not violate the dedication to park use or Charter Section 55. Council Policy 700-06, Encroachments on City Property was adopted, in part, to address issues associated with placements of wireless communication facilities in dedicated parks. Basically, the City may grant encroachment authorization if it is determined by the responsible department that it would not change or interfere with the use or purpose of the parkland. The Park and Recreation Department has reviewed and worked cooperatively with AT&T to find the best solution for AT&T that would not interfere with the use of the park.

### **Conclusion:**

It is important to note that while the Mission Bay Park Committee voted to deny the 30-foot tall stealth clock tower, the same committee voted to approve a 30-foot tall faux palm tree in the Mission Bay Park parking lot (Attachment 10). Faux palm trees typically are permitted in settings with other live palms of similar height and species. Ten or more years ago, they were once considered a novelty because there were not many options for providing height in areas where existing tall support structures were non-existent. Additionally, antennas were smaller back then and the associated electrical components were limited in comparison to what is required today for all of the voice and data coverage demanded by consumers. Palm fronds have improved over the years, but they still fall short of a totally natural appearance. Furthermore, antennas have in some case, doubled in length over the years, and fronds are limited in concealing them as well as the RRU's, TMA's, surge suppressors and the required associated conduit. Finally, the existing palm species in the parking lot consists of only Mexican Fan Palms, which would be inconsistent with the current telecom palm design. The goal of the WCF

regulations and policies is to integrate and conceal these facilities when possible and a completely stealth option on the perimeter of the park is far more preferable to an individual faux palm tree supporting a variety of antennas and associated electrical components.

The proposed stealth clock tower complies with the Wireless Communication Antenna Regulations as well as all other applicable regulations, development standards and guidelines of the SDMC, Mission Bay Park Master Plan, Local Coastal Program Land Use Plan, and the General Plan. The project would improve the overall network coverage and capacity to the surrounding area while concealing all aspects of the facility. Therefore, staff recommends the Planning Commission to deny the appeal and uphold the Hearing Officer's decision to approve the Coastal Development Permit No. 845258 and Neighborhood Use Permit No. 857966.

## **ALTERNATIVE**

- 1. **DENY** the Appeal, and **APPROVE** Coastal Development Permit No. 845258 and Neighborhood Use Permit No. 857966, with modifications.
- 2. APPROVE the Appeal and DENY Coastal Development Permit No. 845258 and Neighborhood Use Permit No. 857966, if the findings required to approve the project cannot be affirmed.

Respectfully submitted,

Mike Westlake Program Manager Development Services Department

Simon Tse Associate Planner Development Services Debartment

Attachments:

- 1. Aerial Photograph
- 2. Project Location Map
- 3. Project Data Sheet
- 4. CDP No. 845258 and NUP No. 857966 with Conditions
- 5. CDP No. 845258 and NUP No. 857966 Findings and Resolution
- 6. Notice of Environmental Exemption
- 7. Project Plan
- 8. Photo Survey
- 9. Photosimulation of Clock Tower
- 10. Photosimulation of Faux Palm Tree

- Notice of Public Hearing Appeal to Planning Commission 11.
- 12.
- Project Chronology Community Planning Group Recommendation Ownership Disclosure Statement AT&T Officers Copy of Appeal(s) 13.
- 14.
- 15.
- 16.



North



# Aerial Photo (Birds Eye)

AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West Project No. 198482 3181 Mission Boulevard, San Diego, CA 92109





**Location Map** 

AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West Project No. 198482 3181 Mission Boulevard, San Diego, CA 92109



ATTACHMENT 2

		PROJECT DATA SHEET			
PROJECT NAME:		AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West			
PROJECT DESCRIPTION:		Coastal Development Permit (CDP) and Neighborhood Use Permit for a Wireless Communication Facility (WCF) to completely concealed twelve (12) panel antennas and associated equipment inside a 30-foot high clock tower at 3181 Mission Boulevard in the CC-4-5 Zone within the Mission Bay Park Master Plan.			
COMMUNITY PLAN AREA:		Mission Bay Park			
DISCRETIONARY ACTIONS:		Coastal Development Permit & Neighborhood Use Permit			
COMMUNITY PLA USE DESIGNATIO		Park			
Zone: Height Limit: Front Setback: Side Setback: Rear Setback:	CC-4-3 30-feet ma 10-feet 10-feet 10-feet	ximum h <b>eight</b> limit (Coastal He	ight Limit)		
ADJACE PROPERTI		AND USE DESIGNATION & ZONE	EXISTING LAND USE		
NORTH: SOUTH: EAST:		CC-4-5	Mission Bay Park		
		CC-4-5	Mission Bay Park		
		CC-4-5	Mission Bay Park		
WEST:		OP-1-1	Parking Lot		
DEVIATIONS OR VARIANCES REQUESTED:	None	e			
COMMUNITY PLANNING GROUP RECOMMENDATION:The Mission Bay Park Recreation Council voted to support a Wireless Communication Facility consisting of a 30-foot tall faux mono-palm a associated equipment.					

RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES PERMIT INTAKE, MAIL STATION 501

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

PERMIT INTAKE MAIL STATION 501

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

INTERNAL ORDER NUMBER: 24000473

# COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 845258 NEIGHBORHOOD USE PERMIT NO. 857966 AT&T MOBILITY BONITA WEST COVE PTS NO. 198482 PLANNING COMMISSION

DRAFT

This Coastal Development Permit No. 845, 58 and the Neighborhood Use Permit No. 857966 is granted by the Hearing Officer of the City of Star Director in the CITY DF SAN DIEGO, Owner, and AT&T MOBILITY, mentage, jursual to San Diego Municipal Code [SDMC] section 126.0701, 126.0205 and 141.0420. The site is located at 3181 Mission Boulevard in the CC-4-5 zone of the Mission Bay Park Master Plan. The project site is legally described as that portion of Pueblo Lot 1803, in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California, as shown on the altered map of Mission Beach No. 1809, recorded in the Office of the County Recorder of Said County.

Subject to the terms and conditions set forth in this Permit, permission is granted to Owner and Permittee for a Wireless Communication Facility, described and identified by size, dimension, quantity, type, and location on the approved exhibits [Exhibit "A"] dated September 29, 2011, on file in the Development Services Department.

The project shall include:

- a. A Wireless Communication Facility (WCF) consisting of twelve (12) panel antennas completely concealed inside a 30-foot high clock tower behind Fiberglass Reinforced Panel (FRP) screenings with the associated equipment located inside the structure as illustrated on the approved [Exhibit "A"] date September 29, 2011, on file in the Development Services Department.
- b. Landscaping (planting, irrigation and landscape related improvements);
- c. Accessory improvements determined by the City Manager to be consistent with the land use and development standards in effect for this site per the adopted community plan,

California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines, public and private improvement requirements of the City Engineer, the underlying zone(s), conditions of this Permit, and any other applicable regulations of the SDMC in effect for this site.

## STANDARD REQUIREMENTS:

1. This permit must be utilized within thirty-six (36) months after the date on which all rights of appeal have expired. Failure to utilize and maintain utilization of this permit as described in the SDMC will automatically void the permit unless an Extension of Time has been granted. Any such Extension of Time must meet all SDMC requirements and applicable guidelines in affect at the time the extension is considered by the appropriate decision maker.

2. No permit for the construction, occupancy or operation of any facility or improvement described herein shall be granted, nor shall any activity authorized by this Permit be conducted on the premises until:

- a. The Owner/Permittee signs and returns the Permit to the Development Services Department; and
- b. The Permit is recorded in the Office of the San Diego County Recorder.

3. Unless this Permit has been reloked by the City of an Diego the property included by reference within this Permit shall be accuracily for the purposed and under the terms and conditions set forth in this Permit up ess otherwise authorized by the Development Services Department.

4. This Permit is a covenant running with the subject property and shall be binding upon the Owner/Permittee and any successor or successors, and the interests of any successor shall be subject to each and every condition set out in this Permit and all referenced documents.

5. The continued use of this Permit shall be subject to the regulations of this and any other applicable governmental agency.

6. Issuance of this Permit by the City of San Diego does not authorize the Owner/Permittee for this permit to violate any Federal, State or City laws, ordinances, regulations or policies including, but not limited to, the Endangered Species Act of 1973 [ESA] and any amendments thereto (16 U.S.C. § 1531 et seq.).

7. The Permittee shall secure all necessary building permits. The Permittee is informed that to secure these permits, substantial modifications to the building and site improvements to comply with applicable building, fire, mechanical and plumbing codes and State law requiring access for disabled people may be required.

8. Construction plans shall be in substantial conformity to Exhibit "A." No changes, modifications or alterations shall be made unless appropriate application(s) or amendment(s) to this Permit have been granted.

9. All of the conditions contained in this Permit have been considered and have been determined to be necessary in order to make the findings required for this Permit. It is the intent of the City that the holder of this Permit be required to comply with each and every condition in order to be afforded the special rights which the holder of the Permit is entitled as a result of obtaining this Permit.

In the event that any condition of this Permit, on a legal challenge by the Owner/Permittee of this Permit, is found or held by a court of competent jurisdiction to be invalid, unenforceable, or unreasonable, this Permit shall be void. However, in such an event, the Owner/Permittee shall have the right, by paying applicable processing fees, to bring a request for a new permit without the "invalid" conditions(s) back to the discretionary body which approved the Permit for a determination by that body as to whether all of the findings necessary for the issuance of the proposed permit can still be made in the absence of the "invalid" condition(s). Such hearing shall be a hearing de novo and the discretionary body shall have the absolute right to approve, disapprove, or modify the proposed permit and the condition(s) contained therein.

10. The Permitee shall defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City, its agents, officers, and employees from any and all claims, actions, proceedings, damages, judgments, or costs, including attorney's fees, against the City or its agents, officers, or employees, relating to the issuance of this permit including, but not limited to, any action to attack, set aside, void, challenge, or annul this development approval and any environmental document or decision. The City will promptly notify Permite cliany caim, coion, or proceeding and, if the City should fail to cooperate fully in the defense, the second set all not the second be responsible to defend, indemnify, and hold harn ess the City or R agents, officers, and employees. The City may elect to conduct its own defense, participate in its own defense, or obtain independent legal counsel in defense of any claim related to this indemnification. In the event of such election, Permitee shall pay all of the costs related thereto, including without limitation reasonable attorney's fees and costs. In the event of a disagreement between the City and Permitee regarding litigation issues, the City shall have the authority to control the litigation and make litigation related decisions, including, but not limited to, settlement or other disposition of the matter. However, the Permitee shall not be required to pay or perform any settlement unless such settlement is approved by Permitee.

11. The proposed design complies with the Telecommunication Facility Guidelines as a Complete Concealment Facility and as a result, the permit will not contain an expiration date. It is the responsibility of the wireless carrier to maintain the appearance of the approved facility to the conditions set forth in this permit unless the site is removed and restored to its original condition. Code compliance shall be notified if the appearance or the scope of the project has changed without the approval of the Development Services Department.

## ENGINEERING REQUIREMENTS:

12. Prior to the issuance of any construction permits, the Permittee shall incorporate any construction Best Management Practices necessary to comply with Chapter 14, Article 2, Division 1 (Grading Regulations) of the Municipal Code, into the construction plans or specifications.

13. Prior to the issuance of any construction permits, the Permittee shall submit a Water Pollution Control Plan (WPCP). The WPCP shall be prepared in accordance with the guidelines in Appendix E of the City's Storm Water Standards.

14. Prior to the issuance of any construction permits, the Permittee shall obtain a Nonexclusive Right-of-Way Use Agreement from the City of San Diego for the proposed telecommunication facilities within Mission Boulevard.

15. Prior to the issuance of any construction permits, the Permittee shall obtain a Public Rightof-Way Permit for the construction of facilities in Mission Boulevard, satisfactory to the City Engineer.

16. The Permittee shall assure, by permit and bond, the proposed work in the City right-of-way, show all of the proposed work on City Standard "D Sheets" and upon completion and acceptance of the work by the City Engineer, the Permittee shall as-built the drawings, satisfactory to the City Engineer.

17. Any party on whom fees, dedications, reservations or other exactions have been imposed as conditions of approval of this development permit, may protest the imposition within 90 days of the approval of this development permit by filing a written protest with the City Clerk pursuant to California Government Code 66020

# LANDSCAPE REQUIPEMEN

18. No trees shall be removed as part of this project.

19. Landscape areas damaged during construction shall be replaced in kind to the satisfaction of the Park & Recreation Dept. and revegetated by the Permittee, if necessary, per the Land Development Manual: Landscape Standards and the Landscape Regulations.

# PARK & RECREATION REQUIREMENTS:

20. The Park and Recreation Department shall review and approve all improvement plans prior to building permit issuance.

## PLANNING REQUIREMENTS:

21. Equipment associated with this WCF (Remote Radio Units, Tower Mounted Amplifiers, Surge Suppressors, and the GPS antennas) shall be located inside the tower, not visible to the public.

22. A topographical survey conforming to the provisions of the SDMC may be required if it is determined, during construction, that there may be a conflict between the building(s) under construction and a condition of this Permit or a regulation of the underlying zone. The cost of any such survey shall be borne by the Permittee.

23. There shall be compliance with the regulations of the underlying zone(s) unless a deviation or variance to a specific regulation(s) is approved or granted as a condition of approval of this Permit. Where there is a conflict (including exhibits) of this Permit and a regulation of the underlying zone, the regulation shall prevail unless the condition provides for a deviation or variance from the regulations. Where condition (including exhibits) for this Permit establishes a provision which is more restrictive than the corresponding regulation of the underlying zone, then the condition shall prevail.

24. The building materials and paint used for the RF transparent screen shall not result in any noticeable lines or edges in the transition as illustrated in the approved Exhibit "A".

25. The photosimlation(s) for the proposed project must be printed (not stapled) on the building plans. This is to ensure the construction team building the project is aware of the City's expectations with regard to the appearance of the finished project.

26. The height(s) of the building(s) or structure(s) shall not exceed those heights set forth in the conditions and exhibits (including, but not limited to, elevations, and cross sections) or the maximum permitted building height of the underlying zone, whichever is lower, unless a deviation or variance to the height limit has been granted as a specific condition of this permit.

27. Any future requested amendments to this Permit shall be reviewed for compliance with the regulations of the underlying zone(s which are in effect on the date of the submittal of the requested amendment.

28. No mechanical equipment, tank, duct, elevator, cooling tower, mechanical ventilator or air conditioner shall be erected, constructed, converted, established, altered, or enlarged on the roof of any building, unless all such equipment and appurtenances are contained within a completely enclosed, architecturally integrated structure whose top and sides may include grillwork, louvers, and latticework.

29. Prior to the issuance of a construction permit, the Permittee shall provide a certified cumulative radio frequency model study demonstrating compliance with the Federal Communications Commission's Radio Frequency Guidelines. All significant contributors to the ambient RF environment should be considered in the radio frequency model study.

30. Prior to obtaining a Construction Permit the following items must be illustrated on the construction drawings; coax cable tray, meters, telco, A/C units, generator receptacles, cable runs, bridges, dog houses and external ports. These appurtenances must be minimized visually so as to avoid the effect of changing the outward appearance of the project from what was approved on the exhibits.

31. The Permittee is responsible for notifying the city prior to the sale or takeover of this site to any other provider.

32. All private outdoor lighting shall be shaded and adjusted to fall on the same premises where such lights are located and in accordance with the applicable regulations in the SDMC.

33. Per LDC Section §59.5.0404 Construction Noise (a), It shall be unlawful for any person, between the hours of 7:00 p.m. of any day and 7:00 a.m. of the following day, or on legal holidays as specified in Section 21.04 of the San Diego Municipal Code, with exception of Columbus Day and Washington's Birthday, or on Sundays, to erect, construct, demolish, excavate for, alter or repair any building or structure in such a manner as to create disturbing, excessive or offensive noise unless a permit has been applied for and granted beforehand by the Noise Abatement and Control Administrator.

## **INFORMATION ONLY:**

- Please note that an Administrative Planning Hold will be placed on the project prior to Final Clearance from the City's Building Inspector to ensure compliance with the approved plans and associated conditions. <u>Prior to calling for your Final Inspection from</u> your building inspection official, please contact the Project Manager listed below at (619) 687-5984 to schedule an inspection of the completed facility. Please schedule this administrative inspection at least five working days ahead of the requested Final Inspection date.
- Any party on whom fees, dedications, reservations, or other exactions have been imposed as conditions of approval of this development permit, may protest the imposition within ninety days of the approval of this development permit by filing a written protest with the City Clerk pursuant to California G vernment Code §66020.
- This development may be subject to impact fees : the time of construction permit issuance

APPROVED by the Planning Commission of the City of San Diego on September 29, 2011 and Approved Resolution No. <u>HO-6421</u>.

Coastal Development Permit No. 845258 Neighborhood Use Permit No. 857966 PTS No. 198482/Internal Order No. 24000473 Date of Approval: September 29, 2011

AUTHENTICATED BY THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

Simon Tse - Associate Planner

**NOTE:** Notary acknowledgment must be attached per Civil Code section 1189 et seq.

The undersigned Owner/Permittee, by execution hereof, agrees to each and every condition of this Permit and promises the permittee hereunder.



By

NAME TITLE

AT&T MOBILITY Permittee

By\_

NAME TITLE

**NOTE:** Notary acknowledgments must be attached per Civil Code section 1189 et seq.

## DRAFT PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. HO-6421 COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 845258 NEIGHBORHOOD USE PERMIT NO. 857966 AT&T MOBILITY WEST BONITA COVE PROJECT NO. 198482

WHEREAS, CITY OF SAN DIEGO, Owner, AT&T MOBILITY, Permittee, filed an application with the City of San Diego for a permit to install a Wireless Communication Facility (WCF) consisting of twelve panel antennas and associated equipment completely concealed inside a 30-foot high clock tower with proposed landscaping as described in and by reference to the approved Exhibits "A" and corresponding conditions of approval for the associated Coastal Development Permit No. 845258 and Neighborhood Use Permit No. 857966;

WHEREAS, the project site is located at 3181 Mission Boulevard in the CC-4-5 zone of the Mission Bay Park Master Plan;

WHEREAS, the project site is legally described as that portion of Pueblo Lot 1803, in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California, as shown on the altered map of Mission Beach No. 1809, recorded in the Office of the County Recorder of Said County;

WHEREAS, on April 22, 2014 the Circuit Son Dieto, as Land Agency alrough the Development Services Department, made and issued an Epsiron de tal Letermination that the project is exempt from the California Environment I Quality act (SEQA) (Dialic desources Code section 21000 et. seq.) under CEQA Guideline Section 1 2022 New construction or conversion of small structures) and there was no appeal of the Environmental Determination filed within the time period provided by San Diego Municipal Code Section 112.0520;

WHEREAS, on May 11, 2011, the Hearing Officer of the City of San Diego considered COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 845258 and NEIGHBORHOOD USE PERMIT NO. 857966, pursuant to the Land Development Code of the City of San Diego; and

WHEREAS, on May 24, 2011, an appeal was filed to the City of San Diego by the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board and the Mission Beach Town Council to the Hearing Officer's decision; and

WHEREAS, on September 29, 2011, the Planning Commission of the City of San Diego has considered the appeal and all plans, exhibits and written documentations contained in the file for this project on record in the City of San Diego, and has considered the oral presentation given at the public hearing; and considered COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 845258 and NEIGHBORHOOD USE PERMIT NO. 857966 pursuant to the Land Development Code of the City of San Diego;

BE IT RESOLVED by the Planning Commission of the City of San Diego as follows:

That the Planning Commission adopts the following written Findings, dated September 29, 2011.

## FINDINGS:

### Coastal Development Permit - Section 126.0708

1. The proposed coastal development will not encroach upon any existing physical access way that is legally used by the public or any proposed public accessway identified in a Local Coastal Program land use plan; and the proposed coastal development will enhance and protect public views to and along the ocean and other scenic coastal areas as specified in the Local Coastal Program land use plan; and

The entire Mission Bay Park is located within the Coastal Zone. Consequently, this Master Plan includes planning and development standards to protect and preserve the state's coastal resources pursuant to the adoption and certification of the City of San Diego's Local Coastal Program. As designed, the proposed WCF will not encroach upon any existing physical access way that is legally used by the public. Instead, the clock tower design provides an element that serves a function to park visitors. Landscaping is also proposed around the clock tower to enhance the public views to and along Mission Boulevard. Therefore, the proposed project will not impact any public views to or along the ocean or other scenic coastal areas specified in the Local Coastal Program land use plan.

# 2. The proposed coastal development will not adversely affect environmentally sensitive lands; and

The proposed project will not advorsely affect environmentally cansitive lands and thus will not cause any impacts.

# 3. The proposed coast of development is in comformity with the certified Local Coastal Program land use plan and complies with all regulations of the certified Implementation Program; and

The proposed project conforms to the certified Mission Bay Park Master Plan and the Local Coastal Program and is consistent with the design guidelines, and development standards in effect for this site per the Coastal Overlay Zone (Coastal Appealable).

## 4. For every Coastal Development Permit issued for any coastal development between the nearest public road and the sea or the shoreline of any body of water located within the Coastal Overlay Zone the coastal development is in conformity with the public access and public recreation policies of Chapter 3 of the California Coastal Act.

The proposed project is not within the area between the first public road and the sea or shoreline of any body of water within the Coastal Overlay Zone. No deviations or variances from the development regulations are required to implement the proposed project. The proposed coastal development will conform to the public access and public recreation policies of Chapter 3 of the California Coastal Act.

### Neighborhood Use Permit - Section 126.0205

1. The proposed development will not adversely affect the applicable land use plan; The City of San Diego General Plan addresses Wireless Facilities in section UD-A.15. The intent of this section is to minimize the visual impact of Wireless Facilities by utilizing camouflage and

screening techniques to hide or blend them into the surrounding area, design aesthetically pleasing facilities that are respectful of the neighborhood context, and conceal associated equipment in underground vaults or unobtrusive structures. In this case, both the equipment and the antennas are completely concealed inside a new 30-foot high clock tower featuring design elements from the Mission Bay Park. The antennas are placed behind Fiberglass Reinforced Panel (FRP) materials on the upper most portion of the tower. The equipment will be located on the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> story. Along with the proposed landscaping the project has been designed to integrate with the surrounding park setting with minimal impacts to the park use. The City's General Plan requires that WCF's be respectful of the neighborhood context and minimally visible. In this case, the proposed WCF meets the requirements of the WCF regulations of the Land Development Code and the intent of the City's General Plan.

2. The proposed development will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, and welfare; and The Telecommunication Act of 1996 preempts local governments from regulating the "placement, construction and modification of wireless communication facilities on the basis of the environmental effects of Radio Frequency (RF) emissions to the extent that such facilities comply with the Federal Communication Commission's (FCC) standards for such emissions." The proposed project would be consistent with the FCC's regulations for wireless facilities. To insure that the FCC standards are being met, a condition has been added to the permit that requires that AT&T Mobility submit a RF study to demonstrate compliance with the applicable FCC regulations prior to building permit issuance. Therefore, based on the above, the project would not result in any significant health or safety risks to the surrounding area within matters of the City's jurisdiction.

The proposed devel on ent Vil co with the applicable regulations of the Land 3. Development Code The project completes with Ill applicable cevelopment regulations of the Land Development Code. The project is located in the CC-4-5 zone and the antennas associated with this WCF are at least a minimum of 100 feet away from the property lines of daycare, elementary and middle schools, and residential uses requiring a Neighborhood Use Permit. The project is also located within the Coastal Appealable Area, which requires a Coastal Development Permit, and is process as a consolidated Process 3, Hearing Officer's decision. The 30-foot clock tower has been designed to completely conceal all twelve (12) antennas, associated components and mounting brackets. Additionally, equipment associated with the operation of this WCF is fully concealed inside the tower, on the first and second floor. As designed, the project complies with Land Development Code Section 141.0420 Wireless Communication Regulations. This section of the Code requires all applicants to conceal or minimize the visual impacts of the Wireless Communication Facilities through integration. Such integration includes the use of architecture, landscaping and creative siting solutions.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that, based on the findings hereinbefore adopted by the PLANNING COMMISSION, COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 845258 and NEIGHBORHOOD USE PERMIT NO. 857966 is hereby GRANTED by the PLANNING COMMISSION to the referenced Owner/Permittee, in the form, exhibits, terms and conditions as set forth in COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 845258 and NEIGHBORHOOD USE PERMIT NO. 857966 a copy of which is attached hereto and made a part hereof.

Simon Tse Associate Planner Development Services

Adopted on: September 29, 2011 Internal Order No. 24000473

DRAFT

### NOTICE OF EXEMPTION

(Check one or both)

TO: <u>X</u> RECORDER/COUNTY CLERK P.O. BOX 1750, MS A-33 1600 PACIFIC HWY, ROOM 260 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101-2422 FROM: CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

OFFICE OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH 1400 TENTH STREET, ROOM 121 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814

PROJECT NO.: 198482

#### PROJECT TITLE: AT&T Bonita Cove West

<u>PROJECT LOCATION-SPECIFIC:</u> The project is located within Mission Bay Park, south of West Mission Bay Drive, east of Mission Boulevard and the Plunge amusement area.

PROJECT LOCATION-CITY/COUNTY: San Diego/San Diego

<u>DESCRIPTION OF NATURE AND PURPOSE OF THE PROJECT</u>: A Coastal Development Permit for the installation and operation of twelve panel antennas and associated equipment cabinets for the AT&T telecommunications network. The twelve antennas would be placed within a newly constructed 30 foot high, clock tower totaling 320 square-feet. The facility would be located in a grassy area, adjacent to an existing parking lot, east of Mission Boulevard, south of West Mission Bay Drive and within Bonita Cove West Park.

NAME OF PUBLIC AGENCY APPROVING PROJECT: City of San Diego

<u>NAME OF PERSON OR AGENCY CARRYING OUT PROJECT:</u> AT&T Mobility, contact Kevin Becker 5738 Pacific Center Boulevard San Diego California 92128. (858) 717-7908

### EXEMPT STATUS: (CHECK ONE)

- () MINISTERIAL (SEC. 21080(b)(1); 15268);
- () DECLARED EMERGENCY (SEC. 21080(b)(3); 15269(a));
- () EMERGENCY PROJECT (SEC. 21080(b)(4); 15269 (b)(c)
- (X) CATEGORICAL EXEMPTION: 15303 (NEW CONSTRUCTION)
- () STATUTORY EXEMPTION:

<u>REASONS WHY PROJECT IS EXEMPT</u>: The City of San Diego conducted an Initial Study which determined that the project would qualify to be categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 (new construction). The project as proposed is consistent with both the Mission Beach Community Plan and Mission Bay Park Master Plan and as designed it is consistent with all height and setback regulations. The site does not contain historical or biological resources. The exemption allows for the installation and construction of small structures, and where the exceptions listed in CEQA Section 15300.2 would not apply.

LEAD AGENCY CONTACT PERSON: JEFF SZYMANSKI

<u>TELEPHONE:</u> (619) 446-5324

### IF FILED BY APPLICANT:

- 1. ATTACH CERTIFIED DOCUMENT OF EXEMPTION FINDING.
- 2. HAS A NOTICE OF EXEMPTION BEEN FILED BY THE PUBLIC AGENCY APPROVING THE PROJECT? () YES () NO

IT IS HEREBY CERTIFIED THAT THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO HAS DETERMINED THE ABOVE ACTIVITY TO BE EXEMPT FROM

Max 1 Sewor Rean SIGNA/URE/TITLE

<u>April 22, 2011</u> DATE

( ) SIGNED BY APPLICANT

(X) SIGNED BY LEAD AGENCY

CHECK ONE:

DATE RECEIVED FOR FILING WITH COUNTY CLERK OR OPR:



# SS0068 **BONITA COVE WEST**

3181 MISSION BOULEVARD SAN DIEGO, CA 92109

T01

Z01

Z02

Z03

Z04

Z05

L01

- DRIVING DIRECTIONS FROM AT&T OFFICE:
- HEAD WEST ON LUSK BOULEVARD & TURN RIGHT AT VISTA SORRENTO PARKWAY,
- TURN LEFT AT SORRENTO VALLEY HOULEVARD.
- TURN RIGHT AT ROSEULE STREET.
- TURN LEFT AND MERGE ONTO 1-5 SOUTH.
- TAKE EXIT 23 TOWARD BALBOA AVENUE/GARNET AVENUE.
- MERGE ONTO MISSION BAY DRIVE.
- TURN RIGHT AT GARNET AVENUE.
- CONTINUE ONTO BALBOA AVENEUE.
- CONTINUE ONTO GRAND AVENUE.
- TURN LEFT AT MISSION BOULEVARD.
- MAKE A LEFT TURN AT APPROXIMATELY 3115 MISSION BOULEVARD INTO THE PARKING LOT.
- THE SITE WILL BE ON THE LEFT.

PROJECT APPLICANT: ATAY MOBILITY 5738 PACIFIC CENTER BLVD. SAN DIEGO, CA 92121

CONSTRUCTION MANAGER: BRIAN SVENONIUS BLACK AND VEATCH 9820 WILLOW CREEK ROAD. SURE 310 SAN DEIGO, CA 92131

PLANNING REPRESENTATIVE: SHELLY KILBOURN PLANCOM INC. JUZ STATE PLACE ESCONDUDO, CA 92029 619.208.4885 PHONE

STE ACQUISITION: DUFFY DAUGHERTY PLANCOM INC. 302 STATE PLACE ESCONDIDD, CA 92029 925.548.2050 PHONE

1

5

R.F. ENGINEERING REPRESENTATIVE: RAM JINDAL RAY JINLAL ATACT WOBILITY 5738 PACIFIC CENTER BLVD. SAN DIEGO, CA 92121 619.599.3254 PHONE



# VICINITY MAP

#### LEGAL DESCRIPTION:

(PENDING RECEIPT OF TITLE REPORT)

THAT PORTION OF PUEBLO LOT 1803. IN THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO, COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, AS SHOWN ON THE ALTERED MAP OF MISSION 843CH NO. 1809, RECORDED IN THE OFFICE OF THE COUNTY RECORDER OF SAID COUNTY.

#### LEGAL DESCRIPTION

!	TYPE OF INSPECTION	DESIGN STRENGT
	I	

<u>PROPERTY\_OWNER:</u> CTY OF SAN DIEGO/PUBLIC AGENCY

ARCHITECT: DI DONATO ASSOCIATES 3039 FIRST AVE, SUITE 100 SAN DIEGO, CA 92103 619.239.4210 PHONE 619.239.4250 FAX

2

6

LONGITUDE: 11715'01.63" W

LATITUDE: 32'46'12.28' N

101AL SITE AREA: 1,357,765.2 SF (31.17 AC)

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

SITE ADDRESS; 3181 MISSION BOULEVARD SAN DECO CA 92109

ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER: 423-680-12-00

EXISTING FLOOR AREA:

EROPOSED PROJECT AREA: APPROX, 320 SF

TELEPHONE: ATAT

<u>OVERLAY ZONES:</u> COASTAL HEIGHT LIWIT

PROPOSED TYPE OF CONSTRUCTION:

ALL WORK SHALL COMPLY WITH THE FOLLOW APPLICABLE CODES:

CALIFORNIA BUILDING CODE, 2007 EDITION

CALIFORNIA PLUMBING CODE, 2007 EDITION

CAUFORNIA MECHANICAL CODE, 2007 EDITION

CAUFORNIA ELECTRICAL CODE, 2007 EDITION CALIFORNIA FIRE CODE, 2007 EDITION

IN THE EVENT OF CONFLICT, THE MOST RESTRICTIVE CODE SHALL PREVAIL

#### PROJECT INFORMATION

ADA COMPLIANCE

FACILITY IS UNMANNED AND NOT FOR HUMAN HABITATION. WIRELESS TOLEODMUNICATIONS MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT ROOMS ARE EXEMPT FROM REQUIREMENTS TO PROMDE BUILDING UPGRADES FOR DISABLED ACCESS PER THE FOLLOWING:

CBC SECTION NOSE-BUILDING ACCESSIBILITY CAL ACS ACCESSIBILITY STANDARDS INTERPRETIVE MANUAL

CONSTRUCTION REPRESENTATIVE	
ITE ACQUISMON	
I.F. ENGINEERING REPRESENTATIVE	
LANNING REPRESENTATIVE	
TAT REPRESENTATIVE	
ANDLORD	
DM-E911	

# CURRENT USE: EXISTING OCCUPANCY:

<u>Setbacks:</u> Front: 10' Side: 10' Street Side: 10' Rear: 10'

WATER/SEWACE:

UNUTIES:

THE PROJECT CONSISTS OF THE INSTALLATION AND OPERATION DF (12) TWELVE PANEL ANTENNAS AND ASSOCIATED EQUIPMENT CABINETS FOR AT&F TELECOMMUNICATIONS NETWORK.

A TOTAL OF (12) TWELVE ANTENNAS ARE TO BE MOUNTED IN A PROPOSED CLOCK TOWER, A TOTAL OF (8) EIGHT INDOOR EQUIPMENT CABINETS ARE TO BE LOCATED IN TWO LEVELS OF AN EQUIPMENT ROOM WITHIN THE PROPOSED TOWER.

THE FACILITY WILL ENHANCE THE GENERAL HEALTH, SAFETY, AND WELFARE OF THE DOUNTY AND SURROUNDING CITIES BY PROMOINC MORE RELABLE CELLULAR COMMUNICATION AT THIS LOCATION.

FIRE DEPT .: CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# EXISTING TYPE OF CONSTRUCTION:

3

7

<u>JURISDICTION:</u> City of San Diego

ELECTRICAL: SDG&E

EXISTING ZONING:

TITLE SHEET

SITE PLAN AREA PLAN SITE ELEVATIONS SITE ELEVATIONS ANTENNA DETAILS

LANDSCAPE DEVELOPMENT PLAN









NOTE: ALL NOTES REFERRING TO "MATCH EDISTING" REFER TO THE RESTROOM BAILDING ACROSS THE STREET.













E.	Common rame	Size	Qty	x	Mature height/ spread	Form/function
elenli	Pygniy date Palm	45" pos. multi- trunk with min. of 3 trunks per bound potrn	3	1003	810° TALL 68° ₩IDE	VERTICAL ACCENT
ES	VARITES	existing	N/A	N/A	VARIES	VARIES
8	VARIES	existing	R/A	N/A	VARIES	VARIES
45	INDIAN Hawithorn	5 gollen	n/a	106%	4'-5' TALL 5'-6' Wide	ACCENT SHRUB
IS	uly-of- Rhe-Nile	5 gallen	n/a	100%	4'-5' TALL 2'-3' Wide	ACCENT SHRUB

. THE PLANTING PLAN IS DAGRAMMATIC AND SHALL BE USED AS A GUIDE FOR SETTING OUT PLANTS. PRIOR TO PLANTING, THE PARK & RECREATION DEPARTMENT STAFF REPRESENTATIVE SHALL REVIEW ALL PLANT LOGATIONS.

2. LANDSCAPE CONTRACTOR SHALL MAINTAIN ALL PLANTINGS FOR A PERIOD OF TWENTY-FOUR (24) MONTHS ATTER FINAL ACCENTANCE OF THE BUILDING. ALL AREAS SHALL HE KEPT CLEAN, WATERED AND WEED-FREE. ALL DEAD OR UTING PLANTS WATERED SHALL BE REPLACED WITHIN TWO (2) WEEKS. OWNER SHALL MAINTAIN SITE AFTER CONTRACTOR MAINTENANCE PERIOD.

IRRIGATION: AN AUTOMATIC, ELECTRONICALLY CONTROLLED IRRICATION SYSTEM SHALL BE PROVIDED AS REQUIRED FOR PROPER IRRIGATION, DEVELOPMENT AND MUINTENAACE OF THE VEGETATION IN A HEALTHY, DESEASE-RESISTANT CONDITION. THE DESIGN OF THE SYSTEM SHALL PROVIDE NEGRAIATE SUPPORT FOR THE VEGETATION SELECTED, TYPE OF IRRIGATION SYSTEM PROPOSED: DRIP.

ALL DAMAGE TO THE SURROUNDING PARK AREA SHALL BE CORRECTED BY THE CONTRACTOR AND APPROVED BY THE PARK & RECREATION DEPARTMENT.

5. THE CONTRACTOR SHALL ENSURE THAT EXISTING (RRIGATION IS ADJUSTED AND MODIFIED FOR EVEN AND ADEQUATE COVERAGE OF THE MODIFIED TURF AREA.



2



GENERAL NOTES:

1

A PROR TO THE ISSUANCE OF ANY CONSTRUCTION PERMIT, THE OWNER/PERMITTEE SHALL INCORPORATE ANY CONSTRUCTION BEST MANGEMENT PRACTORS NECESSARY TO COMPLY WITH CHAPTER 14, ANTICLE 2, DWISION 1 (GRADING REGRATIONS) OF THE SAN DECO MUNICIPAL CODE, INTO THE CONSTRUCTION PLANS OR SPECIFICATIONS.































7


### ATTACHMENT 9



SS0068 Bonita Cove West 3181 Mission Blvd. San Diego, CA 92109



Proposed antennas and equipment mounted within new tower\_\_\_\_\_

the de the booth

Proposed landscaping\_





18 H H





**Pixelated Summer** by Sarah Lejeune with Angelo Camporaso 2008 South Belmont Park Comfort Station, 3000 Block Mission Boulevard, 92109







Photosimulation of proposed telecommunications site



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Date of Notice: September 15, 2011 NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING APPEAL TO PLANNING COMMISSION

Internal Order No. 24000473

As a property owner, tenant, or person who has requested notice, you should know that a public hearing will be held by the Planning Commission to consider an appeal of the May 11, 2011, Hearing Officer decision to approve an application for a (Process 3) Coastal Development Permit and Neighborhood Use Permit for a Wireless Communication Facility. The project site is located at 3181 Mission Boulevard in the CC-4-5 zone of the Mission Bay Park Master Plan, Coastal Overlay Zone (Appealable), Coastal Height Limitation Overlay Zone, and Council District 2.

DATE OF HEARING:	September 29, 2011
TIME OF HEARING:	9:00AM
LOCATION OF HEARING:	Council Chambers, 12 <sup>th</sup> Floor, City Administrative
	Building, 202 C Street, San Diego, California 92101
PROJECT TYPE/PROJECT NUMBER:	COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT/
	NEIGHBORHOOD USE PERMIT, PTS 198482
	PROCESS 3
PROJECT NAME:	APPEAL OF THE AT&T MOBILITY BONITA COVE
	WEST
APPLICANT NAME:	Shelly Kilbourn, PlanCom, Inc.
COMMUNITY PLAN AREA:	Mission Bay Park Master Plan
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	2
CITY PROJECT MANAGER:	Simon Tse, Associate Planner
PHONE NUMBER/E-MAIL:	(619) 687-5984/ <u>Stse@sandiego.gov</u>

The decision made by the Planning Commission is the final decision by the City.

The final decision by the City of San Diego is appealable to the California Coastal Commission in accordance with Land Development Code Section 126.0710(a). Appeals to the Coastal Commission must be filed with the Coastal Commission at 7575 Metropolitan Drive, Suite 103, San Diego, CA 92108. (Phone: 619-767-2370). Appeals must be filed within 10 working days of the Coastal Commission receiving a Notice of Final Action from the City.

If you wish to challenge the City's action on the above proceedings in court, you may be limited to addressing only those issues you or someone else have raised at the public hearing described in this notice, or written in correspondence to the City at or before the public hearing.

This project was determined to be categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act on April 20, 2011 and the opportunity to appeal that determination ended May 4, 2011.

If you have any questions about this matter, you can contact the City Project Manager listed above. This information will be made available in alternative formats upon request. To request an agenda in alternative format or to request a sign language or oral interpreter for the meeting, call <u>Support Services at</u> (619) 321-3208 at least five working days prior to the meeting to insure availability. Assistive Listening Devices (ALD's) are also available for the meeting upon request.

Rev 7-27-11 HMD

### **ATTACHMENT 12**

### AT&T MOBILITY BONITA COVE WEST PROJECT CHRONOLOGY PTS #198482 INT #24000473

Date	Action	Description	City Review	Applicant Response
9/2/2010	Completeness Check	Project Deemed Complete		
10/20/2010	First Assessment Letter		48 days	
2/18/2011	Second Submittal			120 days
3/16/2011	Second Assessment Letter		36 days	
3/28/2011	Third Submittal			12 days
4/22/2011	All issues cleared		25 days	
5/11/2011	Hearing Officer		19 days	
5/24/2011	Project appealed		3 days	
9/29/2011	Public Hearing appeal to Planning Commission		128 days	
Tota	l Staff Time:	Does not include City Holidays and Furlough	259 Calendar days	
Total Applicant Time:		Does not include City Holidays and Furlough		132 Calendar days
Total Proj	Total Project Running Time:From Deemed Complete to PC Hearing388 Calendar da		alendar days	

### **MINUTES**

### City of San Diego Park and Recreation Board

### **MISSION BAY PARK COMMITTEE**

April 5, 2011

Meeting Location: Santa Clara Point Recreation Center 1008 Santa Clara Place San Diego, CA 92109

### Mailing address is:

Park and Recreation Department Developed Regional Parks 2125 Park Blvd. Attn: Mission Bay Park Manager San Diego, CA 92101

### Members Present

Kevin Konopasek David Potter Paul Robinson

Katy Bendel

Rick Bussell Jim Greene

### Members Absent

Lani Lutar Cynthia Hedgecock (exc) Judy Swink (exc)

### Staff Present

Stacy McKenzie

### CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Paul Robinson called the meeting to order at 6:03 PM.

### APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

MSC IT WAS MOVED/SECONDED AND CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE FEBRUARY 1, 2011 MEETING.

### (POTTER/BUSSELL 6-0-0)

### **NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT / COMMUNICATIONS**

Don Gross – Mr. Gross wanted to let the Committee know that there is not enough sand on the walkway at Fiesta Island on either side of the entrance. Mr. Gross says that there should be about 6 feet on either side so that people are not walking on the road. Mr. Gross also commented on the "No Vehicle" signage. Mr. Gross pointed out that the sign says no vehicle after 10:00 pm, although the signs in the parking lot says no parking from 2:00 AM to 4:00 AM. Mr. Gross also mentioned the ground breaking for the Rose Creek Bridge.

### CHAIRPERSONS REPORT

Mr. Robinson stated that he will be out of town on Tuesday, May 3, 2011, the date of the next Mission Bay Park Committee meeting. Mr. Robinson requested the one agenda item be trailed until June and that May be dark unless there are other concerns.

### STAFF REPORTS

Thyme Curtis, Council Representative 2

Ms Curtis was not present at tonight's meeting.

### Council Representative 6

There is no representative for Council District 6 at this time.

### Stacy McKenzie, District Manager, Mission Bay Park

Ms. McKenzie reported the seasonal closure of the Mission Bay area comfort stations has concluded. The comfort stations were re-opened April 1, 2011. Ms. McKenzie also reported The North Crown Point Gazebo project was selected as project of the year by the American Public Works Association.

Ms. McKenzie shared an invitation to the Rose Creek Bikeway and Pedestrian Bridge Project ground breaking. The ground breaking will be held April 29, 2011 @ 10:30 AM. All interested in attending should meet at Campland by the Bay.

Ms. McKenzie answered some questions concerning the quarterly financial report which was distributed at the February 1, 2011 meeting of the Mission Bay Park Improvement Fund Oversight Committee. There was a question on what was the "PY actual". The "PY actual" was already given to us at the last Mission Bay Park Improvement Fund Oversight Committee meeting, when they gave the totals for the fiscal year. (July 2009-June 2010) \*PY Actual Invoice \$24,615,347 (as stated on the most current report) and \*PY Actual Average \$27,746,012 (as stated on the prior report).

### Sergeant Troy Keach, San Diego Life Services

Sergeant Troy Keach was not present at tonight's meeting but was represented by Lifeguard Sergeant Care. Sergeant Care spoke on the spring break crowds, summer crowds and summer staffing with focus on Mission Bay and the boating aspects. Sergeant Care said he was at the recent Crew Classic event and felt it was a successful event with crews from colleges all over the nation.

### Lieutenant James Filley, San Diego Police Department, Northern Division

Lieutenant Filley reported on the shift change in the beach area. There will now be ten officers on duty during the day and ten officers on duty during the night in order to address special events, parties, etc. Lt. Filley said the San Diego Police Department, Northern Division, is managing the facilitation of a Homeland Security grant for increased enforcement to monitor drug trafficking, unidentified boats, etc. Additional equipment such as bikes, etc. will also be purchased. It was also mentioned that any over time paid to the officers is paid via Federal grant monies.

### **REQUEST FOR CONTINUANCE**

None

### ACTION ITEMS

<u>Consent</u> (These items are adopted without discussion; they can be moved to adoption by any Committee member.)

101. None

### MSC IT WAS MOVED/SECONDED AND CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY TO MOVE ITEMS #301, 302, 303 UNDER "<u>SPECIAL EVENTS</u>" TO THE CONSENT PORTION OF THE AGENDA.

### (BUSSELL/POTTER 6-0-0)

### 301. Spring Triathlon Sunday May 1, 2011 – Presented by Rick Kozlowski

Event organizer requests approval to increase the closure time for Fiesta Island from 7:00 AM - 9:00 AM (standard race permit time) to 6:45 AM - 9:00AM, for the Spring Triathlon to be held on Sunday May 1, 2011.

### 302. Mission Bay Triathlon, Sunday October 1, 2011 - Presented by Rick Kozlowski

Event organizer requests approval to increase the closure time for Fiesta Island from 7:00 AM - 9:00 AM (standard race permit time) to 6:45 AM - 9:00AM, for the Mission Bay Triathlon to be held Sunday October 1, 2011.

303. All Women's Triathlon, Sunday October 16, 2011 - Presented by Rick Kozlowski

Event organizer requests approval to increase the closure time for Fiesta Island from 7:00 AM - 9:00 AM (standard race permit time) to 6:45 AM - 9:00AM, for the All Women's Triathlon to be held Sunday October 16, 2011.

### MSC IT WAS MOVED/SECONDED AND CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY TO APPROVE THE CONSENT PORTION OF THE AGENDA

### (BUSSELL/POTTER 6-0-0)

<u>Adoption</u> (Each adoption item requires individual action; they can be moved to consent by action of the Committee.)

201. Bonita Cove West Telecommunications Tower - Shelly A Kilbourn, AT&T

Shelly Kilborn spoke on the Telecommunications Tower set for construction at Bonita Cove. Ms. Kilborn stated she went to the Mission Beach Town Council and the Mission Beach Precise Planning Group. Ms. Kilborn said neither group would support the "Palm Tree" design nor the new "Clock Tower" which is designed to pick up existing elements. There will also be additional landscaping around the "Clock Tower".

201. Bonita Cove West Telecommunications Tower – Shelly A Kilbourn, AT&T (continued)

Committee Member comments:

- Photos are confusing, where exactly is it located?
  - Tower is located in the parking lot of Bonita Cove, across the street from the Belmont Park Roller coaster.
- Committee member said it is an eyesore, it would get graffiti
- Another Committee member expressed concerns over graffiti

Public Comments:

- Dennis Lynch, Mission Beach Precise Planning Board
  - Mr. Lynch stated he is interested in the Mission Bay Park Committee's view point and opinion of this recent project. Mr. Lynch feels this project intrudes on the park and there are other areas much more suited. An example would be near the Islandia or near Hospitality Point (there is a pocket of land near the Lifeguard Station.) Mr. Lynch asked for the Mission Bay Park Committee viewpoint.

Committee Member comments:

• Chairperson Paul Robinson refreshed everyone's memory by reminding the Committee that Ms. Kilborn was asked to take the design to the Mission Beach Town Council and the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board.

Ms. Kilborn said the Islandia or the Hospitality Point areas could not accommodate their coverage gap. She said these areas are too far east, the antennae needs to be in the Bonita Cove area. Ms. Kilborn said that AT & T would accommodate any design.

### MSC IT WAS MOVED/SECONDED AND CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY TO OPPOSE THE CURRENT PLAN ON THE 'CLOCK TOWER' DESIGN AND TO SUPPORT THE 'PALM TREE' DESIGN.

### (BENDEL/GREEN 6-0-0)

<u>Special Events</u> (Special Events that require road or plaza closures, or will potentially impact park and/or commercial operation, are brought to the Committee for a formal recommendation. They can be moved to Consent by action of the Committee.)

### 304. San Diego Celebrates Israel - Presented by Darci Manzo Wilson, Event Planner

Event organizer requests approval to hold a community family event on Sunday, May 15, 2011, 7:00 AM - 4:00 PM at North Ski Beach. Expected spectatorship is 2,000. This event site serves as the start and finish line for the 50 mile Bike for Israel ride. There will be food vendors and jumpers for the children.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Event organizer requests approval to hold a community

304. <u>San Diego Celebrates Israel</u> – Presented by Darci Manzo Wilson, Event Planner (continued)

family event on Sunday, May 15, 2011, 7:00 AM – 4:00 PM at North Ski Beach. Expected spectatorship is 2,000.

### MSC IT WAS MOVED/SECONDED AND CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY TO APPROVE THE COMMUNITY FAMILY EVENT "SAN DIEGO CELEBRATES ISRAEL" TO BE HELD SUNDAY MAY 15, 2011, 7:00 AM – 4:00 PM AT NORTH SKI BEACH.

### (BUSSELL/POTTER 6-0-0)

### **INFORMATION ITEMS**

501. San Diego B.I.G. – Laura Hendrickson, Executive Director

Laura Hendrickson, Executive Director for San Diego B.I.G. provided a handout and information about her group. San Diego B.I.G. sponsors and hosts volleyball and events and opportunities to give back to the community. Their goal is to build San Diego's volleyball network.

### **SUB-COMMITTEE**

601. None

### COMMITTEE MEMBER REPORTS/COMMENTS The reports are non-debatable.

Rick Bussell announced the annual Linda Vista Multi-Cultural Fair at the Linda Vista Shopping Center this weekend.

ADJOURNMENT - Chairperson Robinson adjourned the meeting at 6:48 PM

Notice of Next Regular Meeting: Tuesday, TBA

6:00 PM Santa Clara Recreation Center 1008 Santa Clara Place San Diego, CA 92109

Respectfully submitted,

Stacy McKenzie District Manager, Mission Bay Park

ATTACHMENT (3

Mission Bay Park Committee Minutes April 5, 2011 Page 6

<u>Please Note:</u> If there are any questions regarding this agenda, please contact Sharon Knutson, at (619) 235-1157. This information is available in alternative formats upon request. To request an agenda in Braille, large print or cassette or to request a sign language or oral interpreter for the meeting, call Sharon Knutson, at (619) 235-1157 at least five (5) working days prior to the meeting to ensure availability. Alternative Listening Devices (ALD's) are also available for the meeting, if requested at least five (5) working days prior to the meeting to ensure availability.

THE CITY OF BAN DISCO	City of San Diego Development Services 1222 First Ave., MS-302 San Diego, CA 92101 (619) 446-5000	Ownership Disclosure Statement
	eck appropriate box for type of approval (s) required evelopment Permit    「Site Development Permit ntative Map    Vesting Tentative Map    Map	ested: 「 Neighborhood Use Permit <b>IX</b> Coastal Development Permit nit 「 Planned Development Permit 「 Conditional Use Permit Waiver 「 Land Use Plan Amendment + 「 <b>Other</b>
Project Title	· Dita Caua West	Project No. For City Use Only
Project Address:	7 Bonita Cove West	
3181 Mission B	lvd, San Diego, CA 92109 (Mission Bay I	Park)
Part I - To be com	pleted when property is held by Individu	ual(\$)
above, will be filed wi below the owner(s) a who have an interest individuals who own t from the Assistant Ex Development Agreem Manager of any chan the Project Manager	ith the City of San Diego on the subject proper nd tenant(s) (if applicable) of the above referer in the property, recorded or otherwise, and state the property). <u>A signature is required of at leas</u> ecutive Director of the San Diego Redevelopme tent (DDA) has been approved / executed by t ges in ownership during the time the application at least thirty days prior to any public hearing off in a delay in the hearing process.	vedge that an application for a permit, map or other matter, as identified ty, with the intent to record an encumbrance against the property. Please list need property. The list must include the names and addresses of all persons a the type of property interest (e.g., tenants who will benefit from the permit, all tone of the property owners. Attach additional pages if needed. A signature ant Agency shall be required for all project parcels for which a Disposition and the City Council. Note: The applicant is responsible for notifying the Project n is being processed or considered. Changes in ownership are to be given to on the subject property. Failure to provide accurate and current ownership
Name of Individua	(type or print):	Name of Individual (type or print):
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	(Real Estate Asset Department)	
	enant/Lessee Redevelopment Agency	Owner Tenant/Lessee Redevelopment Agency
Street Address: 1200 3rd Ave, St	e 1700	Street Address:
City/State/Zip: San Diego, CA 92	2101	City/State/Zip:
Phone No: ( 619) 236-6081	Fax No:	Phone No: Fax No:
Signature :	Date: Jan 12, 2009	Signature : Date:
Name of Individua	I (type or print):	Name of individual (type or print):
Owner Te	nant/Lessee Redevelopment Agency	Owner Tenant/Lessee Redevelopment Agency
Street Address:		Street Address:
City/State/Zip:		City/State/Zip:
Phone No:	Fax No:	Phone No: Fax No:
Signature	Date:	Signature : Date:
	\	

Printed on recycled paper. Visit our web site at <a href="http://www.sandieoo.gov/development-services">www.sandieoo.gov/development-services</a> Upon request, this information is available in alternative formats for persons with disabilities.

# **Executive Blos**



### Randall L. Stephenson Chairman, Chief Executive Officer and President

 $s_2 \, nd \epsilon_3$  . Stephenson is chairman of the board, this favocative officer and president of AT&T Inc. He was appointed to the position in 2007.

Since becoming chairman, Mr. Stephenson has strengthened ATST's position as the wolld's largest telecommunications. company and as a global leader in mobile breacband and IPbased business communications services. Under his leadership, Ali&Leise has accelerated its growth in advanced TV services and is a leader in local search advertising.

Mr. Stephenson providually served as the company's chief. operating officer. (root: 2004 to 2007, where no was responsible for all wireless and whee operations, and as server executive vice president and chief figandial officer from 2001 to 2004,

Mr. Stephenson was able ited to  $\Lambda^{*}8^{**}s$  board of exectors in 2005

toro a Oldahoma Cov. Ma Stemensor, Istaan his cardol with Southwestern Bell (Elephone in 1982, in the information) technology organization in Oklahoma, the then progressed through a vertex of leadership pesitions including an assignment in Mexico City as SBC 1 demotional's director of finance, evenseurly SEC's ownership interest in Tald(proside Mexico, In-1995 he was named controller for SEC Communications. Mr. Stephensonia skiss who an action yroe preside it. Consumer Marketing.

Under Mr. Stephenson's teacorship, ATST announced the largest education inductive in company matery =  $\kappa^2$  ST Aspire -  $\kappa$  \$100 million phrianthropic program to help strengthen stirkless success and workforce readiness.

He is a member of the board of directors of Emerson Flectric Coll, a Kasional Executive Beard member of the Box Scouts of America (BSA) and charm an of the United Way of Mctropolition Dallas Campeign for 2011

### Leadership

### AT&T Executive Bios



Randall L. Stephenson Charnian, Croef Executive Officer and President



James W. Cicconi Sen or Exercised Mile President - Exercise and Les stative Affects, Affect Services, inc



Catherine M. Coughlin Ferrior Executive Vice President was Clobal Warbating Officer



Forrest E. Miller Group President - Corporate Strategy April Depthysion



Ronald E. Spears amor fixed utive Vide President - Exacutive Operation s



President and Chief Parentova, Olivora, A(8,1 Bilgipera Solutions

John Stephens Server Exercitive Vice Prevident and Chief Financial Officer

### Investor Relations

Company Information

Corporate Governance

Financial Reporting

Stock Information

Stockholder Services

investor News

Calendar

Investor Contacts

FAO

### Stock Quote (NYSE))

Price \$27.55 Last Trade 62:00 PM Sep 09 2011 Change ♥ S-041 Change (%) -1.47% Volume 20,586,400 52 Week Low \$ 27 20-57 Week High C 11 04 Day Low \$27.48 \$27.86 Day High

Proce Quates/Charts

### Related Content

AT&T Senior Executive Biographies Citizenship and Sestamability Diversity Innovation

### AT&T 2011 Annual Meeting of Stockholders

2011 Proxy Statement 2010 Annual Report View 2011 Young Results

John T. Stankey



'n

# Rainh de la Yega President and Chief Exercises (Thren, Krist) Mohiny and Constituter Markins

Wayne Watts Semior Exercise Vice Precision and Semiore Counse



Rayford Wifkins, Jr. Chiel Executive Officer - ATRY Diversitied Businusses

.

ATTACHMENT 16

	City of San Diego	Development l	Permit/	FORM
	Development Services 1222 First Ave. 3rd Floor Envir Star Diago CA 20101	ronmental Determ		DS-303 <sup>-</sup>
THE CITY OF BAN DIES	San Diego, CA 92101 (619) 446-5210	Appeal Appl	ication	May 2010
See Information	Bulletin 505, "Development Permits Ap	peal Procedure." for information or	the appeal p	rocedure.
1. Type of Appea	d:			
Process Two E Process Three Process Four I	Decision - Appeal to Planning Commission Decision - Appeal to Planning Commission Decision - Appeal to City Council	Environmental Determina Appeal of a Hearing Offic	tion - Appeal to er Decision to re	City Council evoke a permit
<b>2. Appellant</b> <i>Plea</i> 118.0105)	se check one 🖾 Applicant 🖾 Officially re	cognized Planning Committee 🛛 In	terested Persor	r" <u>(Per M.C. Seo.</u>
Name: MISSION BEACH	PRECISE PLANNING BOARD	E-mail Address: dkwatkns@aol.com		
Address:	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	City: State: Zip Code:	Telephor	
<u>c/o 713 Isthmus C</u> 3. Applicant Nam	Court San Diego ne (As shown on the Permit/Approval being a	<u>CA 92109</u> poealed). Complete if different from a	<u>(858) 34</u> ppellant.	4-1684
-	PLANCOM, Inc. for AT&T_Mobility		,	
4. Project Inform	ation ntal Determination & Permit/Document No.:	Date of Decision/Determination:	City Project M	anager:
				anayen.
<u> 1&amp;T Mobility Bo</u> ecision (describe	nita Cove West Project No. 198482	May 11, 2011/Approve Permit	Simon Tse	
Development Ser	vices Department Hearing Officer approved th	ne <u>Coastal Development Permit for a V</u>	<u> Mireless Comm</u>	unication
Eacility to be come	structed at Mission Bay Park across from Belr	nont Dark in the heart of the Mission F	cash communi	
Grounde for A	ppeal (Please check all that apply)	Hont Park in the near or the Mission c	each commun	ι <u>γ</u> .
. I Findings No Description of Gr	other matters (Process Three and Four decision t Supported (Process Three and Four decisions o rounds for Appeal ( <i>Please relate your descri</i>	nly)	eal as more full	
<u>Chapter 11, Arlicie</u>	<u>2, Division 5 of the Sen Diego Múnicipal Co</u>	<u>le</u> . Attach additional sheets if necess	ary.) 	
PLEASE SEE EX	<u>HIBIT A, WHICH IS ATTACHED HERETO AI</u>	ND INCORPORATED HEREWITH.		
			<u></u>	
	RECEIVED			
·				······································
	MAY 242011			
 	DEVELOPMENT SERVICES			<u></u>
		······································	<b></b>	— <b>——</b> —————————————————————————————————
6. Appellant's Sig	nature: I certify under penalty of perjury that	the foregoing, including all names and	d addresses, is	true and correct.
Signature: Lel	be batking	Date: <u>May 24, 2011</u>	, , ,	
chang	Planning Anarl	e.		
Note: Faxed app	eals are not accepted. Appeal fees are not	n-refundable.		
<u></u>		site at <u>www.eandieqo.gowdevelopment-se</u>		<del></del>
	Upon request, this information is available	in alternative formats for persons with disa	bilities.	

AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West Project No. 198482

### EXHIBIT A

### RECOGNIZED COMMUNITY PLANNING GROUP AS "INTERESTED PARTY"

The Mission Beach Precise Planning Board ("MBPPB"), a recognized community planning group, is filing this Appeal Application on behalf of itself, the Mission Beach community and the Mission Beach Town Council ("MBTC") to appeal the Development Services Department Hearing Officer's decision to approve the Coastal Development Permit for a Wireless Communication Facility on public park land to the Planning Commission for review. Both the MBPPB and the MBTC expressed active interest in the outcome of this proposed project in writing throughout this process with the Development Services Department Project Manager prior to the May 11, 2011 Public Hearing.

On February 24, 2011, MBPPB Chair Debbie Watkins was asked via e-mail by Development Services Department Planner/Project Manager Simon Tse to place the proposed AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West project on its March 15, 2011 Agenda for a recommendation. Mr. Tse attached proposed project plans at Mission Bay Park for the construction of a 30-ft clock tower structure to house computer equipment and install 12 cell tower antennas in the heart of Mission Beach. [See: Attachment 1, which is attached hereto and incorporated herewith.] In addition, MBPPB Chair Watkins was asked via e-mail by Plancom, Inc. representative Shelly Killbourn, who represents AT&T Mobility, to place this proposed project on its March 15<sup>th</sup> Agenda for discussion. [See: Attachment 2, which is attached hereto and incorporated herewith.] As a result of these requests, the MBPPB Chair sent an e-mail to Ms. Killbourn and Mr. Tse confirming the proposed project will be placed on its March 15<sup>th</sup> Agenda. [See: Attachment 3, which is attached hereto and incorporated herewith.]

On March 9, 2011, the MBPPB Chair sent the March 15, 2011 Agenda under cover of an e-mail memorandum to Ms. Killbourn and Mr. Tse. [See: e-mail Attachment 4 and Agenda Attachment 5, which are attached hereto and incorporated herewith.]

On March 21, 2011, MBPPB Chair Watkins sent an e-mail to Mr. Tse with a copy to Ms. Killbourn notifying them that the AT&T Bonita Cove PTS 198482 project plans were presented to the Board, and the Board unanimously opposed the proposed location of the 30-ft clock tower structure on public park land. [See: Attachment 6, which is attached hereto and incorporated herewith.] In addition, a Memorandum of Recommendation from the MBPPB was sent under cover of the above-referenced e-mail to Simon Tse, Development Services Planner and the Mission Bay Park Commission. [See: Attachment 7, which is attached hereto and incorporated herewith.] Also, please refer to the March 15, 2011 Minutes of the MBPPB detailing the discussion and recommendation of this proposed project. [See: Attachment 8, which is attached hereto and incorporated herewith.]

Further, on February 24, 2011, the MBTC President Bob Ruane was asked via e-mail by Plancom, Inc. representative Shelly Killbourn, who represents AT&T Mobility, to place this proposed project on its March 9, 2011 Agenda for presentation. On February 25, 2011,

AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West Project No. 198482

MBTC President Ruane responded to said request. [See: Attachment 9, which is attached hereto and incorporated herewith.]

On March 16, 2011, Development Services Department Planner/Project Manager Simon Tse sent an e-mail to MBTC President Ruane requesting a copy of the Minutes of the March 9, 2011 Meeting of the MBTC. On March 24, 2011, President Ruane sent the Minutes of the March 9<sup>th</sup> meeting under cover of his March 24<sup>th</sup> e-mail to Mr. Tse highlighting the notes of that discussion whereby the straw vote garnered majority support for rejecting the current proposed location. [See: e-mail Attachment 10 and Minutes Attachment 11, which are attached hereto and incorporated herewith.]

Apparently, the "Notice of Public Hearing Hearing Officer Development Services Department" dated April 27, 2011 was mailed to property owners and tenants within 300 feet of the proposed project, which sits in the middle of Mission Bay Park. However, there are very few residences within 300 feet of the proposed project at Mission Bay Park, across from Belmont Park. Moreover, the Belmont Community Room where the MBPPB and the MBTC hold their monthly community meetings is within 300 feet of the proposed project and no notice of the hearing was given.

Although the MBPPB and the MBTC were active participants in this review process by its prior acts of interest in writing to the Development Services Department Project Manager as discussed above, the Mission Beach community planning group and the Mission Beach community town council were not informed of the May 11, 2011 hearing by Development Services Department or Project Manager. We assume our written recommendations and communications were relayed to the Hearing Officer by Development Services Department Flanner/Project Manager Simon Tse.

### **GROUNDS FOR APPEAL**

<u>Conflict with Other Matters</u>. The Hearing Officer's decision to approve the proposed AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West project to construct a new 30-ft clock tower structure to house computer equipment and install 12 cell tower antennas is in conflict with the Mission Bay Park Master Land Use Plan Update, and the City of San Diego's City Charter Section 55 <u>Park and Recreation</u> and Section 55.1 <u>Mission Bay Park – Restrictions upon Commercial Development</u>.

The proposed location of this 30-ft clock tower to house computer equipment with 12 AT&T cell tower antennas mounted on top causes an unwanted obstruction that blocks views and disrupts enjoyment of the park land for the public to play sports, relax with family and friends, and other types of family activities.

The Mission Bay Park Master Land Use Plan ("MBPMP") explains that the majority of park visitors enjoy the water as a setting for "land-based recreation, i.e., walking, jogging, bicycling and picnicking." (p.35) As a result, the MBPMP claims that Mission Bay Park "should be a park in which land uses are located and managed so as to maximize their recreation and environmental functions, minimize adverse impacts on adjacent areas, facilitate public access and circulation, and capture the distinctive aesthetic quality of each

AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West Project No. 198482

area of the Bay. The Park should also enhance the viability and use of other connected open space areas so as to promote the creation of a comprehensive, integrated open space into and out of Mission Bay." (p.35)

Further, the MBPMP does not grant authority to construct a wireless communication facility on dedicated lease areas.

It states that dedicated lease areas on Mission Bay Park are comprised of both non-profit and commercial leases that contribute to the revenues of the City while providing a variety of recreational opportunities to park visitors. (p.43) The MBPMP gives basic objectives to consider regarding dedicated lease areas. The most relevant objective to the instant case states as follows:

Commercial leases should provide a variety of recreational opportunities, i.e., high, as well as moderately priced guest housing accommodations, recreational vehicle camping, and sites for primitive tent camping. (p.43)

Moreover, the City of San Diego's City Charter at Section 55 <u>Park and Recreation</u> and Section 55.1 <u>Mission Bay Park – Restrictions upon Commercial Development</u> should guide the City in its decision making. Mission Bay Park is supposed to be public park land in perpetuity. It was transferred to the City of San Diego with several restrictions that were adopted by the Citizen of San Diego into the San Diego City Charter. Any changes in land use or purpose must be ratified by a vote of gualified electors.

Section 55 states in part as follows:

All real property owned in fee by the City heretofore or hereafter formally dedicated in perpetuity by ordinance of the Council or by statute of the State legislature for park, recreation or cemetery purposes shall not be used for any but park, recreation or cemetery purposes without such changed use or purpose having first been authorized or later ratified by a vote of two-thirds of the qualified electors of the City voting at an election for such purpose.

Section 55.1 assures that most of the areas making up Mission Bay Park are available for public recreational use. It sets limitations upon commercial development of leaseholds at Mission Bay Park so that no more than 25 percent of the land area and 6.5% of the water area can be used for private purposes.

However, if park land is now considered a viable resource for the City to construct revenue-producing cell towers, it would behave the City to select a less intrusive location away from every day public activity at Mission Bay Park to construct a 30-ft clock tower structure as a wireless communication facility.

ATTACHMENT 16

AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West Project No. 198482

<u>Findings Not Supported</u>. The hearing officer's findings to approve the proposed AT&T Mobility Bonita Cove West project to construct a new 30-ft clock tower structure to house computer equipment and install 12 cell tower antennas are not supported by the information provided to the hearing officer.

The Hearing Officer totally disregarded the recommendations of the Mission Beach community and the Mission Bay Park Committee.

The Mission Bay Park Committee unanimously opposed the proposed AT&T plans to construction of a 30-ft clock tower structure at this location. The Mission Beach Precise Planning Board unanimously opposed the proposed location of the 30-ft clock tower on public park land. [See: Attachments 7 and 8.] The Mission Beach Town Council general membership straw vote garnered majority support for rejecting the current proposed location. [See: Attachment 11.]

### CONCLUSION

If park land is now considered a viable resource for the City to construct revenueproducing cell towers, it would behave the City to select a less intrusive location away from every day public activity such as park land at or around Mariner's Point. In addition, one has to question whether construction of a large clock tower structure should become the preferred method to meet a company's transmission goals. Finally, one must appreciate that any allowed use, both as to its location and manner in which it is constructed, creates a precedent for future similar development requests often without the scrutiny that each individual occurrence deserves. Our park lands are precious. Subj:AT&T Bonita Cove PTS 198482Date:2/24/2011 12:55:30 P.M. Pacific Daylight TimeFrom:STse@sandlego.govTo:dkwatkns@aol.comCC:shellykilbourn@cox.netGood afternoon Ms. Watkins-

I am forwarding you plans and sims for the AT&T Bonita Cove project which is being proposed in the Mission Bay Park. The project is NOT located in the Mission Beach planning area, however, we have asked the applicant (Shelly Kilbourn, representing AT&T) to present the project to your CPG as a courtesy. The project is located in the Mission Bay Park and will also go to the Mission Bay Park Committee for a presentation. Can you please put this item on your next available agenda. Thank you and let me know if you have any other questions.

ST

Sinton Tao I Plenner I Office: 615:537.5384 I Fax: 819:448.6466 I Development Services Department I 1222 First Avenue, 5th Floor San Diego, CA 92101-4163 I

=

 Subj:
 AT&T Bonita Cove West

 Date:
 2/24/2011 1:19:28 P.M. Pacific Daylight Time

 From:
 shellykilbourn@cox.net

 To:
 dkwatkns@aoi.com

 CC:
 STse@sandlego.gov

 Dear Ms. Watkins,

As Mr. Tse indicated in his email to you, we would like to present this project to you at your next meeting. Please let me know if you can accommodate our item on the March agenda.

Thank you,

÷.,

Shelly A. Kilbourn PLANCOM, INC. 302 State Place Escondido, CA 92029 (619) 208-4685

Information from ESET NOD32 Antivirus, version of virus signature database 5490 (20100929)

The message was checked by ESET NOD32 Antivirus.

http://www.eset.com

 Subj:
 Re: AT&T Bonita Cove West

 Date:
 2/24/2011 3:11:51 P.M. Pacific Daylight Time

 From:
 Disvations@aol.com

 To:
 shellykilbourn@cox.net

 CC:
 STse@sandiago.gov

### Ms. Kilbourn.

This matter will be placed on our March 15th agenda as an Information Item with Recommendations. The meeting starts at 7:00 p.m., however, the first part of the meeting will consist of our Board's Elections. You do not need to be present for that process so I'll schedule your presentation for 7:30.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Thank you,

Debbie Watkins, Chair/Secretary Mission Beach Precise Planning Board

In a message dated 2/24/2011 12:19:28 P.M. Pacific Standard Time, shellykilbourn@cox.net writes:

Dear Ms. Watkins,

As Mr. Tse indicated in his email to you, we would like to present this project to you at your next meeting. Please let me know if you can accommodate our item on the March agenda.

Thank you,

Shelly A. Kilbourn

PLANCOM, INC.

302 State Place

Escondido, CA 92029

(619) 208-4685

Information from ESET NOD32 Antivirus, version of virus signature database 5490 (20100929)

The message was checked by ESET NOD32 Antivirus.

http://www.eset.com



Subj: MBPPB March Agenda

3/9/2011 9:04:20 P.M. Pacific Daylight Time Date:

From:

Dkwatkns@aol.com shellvkilbourn@cox.net, stse@sandiego.goy To:

Roulon@san.m.com CC:

The March 15, 2011 Agenda of the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board (MBPPB) is attached for your reference. Please note your agenda item as AT&T Bonita Cove West.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Thank you.

Deb Watkins, Chair/Secretary MBPPB

### Mission Beach Precise Planning Board Agenda: March 15, 2011 @ 7:00 PM Belmont Park Community Room

### **Opening Functions**

Call to Order Approval of Minutes for February, 2011

### Administrative Items

Revisions to Agenda (requires ¾ vote) Chair's Report Secretary's Report

### Public Comment (limited to 3 minutes per speaker)

### **Reports from Government Officials**

### Other

P.

### Information/Recommendation Item:

• AT&T Bonita Cove West – Proposed new clock tower with 12 AT&T cell phone antennas mounted on top that will house computer equipment at 3181 Mission Boulevard (Mission Bay Park)

## Board Communications

Action Item:

2011 Board Election for Area Representatives

### Adjournment

Our next meeting will be **Tuesday, April 19, 2011** beginning at 7:00 PM in the Belmont Community Room. Contact Deb Watkins at 858-344-1684 to request items for the agenda. 

 Subj:
 Re: AT&T Bonita Cove PTS 198482

 Date:
 3/21/2011 10:11:15 A.M. Pacific Daylight Time

 From:
 <u>Dkwatkns@aol.com</u>

 To:
 <u>STse@sandiego.gov</u>

 CC:
 <u>shellykilbourn@cox.net</u>, <u>dcl7777@aol.com</u>

Good morning Mr. Tse,

Pursuant to your request, the proposed AT&T Bonita Cove West PTS 198482 project was presented to the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board ("MBPPB") at its March 15, 2011 meeting by a representative of Plancom, Inc. The attached memorandum documents the MBPPB's unanimously opposition to the proposed location of the 30-ft clock tower structure on public park land.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any further questions.

Thank you.

Regards,

Debbie Watkins, Chair MBPPB

In a message dated 2/24/2011 12:55:30 P.M. Pacific Daylight Time, \$Tse@sandiego.gov writes:

Good afternoon Ms. Watkins-

I am forwarding you plans and sims for the AT&T Bonita Cove project which is being proposed in the Mission Bay Park. The project is NOT located in the Mission Beach planning area, however, we have asked the applicant (Shelly Kilbourn, representing AT&T) to present the project to your CPG as a courtesy. The project is located in the Mission Bay Park and will also go to the Mission Bay Park Committee for a presentation. Can you please put this item on your next available agenda. Thank you and let me know if you have any other questions.

ST

=

Simon Tse | Planner | Offics: 619,667.6984 | Fax: 619,446.6499 |

Development Services Department i

1222 First Avenue, 3th Floor San Diego, CA 92101-41861

### TO: Simon Tse, Planner, City of San Diego, Development Services Mission Bay Park Commission

FROM: Debbie Watkins, Chair, Mission Beach Precise Planning Board

DATE: March 21, 2011

Re: AT&T Bonita Cove West PTS 198482 (Mission Bay Park)

Pursuant to your request, the proposed AT&T Bonita Cove West installation of 12 antennas on a new 30-ft clock tower on public park land at 3181 Mission Boulevard was presented to the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board ("MBPPB") at its March 15, 2011 meeting by a representative of Plancom, Inc.

The MBPPB unanimously opposed the proposed location of the 30-ft clock tower on public park land. Concerns were raised and are listed below for consideration.

- Mission Bay Park is supposed to be public parkland in perpetuity. Any
  commercial activity on parkland is inappropriate and inconsistent with the
  peaceful enjoyment of park use by the public. Also, it would set a precedent for
  other types of commercial development on park land.
- The proposed location of this 30-ft clock tower with 12 AT&T cell phone antennas mounted on top that will house computer equipment for the antennas causes an unwanted obstruction that blocks views and disrupts enjoyment of the parkland for the public to play sports, relax with family and friends, and other types of family activities.

RECOMMENDATION: If park land is now considered a viable resource for the City to construct revenue-producing cell towers, it would behave the City to select a less intrusive location away from every day public activity such as park land at or around the Hyatt Islandia. In addition, one has to question whether construction of a large clock tower structure should become the preferred method to meet a company's transmission goals. Finally, one must appreciate that any allowed use, both as to its location and manner in which it is constructed, creates a precedent for future similar development requests often without the scrutiny that each individual occurrence deserves. Our park lands are precious.

Thank you for your consideration.

cc. Shelly Kilbourn, Plancom, Inc.

### Mission Beach Precise Planning Board Tuesday, March 15, 2011 Belmont Park Community Room Minutes of Meeting

### Board Members Present:

Carole Haviat Gernot Troif Dennis Lynch Debbie Watkins

Bob Ondeck Mary Willmont Mary Saska

### Absent:

Ron Oliver

### **OPENING FUNCTIONS**

Meeting was called to order by Chair Debbie Watkins at 7:05 p.m.

Approval of Minutes for February, 2011

Copies of the draft of the February 15, 2011 Minutes of Meeting were distributed and reviewed. The Minutes were approved by unanimous consent as written.

### ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

Revisions to Agenda

Copies of the March 15, 2011 Agenda were distributed and reviewed. There were no additions to the Agenda.

### Chair's Report

Chair Debbie Watkins reported that letters were sent to Area V representatives Dave Lombardi and Peggy Bradshaw informing them that they have missed four regular meetings in violation of the Board's Bylaws and, as a result of their absences, their seats in Area V have been declared vacant and open for nominations.

### Secretary's Report

Secretary Watkins announced that because of Ron Oliver's absence at this meeting as Election Secretary, she will act as Election Secretary and report results of election ballots after the close of elections.

Further, Secretary Watkins pointed out that Mr. Oliver has now missed four regular meetings in violation of the Board's Bylaws. As a result, the Chair will notify Mr. Oliver that his seat in Area I has been declared vacant and open for nominations.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

- Tom Lochtefeld, current leaseholder of Belmont Park property, gave an update regarding his lease re-negotiations with the City. He informed the Board that if negotiations are not successful, a new buyer will take over the end of December.
- Dave Lombardi and Peggy Bradshaw, both present at this meeting, each expressed an interest in being considered candidates for nominations to fill the two new open seats in Area V for a one-year term at the next meeting.



**REPORTS FROM GOVERNMENT OFFICALS** 

None.

### OTHER

Information/Recommendation Item:

 AT&T Bonita Cove West – Proposed new 30-ft clock tower structure with 12 cell tower antennas mounted on top that will house computer equipment to operate said antennas located at 3181 Mission Boulevard

The City of San Diego, Development Services Department asked the Board to place this project on its Agenda as an Information/Recommendation Item at the direction of the Mission Bay Park Commission because the project affects the Mission Beach community.

Shelly Kilbourn of Plancom, Inc. presented AT&T's proposed project plans.

Ms. Kilbourn distributed the plans and photographs of the proposed 30 ft. clock tower structure and asked the Board for comments and questions. The Board asked numerous questions regarding the clock tower design concept, functionality, safety, and maintenance responsibilities, among others.

After discussion, the Board unanimously opposed the proposed location of the 30-ft clock tower structure on public park land for the reasons listed below.

- Mission Bay Park is supposed to be public park land in perpetuity. Any commercial
  activity on park land is inappropriate and inconsistent with the peaceful enjoyment of
  park use by the public. Also, it would set a precedent for other types of commercial
  development on park land.
- The proposed location of this 30-ft clock tower structure causes an unwanted obstruction that blocks views and disrupts enjoyment of the park land for the public to play sports, relax with family and friends, and other types of family activities.

Further, the Board's recommendation regarding the project is as follows: If park land is now considered a viable resource for the City to construct revenue-producing cell towers, it would behoove the City to select a less intrusive location away from every day public activity, such as park land at or around the Hyatt Islandia. In addition, one has to question whether construction of a large clock tower structure should become the preferred method to meet a company's transmission goals. Finally, one must appreciate that any allowed use, both as to its location and manner in which it is constructed, creates a precedent for future similar development requests often without the scrutiny that each individual occurrence deserves.

The Board authorized Chair Watkins to respond accordingly in writing to the Development Services Department and Mission Bay Park Commission.

BUILDING PLAN REVIEWS None.

### BOARD COMMUNICATIONS Action Items:

### • 2011 Board Election for Area Representatives

The Election Secretary reported the results of the election ballots, each receiving 2/3 vote as required:

Areal	Mary Willmont	3-year term expires 2014
Area II	Mike Meyer	3-year term expires 2014
Area III	Bob Ondeck	3-year term expires 2014
Area IV	Mary Saska	3-year term expires 2014

A motion was duly made as follows:

Motion 1 was made by Bob Ondeck and seconded by Mary Willmont TO ACCEPT the newly elected Board Members for the terms listed above.			
VOTE	For: 6	Against: 0	Abstain: 0
Motion passes.			

Any additions to the agenda need to be to the Chair 10 days PRIOR to the scheduled Board meeting.

The next Board Meeting is Tuesday, April 19, 2011 in the Belmont Community Room.

### ADJOURNMENT

Motion 2 was made by Gernot Trolf and seconded by Bob Ondeck to ADJOURN the meeting.

VOTE For: 6 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

Meeting was adjourned at 8:10 p.m.

Completed by: Debbie Watkins, Secretary 
 Subj:
 FW: AT&T Wireless - Bonita Cove West

 Date:
 5/23/2011 8:19:41 A.M. Pacific Daylight Time

 From:
 bob@bsachhomesrealestate.com

 To:
 Dkwatkns@aot.com

 Here is the initial contact.

Bob Ruane

Broker/ Beach Homes Real Estate

www.SanDiegoMissionBeach.com

President/ Mission Beach Town Council

www.WissionBeachTC.org

858/488-1400

From: Shelly A Kilbourn [mailto:<u>shellykilbourn@cox.net]</u> Sent: Friday, February 25, 2011 2:07 PM To: Bob Ruane Subject: Re: AT&T Wireless - Bonita Cove West

Hi Bob,

No more than 15 minutes.

Thanks,

Shelly A. Kilbourn PlanCom, Inc. 302 State Place Escondido CA 92029 (619)208-4685

On Feb 25, 2011, at 11:41 AM, Bob Ruane < bob@beachhomesrealestate.com> wrote:

Hello Shelly, How much time do you need? Thanks,

Bob Ruane

Beach Homes Real Estate- Sroker

www.SanDiegoMissionBeach.com

Mission Beach Town Council- President

www.MissionBeachTC.org

858/488-1400

From: Shelly Kilbourn [mailto:<u>shellykilbourn@cox.net]</u> Sent: Thursday, February 24, 2011 12:27 PM To: <u>bob@beachhomesrealestate.com</u> Subject: AT&T Wireless - Bonita Cove West

Dear Mr. Ruane,

I am representing AT&T on a project proposed in Mission Bay Park across the street from Belmont Park. I would like to present the project to the Mission Beach Town Council at your next meeting. Will you please let me know if you can accommodate me on your March 9 agenda. I plan to attend the Mission Beach Precise Planning Board on March 15 and then the Mission Bay Park and Recreation Council on April 5.

I appreciate vour assistance.

Shelly A. Kilbourn PLANCOM, INC. 302 State Place Escondido, CA 92029 (619) 208-4685

Information from ESET NOD32 Antivirus, version of virus signature database 5490 (20100929)

The message was checked by ESET NOD32 Antivirus.

http://www.eset.com

 Subj:
 FW: AT&T Mobility Bonita Park Project

 Date:
 5/19/2011 11:06:12 A.M. Pacific Daylight Time

 From:
 bob@ineachhomesrealestate.com

 To:
 Dkwatkns@aol.com

Dabbie-Here's the email to Simon.

From: Bob Ruane [mailto:<u>bob@beachhomesrealestate.com</u>] Sent: Thursday, March 24, 2011 11:41 AM To: 'Tse, Simon' Subject: RE: AT&T Mobility Bonita Park Project

Here are the minutes from the march general meeting of the MBTC. Our notes re the ATT site are highlighted. Thank you,

. . . . . . . . . . . . . . .

Bob Ruane

Broker/ Beach Homes Real Estate www.SanDiegoMissionBeach.com

President/ Mission Beach Town Courici <u>www.MissionBeachTC.org</u>

858/488-1400

en en la companya de la companya de

From: Tse, Simon [mailto:<u>STse@sandiego.gov]</u> Sent: Wednesday, March 16, 2011 8:35 AM To: 'Bob@BeachHomesRealEstate.com' Cc: Tse, Simon Subject: AT&T Mobility Bonita Park Project

Good morning Mr. Ruane,

My name is Simon Tse and I am the Associate Planner from the Development Services Department, I was informed by the applicant that the project was presented to the Mission Beach Town Council on March 9, 2011. Do you happen to have minutes for this meeting related to this item? Thank you and let me know if you have any questions.

ST

Simon Tse I Planner I Office: 619,857,6964 ( Fax. 619,646,6458 ) Development Services Department ( 1222 First Avenue, 6th Floor Can Olego, 0.4 02101-4166 )



MISSION BEACH TOWN COUNCIL General Membership Meeting Belmont Park Community Room March 9, 2011

**Call to Order: Bob Ruane**, President, called the meeting to order at 7:03 p.m. Kat Ohlmann led the Pledge of Allegiance. Introductions of attendees followed:

- Members of the Executive Board Bob Ruane, President, Jasmine Kung, Vice President, Betty Jean Lundquist, Secretary, Scott Morrison, Treasurer, Jill Lester, Membership
- Representatives of Elected Officials Ricardo Flores for Susan Davis, US Congress, 619-280-5353; Thyme Curtis for Kevin Faulconer, City Council District 2, 619-236-7351, <u>tourtis@sanaiego.gov</u>; Terri Winbush, City Attorney's office, <u>twinbush@sanaiego.gov</u>, 619-533-5500
- ◆ San Diego Police Department Capt Al Guaderrama, 858-552-1710, sauaderrama@pd.sondiego.gov
- San Diego Fire Station 21 Bill Degrenier
- Area Reps Area 1 Ed Thiele, Area 3 Debra Bowman, Area 4 Andy Chotiner, Area 5 – Kat Ohlmann, Area 6 – Jasmine Kung, Area 8 – Sean McQuade, Area 9 - Bob Craig
- Guests Nick Cantalupo, Coffee Break; Brian Austin, Surfrider; Shelly A. Kilbourn, AT&T

**Approval of Minutes:** Minutes from the February 2011 general membership meeting were approved as written.

**Treasurer's Report:** Scott Morrison reported a balance of \$9,000 +/-, \$530 membership deposits in February, with a total of \$6,000 in membership deposits this year. Report was approved.

**President's Report: Bob Ruane** indicated that he had sent a letter on behalf on MBTC to the Mayor's office in support of Tom Lochtefeld's position on Belmont Park lease. No response had been received as of the meeting date.

**Membership Report: Jill Lester** reported the statistics on the recent membership drive. MBTC has 10 fewer members than last year with 389 voting members. Of greatest concern is the low participation on the part of the business community. Long term tenants are also sparsely represented. Area 7, which represents much of the Mission Beach Business District, currently has no Area Rep.

**Budget Report: Scott Morrison** presented the 2011 Budget for MBTC, pointing out that the biggest expense is postage and printing for the membership drive. Expenses total \$7,200 with approximately \$2,000 remaining for supporting various activities during the year.

**MOTION:** The motion made by Willie Gardner to accept the 2011 budget was seconded by Ed Thiele and approved by the membership.

**Fire Station 21 Report: Bill Degrenier** gave an update on the current "Brown Out" for Station 21 as well as other Fire Stations in the area. He indicated that every other month the Hose Truck (one of the two trucks for Station 21) is out of service due to budgetary constraints. The ladder truck remains in service. He indicated that 17% of the work force is shut down each day in the local area, with 8 fire engines not being used.

**San Diego City Council Faulconer Report: Thyme Curtis,** Representative, reported the dates currently scheduled for undergrounding of utilities in Mission Beach – South Mission from the jetty to San Fernando, 2011-2013; Ventura to El Carmel, 2014-2016; El Carmel to San Jose, 2015-2017; and San Jose to Pacific Beach Drive, 2016-2018. She indicated that these dates would probably be altered, occurring later. Thyme reiterated that Kevin Faulconer is actively working to retain San Diego's redevelopment funds, which are in jeopardy due to budgetary cuts. Citizen notification is mandatory to get pothole and rut repairs accomplished – call Streets Division Dispatch - 619-527-7500. Thyme also indicated that the regulations for the marijuana dispensaries will be considered at the March 28 council meeting. It is hoped that stricter regulations will be put into place at that time. Questions were posed regarding the condition of the sea wall, and the process of having Mission Beach be one of the communities to test solar trash compactors.

**Surfrider Report:** Brian Austin gave a presentation on value of ashcans being placed in public areas to reduce cigarette butts being discarded on the ground. He presented statistics regarding the successful usage of the ashcans currently placed in various communities, and the number currently requested for future installation. Kat Ohlmann indicated that 3 cans had been installed as part of a promised 10 cans available to Mission Beach at no charge. Brian indicated that he would research the status. Community members can request placement options; however, accompanying cleanout support must be provided. Large corporate sponsors often donate ashcans for distribution.

**Mission Beach Coffee Break Request:** Nick Cantalupo requested that MBTC support his request for placement of a South Mission Beach Business District sign on the boardwalk similar to the sign placed for the North Mission Beach Business District some months ago.

**MOTION:** The motion passed to support endorsement by MBTC to erect a sign similar to the North Mission Beach Business District sign on the Board walk.

AT&T 30' Tower Request: Shelly Kilbourn, gave a summary of the plan designed by AT&T and modified by Parks and Recreation for the placement of a 30' Cell Tower across from Belmont Park. The Clock Tower, housing 12 antennas inside, would provide for improved cell phone service in South Mission Beach. A lively discussion followed. The motion was made for a straw vote from the membership to indicate interest in the idea. Mike Meyers moved that MBTC reject the idea of the AT&T tower in the proposed location, and that AT&T find another (better) location. Additionally, he wanted to state

support for AT&T finding a way to improve signal in the area. Straw vote garnered majority support for rejecting the current proposed location.

**SDPD Report: Capt Guadarama** was pleased to announce that the recent rash of residential burglaries had slowed to almost zero. Two suspects are now in custody, and a third has been identified. The first week in May the beach area will have an additional 10 officers and 1 additional sergeant. The window etching culprit who was etching windows in PB and OB is also now in custody.

**City Attorney's Report: Terri Winbush** emphasized the importance of calling SDPD to report crime of any sort. Without a police report it is very difficult for her prosecute offenders. Please contact her at <u>winbush@sandiego.gov</u>, 619-533-5500

### Area Representatives' Reports:

Area 1 – Ed Thiele indicated that all was copasetic with the volleyball players. A dead dolphin on the beach was removed.

Area 4 - Andy Chotiner commented on dogs on the beach

**Area 9 – Bob Craig** suggested that MBTC request that Mission Beach be a participant in the trial of solar Trash compactors.

Meeting was adjourned at 8:28.

Respectfully submitted, Betty Jean Lundquist, Secretary