

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# REPORT TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION

DATE ISSUED: April 26, 2012 REPORT NO. PC-12-042

ATTENTION: Planning Commission, Agenda of May 3, 2012

SUBJECT: BALBOA PARK PLAZA DE PANAMA PROJECT

**REFERENCE:** Report to Planning Commission No. 10-099 and Planning Commission

Resolution No. 4640-PC (Initiation of Amendments to the Balboa

Park Master Plan and Central Mesa Precise Plan)

OWNER/

**APPLICANT:** Plaza de Panama Committee and City of San Diego

### **SUMMARY**

THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. NO ACTION IS REQUIRED ON THE PART OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION.

#### **BACKGROUND**

Balboa Park is located in the heart of San Diego, immediately north of the downtown area. The Park is surrounded by the communities of Golden Hill, North Park, Uptown and Centre City. Balboa Park is one of the City's largest developed parks at 1,172 acres and is host to numerous passive and active recreational activities, cultural and educational institutions, and special events. Over 12 million visitors come to Balboa Park each year to enjoy the diversity the park has to offer.

Development, maintenance and management of Balboa Park are governed by the Balboa Park Master Plan (BPMP), the Central Mesa Precise Plan (CMPP), the East Mesa Precise Plan (EMPP) and subsequent amendments to these documents. The BPMP is a part of the City's Progress Guide and General Plan (General Plan), and implements land use policies for Balboa Park. Therefore, amendments to the Master Plan and its Precise Plans must follow the Land Use and Community Planning Element of the General Plan.

The BPMP was adopted by City Council on July 25, 1989 (Resolution No. R-274090). The BPMP addresses the entirety of Balboa Park and provides general guidelines for development. The CMPP was adopted by City Council on October 20, 1992 (Resolution R-280920) and addresses the central portion of the Park in greater detail.

In his January 2010 State of the City Address, Mayor Jerry Sanders indentified the restoration of the Plaza de Panama as a signature project for the City to complete in advance of the centennial celebration of Balboa Park beginning in December 2014. In an effort to achieve this goal, Mayor Sanders has solicited the guidance and support of the community under the leadership of Dr. Irwin Jacobs. The Plaza de Panama Committee, a 501(c)(3) non-profit entity, has been established to raise funds and coordinate efforts necessary to meet the December 2014 deadline. The Plaza de Panama Committee has retained a consultant team to work with community groups and Park stakeholders, and prepare designs and documentation required to implement the project.

On October 21, 2010 the City of San Diego Planning Commission voted unanimously to initiate amendments to the BPMP and CMPP to further evaluate the project proposal (Planning Commission Resolution 4640-PC).

Since plan amendment initiation, the Plaza de Panama Committee and its consultant team have attended numerous meetings with Park and Recreation and community planning advisory bodies. As the officially recognized planning group for Balboa Park, the Balboa Park Committee has conducted workshops at most of its meetings in the past 18 months. Some of these meetings include the following:

•		Balboa Park Committee	17 Meetings	
•		Park and Recreation Board (Park	&R Board)	
		2 Meetings		
•		P&R Board's Design Review	Committee	
		1 Meeting		
•		Historical Resources Board (H	HRB) 6	
	Meetings			
•		HRB's Design Assistance Sub	committee	
		1 Meeting		
•		North Park Planning Committ	ee 4	
	Meetings			
•		Uptown Planners 5 Meeti	ngs	
•		Greater Golden Hill Planning Committee		
		3 Meetings		
•		Centre City Advisory Commit	ttee 3	
	Meetings			
•		Mayor's Committee on Disabi	ilities 2	
	Meetings			

In addition to meetings with recognized advisory bodies, the Plaza de Panama Committee and its consultant team have met with numerous Balboa Park stakeholders. There have been approximately 57 meetings with Balboa Park institutions and organizations such as House of Hospitality, House of Pacific Relations, Museum of Man, the Spreckels Organ Society and The Old Globe Theatre. There have been approximately 50 outreach meetings to other community groups, City Council members, and City committees.

### PROJECT DESCRIPTION

#### PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The underlying purpose of the Balboa Park Plaza de Panama, Circulation and Parking Structure Project is to restore pedestrian and park uses to the Central Mesa and alleviate pedestrian/vehicular conflicts (defined as vehicles and pedestrians crossing the same area at potentially the same time). To achieve this underlying purpose, six primary objectives are envisioned:

- Remove vehicles from the Plaza de Panama, El Prado, Plaza de California, the Mall (also called "the Esplanade"), and Pan American Road East while maintaining public and proximate vehicular access to the institutions which are vital to the park's success and longevity.
- Restore pedestrian and park uses to El Prado, Plaza de Panama, Plaza de California, the Mall, and re-create the California Garden behind the Organ Pavilion.
- Improve access to the Central Mesa through the provision of additional parking, while maintaining convenient drop-off, disabled access, valet parking, and a new tram system with the potential for future expansion.
- Improve the pedestrian link between the Central Mesa's two cultural cores: El Prado and the Palisades.
- Implement a funding plan including bonds that provides for construction of a self-sustaining paid parking structure intended to fund the structure's operation and maintenance, the planned tram operations, and the debt service on the structure only.
- Complete all work prior to January 2015 for the 1915 Panama-California Exposition centennial celebration.

#### PROJECT OVERVIEW

The various components of the project are listed below and a detailed description of each component is included.

- 1. Plaza de Panama
- 2. El Prado and Plaza de California
- 3. Centennial Bridge and Centennial Road
- 4. Alcazar Parking Lot
- 5. The Mall and Pan American Promenade
- 6. Parking Structure, Rooftop Park, Tram and Arizona Street Landfill

Presently, vehicles entering the Park from the west proceed across the Cabrillo Bridge/El Prado and enter the core through Plaza de California. Traffic flows along El Prado and then into Plaza de Panama, where limited parking is available. Cars may then continue south toward the Alcazar parking lot or the Organ Pavilion parking lot via Pan American Road.

The basic concept of the project is to remove vehicular access and parking from the Plaza de Panama, El Prado, Plaza de California, the Mall, and Pan American Road East. This would allow these areas to be pedestrian only, as well as reclaim additional park acreage for visitor usage. Traffic would be routed via a two-way circulation pattern. A new two-way bridge, "Centennial Bridge," would connect the eastern end of Cabrillo Bridge to the western side of the Alcazar parking lot. At that point the new two-way "Centennial Road" would flow through the Alcazar parking lot, exiting to the east; then continuing to the south where vehicles can access the new Organ Pavilion parking structure via two entry ramps, also connecting into Presidents Way. A tram would provide service from the parking structure to the Plaza de Panama. Existing one-way access along Pan American Road West and Pan American Place would continue to be restricted to authorized and emergency vehicles only.

#### DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT COMPONENTS

#### Plaza de Panama

The historic use of the Plaza de Panama during both the 1915–16 and 1935–36 Expositions was pedestrian open space. During these two periods the Plaza was completely open for pedestrian circulation, marching bands, exhibits, and special events. Parking was initially introduced in the Plaza after the first exposition. It is believed that the Plaza surface was decomposed granite impregnated in an asphaltic base. Originally, the Plaza was defined by five temporary buildings designed by renowned architect Bertram G. Goodhue in the Spanish Colonial Revival style.

Of the five "temporary" buildings constructed for the expositions, only the two southernmost buildings survive (as reconstructions): the House of Charm (1996) and the House of Hospitality (1997). The building on the north end is the 1926 San Diego Museum of Art, which replaced the 1915 Sacramento Valley Building. The other two buildings on the northern portion on the Plaza are non-historic: the Timken Museum of Art (1964) and the San Diego Museum of Art Auditorium and Sculpture Garden (1965). These later two buildings were built in Modernist styles.

During the 1935–36 California Pacific International Exposition, two large reflecting pools and a ceremonial arch were added in the Plaza, parking was eliminated, and the Plaza (at least at the edges) was once again returned to pedestrian use. After 1936, the reflecting pools and arch were removed, and parking and vehicular circulation again returned to the Plaza. In the existing condition, the majority of the Plaza is used for parking (54 cars). Currently, pedestrian access across the Plaza conflicts with vehicular traffic and the center of the Plaza is cut off from pedestrian use by a traffic circle and parking aisles.

Under the proposed project, parking and vehicle circulation would be removed from the Plaza de Panama and the Plaza would be redesigned with non-asphalt specialty paving, shade trees, movable tables and chairs, 1915 replica lighting, and other amenities, such as the shallow reflecting pools, that can be turned off to accommodate large events and festivals. The Plaza would incorporate shade trees along the eastern and western sides of the Plaza, with the central portion of the Plaza remaining mostly open for flexibility. The fountain located in the center of the Plaza (added in 1995 pursuant to the CMPP) would be retained and is incorporated into the

project. The landscaping, site furniture, water features, lighting, and signage are described further in the Landscaping section.

#### El Prado and Plaza de California

#### El Prado

The Plaza de California is a small plaza encircled by the California Building. El Prado is the primary east-west circulation element that runs through the Central Mesa, from Sixth Avenue to the Plaza de Balboa. Historic photographs show visitors strolling along El Prado, framed by long arcades, decorative street lights, and neatly manicured Black Acacia trees.

Immediately after the 1915–16 Exposition, vehicular traffic took over El Prado, and traffic has continued to flow from the Cabrillo Bridge east through the Plaza de California and along El Prado ever since. The only exception to this was during the 1935-36 Exposition when only pedestrians and shuttle buses were allowed.

In the existing condition, Cabrillo Bridge/El Prado is the only access to the Park from the west, and the heavy use of the roadway by vehicular traffic influences both the form and function of this axis. The project would allow only pedestrian use in the El Prado. Note that automobiles were removed from El Prado east of the Plaza de Panama in the 1970s. The Prado west of Plaza de Panama still carries automobile traffic.

### Plaza de California

The Plaza de California was historically used as a pedestrian square during the 1915-16 Exposition, and later during the 1935-36 Exposition. Vehicular use of El Prado currently limits this use. Vehicle traffic would be removed from El Prado to allow pedestrians to access the main axis of the Park.

### Centennial Bridge and Centennial Road

#### Centennial Bridge

The Centennial Bridge and Centennial Road are proposed to reconfigure vehicular traffic flow and enable the Plaza de California, west El Prado, Plaza de Panama, and the Mall to be dedicated to pedestrians. The Centennial Bridge would be 44 feet wide (edge-to-edge), with two 14-footwide vehicular travel lanes for two-way traffic. There would also be an 8-foot wide walkway on the outer radius for pedestrians, separated from vehicles by a traffic barrier. The Centennial Bridge, as proposed, is 405 feet long from Cabrillo Bridge to the Alcazar parking lot, would span 345 feet between the abutments, and would be supported by six rectangular shaped columns, with approximately 50 feet spacing between columns.

The Centennial Bridge would require removal of approximately 70 linear feet of the existing railing and sidewalk at the east end of the Cabrillo Bridge and would have an expansion joint where it connects to the Cabrillo Bridge making the two structures independent from one another; meaning that no forces would be transferred from one bridge to the other, ensuring that

the Centennial Bridge would have no direct structural effect on the Cabrillo Bridge. The Centennial Bridge would continue eastward across Cabrillo Canyon around the southwest corner of the Museum of Man. The bridge would be curved, would span the existing canyon (60 feet in height at the deepest point of the canyon), and then connect to the Alcazar parking lot. At this point, it would be at a slightly higher elevation than the Cabrillo Bridge. The bridge would be separated from the southwest corner of the California Building by 55 feet.

The Centennial Bridge would be constructed of concrete and designed to minimize its overall depth/size and the visibility. The bridge, abutments, and columns are designed to be simple and thin.

#### Centennial Road

The Centennial Road would consist of two lanes measuring 28 feet (14 feet each) in width, and would connect the Alcazar parking lot to the new Organ Pavilion parking structure and continue on to Presidents Way. The proposed alignment would follow the existing drive that connects Pan American Road with the Alcazar parking lot for a portion of its length. The Centennial Road is proposed to drop down and become grade separated in order to allow vehicles to pass below the pedestrianized Pan American Road to access the east side of the new underground parking structure.

To accomplish this, the Centennial Road would traverse the edge of Palm Canyon and the southerly portion of the proposed Centennial Road would encroach upon the ornamental plantings within Palm Canyon. Accordingly, the proposed project would realign and extend the 1970s Palm Canyon Walkway which is an existing raised wood pedestrian path that connects the Alcazar parking lot with the Mall. The project would extend the existing walkway from its current terminus to the International Cottages. The new addition would intersect with the existing walkway and would curve through and around the existing palms.

### **Alcazar Parking Lot**

The Alcazar parking lot currently contains 136 total parking spaces including 5 Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) spaces. This parking lot would be reconfigured to provide drop-off, loading, valet stacking, and disabled access parking. The lot would be reconfigured to accommodate the relocated ADA spaces from the Plaza de Panama and would include a total of 32 ADA spaces as well as a passenger drop-off area adjacent to Alcazar Garden.

In addition, approximately 18 valet stacking spaces would be located along the southern and eastern edges of the parking lot, which would approximately double the current capacity for valet services. A small valet booth and linear wood log pergola structure associated with the valet services would be located along the eastern edge of the parking lot.

For those visitors utilizing the drop-off, valet and/or disabled parking spaces, the reconfigured Alcazar parking lot would serve as the entry point into the Central Mesa; either through the adjacent Alcazar Garden or via a new ADA compliant pedestrian walkway behind the House of Charm. The drop-off area would allow cars to pull out of the flow of traffic and stop without

blocking traffic. The existing sidewalk adjacent to the Alcazar Garden would be widened to provide a more generous entry plaza. Disabled visitors and those using the valet service or being dropped off would be able to access El Prado through the Alcazar Garden as they do today.

In the southwest corner of the parking lot, a new set of stairs would be added to provide access into the archery range, and a small single fixture restroom would replace the existing restroom/storage building which is to be demolished. A small trash enclosure would be provided adjacent to the restroom.

In addition, the project would include a raised pedestrian bridge and walkway along the rear (south) side of the House of Charm/Mingei Museum. The House of Charm pedestrian bridge/walkway would be a concrete structure with a stucco or light sand finish, in order to be compatible with the House of Charm. The bridge railing would be steel, powder-coated dark olive green similar to the existing arcade railing adjacent to the House of Charm. The new walkway would provide direct ADA compatible pedestrian access from the Alcazar parking lot to the Plaza de Panama through the arcade adjacent to the House of Charm; but would be designed such that it would span the Museum loading area.

#### The Mall and Pan American Promenade

Pan American Road/Pan American Road East (as it is denoted in the *Thomas Guide*) is the segment of street that connects the Plaza de Panama to Presidents Way. The portion of Pan American Road consisting of the roadway and landscaped median between the Plaza de Panama and the Spreckels Organ Pavilion is referred to as "The Mall." The Mall and Pan American Road East are currently used to provide vehicular connection around the Organ Pavilion to Presidents Way and Park Boulevard.

The project would reroute vehicle traffic to the Centennial Road west of the Mall. This would enable the Mall to be re-proportioned to recall the historic design by widening the median lawn, removing non-historic walkways, and re-establishing the historic tree and street light pattern, while accommodating managed vehicle use (tram and emergency or special event vehicles only).

Pan American Road East would be converted to a promenade that would provide a tram and pedestrian route connecting the Mall to the Organ Pavilion, the Palisades, and the park atop the underground parking structure. This tram and pedestrian route is identified in the CMPP as the "Pan American Promenade" and will be referred to as such throughout this report. As previously discussed, the Centennial Road would allow vehicles to pass below Pan American Promenade to access the east side of the new underground parking structure discussed below. The Promenade would be shared with a new tram system, which would shuttle visitors from the new parking structure to the Plaza de Panama.

### Organ Pavilion Parking Structure, Rooftop Park, Tram, and Arizona Street Landfill

### Parking Structure

The existing Organ Pavilion surface parking lot is southwest of the Spreckels Organ Pavilion. The project would construct a new underground parking structure with approximately 799 parking spaces on three levels with a 2.2-acre rooftop park. This proposal would result in a net gain of approximately 262 parking spaces for the Central Mesa.

Making use of the sloped site, the southeast elevation of the structure would be open to allow for natural light and ventilation, thereby reducing the need for mechanical ventilation equipment. During construction of the parking structure, three of the four large Torrey Pine trees behind the Organ Pavilion would be protected. The fourth would be evaluated by a certified arborist for structural integrity, as it is currently leaning toward the Organ Pavilion. This tree would not be impacted by the project, but may need to be removed to protect the historic Organ Pavilion and to alleviate safety concerns.

Vehicle access would be grade separated from the pedestrian and tram traffic running along the reconfigured Pan American Promenade. The vehicle road (Centennial Road) would continue below grade along the northeast side of the structure, and at grade but below the top level of the parking structure along the southeast side, to Presidents Way and Park Boulevard. A proposed 150-foot-long deck over Centennial Road would provide pedestrian and tram access to the Organ Pavilion and northward to the Mall. Vehicle access to and from the new structure would be provided from two points of entry on the east side of the structure from the new Centennial Road.

Users arriving from both the west (via the Cabrillo Bridge) and the east (via Presidents Way) could both access the facility. The parking structure would have entrance, exit, internal circulation, and revenue control equipment.

### Rooftop Park

Where the existing surface parking lot exists, a new rooftop park would include the re-created "California Garden" and an open lawn. The rooftop park would contain a central elevator courtyard with a large open air trellised pavilion around it. On the northeast corner of the rooftop park would be a new public restroom approximately 1,385 square feet in size, to replace the 1990s restroom being removed near the International Cottages. A second small restroom would be provided adjacent to the new visitor center (1,400 square feet) which would be located on the southwest corner. Tram stops would be located adjacent to the central elevator core and the visitor center. Each stop would include seating for waiting tram users.

#### Tram

Trams were introduced in conjunction with both expositions. The 1915 trams consisted of a small tractor pulling trailers with back-to-back benches. The tram system used in 1935 was

motorized, hinged buses. In the existing condition, the Balboa Park tram system, the "red trolleys," is a free intra-park tram system operated by Old Town Trolley Tours of San Diego contracted to the City of San Diego. Passengers board at designated tram stops within the Central Mesa and West Mesa with targeted stops every 5–10 minutes. The current tram route primarily runs along Presidents Way and Pan American Road/Pan American Road East with tram stops at Inspiration Point, The Palisades (two stops), the Organ Pavilion and the Plaza de Panama. Every half hour the tram visits the West Mesa, traveling along El Prado, 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Balboa Drive with stops at Sefton Plaza and the intersection of 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Upas Street. The actual tram schedule varies by the time of year and day of the week.

The project would link parking in the new structure with popular destinations by operating an accessible tram. The new trams would be low-floor, low-speed vehicles that can share the road with pedestrians and provide access to all park visitors, including disabled visitors. The proposed tram vehicles would carry between 16 and 100 passengers. User-friendly features would include a very low floor for easy loading and unloading for passengers of all ages and abilities. It would provide several options for wheelchair accessibility using on-board ramps and tie downs.

The new tram service would be introduced during the construction phase of the proposed project. Upon completion of the project, the tram route would be modified to run from the Organ Pavilion parking structure along the Mall to the Plaza de Panama. The proposed new tram service is intended to supplement rather than replace the existing system and would be designed such that both integration with existing tram system and future expansion would be possible.

#### Arizona Street Landfill

As discussed above, the Organ Pavilion parking structure would be three levels below ground and would result in 142,000 cubic yards of excess soil requiring disposal. The project proposes to export the soil to the nearby Arizona Street Landfill. The proposed haul route to the Arizona Street Landfill would be from the current Organ Pavilion parking lot to Presidents Way, east on Presidents Way to Park Boulevard, north on Park Boulevard to Zoo Place, south on Zoo Place to Florida Drive, south on Florida Drive to Pershing Drive, and north on Pershing Drive to the Arizona Street Landfill. This route would be the most direct and least impactful route (in terms of traffic, residential noise, and emissions) for the haul operation.

The fill hauled to the Arizona Street Landfill would be utilized for grade contouring on top of the existing soil cap (previously placed to prevent rainwater infiltration). Fill and grade contouring is anticipated in three areas of the Arizona Street Landfill. Site 1, southwest of the Park and Recreation Operations Yard, is anticipated to take approximately 116,000 cy of export, with fills ranging from 2 feet to 11 feet in height, 2:1 and 4:1 manufactured slope gradients are anticipated. Site 2, the existing East Mesa archery range, is anticipated to take approximately 11,000 cy of export with fills ranging from 2 to 4 feet in height, 2:1 maximum slope gradients are anticipated. Site 3, the former "casting ponds," is anticipated to take approximately 15,000 cy of export with fills ranging from 2 to 8 feet, 2:1 maximum slope gradients are anticipated. Fill areas would be hydroseeded with a mix of native non-invasive species that would not require irrigation and are consistent with "passive" park uses and Park and Recreation land use goals for the Arizona

Street Landfill.

### **Other Project Components**

#### **Pedestrian Circulation**

Pedestrians would still be able to cross the Cabrillo Bridge and enter the Park through the California Building archway as they do in the existing condition. As proposed, the newly pedestrianized El Prado would provide improved access to the Plaza de Panama; from there, pedestrians could proceed south along the Mall to the Organ Pavilion and Palisades area. For those visitors being dropped off at the Alcazar parking lot, pedestrian access to El Prado would be either north through the Alcazar Garden or east via a newly constructed raised pedestrian walkway proposed as part of this project.

Pan America Promenade would be for pedestrian/tram-only circulation. A grade-separated pedestrian walkway, at the intersection of Pan American Road and the new Centennial Road, would be constructed from the new park atop the Organ Pavilion parking structure over the new Centennial Road to avoid pedestrian/vehicular conflicts at this intersection. Finally, the project would incorporate an extension to the Palm Canyon walkway, a raised wood pedestrian path that connects the Alcazar parking lot with the International Cottages.

## **Bicycle Circulation**

Bicycle use would be permitted within the core of the Park; however, no dedicated bicycle routes would be provided pursuant to the circulation objectives and policies of the CMPP. Bicycle circulation would also be allowed along Centennial Bridge and Centennial Road similar to automobiles. Bicycle storage facilities would be located within the Organ Pavilion parking structure and on the rooftop park.

#### **Parking**

### a. Proposed Parking Changes

The project would remove parking and valet drop-off from the Plaza de Panama. This would involve relocating the standard parking spaces to the new parking structure to be located at the existing Organ Pavilion surface parking lot. The ADA spaces would be relocated to the reconfigured Alcazar parking lot. The valet drop-off zone would also be relocated to the Alcazar parking lot. As proposed, the Alcazar parking lot would have 18 valet loading/unloading stalls and a valet station. Valet parking would also utilize a portion (up to 70 spaces) of the first (lowest) floor of the parking structure for stacked parking. The proposed valet spaces on the first floor of the parking structure are intended to replace the displaced valet parking currently occurring in the Organ Pavilion, Alcazar, and Federal Building lots. Stacked parking generally result in an increase of approximately 30 percent in the capacity of the designated garage area which frees up additional stalls in non-paid parking lots. Overall, the project would result in a net gain of 260 parking spaces within the Central Mesa. The allocation of these changes is outlined below.

#### PROJECT PARKING SPACE SUMMARY BY TYPE

Parking Facility	Existing Configuration		Proposed Project Configuration			Net Change +(-)	
	Std.	ADA	Total	Std.	ADA	Total	, , ,
Plaza de Panama <sup>1</sup>	33	21	54	0	0	0	(54)
Alcazar Parking Lot	131	5	136	0	32	32	(104)
Organ Pavilion Lot	357	10	367	0	0	0	(367)
Organ Pavilion Parking Structure	0	0	0	781	16	797 <sup>2</sup>	797
Presidents Way	22	0	22	10	0	10	(12)
Total Project	543	36	579	791	48	839	260

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Existing Configuration" stall counts do not include six "loading" stalls, one "taxi" stall, or six "motorcycle" stalls.

### b. Paid Parking

Paid parking would be implemented for the new parking structure to offset the costs associated with the construction of the underground parking facility. Parking revenue would also be used to support the expanded tram system and the management, operating, and maintenance expenses of the parking garage.

It is anticipated that the parking garage would be managed by a private operator who would also manage the new tram service.

Paid parking would be handled through central "pay-on-foot" machines. The pay-on-foot system would provide flexibility for payment and enforcement efforts. There would be no need for entrance or exit gates and parkers would locate any available parking stall. Once they park their vehicle, the visitor would pay the parking fee at one of the twelve pay-on-foot machines. Vehicles would exit the parking structure without having to stop at a cashier booth or exit gate. The parking fee would be a "flat rate" fee of \$5 for up to 5 hours. This rate structure was chosen for the following reasons:

- The average stay for Balboa Park visitors is 3.1 hours (Land Use, Circulation & Parking Plan [Jones & Jones 2004]).
- The proposed five-hour period allows the typical Park guest to complete their visit within the designated five-hour period.

The proposed parking structure would be able to accommodate up to 25 motorcycle spaces and racks for up to 15 bicycles in addition to the 797 spaces for automobiles.

- The proposed rate structure was designed to provide the maximum amount of visitor parking availability by discouraging general employee parking demand that averages 8+ hours per parked vehicle, which displaces two+ Park visitors.
- Parking violation enforcement efforts are much more efficient with a flat rate structure versus an hourly rate structure. This reduces parking structure operating expenses.

A violation notice or fine could be incurred if a vehicle remains in the parking structure beyond the initial five-hour period. Extending the stay would require an additional fee of \$5 for an additional five hours.

### c. Staff and Employee Parking

Currently, staff and employees utilize over 550 of the most centrally located parking spaces. Employees would no longer have access to spaces in the Plaza de Panama or Alcazar parking lots, with the exception of employees with handicapped placards. Employees would be able to use the paid parking in the new Organ Pavilion structure or the unpaid spaces in parking lots such as the Pan American lot, Federal Building lot, or the Inspiration Point lot. Because of the costs associated with the parking structure, it is expected that many employees would avoid the new structure and instead park in the more remote lots.

### **Emergency and Service Vehicle Access**

The Plaza de California and El Prado design would allow full-sized fire engines and any other emergency or service vehicles to access the interior of the West Prado area in the event of an emergency. Retractable bollards would be in place west of the California Building's archway to allow emergency and service vehicles to access El Prado; but all other vehicular traffic would be routed south and east via the proposed Centennial Road.

### **Landscaping Plan**

### Plaza de Panama

The landscape plan for the Plaza de Panama calls for a double row of shade trees along the outer edges of the Plaza. Trees that currently screen adjacent historic buildings would be removed. The new trees would be located further away from the historic façades to shade the edges of the Plaza. The foundation plantings adjacent to the Houses of Charm and Hospitality would be thinned to eliminate historically inappropriate species and supplemented to include low ornamental plantings and bougainvillea in order to provide better views of the architecture. The existing asphalt surface would be replaced with specialty paving with a monolithic appearance, to provide a smooth, unbroken backdrop for Plaza activities. Historically accurate reproduction light fixtures, and movable tables and chairs would be added.

Lawn panels would be implemented around the perimeter of the Plaza in order to match the historic design, and the small plaza in front of the Timken Museum would be incorporated to make it part of the overall plaza composition. The Museum of Art steps, located along the northern edge of the Plaza, would be re-created using the 1926 layout. The central fountain,

which would remain, would be flanked to the north and south by two shallow reflecting pools.

### El Prado

The proposed landscaping design would recall the formal 1915–16 appearance. New trees and landscaping would be installed in their historic locations and the existing asphalt surface would be replaced with specialty paving with a monolithic appearance. The original roadway width would be restored and reinforced with a formal organization of ornamental trees and historic lighting. Foundation plantings along the arcades would be thinned to remove historically inappropriate species and be supplemented to include low ornamental plantings and Bougainvillea. Ornamental "El Prado Trees" would be evenly spaced along both sides of El Prado, interspersed with pedestrian benches and formal lighting fixtures (historic replicas reproduced in a more durable material) located in their approximate historic locations.

### Plaza de California

The proposed design for the Plaza de California would reuse the historically accurate tree planters recently added by the City in their historic locations. The existing non-historic interlocking pavers would be replaced with specialty paving with a monolithic appearance in order to provide a smooth, unbroken backdrop for Plaza activities.

### Centennial Bridge

Upon completion of the bridge, the disturbed areas would be revegetated with natural and native vegetation. Where possible, existing Eucalyptus trees would be preserved in place and additional plantings would be added along the entire length of the Bridge.

### Centennial Road

The portion of the Centennial Road from the eastern side of the Alcazar parking lot to the new Organ Pavilion parking structure would receive the "Palm Canyon" landscaping treatment where revegetation is required. During construction of the Centennial Road and the Palm Canyon Walkway extension, care would be taken to minimize impacts to the existing trees and vegetation. The "City Christmas Tree" near Palm Canyon would be relocated or replaced.

### Alcazar Parking Lot

Landscaping includes new tree plantings along the western, eastern, and southern periphery of the Alcazar parking lot. Where possible, existing trees would be relocated or replanted subsequent to the completion of grading activities at the Alcazar parking lot. The tree types and understory species would be consistent with either the "Cabrillo Canyon" and/or the "Palm Canyon" plant palette. The parking lot would include rows of shade trees set within landscape islands exceeding the City requirement that a shade tree would be within 30 feet of each parking stall. The outer edges of the parking and portions of the interior would include specialty pedestrian paving, but of a different type than in the historic core areas (e.g., Plaza de Panama, El Prado) in order to provide differentiation. A sidewalk (with paving complementary to the Plazas and El Prado) would encompass the perimeter of the lot to provide views of the adjacent

canyons, accommodate valet users movement, and access into the archery range.

### The Mall

The landscaping plan for the Mall would include widening the central landscaped median to more closely resemble its original 1915 design (fire lane width requirements make exact replication infeasible). Consistent with the plan for El Prado, the landscaping plan also includes specialty paving and a formal organization of trees, pedestrian benches, and historic replica lighting fixtures located in their 1915 locations. The east and west edges would be defined by concrete mow curbs. Beyond the mow curbs the grade and vegetation would reflect the existing landscape themes of Palm Canyon to the west and the Japanese Friendship Garden to the east.

### Rooftop Park/Pan American Promenade/Arizona Landfill

The landscaping would provide a continuous pedestrian/tram promenade, the Pan American Promenade, along the western edge that would unify the International Cottages, the Organ Pavilion, and the new rooftop park and gardens. The promenade would be accentuated by a colonnade of shade trees, and specialty paving would unify the new rooftop park and gardens with the Organ Pavilion, the Mall, Plaza de Panama, and El Prado.

The landscape design shows the northern area as the re-created "California Garden" and a central courtyard containing the stairwell and elevator core structures with a large open air pavilion around it. This central courtyard would also contain fixed tables and chairs and small planted areas. The stairwell/elevator core would include two glass elevators clad in water-cut steel panels that utilize a traditional grille pattern, creating a backlit Moorish lantern effect. The trellis structures along Pan American Promenade, as well as the visitor center, would include photovoltaic solar panels on the roofs (concealed behind parapets in the case of the visitor center). The southern half of the rooftop park would consist of a large open lawn intended to be a flexible and adaptable open space area suitable for many uses, edged by small informal gardens and ornamental trees to the east. A nine-foot-wide walkway and decorative railing would form the eastern edge of the rooftop park. A "green living wall" system is proposed along this entire east façade. The design would utilize a separate pre-manufactured steel mesh or grate product to provide a trellis-like structure that would accommodate the growth of vines and other plant materials along vertical surfaces. The trellis system would be attached to the exterior façade of the parking structure and over time, the vegetation would fill in the entire trellis system, resulting in a living "green" wall. The area between the southeastern edge of the parking structure and the Centennial Road would be landscaped with "native garden" plantings. This area would also contain evergreen trees to shield views of the parking structure's open eastern face. The landscaping east of the Centennial Road would be "Australian Canyon Landscape" plantings.

As described above, the project would export soil excavated from the construction of the parking structure to the Arizona Street Landfill on the East Mesa. Upon completion of the hauling and grading activities, hydroseeding would be required in order to re-vegetate the site for erosion control. Pursuant to the East Mesa Precise Plan (EMPP), the Arizona Street Landfill is intended ultimately to be "reclaimed" as passive use parkland. In accordance with this goal, revegetation of the site would include low-growing, non-invasive, non-irrigated species that would be

compatible with passive recreational uses such as kite flying, picnicking, and pick-up ball games. Grading and revegetation of the site, through hydroseeding, would be done in a manner that would not preclude further restoration of the site in the future according to EMPP goals.

### Tree Removal and Relocation

Balboa Park contains numerous trees that are important because of their size, location, or history (e.g., person who donated or planted them). Accordingly, a tree survey was conducted in and around the project area and dictated the design of the project.

Trees within the project footprint which cannot feasibly be relocated or were found to be infested or diseased will be removed. Of the 753 trees surveyed within or adjacent to the project area; 372 would remain, approximately 216 trees would be relocated within the Park, and approximately 165 trees would be removed. The project design includes the planting of approximately 405 new trees.

The proposed Project will begin solicitation of recommendations from officially recognized advisory bodies starting May 3, 2012 with the Balboa Park Committee, the officially recognized planning group for Balboa Park. Recommendations from the surrounding communities of Uptown, Centre City, Golden Hill and North Park have been received, and those recommendations will be included in the future action item with the Planning Commission. In addition, recommendations will be solicited from the park and Recreation Board's Design Review Committee, the Park and Recreation Board, the Historical Resources Board, the Mayor's Committee on Disabilities, and the Planning Commission before final action by City Council in July of 2012.

Respectfully submitted,

Stacey LoMedico Director Park and Recreation Department

Charles Daniels
Park Designer
Park and Recreation Department

LOMEDICO/cpd

Attachment: PowerPoint Presentation