### ATTACHMENT 2





### **ATTACHMENT 4**





Ocean Deach			
Existing Population-Based Parks	Existing Useable Acres		
Community Parks:			
Ocean Beach Community Park	1.21 acres		
Neighborhood and Pocket Parks:			
Ocean Beach Gateway Pocket Park	0.22 acres		
Park Equivalency:			
Ocean Beach Elementary Joint Use Facility	<u>1.20 acres</u>		
Total:	<u>2.63 acres</u>		
Future Park Acreage Required	<u>42.20 acres</u>		
Future Park Deficit	<u>39.57 acres</u>		

# Existing and Future Population-based Parks and Recreation Facilities in Ocean Beach

\*General Plan Guideline: 15,071 people divided by  $1,000 = 15.07 \times 2.8$  acres = 42.20 acres of population-based parks.

Existing Recreation Center(s):	Future Requirements	Future Deficit
10,090 square feet Ocean Beach	10,200 Square Feet**	110 Square Feet
Community Recreation Center		

\*\*General Plan Guideline: Recreation Center (17,000 square feet) serves population of 25,000. 15,071 people divided by 25,000 people = 60 % of a 17,000 square foot Recreation Center = 10,200 square feet.

Existing Aquatic	Future Requirements	Future Deficit
Complex:		
0 Existing	30 % of an Aquatic	30 % of an Aquatic
	Complex***	Complex

\*\*\*General Plan Guideline: Aquatics Complex serves population of 50,000. 15,071 people divided by 50,000 people = 30 % of an Aquatics Complex.



Park Equivalency Credits				
Park Equivalencies	Net Useable Acreage to be used as a Park Equivalency Credit	<b>Recreation Components and Amenities</b>		
Portion of Resource-Based Parks				
Brighton Avenue Park (within Ocean Beach Park)	2.00 acres	Walkways, picnic areas, lighting, barbecues, and hot coal receptacles.		
Saratoga Beach Park (within Ocean Beach Park)	1.20 acres	Walkways, children's play area, plaza area, fitness course, seating and lighting.		
Veterans Park (within Ocean Beach Park)	0.40 acres	A plaza area, walkways, seating, interpretive panels, landscaping, lighting and a park sign.		
Dog Beach (within Mission Bay Park)	5.00 acres	Hardscape, landscape, accessible pathway, retaining wall, and lighting.		
Dusty Rhodes Park (within the Mission Bay Park)	5.00 acres	New children's play area, picnic areas, parking, benches, an accessible pedestrian path with security lighting connecting the parking lot to the west with the parking lot to the east.		
Robb Field (within Mission Bay Park)	3.50 acres	Children's play area, small multi-purposed courts, picnic areas, benches connected by a new pathway and an accessible pedestrian ramp to the San Diego River Park trail.		
Trails Famosa Slough Open Space Trail	0.55 acres	Improve an existing trail to be meet accessibility standards and provide, benches, interpretive signs, fencing where needed, native landscaping, trash and recycling containers.		
Joint Use Facilities				
Ocean Beach Elementary School	Existing	Turf and irrigation upgrades and/or replacement after the year 2014, 25 years into the term of the existing 50-year joint use agreement, to extend the life of the facility.		
Barnes Tennis Center	3.00 acres	New passive park may include a comfort station, basketball courts, picnic facilities, barbecues, drinking fountains, children's play areas, security lighting, walkways, trash and recycling containers, community garden, landscaping and fencing, where needed.		
<b>Total Equivalencies Credit</b>	20.65 acres			





#### **ATTACHMENT 10**



#### ATTACHMENT 11



# **OBCPU Proposed Revisions to Variance Language**

May 12, 2014

## Strike following paragraph from page Intro 06:

The LDC defines the purpose and procedures for variances. A series of variances have been granted in recent years which have resulted in an increased FAR. The variances, which were met by objections from the community, allowed development of singlefamily residences. The properties are undersized per the zone's minimum lot size requirements, have no alley access, and are within a mapped flood plain. There are no special circumstances or conditions applying to properties in the multi-family designated areas of Ocean Beach that do not apply generally to other properties in the RM-2-4 zone. While the .7 FAR is unique to Ocean Beach, strict application of the regulations would not deprive a property owner of reasonable use of the land, and granting of variances to increase allowable FAR in the RM-2-4 zone would adversely affect the Ocean Beach Community Plan.

# **Insert in Plan Introduction**

The Land Development Code defines the purpose and procedures for variances. A series of variances were granted in the years leading up to the 2014 adoption of the updated Ocean Beach Community Plan that raised issues of neighborhood scale. The variances were met by objections from the community planning group because they made possible the development of single-family residences with increased bulk and scale which exceeded the allowable FAR permitted by existing regulations.<sup>1</sup>

In response to the community's concerns about neighborhood character and overall desire to maintain Ocean Beach's established character, additional policies were included in the Urban Design Element – Residential Neighborhood Recommendations (See Policies 4.2.1-4.2.9). These policies are intended to achieve transitions in scale between existing structures and new infill development . In addition, one of the overall plan goals is to "encourage development that builds on Ocean Beach's established character as a mixed-use, small-scale neighborhood." This overall plan goal, which is reflected throughout the plan, together with the more targeted, detailed residential neighborhood urban design policies, will provide guidance to project designers, community members, property owners and staff reviewers. As City staff reviews discretionary projects, including variance requests, an evaluation of how the proposed project implements the overall intent of the plan and conforms with its policies will be conducted. The evaluation will form the basis for a determination as to whether the granting of the discretionary permit would adversely affect the Ocean Beach Community Plan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Existing regulations specify FARs of 0.7, 0.75, 1.80, and 2.0 for the RM-2-4, RM-1-1, RM-5-12. and CC-4-2 zones, respectively.

# Insert in Urban Design Element (Section 4.2 Policies)

4.2.3 Encourage gradual transitions between new residential structures and existing adjacent buildings by incorporating side yard setbacks and upper story stepbacks. Create visual interest and variety, while maintaining a sense of harmony and proportion along street frontages and other portions of the project exposed to the public view (Refer to General Plan Polices UD-A.5 and UD-B.1).

4.2.4 New residential development should take design cues from the historic smallscale character of the residential areas in Ocean Beach. <u>Establish respectful and</u> <u>functional site arrangement of buildings and parking areas, and a high quality of</u> <u>architectural and landscape design.</u>

4.2.8 Discourage lot-splitting in single family areas and maintain residential lot sizes in their existing conditions to the highest degree possible.

4.2.9 Maintain the community's small-scale character and avoid exceptions to established floor-area ratios to the greatest extent possible under the law.<sup>2</sup>



 $<sup>^2</sup>$  Existing regulations specify FAR's of 0.7, 0.75, 1.80, and 2.0 for the RM-2-4, RM-1-1, RM-5-12, and CC-4-2 zones, respectively.

#### RESOLUTION NUMBER R-\_\_\_\_\_

DATE OF FINAL PASSAGE \_\_\_\_\_

## A RESOLUTION APPROVING AN AMENDMENT TO THE OCEAN BEACH COMMUNITY PLAN AND THE GENERAL PLAN TO EFFECT A COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE TO THE OCEAN BEACH COMMUNITY PLAN

WHEREAS, on \_\_\_\_\_\_, the City Council of the City of San Diego held a public hearing for the purpose of considering amendments to the Ocean Beach Community Plan, the General Plan and Implementation Plan and other actions associated with the comprehensive update to the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program; and

WHEREAS, the current Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program was adopted in 1975; and

WHEREAS, the Ocean Beach Community Plan Update provides a balanced land use plan, and preserves the existing mixed-use, coastal village community character and continues to meet the needs of the Ocean Beach community; and

WHEREAS, the update to the Ocean Beach Community Plan Update focuses on urban design, community character, public views, multi-modal mobility, protection of sensitive resources, and sea level rise; and

WHEREAS, as part of the plan update, the General Plan will be amended because the Community Plan is a component of the General Plan; and

WHEREAS, the City desires to correct an inconsistency between the zone and the residential land use designation for a portion of Ocean Beach by rezoning 99 properties as part of the update process; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission of the City of San Diego held a public hearing on May 29, 2014, to consider this amendment to the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission found, based on its hearing record, that this comprehensive community plan update is consistent with and implements the City of San Diego's 2008 General Plan and that the proposed update helps achieve long-term community and city-wide goals; and

WHEREAS, the City Council has considered the Planning Commission record and recommendation as well as the maps, exhibits, and written documents contained in the file for this update on record in the City of San Diego, and has considered the oral presentations given at the public hearing; NOW THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, by the City Council of the City of San Diego that the Ocean Beach Community Plan Update incorporates each of the policies of the City of San Diego's 2008 General Plan that the City Council has determined are mandatory and fundamental to advancement of the General Plan's goals as they apply to the Ocean Beach community: and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the City Council of the City of San Diego hereby adopts amendments to the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program that implement the comprehensive update thereto, and that it adopts corresponding amendments to the General Plan, with a copy of said update being on file in the office of the City Clerk as Document No. R-\_\_\_\_\_.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that prior to becoming effective, this resolution shall be submitted to the San Diego County Regional Airport Authority (SDCRAA) for a consistency determination. BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that if the SDCRAA finds this resolution consistent with the Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan (ALUCP) for San Diego International Airport (Lindberg Field), this resolution shall take effect and be in force as of the date of the finding of consistency, except that the provisions of this resolution inside the Coastal Overlay Zone, which are subject to California Coastal Commission jurisdiction as a City of San Diego Local Coastal Program amendment, shall not take effect until the date the California Coastal Commission unconditionally certifies those provisions as a local coastal program amendment.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that if the SDCRAA determines that this resolution is inconsistent or conditionally consistent, subject to proposed modifications, with the ALUCP for Lindberg Field, the resolution shall be submitted to the City Council for reconsideration.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, if the SDCRAA determines that this resolution is conditionally consistent with the ALUCP for Lindberg Field, but that consistency is subject to proposed modifications, the City Council may amend this resolution to accept the proposed modifications, and this resolution as amended shall take effect and be in force on the thirtieth day from and after its final passage, except that the provisions of this resolution as amended inside the Coastal Overlay Zone, which are subject to California Coastal Commission jurisdiction as a City of San Diego Local Coastal Program amendment shall not take effect until the date the California Coastal Commission unconditionally certifies those provisions as a local coastal program amendment.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that a proposed decision by the City Council to overrule a determination of inconsistency or to reject the proposed modifications for a finding of conditional consistency shall include the findings required pursuant to Public Utilities Code section 21670 and require a two-thirds vote; the proposed decision and findings shall be forwarded to the SDCRAA, California Department of Transportation, Division of Aeronautics, and the airport operators for Lindberg Field; and the City Council shall hold a second hearing not less than 45 days from the date the proposed decision and findings were provided, at which hearing any comments submitted by the public agencies shall be considered and a final decision to overrule a determination of inconsistency shall require a two-thirds vote.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that if the City Council makes a final decision to overrule a determination of inconsistency, resolution shall take effect and be in force thirtieth day from and after that final decision, except that the provision of this resolution inside the Coastal Overlay Zone, which are subject to California Coastal Commission jurisdiction as a City of San Diego Local Coastal Program amendment shall not take effect until the date the California Coastal Commission unconditionally certifies those provisions as a local coastal program amendment.

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, City Attorney

By

Corrine Neuffer Deputy City Attorney

CLN:dkr 5/16/2014 Or.Dept: DSD Doc. No. 790076 Comp. R-2014-747 I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was passed by the Council of the City of San Diego, at this meeting of \_\_\_\_\_.

> ELIZABETH S. MALAND City Clerk

By\_\_\_\_\_ Deputy City Clerk

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ (date)

KEVIN L. FAULCONER, Mayor

Vetoed: \_\_\_\_\_(date)

KEVIN L. FAULCONER, Mayor

RESOLUTION NUMBER R-\_\_\_\_\_

DATE OF FINAL PASSAGE \_\_\_\_\_

A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO CERTIFYING ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT PROJECT NO. 308424/SCH. NO. 2011071082 AND ADOPTING THE MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM, FINDINGS, AND STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE TO THE OCEAN BEACH COMMUNITY PLAN AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM.

WHEREAS, the City of San Diego undertook a comprehensive update to the 1975 Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program, which project includes amendments to the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program and General Plan and Implementation Plan, an update of the Ocean Beach Public Facilities Financing Plan, and associated actions (Project); and

the matter was set for a public hearing to be conducted by the City Council of the City of San Diego; and

WHEREAS, the matter was heard by the City Council on \_\_\_\_\_; and

WHEREAS, the City Council considered the issues discussed in the Environmental Impact Report Project No. 308424/Sch. No. 2011071082 (Report) prepared for this Project; NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, by the City Council of the City of San Diego, that it is hereby certified that the Report has been completed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act of 1970 (CEQA) (California Public Resources Code Section 21000 et seq.), as amended, and the State Guidelines thereto (California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Chapter 3, Section 15000 et seq.), that the Report reflects the independent judgment of the City of San Diego as Lead Agency and that the information contained in said Report, together with any comments received during the public review process, has been reviewed and considered by the City Council in connection with the approval of the Project; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that pursuant to CEQA Section 21081.6, the City Council hereby adopts the Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program, or alterations to implement the changes to the Project as required by the City Council in order to mitigate or avoid significant effects on the environment, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit A hereto and incorporated herein by reference; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that pursuant to CEQA Section 21081 and CEQA Guidelines Sections 15091 and 15093, the City Council hereby adopts Findings and a Statement of Overriding Considerations with respect to the Project, copies of which are attached hereto as Exhibit B and Exhibit C and incorporated herein by reference; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Report and other documents constituting the record of proceedings upon which the approval is based are available to the public at the office of the City Clerk at 202 C Street, San Diego, CA 92101; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the City Clerk is directed to file a Notice of

Determination with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors for the County of San Diego regarding

the Project after final passage of the ordinances associated with the Project.

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, City Attorney

By

Corrine Neuffer Deputy City Attorney

CLN:dkr 5/16/2014 Or.Dept: DSD Doc. No. 790100 Comp. R-2014-746

ATTACHMENT(S): Exhibit A, Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program Exhibit B, Findings Exhibit C, Statement of Overriding Considerations

I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was passed by the Council of the City of San Diego, at this meeting of \_\_\_\_\_\_.

ELIZABETH S. MALAND City Clerk

By\_\_\_\_

Deputy City Clerk

Approved:

(date)

KEVIN L. FAULCONER, Mayor

Vetoed:

(date)

KEVIN L. FAULCONER, Mayor

ORDINANCE NUMBER O-\_\_\_\_\_ (NEW SERIES)

DATE OF FINAL PASSAGE \_\_\_\_\_

AN ORDINANCE OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO CHANGING 20.53 ACRES LOCATED IN OCEAN BEACH, WITHIN THE OCEAN BEACH COMMUNITY PLAN AREA, IN THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA, FROM THE SINGLE FAMILY ZONE OF RS-1-7 TO THE MULTI-FAMILY ZONE OF RM-1-1, AND REPEALING ORDINANCE NO. 32 ADOPTED SEPTEMBER 6, 1932, and ORDINANCE NO. 12793 ADOPTED APRIL 14, 1930, OF ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO INSOFAR AS THE SAME CONFLICT HEREWITH.

BE IT ORDAINED, by the Council of the City of San Diego, as follows:

Section 1. That 20.53 acres located in Ocean Beach and legally described as in the following boundary description as (description being drafted) and as shown on Zone Map Drawing No.B-4297, filed in the office of the City Clerk, are rezoned from the RS-1-7 into the RM-1-1 zone, as the zone is described and defined by San Diego Municipal Code Chapter 13 Article 1 Division 4. This action amends the Official Zoning Map adopted by Resolution R-301263 on February 28, 2006.

Section 2. That Ordinance No. 12793 adopted April 14, 1930 and Ordinance No. 32 adopted September 6, 1932 of the ordinances of the City of San Diego are repealed insofar as the same conflict with the rezoned uses of the land.

Section 3. That a full reading of this ordinance is dispensed with prior to its final passage, a written or printed copy having been available to the City Council and the public a day prior to its final passage. Section 4. That prior to becoming effective, this ordinance shall be submitted to the San Diego County Regional Airport Authority (SDCRAA) for a consistency determination.

That if the SDCRAA finds this ordinance consistent with the Airport Land Use Compatibility Plan (ALUCP) for San Diego International Airport (Lindberg Field), this ordinance shall take effect and be in force as of the date of the finding of consistency, except that the provisions of this ordinance inside the Coastal Overlay Zone, which are subject to California Coastal Commission jurisdiction as a City of San Diego Local Coastal Program amendment, shall not take effect until the date the California Coastal Commission unconditionally certifies those provisions as a local coastal program amendment.

That if the SDCRAA determines that this ordinance is inconsistent or conditionally consistent, subject to proposed modifications, with the ALUCP for Lindberg Field, the ordinance shall be submitted to the City Council for reconsideration.

That if the SDCRAA determines that this ordinance is conditionally consistent with the ALUCP for Lindberg Field, but that consistency is subject to proposed modifications, the City Council may amend this ordinance to accept the proposed modifications, and this ordinance as amended shall take effect and be in force on the thirtieth day from and after its final passage, except that the provisions of this ordinance as amended inside the Coastal Overlay Zone, which are subject to California Coastal Commission jurisdiction as a City of San Diego Local Coastal Program amendment shall not take effect until the date the California Coastal Commission unconditionally certifies those provisions as a local coastal program amendment.

That a proposed decision by the City Council to overrule a determination of inconsistency or to reject the proposed modifications for a finding of conditional consistency shall include the findings required pursuant to Public Utilities Code section 21670 and require a two-thirds vote; the proposed decision and findings shall be forwarded to the SDCRAA, California Department of Transportation, Division of Aeronautics, and the airport operators for Lindberg Field; and the City Council shall hold a second hearing not less than 45 days from the date the proposed decision and findings were provided, at which hearing any comments submitted by the public agencies shall be considered and a final decision to overrule a determination of inconsistency shall require a two-thirds vote.

That if the City Council makes a final decision to overrule a determination of inconsistency, ordinance shall take effect and be in force thirtieth day from and after that final decision, except that the provision of this ordinance inside the Coastal Overlay Zone, which are subject to California Coastal Commission jurisdiction as a City of San Diego Local Coastal Program amendment shall not take effect until the date the California Coastal Commission unconditionally certifies those provisions as a local coastal program amendment.

Section 5. That permits shall not be issued for development that is inconsistent with the provisions of this ordinance unless complete applications for the permits were submitted to the City prior to the date the California Coastal Commission unconditionally certifies the provisions of this ordinance as a local coastal program amendment.

APPROVED: JAN GOLDSMITH, City Attorney

By

Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

CLN:dkr 05/16/2014 Or.Dept:DSD Doc. No. 790136

Attachments: Exhibit A, Ocean Beach Parcel Information

I hereby certify that the foregoing Ordinance was passed by the Council of the City of San Diego, at this meeting of \_\_\_\_\_.

> ELIZABETH S. MALAND City Clerk

By\_\_\_\_\_ Deputy City Clerk

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_(date)

KEVIN L. FAULCONER, Mayor

Vetoed:

(date)

KEVIN L. FAULCONER, Mayor

44848235	44848129	44848132
44848215	44848219	44834215
44848117	44845115	44845120
44834219	44847222	44848127
44848241	44847223	44848109
44848231	44848105	44848234
44848107	44848238	44848134
44834216	44848217	44848110
44847231	44849108	44845123
44847210	44848104	44847224
44849106	44848237	44848239
44849115	44848103	44848240
44845114	44848116	44848227
44849110	44848128	44848111
44845119	44845116	44848130
44847235	44848106	44848218
44847118	44834212	44847220
44848112	44847233	44848229
44847213	44848213	44848131
44845118	44848233	44845117
44848108	44849105	44847218
44849111	44849107	44848133
44849113	44848221	44847209
44834218	44848220	44834214
44847236	44847237	44845121
44847206	44848121	44847211
44848216	44847119	44847114
44849109	44847207	44849112
44848118	44848223	44849114
44847115	44847219	
44848228	44847208	
44834213	44848236	
44848222	44848214	
44834217	44847212	
44845122	44847221	

Ocean Beach Rezone Assessor Parcel Number Information

# PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. - PC

# RECOMMENDING TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF THE UPDATE TO THE OCEAN BEACH COMMUNITY PLAN AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM, AMENDMENTS TO THE GENERAL PLAN AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, CERTIFICATION OF THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT PROJECT NO. 308424/SCH. NO. 2011071082 AND ADOPTION OF THE FINDINGS, STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS (SOC), AND THE MITIGATION AND MONITORING REPORTING PROGRAM (MMRP), AND REZONING OF PARCELS WITHIN OCEAN BEACH

WHEREAS, on May 29, 2014, the Planning Commission of the City of San

Diego held a public hearing for the purpose of considering and recommending to the Council of the City of San Diego approval and adoption of an update to the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program, Amendments to the General Plan and the Implementation Plan, Certification of the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) Project No. 308424/SCH. No. 2011071082 and Adoption of Findings, Statement of Overriding Considerations (SOC), and the Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program (MMRP), and Rezoning of Parcels within Ocean Beach.

WHEREAS, the adopted Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program was last updated in 1975; and

WHEREAS, the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program Update provides a balanced land use plan, and preserves the existing mixed-use, coastal village community character and continues to meet the needs of the Ocean Beach community; and

WHEREAS, the update to the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program focuses on urban design, community character, public views, multi-modal mobility, protection of sensitive resources, and sea level rise; and WHEREAS, the City desires to correct an inconsistency between the zone and the residential land use designation for a portion of Ocean Beach by rezoning 99 properties as part of the update process; and.

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission of the City of San Diego has considered all maps, exhibits, and written documents contained in the file for this project on record in the City of San Diego, and has considered the oral presentations given at the public hearing;

### NOW THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, by the Planning Commission of the City of San Diego that it hereby recommends to the Council of the City of San Diego approval and adoption of adoption of an update to the Ocean Beach Community Plan and Local Coastal Program, Amendments to the General Plan and the Implementation Plan, Certification of the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) Project No. 308424/SCH No. 2011071082 and Adoption of Findings, Statement of Overriding Considerations (SOC), and the Mitigation and Monitoring Reporting Program (MMRP), and Rezoning of Parcels within Ocean Beach.

Theresa Millette, AICP Ocean Beach Community Plan Update Project Manager Planning, Neighborhoods, and Economic Development Department

Dated: May 29, 2014 By a vote of: