

DATE ISSUED: September 8, 2005 **REPORT NO. PC-05-258**

ATTENTION: **Planning Commission, Agenda of September 15, 2005**

SUBJECT: MASHAYEKAN RESIDENCE - PROJECT NO. 56170. PROCESS 3

REFERENCE: HEARING OFFICER AGENDA OF JULY 20, 2005,
REPORT NO. HO-05-124

**OWNER/
APPLICANT:** David Mashayekan
Ryan Reynolds, Island Architects

SUMMARY

Issue(s): Should the Planning Commission approve or deny an appeal of the Hearing Officer's decision approving Site Development Permit No. 169262, for Mashayekan Residence, Project No. 56170, for demolition of an existing single family residence and construction of a one-story, 8,413 square-foot single family residence with attached four car garage and a 1,092 square foot detached guest quarters?

Staff Recommendation: DENY the appeal and APPROVE Site Development Permit No. 169262.

Community Planning Group Recommendation: The La Jolla Community Planning Association considered the project on February 3, 2005, and voted 11-0-1 in favor of the project with no conditions (Attachment 10). The La Jolla Shores Advisory Board considered the project on April 19, 2005, and voted 4-2-0 with three conditions (Attachment 11).

Other Recommendations: None with this action.

Environmental Review: The project was determined to be exempt from the State of California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines, Section 15302, Replacement or Reconstruction.

Fiscal Impact Statement: None with this action. All cost associated with the processing of this project are paid by the applicant.

Code Enforcement Impact: None with this action.

Housing Impact Statement: The La Jolla Community Plan designates the subject property for very low density residential development for up to 5 dwelling units per acre. The proposed single family residence is allowed on this site under this density range on the 31,708 square foot site. The project proposes to demolish one existing single family residence and construct one single family residence. The impact to the La Jolla community will be no net increase of residential housing. The proposed project will not result in an increase in the housing supply for the City of San Diego.

BACKGROUND

A Site Development Permit, in the La Jolla Shores Planned District, is a Process Three, Hearing Officer decision per San Diego Municipal Code Section 103.0104(c). The Site Development Permit was approved by the Hearing Officer on July 20, 2005. On July 20, 2005, Alejandro Doring, an interested person who testified before the Hearing Officer, appealed the project to the Planning Commission.

The project site is a 31,708 square-foot lot zoned SF (Single Family) in the La Jolla Shores Planned District and the La Jolla Community Plan Area. The property is addressed as 2745 Costebelle Drive and is an interior lot (Attachment 1). The site is surrounded by properties also zoned SF and developed with single family residences (Attachment 2 and 3). The La Jolla Community Plan designates the site for residential development at a Very-Low density of 5 dwelling units per acre (Attachment 2).

The site is currently improved with a one-story single family residence, two detached structures and a swimming pool. The demolition of the existing single family residence and two detached structures is the first step in redeveloping the property. The swimming pool will remain on the project site. The topography of the site is relatively flat along Costebelle Drive and the eastern portion of the property. The overall site slopes to the northwest with an overall grade differential approximately 25 feet.

DISCUSSION

Project Description:

The applicant is requesting approval of a Site Development Permit for the proposed demolition of the existing single family residence and the construction of a one-story, 8,413 square-foot single family residence with attached four-car garage and a 1,092 square-foot detached guest quarters. The main residence will include a living room, dining room, family room, breakfast

nook, kitchen, library, 5 bathrooms, 4 bedrooms, laundry room and a four-car garage. The guest quarters will include a sitting room, media room, two bathrooms and one bedroom.

Exterior elevations propose earth tone stucco walls, windows, wood frame garage doors, and a grey slate roof. Site improvements will include fencing and landscaping. The existing pool will remain as part of the proposed project. All other detached structures located on the property will be removed as part of the Site Development Permit.

Community Plan Analysis:

The site for the proposed new single dwelling unit is designated in the La Jolla Community Plan as Very Low Density Residential (0-5 du/acre). This project conforms with that land use designation.

The subject site is located in a single family residential neighborhood. The proposed residential development replaces an existing single-story home with a new single-story residence. The plan recommends that in order to promote transition in scale between new and older structures the design should create visual relief through the use of diagonal or off-setting planes, building articulation, roofline treatment and variations within front yard setback requirements. The front elevation, viewed from the right of way, exhibits variations in the front yard setback, a decorative entry way, multiple windows, and a roofline that is articulated by multiple pitched roofs. The project proposes earth tone stucco with a grey slate roof type as the primary exterior colors and materials. The density and design of the project conform to the policies of the La Jolla Community Plan for residential development.

COMMUNITY PLANNING GROUP RECOMMENDATION

On February 3, 2005, the La Jolla Community Planning Association voted 11-0-1 in favor of the project with no conditions (Attachment 10).

The La Jolla Shores Advisory Board considered the project on April 19, 2005 and voted 4-2-0 with three conditions (Attachment 11), which are listed below:

1. *The project is to provide a 10 foot setback:* The project has been redesigned along the northeastern portion of the site. The front yard setback in the northeastern portion of the project, near the proposed garage, is 8 feet. The project no longer has a 6 foot setback. The remainder of the proposed project observes an overall 22 foot front yard setback.
2. *An additional curb cut will not be allowed along Costebelle Drive. Project already has access via a private easement:* The project has been revised with no curb cut proposed along Costebelle Drive.
3. *No parking in the required front yard* The project has been revised to remove the driveway and parking within the required front yard.

APPEAL ISSUES

The appellant, Alejandro Doring, an interested person who testified before the Hearing Officer on July 20, 2005, filed an appeal on July 20, 2005 (Attachment 9). The issues identified in the written appeal to the Planning Commission, can be categorized in the following:

1. Bulk and scale on lot not addressed by commission as to impact on neighboring property.

Staff's Response: La Jolla Shores Planned District Section 103.0304.1(k) states "No building or structure shall be erected, constructed, altered, moved or enlarged to a greater height than thirty (30) feet." Section 103.0304.1(l) states "No building or structure shall be erected, constructed, altered, moved in or enlarged to cover more than 60% of the lot or parcel." (Attachment 14)

The proposed project is a one-story single family residence with a proposed overall height of 20' 4" (top of chimney); this height is under the maximum 30 foot height limit. The proposed residence and detached guest quarters total 9,505 square feet and the project site is 31,708 square feet. These numbers calculate a lot coverage of 29.97%, which is rounded to 30%. The proposed lot coverage of 30% is under the 60% lot coverage stated in 103.0304.1(l).

Staff has reviewed the project and does not feel that the proposed project design has bulk and scale that would negatively impact the neighboring properties. The proposed project is within the requirements of the La Jolla Shores Planned District and the San Diego Municipal Code.

2. La Jolla Planned District president is the applicant's architect and the community meeting was moved so no objections to the project could be read.

Staff's Response: The project applicant is Ryan Reynolds with Island Architects. Ryan is not the president of the La Jolla Planned District Ordinance group in La Jolla. The La Jolla Planned District Ordinance group is a subcommittee to the La Jolla Community Planning Association. The recognized community group for La Jolla is the La Jolla Community Planning Association. Staff is not aware of community meetings being moved regarding the proposed project. The City of San Diego does not notice the neighbors of a community level meeting regarding proposed development.

3. Purpose of attic over garage that essentially raises bulk without need.

Staff's Response: The proposed project is a one-story single family residence with a proposed overall height of 20' 4" (top of chimney); this height is under the maximum 30 foot height limit. Staff has reviewed the project and determined that the proposed design is in conformance with the surrounding neighbors.

CONCLUSION

Staff has reviewed the proposed Site Development Permit application and found it to be in conformance with the applicable sections of the San Diego Municipal Code regulating Site Development Permits and land use policies. Staff has determined that the required findings can be made as the project meets the applicable San Diego Municipal Code regulations and requirements. Staff recommends approval of the project as proposed.

ALTERNATIVES

1. **Deny** the appeal and **Approve** Site Development Permit No. 169262 with modifications.
2. **Approve** the appeal and **Deny** Site Development Permit No. 169262 if the findings required to approve the project cannot be affirmed.

Respectfully submitted,

Marcela Escobar-Eck
Deputy Director, Customer Support and
Information Division
Development Services Department

Laura C. Black, Project Manager
Customer Support and
Information Division
Development Services Department

MEE/LCB

Attachments:

1. Aerial Photograph
2. Community Plan Land Use Map
3. Project Location Map
4. Project Data Sheet
5. Project Site Plan
6. Project Plans – Building Elevations
7. Draft Permit with Conditions
8. Draft Resolution with Findings
9. Copy of Appeal
10. Community Planning Group Recommendation, February 3, 2005
11. La Jolla Shores Advisory Board Recommendations, April 19, 2005
12. Ownership Disclosure Statement
13. Project Chronology
14. La Jolla Shores Planned District Section 103.0304.1 (k)(l)