

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD**  
DRAFT  
MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

**August 24, 2006**

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

---

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Burnett at 1:04 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Vice Chairperson	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present (left meeting at 3:15)
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent
Deputy City Attorney	Nina Fain-Newman	Present

Staff to the Board in attendance:

- Delores Johnson, Board Secretary
- Diane Kane, Senior Planner
- Kelley Saunders, Associate Planner
- Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
- Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES of June 22, 2006**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO APPROVE THE JUNE 22, 2006 MINUTES. WITH CORRECTIONS TO THE NAME FOR ITEM #9 AND TO THE DISCUSSION ON ITEM #15.)

Second by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 6-0-3(Curry, Delawie, McNeely) Motion passes.

The motion was followed by Board discussion of what should be reflected in the minutes regarding items proposed for designation under Criterion A when discriminatory deed restrictions were placed on a property at any time during its history.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO REFER THE ISSUE OF DISCRIMINATORY DEED RESTRICTIONS AND CRITERION A TO THE POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE.

Second by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 6-3 (Emme, McNeely, Sewell)-0. Motion passes.

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

- Katheryn Rhodes about Richard Dana having used the La Playa trail and the La Playa Trail Association placing markers along the Trail.
- Vonn Marie May announced a workshop in October on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards being held by the California Preservation Foundation and urged those interested to attend.
- Boardmember McNeely, as an African-American is aware of the covenants of the past that restricted the deeding of property based on race, but does not believe that the Board should refuse to consider properties as historical sites because of those covenants.
- Boardmember Emme about his visit to Calgary, where he purchased National Geographic magazines of January 1942, May 1949, and July 1969. These magazines contained entertaining articles about San Diego.

**ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS****A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

- ABSENCES  
Boardmember Silvas advised staff that he is working out of town and would be absent today. Staff received notification that Boardmember Curry would have to leave early today.

**B. Subcommittee Reports**

**The Design Assistance Subcommittee** met on August 1, 2006 at the Salk Institute for a site tour and to further review the proposed Master Plan and also met on August 2, 2006 to

consider proposed changes to the wall enclosure at the Starlight Bowl in Balboa Park; integrity issues related to potential designation of the house at 3104 Freeman Street; proposed modifications to the structure at 3065 Third Avenue; the deteriorated and possibly unusable historic fabric from the Cliff May-designated structure that was to be relocated from Hillside Drive to Mission Gorge Road; rehabilitation of the 1890s Victorian house located on Law Street, based on a historic photo, and proposed additions; and the proposed replacement of existing aluminum windows in a non-contributing structure within the Sherman Heights Historical District with new aluminum windows. The next regular DAS meeting will be on Wednesday, September 6, 2006 at 3 PM; there will be a special DAS meeting to further review the proposed Salk Institute Master Plan on Tuesday, September 5, 2006 at 3:00 PM.

**The Policy Subcommittee** met on August 14, 2006 and considered staff responses to the previously proposed Historical Research Report Guidelines, additional comments will be accepted through September 22, 2006; preparation of a Mills Act Program and Policy for Cancellation or Non-renewal of Mills Act Agreements; revisions to the adopted HRB District Policy, comments will be accepted through September 22, 2006; and reduced distribution of HRB hearing materials. The next meeting will be on Monday, September 11, 2006 at 3 PM.

**The Archaeology Subcommittee** did not meet in August. The next meeting will be on Monday, September 11, 2006 at 4 PM.

### C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

#### Conflicts of Interest

Boardmember Marshall identified a conflict of interest with Item #5 418 and 450 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Boardmember Emme identified a conflict of interest with Item #7 4774 Cleveland Avenue. Boardmembers Schaefer and Sewell identified a conflict of interest with Item #16 777 Beech Street/El Cortez..

#### Ex Parte Communications

Boardmembers McNeely and Sewell have had ex parte communications with the owner of Item #12, though none of today's agenda items were discussed. Vice Chairperson Schaefer talked with the owner of the Gemmell house (Item 12) and was taken on a tour of the interior. There were discussions about changes to the house.

#### Failure to Visit Sites for Designation

None.

### D. Staff Report

Ms. Delores Johnson was welcomed as the new Secretary to the Board. She has already shown great interest in the historic preservation program and a high level of competence in meeting the demands of the job. Earlier this week the County of San Diego's Historic Site Board honored Boardmember Delawie by designating one of the homes he designed, the Goldzband Residence in La Mesa. This home is of classic modern post-and-beam construction with walls of glass and

exterior overhands throughout and even though it is less than 50 years old, it was designated due to its architectural significance and association with a Master Architect. Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled 11 designation requests from the public on today's agenda, in addition to one referral from Development Services and one project review for consistency with the Secretary of the Interior Standards. This now leaves 16 requests submitted in 2005 that we will bring to the Board during the next two months. In addition, there are 42 designation requests from the public submitted in 2006, including 5 requests since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that are waiting to be reviewed by staff to 58.

### **E. Requests for Continuances**

Staff received a written request for an indefinite continuance from the owners of 3530 Seventh Avenue, Item 13 on the Agenda.

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO CONTINUE ITEM 13 INDEFINITELY, AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

### **ITEM 4 - - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

- **ITEM 8 – ORA AND MYRTLE GINTHER HOUSE at 4741 Panorama Drive**
- **ITEM 10 - MICKEY WRIGHT/SAMUEL HAMILL HOUSE at 2765 Brant Street**
- **ITEM 15 – BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT, UPDATE 6, DESIGNATION OF CONTRIBUTING RESOURCES NOT PREVIOUSLY VOLUNTEERED at (15A) 2425 San Marcos Avenue and (15B) 2608 San Marcos Avenue**

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE ITEMS 8, 10 AND 15 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

### **ITEM 5 – 418 10<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE and 450 10<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE (Trailed from June 22, 2006)**

Applicant: Wendy Tinsley, on behalf of LodgeWorks, L.P.

Location: 418 and 450 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: 418 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue is a utilitarian warehouse built in a rectangular plan of board form concrete and concrete bricks in 1927. 450 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue is a commercial building constructed in approximately 1949 of board form concrete and concrete brick with two original storefronts and an auto bay converted to a third storefront.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the buildings at 418 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue or 450 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue under any HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-06-032

Staff report by Cathy Winterrowd.

Testimony Received:

In support: Wendy Tinsley, Michael Witkin, Lesley Wade, and Scott Moomjian.

In opposition: Bruce Coons of SOHO and Beth Montes.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Harrison asked whether these properties were excluded from the Warehouse District and why they are not important warehouses. Boardmember Schaefer stated that the previous vote to exclude certain properties from the Warehouse District did not mean they were not historical but that they need to be reviewed as individual properties. He agrees that 450 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue should not be designated but disagreed with the staff recommendation for 418 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue. He stated it is significant under Criterion C as a good example of Mission Revival architecture with its simplicity of design, flat surface, parapet and minimal ornamentation. Designation of this building would be consistent with other Board decisions, especially downtown. Boardmember Curry stated that this building exemplifies the style as a utilitarian building and supports designation under Criterion C. Boardmember Sewell stated that although this building was excluded from the boundaries of the Warehouse District, it was reviewed at DAS and that redevelopment of this site needs to consider the ballpark design guidelines and re-use the warehouse building in the hotel design. She feels that the vernacular design is sufficient to designate and that the building is a fine example of the architectural style. She will support Criterion C and feels the façade has enough historical elements to carry it. Boardmember Emme requested the Deputy City Attorney to summarize her memo regarding the Warehouse District and whether CEQA applies to properties that are eligible for listing but are not yet listed.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY VICE CHAIRPERSON SCHAEFER TO SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION FOR 450 10<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE THAT THIS BUILDING SHOULD NOT BE DESIGNATED UNDER ANY HRB CRITERIA.**

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 7-0-1 (Curry). Motion passes.

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE 418 10<sup>TH</sup> AVENUE UNDER CRITERION C FOR ARCHITECTURE.**

Second by Boardmember Curry. Vote: 7-1 (McNeely)-0. Motion fails.

**FURTHER BOARD DISCUSSION**

A question was raised by Mr. Harrison about the number of votes currently needed for a designation and that next month the number of votes needed will be less because of the reduction in the number of Boardmembers. Mr. Harrison then asked about the possibility of reconsidering the last vote. .

THE MEETING WAS RECESSED AT 2:15 PM AND RECONVENED AT 2:44 PM.

#### BOARD DISCUSSION

Nina Fain-Newman read the Board's procedures for reconsideration of a vote. Only someone on the prevailing side can make a motion to reconsider. As Boardmember McNeely cast the only dissenting vote on the previous motion, causing the motion to fail, only she could make a motion to reconsider. Furthermore, a motion to reconsider can be made only if new information becomes available or a new law is enacted. There is also a time limit pertaining to such a motion.

BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL WAS NOT PRESENT DURING DISCUSSIONS REGARDING THIS ITEM AND DID NOT PARTICIPATE ANY ACTION ON THIS ITEM.

#### **ITEM 6 – FRANK AND GLORIA COMPTON/JOHN LLOYD WRIGHT HOUSE**

Applicant: Christine Koop and Beth Montes, on behalf of the owner, Dr. Betty Edwards

Location: 7840 E. Roseland Drive, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The house is a one story Modern style home built in 1948.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Frank and Gloria Compton/John Lloyd Wright House under HRB Criteria C as an excellent example of Modern architecture, and D as the work of Master Architect John Lloyd Wright. The recent garage with guest facility above should be excluded from the designation.

Report Number: HRB-06-045

Staff Report by Mike Tudury.

#### Public Testimony

In support: Two speaker slips were received but both slips indicated that neither person wanted to speak.

Opposed: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Emme stated that the visibility of the property is extremely limited. Although the applicant has agreed to cut back part of the greenery, Boardmember Emme believes alterations should be made before applicants apply for a designation. Boardmember Harrison asked if an approval could be made, conditioning it with an improvement to the right of way. Boardmember Marshall stated that he too was concerned about the visibility although the visibility is better from the end of the street and he can support designation. Vice Chairperson Schaefer stated that he supports the designation, that this building is an important example of Modernist architecture

and defining characteristics can be seen from the public right-of-way. Boardmember Curry stated that visibility is not a criteria for designation and that the HRB needs to look at the criteria. She feels the house has historical value and supports designation because it meets the criteria. Boardmember Sewell supported the staff recommendation of this modernist designed house and has no problem with low visibility.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER CRITERIA C AND D.

Second by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 8-1 (Emme)-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 7 – 4374 CLEVELAND AVENUE HOUSE**

Applicant: City of San Diego, referral from the Development Services Department

Location: 4374 Cleveland Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: The house is a one-and-one-half story Craftsman style home built in 1912.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house under any HRB Criteria, due to modifications which have compromised the architectural and historical integrity of the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-046

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO CONTINUE THIS ITEM FOR 60 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE PUBLIC.

Second by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 7-1 (Schaefer)-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 8 – ORA AND MYRTLE GINTHER HOUSE**

Applicant: Ione Stiegler, on behalf of the owner, Thomas Nelson

Location: 4741 Panorama Drive, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: The house is a one story stucco asymmetrical Spanish Eclectic style home built in 1926 and rests on a concrete stemwall foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ora and Myrtle Ginther House under HRB Criterion C, as an excellent example of the Spanish Eclectic architectural style, exhibiting many characteristics of the style in form, material, detail and feel. Require restoration of the windows at the front left bay to an appropriate style and material as a condition of a Mills Act Agreement for the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-048

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C AS PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 9 – CASA DE TEMPO/SAMUEL WOOD HAMILL HOUSE**

Applicant: Beth Montes on behalf of Lynn Lancaster, owner

Location: 1212 Upas Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a 1935 California Colonial/Monterey Revival home original built in Balboa Park as a raffle house and relocated to 1212 Upas Street.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Casa de Tempo/Samuel Wood Hamill House under HRB Criterion A as a taste and trend setting phenomenon in home design during the Great Depression, reflecting special elements of the city's cultural, aesthetic, architectural, economic and social history, Criterion B for its association with two historic events, the exile of Mexican President General Plutarco Calles and the 1935 California Pacific International Exposition, HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of California Colonial/Monterey Revival architecture, and HRB Criterion D as the work of established Master Architect Samuel Wood Hamill.

Report Number: HRB-06-049

Staff Report by Diane Kane.

#### Testimony Received

In Support: Beth Montes

In Opposition: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Sewell stated that she had asked for this item to be pulled from consent agenda because as an interior designer she was quite impressed with the interior of the house. She felt the interior should be nominated. Beth Montes stated that she was unable to find the name of the designer although she searched for it. Some objections were raised to the nomination because of the politics of Mexican President General Plutarco Calles who had lived in the house for five years during his exile. Other members thought that though his politics may have been deplorable and his exile well deserved, his living there was a historic event worthy of note.

#### BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A, B, C, AND D, AND INCLUDE THE INTERIOR UNDER CRITERION C.

The question was raised of how to designate an interior. Only a few interiors have been designated. Boardmember Emme suggested that this motion be tabled as the consultant had already stated that she would like to talk to the owner about designating the interior. Boardmember McNeely agreed that she was concerned about designating the interior without the owner's knowledge or permission. Staff pointed out that the Board would also have to visit the site again to see the interior. Vice Chairperson Schaefer stated that he only knew of one instance, a house in La Jolla, where the interior had been designated.

BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL WITHDREW THE PREVIOUS MOTION.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A, B, C, AND D.

Second by Boardmember Curry. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL THAT STAFF FOLLOW UP WITH AN EVALUATION OF THE HISTORIC BACKGROUND OF THE INTERIOR.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 10 – MICKEY WRIGHT/SAMUEL HAMILL HOUSE**

Applicant: Beth Montes on behalf of Jeffrey Krebs, owner

Location: 2765 Brant Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one and two story Monterey style house with Colonial Revival elements built in 1933.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mickey Wright/Samuel Hamill House under HRB Criterion B for its association with professional golfer Mickey Wright, Criterion C as an excellent example of the California Monterey style with Colonial Revival style elements, and Criterion D as the work of Master Architect Samuel Hamill.

Report Number: HRB-06-051

#### **BOARD ACTION**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 11 – ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE #4**

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of the owner, Melanie Kemp Lewis

Location: 4151 Stephens Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one story Craftsman style home built in 1920.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #4 under HRB Criterion C as a distinctive example of a late expression of the Craftsman style architecture, retaining good integrity, and under HRB Criterion D for the notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber.

Report Number: HRB-06-052

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd.

Public Testimony: None

Boardmember Marshall had an issue with the vegetation around the house and the checkerboard stairs as he felt they distract from the historic feeling of the house. He also questioned the contemporary stucco finish on the house. The owner, Melanie Kemp Lewis, stated that the previous owners had speckled the entire exterior - even the wood. She had hand-troweled the wood, and had followed someone else's advice about how to restucco to restore to the original state. The owner also stated that the Japanese garden had been designed by a well-known landscaper in 1935. She agreed that the vegetation had become a bit overgrown and she was not averse to cutting some of it back.

BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO DESIGNATE THE HOUSE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D AS RECOMMENDED BY STAFF.

Second by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO INCLUDE A REQUIREMENT IN THE MILLS ACT AGREEMENT TO CUT BACK SOME OF THE VEGETATION WITHOUT DESTROYING THE INTENT OF THE GARDEN.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

**ITEM 12 – ROBERT CAMPBELL AND BELLE ANDERSON GEMMELL/FRANK MEAD/ RICHARD REQUA/HENRY JACKSON HOUSE AND STUDIO**

Applicant: Vonn Marie May on behalf of Peter B. and Laura Wile, owners

Location: 4476 Hortensia Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one and two story Pueblo Revival style home with Spanish Eclectic influences designed in 1916 with a 1926 detached Craftsman style Studio.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert Campbell and Belle Anderson Gemmell/Frank Mead/Richard Requa/Henry Jackson House and Studio under HRB Criterion C for its Pueblo Revival/Spanish Eclectic architecture and Criterion D as the work of Master Architects Frank Mead, Richard Requa and Henry L. Jackson.

Report Number: HRB-06-053

Staff Report by Diane Kane

Public Testimony: None.

Boardmember Emme stated that the property was not visible from the public right-of-way and that all four sides of the house had to be altered. Boardmember Harrison asked the owner if she would permit the house to be made available on public tours. She said that the house had already been included on tours, and in response to a question from Boardmember Harrison, she replied

that she would absolutely agree to a public tour. Vice Chairperson Schaefer noted that although changes have been made to the original house, his focus was on the front façade since the other modifications are not visible. Boardmember Marshall was also concerned about low visibility and stated that really only the garage is visible from the public's vantage point along the sidewalk and that the studio is not visible at all. The garage doors have been changed and seem to be faux wood metal doors. The owner said they were based on old photographs, and that the original hardware had been attached to the new wooden doors made by her husband. Boardmember Marshall also asked if the gate at the sidewalk could be opened. The owner replied that it is always open for fire protection; about five people a day enter the private road and can view the house and grounds. Boardmember Marshall made a remark about the terrific pine tree and asked whether it is historic. The owner said that it was a living Christmas tree from 1960 and that the other site landscape is not historic either. Chairperson Burnett stated that the semi-public/private nature of the property adds to its character and that the gate is open for fire access which mitigates the lack of visual access. Boardmember McNeely agreed that public access is not really an issue since there are public tours of the property and the public can walk by the house. Boardmember Harrison suggested a Mills Act condition to require public tours. Boardmember Schaefer stated he is fine with access now that he knows the gate at the sidewalk is always open. Boardmember Emme stated that the report was not adequate in its description of alterations and asked if there were photos or other records of the changes made to the house. The owner said she had an album of photographs of the house. Emme stated that he could not support designation at this time because he needs more information and would like to see photographs and due to the lack of access.

#### BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL FOR A CONTINUANCE OF THIS ITEM TO AWAIT FURTHER INFORMATION.

Second by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: 7-1 (Emme)-0. Motion passes.

#### ITEM 13 – 3530 SEVENTH AVENUE

Applicant: Duane and Katherine Stratton, owners

Location: 3530 Seventh Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one and two story Early Modern style residence built in C. 1912

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the 3530 Seventh Avenue house under any HRB Criteria due to modifications which have substantially impacted the historical integrity of the property.

Report Number: HRB-06-054

#### BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO CONTINUE ITEM 13, AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNERS.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

**ITEM 14 – OCEAN BEACH COTTAGE EMERGING HISTORICAL DISTRICT -  
BOUNDARY LINE ADJUSTMENT AND PHASE VI CONTRIBUTING SITE  
DESIGNATIONS**

Applicant: (14A) 4528 Saratoga Avenue: Wendy Tinsley, on behalf of owners Brandon and Gretchen Webb

(14B) 4535 Cape May Avenue: Laura Spycia, owner

Location: Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging Historical District, Ocean Beach Community Planning Area, Council District 2

Description: Consider adjustment of the existing Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging Historical District boundary, and the designation of two additional contributing sites located at 4528 Saratoga Avenue (C. 1924 Craftsman bungalow) and 4535 Cape May Avenue (C. 1927 Craftsman bungalow) to the District.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation:

- 1) Adjust the existing Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging Historical District boundary to include Blocks 1 (Lots 1-48), 2 (Lots 1-48), 3 (Lots 1-48), 4 (Lots 1-48), 5 (Lots 1-48), 6 (Lots 1-48), 7 (Lots 1-48), 8 (Lots 1-15 & 34-48), 9 (Lots 1-14 & 34-48), 10 (Lots 1-14 & 35-48), 11 (Lots 1-14 & 35-48), 12 (Lots 1-13 & 35-48), 13 (Lots 1-13 & 36-48), 14 (Lots 1-13 & 36-48) and 32 (Lots 36-48) which were part of the original Ocean Beach subdivision, but excluded during the original establishment of the district.
- 2) Designate the properties located at 4528 Saratoga Avenue and 4535 Cape May Avenue, located in Block 2, Lots 17-18 and 33-34, respectively, under HRB CRITERION F as contributing sites to the Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging Historical District.

Report Number: HRB-06-043

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders.

**Testimony Received: None**

Boardmember Emme noted that there were three different maps included with staff's report. Staff stated that Attachment 5 is the original map showing the boundaries of the Ocean Beach Cottage Emerging District; one map is an 1870 Subdivision Map; the other shows the suggested new boundaries which would include items 14A and 14B. Staff would like to extend the boundaries one block. Boardmember Emme asked Wendy Tinsley about the map that she submitted on behalf of her client for item 14A. The reply was that it came from the County Assessor's office and was from the year 1887. She never saw the actual map as maps are now on microfilm.

In discussion of Item 14B, the owner, Laura Spycia, was asked if she could get rid of a planter that was on one side of the porch. She said if the planter was removed, there would be a gap. Boardmember Marshall remarked that this house was a contributor to the district and that the planter is a minor element; he suggested that stucco could soften the appearance so it would blend in with the district character. Boardmember Sewell stated that she had no problems with

either property particularly since they are being reviewed as contributors to a district not on individual significance; and thought the Board should follow staff's recommendations. Boardmember Harrison asked about other properties in the neighborhood. Staff said that everyone in the proposed new area had been noticed. Properties would become part of the emerging district only if the owners volunteered the properties.

#### BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO ADJUST THE EXISTING BOUNDARARY LINE AS RECOMMENDED BY STAFF.

Second by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTIES LOCATED AT 4528 SARATOGA AVENUE AND 4535 CAPE MAY AVENUE, UNDER HRB CRITERION F AS CONTRIBUTING SITES TO THE OCEAN BEACH COTTAGE EMERGING HISTORICAL DISTRICT.

Second by Boardmember McNeely. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 15 – BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT, UPDATE 6, DESIGNATION OF CONTRIBUTING RESOURCES NOT PREVIOUSLY VOLUNTEERED**

Applicant: Dan and Debi Zumtobel (2425 San Marcos Avenue)  
Vicki Cypherd (2608 San Marcos Avenue)

Location: (15A) 2425 San Marcos Avenue North Park, Council District 3  
(15B) 2608 San Marcos Avenue, North Park, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of 2425 San Marcos Avenue (a C. 1925 Mission Revival house) and 2608 San Marcos Avenue (a C. 1924 Mission Revival house) as contributing resources to the Burlingame Voluntary/Traditional Historical District

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate (15A) 2425 San Marcos Avenue and (15B) 2608 San Marcos Avenue as contributing properties to the Burlingame Voluntary/ Traditional Historical District under HRB Criterion F.

Report Number: HRB-06-044

#### BOARD ACTION

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE AS CONTRIBUTING PROPERTIES PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERION F.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-0. Motion passes.

#### **ITEM 16 - 777 BEECH STREET/EL CORTEZ (trailed from July 27, 2006)**

Applicant: Centre City Development Corporation

Location: 777 Beech Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description Review proposed project for compliance with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The specific Standards for Rehabilitation that apply to the proposed new structure are Standards 2, 9 and 10.

Today's Action: Determine whether or not the proposed construction at 777 Beech Street meets the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent historically-designated El Cortez.

Staff Recommendation Find that the proposed 777 Beach Street project is consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent, historically designated El Cortez building, located at 702 Ash Street.

Report Number: HRB-06-0420

THIS ITEM WAS TRAILED TO THE NEXT HRB MEETING DUE TO THE LACK OF A QUORUM.

ADJOURNED AT 4:27 PM. Boardmember Harrison announced that Boardmember Curry's husband was very ill and that he would like the minutes to reflect that the members of the Board were thinking of her at this difficult time and to adjourn the meeting with the Board's very best wishes to her family. All Boardmembers agreed.

*NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by calling the Department at 619-235-5200.*