

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Marrone has notified Staff that she cannot attend this month's meeting. Boardmember Curry has advised staff she will arrive today at 2:30 PM.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Letters for Item 5 – Western Salt Company Salt Works
- ✓ Letters for Item 14 – Julia Wilson House
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Berge was excited about finding a lost “treasure” map in her packet this month.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Chair Lemmo has a conflict of interest for Items 5 – Western Salt Company Salt Works

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS /PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

Vice-Chair Aréchiga was unable to see the interiors of Item 11; and Boardmember Bethke was unable to see the interiors of Items 7 or 11 and Chair Lemmo were unable to see the interiors of Items 6, 7, and 11. Boardmember Jarmusch was unable to visit Item 11 (both interior and exterior); she will not participate in the vote on Item 11

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO INVOKE THE WAIVER FOR THE BOARDMEMBERS WHO WERE UNABLE TO VIEW THE INTERIORS FOR ITEMS 6, 7 AND 11; PHOTOS INCLUDED IN THE REPORTS ARE SUFFICIENT.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Aréchiga

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

C. STAFF REPORT

- It is with very mixed feelings that I announce Tricia Olsen will be leaving the City of San Diego to take an Associate Planner position with the City of Coronado working with their Historic Site Board. Her last day here is tomorrow and while I am excited for Tricia to move into a new setting, I will miss her terribly. Tricia has been a very valuable member of our historic preservation team for more than 2.5 years. She started in July 2007 as an Intern and has continually worked to improve our nomination process and project reviews. In addition, she helped author the Modernism Context Statement. We will be taking a short break at 3:30 to wish her well. Please join us for cake and a send off at that time.

- Jeff Oakley, an Associate Planner from the Community Planning Division, will be transferred into Tricia's position effective Monday. Kelley Saunders will be his supervisor and will be taking over responsibility for the Over 45 project reviews.
- As most of you know, the revised budget, approved by the City Council in December includes the elimination of one Senior Planner position in the historic preservation section. We do not have the details yet from Personnel to know how this cut will be implemented. However, it will be effective the middle to end of February. Please bear with us during this time of personnel changes and challenges.
- The next Incentives Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, February 8, 2010. The Archaeology Subcommittee meetings have been cancelled until further notice due to a current lack of subcommittee members. The next DAS meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, February 3, 2010. There will be a Policy Subcommittee meeting on Monday, February 8, 2010 at 3:00 PM. Staff has requested Boardmembers to consider their time commitments and interest in serving on this important subcommittee. The February meeting will be to identify subcommittee membership that will be forwarded to the full Board for approval. An agenda for the meeting will be posted prior to the meeting date.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes 2 referrals from Development Services and 8 individual homeowner nominations including 1 continued item and 2 interiors of previously designated resources. There are 46 individual homeowner nominations submitted in 2008, 21 homeowner nominations in 2009, and 2 homeowner nominations in 2010 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.
- Those owners whose property was designated in 2009 or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement beginning in January 2010. Those applications are due no later than March 31, 2010 to be considered this year.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Item 5 – Western Salt Company Salt Works; the property owner, the San Diego Airport Authority, is requesting an indefinite continuance to continue ongoing talks with various agencies regarding future uses of the property. Staff is supporting the request for continuance. The applicant, Bruce Coons for SOHO, reluctantly agreed to a continuance for a maximum of 90 days.

Item-11 – Della M. Ballard House; the applicant requested a 30-day continuance due to the limited number of Boardmembers in attendance

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JARMUSCH TO GRANT A 90-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER, THE SAN DIEGO AIRPORT AUTHORITY

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-0-1
(Lemmo)

Motion Passes

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 30-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 11 – DELLA M. BALLARD HOUSE AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- ITEM 6 – E.A AND EFFIE TINDULA HOUSE
- ITEM 7 – HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE #1
- ITEM 8 – M.B. AND IDA IRVIN/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE #1
- ITEM 9 – CECIL ROPER HOUSE
- ITEM 10 – EVERETT AND FLORENCE MARSHALL HOUSE
- ITEM 11 – DELLA M. BALLARD HOUSE
- ITEM 12 – THE SIM BRUCE RICHARDS AND JANET HOPKINS RICHARDS HOUSE

ALL ITEMS WERE PULLED FROM THE CONSENT AGENDA

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – WESTERN SALT COMPANY SALT WORKS

Continued from October 2009

Applicant: Save Our Heritage Organisation (SOHO)

Property is owned by the San Diego Airport Authority

Location: 1470 Bay Boulevard, 91911, Otay Mesa-Nestor Community, Council District 8 **(1269 3-H)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1470 Bay Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Salt Works located at 1470 Bay Boulevard under HRB Criterion E. The resource shall be listed as an individually significant resource, with the eleven elements identified as “contributing” included in the designation as character defining elements of the resource; and the four elements identified as “non-contributing” excluded from the designation as non-character defining elements.

Report Number: Staff memo dated September 18, 2009 and HRB-08-005

CONTINUED FOR 90-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER

ITEM 6 – E.A AND EFFIE TINDULA HOUSE

Applicant: Hall Family Trust

Location: 3593 29th Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 **(1269 6-E)**

Description: Consider amending the original designation to include specific interior elements of the E.A. and Effie Tindula House (HRB Site #931) located at 3593 29th Street.

Today's Action: Amend the designation to include the specified interior elements of the property under adopted designation criteria, or do not amend.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the addition of these interior elements to the existing designation under HRB Criterion C

Report Number: Staff memo dated January 15, 2009 and HRB-09-061

Staff Report by Tricia Olsen

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge wanted the resolution to state Craftsman Bungalow as the architectural style; to be consistent with the exterior designation style.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga wanted the amendment revised so that the 4th bullet stated dining room.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO ADOPT STAFF'S RESOLUTION AS PROPOSED EXCEPT WE WILL STRIKE INTERIOR FEATURES OF CRAFTSMAN STYLE TO INTERIOR FEATURES OF ARTS AND CRAFTS STYLE ARCHITECTURE

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE # 1

Applicant: Chris & Julia Pallia represented by Happy Hazard LLC.

Location: 3917 Hawk Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 5-J)

Description: Consider amending the original designation to include specific interior elements of the Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec House #1 (HRB Site #929) located at 3917 Hawk Street.

Today's Action: Amend the designation to include the specified interior elements of the property under adopted designation criteria, or do not amend.

Staff Recommendation: Amend the designation of the Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec House #1 (HRB Site #929) located at 3917 Hawk Street to include specified interior elements of the living room and dining room, under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: Staff memo dated January 14, 2009 and HRB-09-056

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Julie Pallia

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge thinks that type of situation occurs here as did in Item 6; where the interiors could fall under the Arts and Crafts.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga would like to include the bedroom door next to the French doors and the push button electrical light switch as character defining features in the resolution.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Vice-Chair Aréchiga

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO AMEND THE DESIGNATION TO STRIKE COLONIAL REVIVAL AND REPLACE WITH ARTS AND CRAFTS AND TO ADD THE ADDITIONAL FEATURES THAT ARE INDICATED ON THE SITE PLAN

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – M.B. AND IDA IRVIN/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Jim and Donna Turbyfill represented by Vonn Marie May.

Location: 4195 Stephens Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 5-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4195 Stephens Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the M.B. and Ida Irvin/Alexander Schreiber Spec House #1 located at 4195 Stephens Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-10-001

Staff Report by Kelley Saunders

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge thinks that Morris B. Irvin should be included as a Master Builder on this house since he signed the water permit.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga thinks the second story on the garage should be included in the designation

Boardmember Bethke wanted to commend Staff for adding analysis to the nomination

Chair Lemmo concurs with Boardmember Bethke

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – M.B. AND IDA IRVIN/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 9 – CECIL ROPER HOUSE

Applicant: Gregory B Strangman Revocable Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 5147 Cape May Avenue, 92107, Ocean Beach Community, Council District 2 (1267 5-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5147 Cape May Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Cecil Roper House located at 5147 Cape May Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1963 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-002

Staff Report by Jennifer Hirsch

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Greg Strangman

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge would like the period of significance to be 1964 instead of 1963; she would also like the name to reflect the Master Architect.

Chair Lemmo is comfortable with changing the period of significance to 1964 but he is not comfortable with changing the name as proposed.

Boardmember Berge would like to continue to discuss the issue of Master Architect.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Staff's recommendation on Criterion D. He is concerned that since the interiors can be viewed as an essential character defining feature of the home; if they were to be changed or altered would the historical significance of the home be changed or altered as well.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga would like to include the interiors as part of the designation.

Chair Lemmo agreed this is a unique instance where the interiors are visible.

Boardmember Garbini mentioned the Board may be seeing this more and more with Modern Geometric style; where the charactering defining features are actually the interiors as well as the exterior, views and outdoor uses. They bring the exterior in.

Boardmember Bethke is not sure he can differentiate between the exterior and interior on a house like this; for purposes of designation he finds it problematic that the owner does not want to designate the interior along with the exterior.

Boardmember Garbini imagines that the view through the house was the intent of the architect.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – CECIL ROPER HOUSE WITH THE CHANGE TO THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE TO 1963-1964

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-1-0
(Bethke)

Motion Passes

ITEM 10 –EVERETT AND FLORENCE MARSHALL HOUSE

Applicant: David Murphy represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2140 33rd Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1289 1-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2140 33rd Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Everett and Florence Marshall House at 2140 33rd Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-003

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Jarmusch wanted to know if there was any information on the stained glass window; i.e. when it was installed.

Boardmember Berge has questions regarding the porch; does not feel that there is enough historic integrity for individual designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 –EVERETT AND FLORENCE MARSHALL HOUSE PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 2-5-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Aréchiga, Bethke, Berge, Garbini)

ITEM 11 – DELLA M. BALLARD HOUSE

Applicant: Andrew & Veece Bullock represented by Christianne Knoop

Location: 4220 Arden Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 **(1268 5-G)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4220 Arden Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Della M. Ballard House located at 4220 Arden Way as a historical resource, including specified interior elements, under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-004

CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 12 – THE SIM BRUCE RICHARDS AND JANET HOPKINS RICHARDS HOUSE

Applicant: Merlin Kastler Trust represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 3360 Harbor View Drive, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 **(1288 3-A)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3360 Harbor View Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Sim Bruce Richards and the Janet Hopkins Richards House at 3360 Harbor View Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1952-1963 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-10-005

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge wanted to know for clarity if Richards was drafted into the Navy or was he a civilian working for the Navy. She would like the period of significance to be changed to 1964.

Vice-Chair Aréchiga would like to see the interior of this home.

Boardmember Jarmusch fully supports the designation and would also like to commend the owner and consultant for nominating the trees as well.

Boardmember Garbini mentioned that the brick walkways are also a character defining feature for this property; just as the trees are. These houses were built as exterior shells designed around views; so seeing the view from the interior is probably an important part of the design.

Boardmember Berge wanted to call out Richards's almost exclusive use of wood and masonry as being notable.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 12 – THE SIM BRUCE RICHARDS AND JANET HOPKINS RICHARDS HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE FOLLOWING CHANGES; THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE CHANGED TO 1952-1964; CRITERION C INCLUDES THE LANDSCAPING, SPECIFICALLY THE THREE TREES AND BRICK WALKWAYS; AND CRITERION D SHOULD REFLECT SIM BRUCE RICHARDS USE OF WOOD AS NOTABLE.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 13 – ISAAC LYON BUILDING AND THE ISAAC LYON RENTAL HOUSE

Applicant: 12th and A Hotel Partners LP represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 1479 J Street and 360 15th Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 4-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1479 J Street and 360 15th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Isaac Lyon Building and the Isaac Lyon Rental House at 1479 J Street and 360 15th Street as historical resources with a period of significance of ca. 1883 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: Staff memo dated January 15, 2009, Staff Memo dated September 13, 2007 and HRB-07-025

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Chair Lemmo is fully in support of Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Curry is also in support of Staff's recommendation; important location.

Boardmember Berge is also in full support of Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation; feels that the context is there to designate both structures under Criterion A as an element of development.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 13 – ISAAC LYON BUILDING AND THE ISAAC LYON RENTAL HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND ADD CRITERION A FOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT FOR THESE STRUCTURES REPRESENT AN EARLY PATTERN OF DEVELOPMENT IN THIS AREA OF SAN DIEGO AND THEY ARE RARE EXAMPLES.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 14 – JULIA WILSON HOUSE

Applicant: Sana Sepehri represented by Archaeos

Location: 4410 Park Boulevard, 92116, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 4-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4410 Park Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Julia Wilson House located at 4410 Park Boulevard as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-10-007

CONTINUED FOR 30-DAYS DUE TO BROWN ACT

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Friday, February 26, 2010

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Chambers

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2:54 PM