

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

JUNE 17, 2005

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM - 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:02 PM. Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 4:25 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Alexander Chuang	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	Donna Jones	Present (arrived @ 1:29 pm)
Boardmember	Edward Lynch	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Timothy Murphy	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present (arrived @ 1:22 pm)
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Nicole Purvis, Associate Planner
Barbara Hubbard, Board Secretary
Noah Stewart, Staff
Karen Heumann, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MAY 26, 2005

BOARD ACTION:

THERE WAS NO BOARD ACTION TAKEN DUE TO SEVERAL CORRECTIONS NEEDED.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

ISSUES WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NOT PREVIOUSLY HEARD AND NOT ON THE AGENDA.

- David Marshall has requested three minutes to present a success story that he previously presented at the CPF Conference called "Ode to the Candy Factory." The presentation consists of reading a humorous poem describing the story of the Showley Brothers Candy Factory during a PowerPoint presentation of how it was moved one block to make way for a new public park. The Candy Factory is the heaviest brick building ever moved in the United States.
- Robert Thiele, representing William James Allen, referencing the Carey Crest House, requested that the letter being distributed to the Board be set for review and perhaps docketed to question the historicity of Carey Crest as it is today.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

Notification of Absences

- Boardmember Sewell had previously notified staff that she would be absent today.

General Information

- The Planning Department budget, including the Historic Resources Board staff budget, was considered by the City Council. The Planning Department budget was placed on the "Wish List" by the Mayor and Council. Staff will be returning to Council shortly with proposed fees that could alleviate some of the budget issues.

B. Subcommittee Reports

- The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on June 1, 2005, and considered four proposed projects, a remodel of two units of El Pueblo Ribera, the Snowflake Bakery Co. Building Project, the F. M. Sheppard Duplex and House Rentals project and the Parker Residence project. The next meeting will be on Wednesday, July 6, 2005, at 3 PM.

- The Policy Subcommittee met on June 13, 2005, and considered the issue of Cultural Landscapes, with a presentation by historian Jim Newland of State Park and Rec. The next meeting will be on Monday, July 11, 2005, at 3 PM.
- The Archaeology Subcommittee did not meet as there were no issues to be considered. The next meeting will be on Monday, July 11, 2005, at 4 PM.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

- Items #5 and #6, Boardmembers Jones and Murphy.

Ex parte communications

- None

Failure to visit sites for designation

- None

D. Staff Report

- Betsy McCullough, Deputy Director of Planning has received a “What do you think?” request for future training as a Certified Local Government (CLG) from Lucinda Woodward of the State Historic Preservation Office regarding COMMISSIONER/BOARD TRAINING. This memo also asks staff what type of workshops they would like regarding CLG GRANTS. Staff has included a copy of this memo in your blue folder. Please review the COMMISSIONER/ BOARD TRAINING issues, add issues that you see fit, and contact HRB staff so that we may communicate your wishes to the SHPO.
- The Imig Manor/Lafayette Hotel project in Mid-City on El Cajon Blvd. that was reviewed several times by the Design Assistance Subcommittee (DAS) will be heard by the Planning Commission on June 23, 2005. The proposed project is consistent with direction given by the DAS and, since HRB staff will be on vacation at that time, David Marshall, the chair of the DAS, has generously agreed to represent the HRB at that meeting.
- A communication from attorney Matt Peterson regarding the Seacliff (Carey Crest) residential project was received by HRB staff, including copies for all Boardmembers. Until today staff has distributed this memo only to the addressee, Chair Schwartz, and to Boardmember Sewell, at her request. Staff is reviewing the project with the Development Services Department Project Manager, Glenn Gargas, in order to determine that work is proceeding per the permit. In a telephone

conversation with Boardmember Sewell, she indicated that she has seen the project site and believes that it is proceeding per previous agreements with the board.

- Regarding re-initiation of historic designation consideration of the “Turquoise House,” HRB staff has reviewed the information submitted by Historian Ron May and has determined that it meets the requirements for return to the Board. Among the issues raised by Mr. May are the identification and rarity of the style, as well as the potential significance of Maggie Irwin Becker. Mr. May will need to submit a full and complete report to HRB staff regarding this property by next month in order for staff to schedule this item on the August agenda. Staff also requests of Mr. May that he submit copies of his June 8, 2005, memo to staff regarding these and other issues for the Board’s information. It should be noted that the re-initiation of this item for the Board’s consideration does not constitute a staff recommendation for or against at this time. Staff will determine its recommendation after receiving the historical report from Mr. May.
- Appeals: As the Board is aware, there are several appeals of the Board’s historic designations that will make their way to Council if the proposed projects are not resolved at the DAS. The F. M. Sheppard Duplex and House Rentals in La Jolla on Coast Blvd. is scheduled to go to Council on September 6, 2005. Both the Unicorn Antiques Building and the Pack Lofts Buildings of the Cosmopolitan Square project have been appealed. Finally, the Snowflake Bakery Building has been appealed. Staff and the DAS will be working with the applicant’s representatives on the Sheppard Duplex and Snowflake Bakery to attempt to resolve the issues and obviate the appeal. The two Centre City appeals (three properties) have not yet been scheduled at this time.
- Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled three designation requests from the public on today’s agenda. Staff has received six new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that have not yet been agendized and are waiting to be reviewed by staff for processing to 37. It is anticipated that seven items will be scheduled for the next meeting, leaving 30 requests on the list.

E. Requests for Continuances

- **ITEM 9 - BISHOP AND COMPANY CRACKER AND CANDY FACTORY**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE AUGUST 25, 2005, HRB MEETING.

Seconded by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 13-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA.

None

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – MEXICAN PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH

Applicant: Centre City Development Corporation (CCDC)

Location: 341-343 13th Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Mexican Presbyterian Church as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Cultural Landscape) and C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-022

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Bruce Coons, SOHO.

In Opposition by:

Jeff Brazel and Robert Wright, of Wright & L’Estrange, representing McMillin Company’s. Kathleen Crawford submitted a speaker slip, but did not speak.

Public Testimony was closed.

NOTE: Karen Heumann, Deputy City Attorney, noted that the subject structure was not owned by the church, but rather by McMillin Company’s.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO HRB MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 22, 2005, ALLOW TIME FOR CCDC AND THE PROPERTY OWNER TO ATTEND THE DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 7, 2005.

Seconded by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 12-0-2(Jones, Murphy). Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – LOUIS DAVIS RENTALS

Applicant: Centre City Development Corporation (CCDC)

Location: 353-357 Thirteenth Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Louis Davis Rentals as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Note and File.

Report Number: HRB-05-023

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Robert Wright, of Wright & L'Estrange, representing McMillin Company's.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

1) BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO "NOTE AND FILE" PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Delawie. Vote: **6** (Chuang, Delawie, Emme, McNeely, Schaefer, Schwartz) – **6** (Burnett, Curry, Harrison, Marshall, Lynch, Silvas) – **2** (Jones, Murphy). Motion fails. (A motion must receive a vote of 8 in favor is required to pass).

2) BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE).

Seconded by Boardmember Harrison. Vote: **7** (Burnett, Curry, Delawie, Lynch, Marshall, Harrison, Silvas) – **5** (Chuang, Emme, McNeely, Schaefer, Schwartz) – **2** (Jones, Murphy). Motion fails. (A motion must receive a vote of 8 in favor is required to pass).

3) BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO HRB MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 22, 2005, TO ALLOW TIME FOR CCDC AND THE PROPERTY OWNER TO ATTEND THE DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 7, 2005.

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas. Vote: **7** (Burnett, Curry, Delawie, Harrison, Lynch, Marshall, Silvas) – **5** (Chuang, Emme, McNeely, Schaefer, Schwartz) – **2** (Jones, Murphy). Motion passes. (A motion for continuance only requires a majority).

ITEM 7 – MAYER HOUSE

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: 4147 Bachman Place, Hillcrest, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Mayer House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERION C (Vernacular Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-024

]Testimony Received:

In Support by:

No speaker slips submitted.

In Opposition by:

Scott A. Moomjian, representing Mark Scialdone.

Public Testimony was closed.

1) BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER DELAWIE TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (VERNACULAR ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Burnett. Vote: **6** (Burnett, Chuang, Curry, Delawie, Lynch, Marshall) – **8** (Emme, Harrison, Jones, McNeely, Murphy, Schaefer, Schwartz, Silvas). Motion fails, property is NOT designated.

2) BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO NOTE AND FILE.

Seconded by Boardmember Murphy. Vote: **10** (Chuang, Delawie, Emme, Harrison, Jones, McNeely, Murphy, Schaefer, Schwartz, Silvas) – **4** (Burnett, Curry, Lynch, Marshall). Motion passes.

ITEM 8 – STRAWN HOUSE

Applicant: Ronald V. May, RPA, on behalf of John and Cindy Edson, owners

Location: 3120 Owen Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Strawn House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERION C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-025

Note: Boardmember Jones stated that she is acquainted with Cindy Edson. Council stated that she did not need to recuse herself from the vote.

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Ronald May and John Edson.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER JONES TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer. Vote: 14-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #718**

ITEM 9 – BISHOP AND COMPANY CRACKER AND CANDY FACTORY

Applicant: Marie Burke Lia, on behalf of AFJR Partnership LP, owners

Location: 448 West Market Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Bishop and Company Cracker and Candy Factory as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or “Note and File.”

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Community History) and C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-026

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Marie Lia requested this property to be continued indefinitely.

In Opposition by:

No speaker slips were submitted.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO CONTINUE THE ITEM INDEFINITELY AT OWNER'S REQUEST.

Seconded by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 13-0-0. Motion passes.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by contacting Board Secretary Barbara Hubbard at (619) 533-6307.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 4:25 P.M.

NEXT MEETING DATE: JULY 28, 2005

LOCATION: City Administration Building, Council Committee Room - 12th Floor.