

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

JULY 28, 2005

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM - 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:02 PM. Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 3:18 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Absent
Boardmember	Alexander Chuang	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Absent
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	Donna Jones	Present
Boardmember	Edward Lynch	Absent
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Absent
Boardmember	Timothy Murphy	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present (arrived @ 1:06 PM)
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Absent

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Nicole Purvis, Associate Planner
Barbara Hubbard, Board Secretary
Noah Stewart, Staff
Karen Heumann, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MAY 26, 2005

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS PRESENTED WITH A VOTE CORRECTION TO ITEM 12-D, ADDING BOARDMEMBER MURPHY TO MAKE A TOTAL OF EIGHT IN FAVOR.

Seconded by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 9-0-0 (Schaefer out of room). Motion passes.

- APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF JUNE 17, 2005

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS PRESENTED.

Seconded by Boardmember Jones. Vote: 9-0-1(Sewell). Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

ISSUES WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NOT PREVIOUSLY HEARD AND NOT ON THE AGENDA.

- Boardmember Emme spoke about the election process he observed during the recent vote for Mayor of San Diego.
- Marie Lia requested that the 448 Market Street property be removed from the August HRB agenda.
- Kathy Riser, Naval Training Center (NTC) gave an update on the progress being made at the historical district.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

Notification of Absences

- Boardmember Burnett, Delawie, Lynch, McNeely and Silva notified staff that they would be absent today.

General Information

- None

B. Subcommittee Reports

- The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on July 6, 2005 and considered the NTC Marketplace, the Snowflake Bakery, the A-1 Globe Flour Mill, 2028-30 L Street, and the Maryland Hotel. The next meeting will be on Wednesday, August 3, 2005 at 3 PM.
- The Policy Subcommittee met on July 11, 2005 and considered HRB Criterion D, the Relocation of the Harwood-Tichenor HRB Site #659 to a site in Sherman Heights, and HRB subcommittee, Membership and Appointments. The next meeting will be on Monday, August 8, 2005 at 3 PM.
- The Archaeology Subcommittee did not meet. The next meeting is scheduled for Monday, August 8, 2005 at 4 PM.

CHAIR SCHWARTZ ASKED THE BOARD FOR A VOTE ON THE NOMINATION OF A NEW MEMBER TO THE POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE TO REPLACE JIM AHERN.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO NOMINATE DON HARRISON TO REPLACE JIM AHERN ON THE POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE.

Seconded by Boardmember Chuang. Vote: 9-0-1(Harrison). Motion passes.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

- None

Ex parte communications

- None

Failure to visit sites for designation

- Item 6 – Boardmember Murphy
- Item 8 – Boardmember Emme

D. Staff Report

- There was no Boardmember response to the California Coastal Commission's query regarding Commission/Board Training, therefore staff did not respond.

- There are a number of Appeals to Council of HRB designations, several of these, Unicorn Antiques/Pack Lofts and the Snowflake Bakery in Centre City, as well as the Sheppard Duplex in La Jolla, are scheduled to be heard at the August 3, 2005 DAS meeting, it is staff's sincere desire that the resolution of these items at the subcommittee meeting may obviate these items proceeding to Council.
- Staff requested that the board members review the information in the blue folders regarding an AIA-sponsored historic preservation conference to be held in Bath, England.
- A copy of the Nomination Form for the 2006 Preserve America Presidential Awards is being passed around to the Boardmembers. If any Boardmember wishes to nominate an exemplary preservation accomplishment that would rise to the National level, please provide the information to HRB staff.
- Staff has become aware that the short-hand descriptions of HRB Criteria, i.e. Criterion A (Cultural Landscape), are sometimes confusing and may be viewed as limiting. An example of this is the reference to Criterion A as cultural landscape, community history, etc. For that reason, staff will be referring to the Criteria by letter, and relying on the full definition that is in the heading of each criterion considered in the staff report.
- Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled seven designation requests from the public on today's agenda. Staff has received four new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that have not yet been agendized and are waiting to be reviewed by staff for processing to 27. It is likely that about three items will be scheduled for the next meeting.
- Betsy McCullough, Deputy Director, Planning Department presented information regarding the HRB Budget.
- Staff was sorry to report that a valued colleague, Nicole Purvis, has resigned from the City and the HRB in order to pursue her thriving stained glass business. I'm sure that you'll want to check out her work, especially in the area of historic-related restoration. Staff stated that the department hopes to be able to hire Nicole on a contract basis to help on occasion. Her last day with the City is tomorrow, Friday, July 29, 2005. Please join us in wishing her well in her new adventure.

E. Requests for Continuances

- None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA.

- **ITEM 5 – BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT – UPDATE IV**
- **ITEM 7 – LOUIS AND JANE FLORENTIN HOUSE**
- **ITEM 10 – GRETA AND HOWARD STEVENTON HOUSE**
- **ITEM 11 – MAYNARD AND BESSIE HEATHERLY HOUSE**
- **ITEM 12 – RUSSELL AND EMMA BATES HOUSE**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEMS ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Murphy. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

- **ITEM 6 – JOSEPH AND ESTEN SHREVE HOUSE**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE) AND C (ARCHITECTURE) AND INCLUDES THE STUCCO WALL, GARAGE AND DEPENDENCY UNIT, AS WELL AS ORIGINAL CONCRETE PAVING AND RED CONCRETE MORTAR STAIRS AND PATH THE LINK THE HOUSE WITH THE STREET AND THE SHORT RETAINING WALL ALONG ALHAMBRA STREET.

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer. Vote: 9-0-1((Murphy). Motion passes.

ACTION ITEMS**ITEM 5 – BURLINGAME VOLUNTARY/TRADITIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT – UPDATE IV**

Applicant: Burlingame property owners currently volunteering their home for designation

Location: 3001 Kalmia Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of one additional site at 3001 Kalmia Street to the Burlingame Voluntary/Traditional Historical District.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File".

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Community Development), C (Architecture) and F (Contributing to a Historical District).

Report Number: HRB-05-027

Testimony Received:

None.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT), C (ARCHITECTURE) AND F (CONTRIBUTING TO A HISTORICAL DISTRICT).

Seconded by Boardmember Murphy. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #526-122.**

ITEM 6 – JOSEPH AND ESTEN SHREVE HOUSE

Applicant: Ronald V. May, RPA, on behalf of David and Rosaleen Flood, owners

Location: 4510 Alhambra Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Joseph and Esten Shreve House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Cultural Landscape) and C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-028

Testimony Received:

None.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE) AND C (ARCHITECTURE) AND INCLUDES THE STUCCO WALL, GARAGE AND DEPENDENCY UNIT, AS WELL AS ORIGINAL CONCRETE PAVING AND RED CONCRETE MORTAR STAIRS AND PATH THE LINK THE HOUSE WITH THE STREET AND THE SHORT RETAINING WALL ALONG ALHAMBRA STREET.

Seconded by Boardmember Schaefer. Vote: 9-0-1((Murphy). Motion passes.

HRB Site #719.

ITEM 7 – LOUIS AND JANE FLORENTIN HOUSE

Applicant: Jim Thompson and Robin Shifflet, owners

Location: 2807 28th Street, North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Louis and Jane Florentin House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERION C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-029

Testimony Received:

None.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Murphy. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #720**

ITEM 8 – ENA SHAPLEY/EDWARD DEPEW HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of Lewis and Lynne Baker, owners

Location: 4252 Arista Street, Presidio Hills, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Consider the designation of the Ena Shapley/Edward Depew House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA C (Architecture) and D (Master Architect).

Report Number: HRB-05-030

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Beth Montes.

In Opposition by:

None.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C (ARCHITECTURE) AND D (MASTER ARCHITECT).

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 9-0-1 (Emme). Motion passes.
HRB Site #721

ITEM 9 – PHILIP AND HELEN GILDRED/RALPH FRANK HOUSE

Applicant: Beth Montes, on behalf of Gary Copson, owner

Location: 1025 Cypress Avenue, Marston Hills, Uptown Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Philip and Helen Gildred/Ralph Frank House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA B (Historical Person), C (Architecture) and D (Master Architect).

Report Number: HRB-05-031

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Beth Montes.

In Opposition by:

None.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER EMME TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA B (HISTORICAL PERSON), C (ARCHITECTURE) AND D (MASTER ARCHITECT).

Seconded by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #722.**

ITEM 10 – GRETA AND HOWARD STEVENTON HOUSE

Applicant: Ruth Alter, on behalf of Isabel Gilda & Travis Ellis, owners

Location: 1355 29th Street, South Park, Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Greta and Howard Steventon House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERION C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-032

Testimony Received:

None.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Murphy. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #723**

ITEM 11 – MAYNARD AND BESSIE HEATHERLY HOUSE

Applicant: Ronald V. May, RPA, on behalf of Mark Sanbower & Paul Cooley, owners

Location: 3585 Villa Terrace, North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Maynard and Bessie Heatherly House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERION C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-033

Testimony Received:

None.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Murphy. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #724**

ITEM 12 – RUSSELL AND EMMA BATES HOUSE

Applicant: Scott A. Moomjian, on behalf of Daniel and Ellen Dewan, owners

Location: 2411 32nd Street, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3

Description: Consider the designation of the Russell and Emma Bates House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Designate under HRB CRITERIA A (Cultural Landscape) and C (Architecture).

Report Number: HRB-05-034

Testimony Received:

None.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA A (CULTURAL LANDSCAPE) AND C (ARCHITECTURE).

Seconded by Boardmember Murphy. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes. **HRB Site #725**

ITEM 13 – PARKER HOUSE

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: 7701 Eads Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the Parker House as a Historical Resource Site.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or "Note and File."

Staff Recommendation: Note and File.

Report Number: HRB-05-035

Testimony Received:

In Support by:

Scott A. Moomjian, Michael Morkin and Michelle Parker.

In Opposition by:

None.

Public Testimony was closed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO NOTE AND FILE.

Seconded by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by contacting Board Secretary Barbara Hubbard at (619) 533-6307.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 3:18 P.M.

NEXT MEETING DATE: August 25, 2005

LOCATION: City Administration Building, Council Committee Room - 12th Floor.