

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

May 25, 2006

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Schwartz at 1:05 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Chairperson	Lloyd Schwartz	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Absent
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Present
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present (left at 2:30)

Staff to the Board in attendance: Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Kelley Saunders, Associate Planner/Historian
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner
Diane Kane, Senior Planner

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF APRIL 27, 2006

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO APPROVE THE APRIL 27, 2006 MINUTES WITH MODIFICATIONS TO CORRECT BOARDMEMBER RECORD OF ATTENDANCE.

Seconded by Boardmember Harrison Vote: 9-0-1 (Silvas). Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

- Council President Scott Peters praised the work of the Board and the volunteer efforts by the Members. He announced that the City Council increased the 2007 Budget to add one full time Historical Resources Planner.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information**

Notification of Absences

- Boardmember Delawie notified staff immediately prior to the meeting that he was not able to return from New Mexico in time for the meeting.

Boardmember Comment:

- Boardmember Schaefer commented on the popularity of historic designation and Mills Act Agreements as seen in real estate advertisements for properties.

B. Subcommittee Reports

The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on May 3, 2006 and considered proposed changes to the front entrance and the existing kiosk of the Keating Building; the relocation of two designated residences from Cave Street in La Jolla to the southeast corner of Westbourne and La Jolla Blvd. to allow expansion of a church parking lot; on site relocation and modification of a designated residence on Kearsarge; modifications to a designated contributing structure in the Golden Hill Historical District; options for retention of two structures identified in the 2004 East Village Survey as potentially historic, in the context of a proposed new project; and, revisions to proposed new construction adjacent to the El Cortez Hotel.

The Policy Subcommittee met on May 8, 2006 and considered new and previous nominations for preservation awards and made final determinations on this year's recipients; alternatives to the current designation appeal process were presented and discussed; a standardized format for historical resource research reports with specific requirements was proposed by staff; the Planning Department's proposal to reduce the number of Board members from 15 to 11 was presented; and additional comments on the draft Historic Preservation Element were accepted.

The Archaeology Subcommittee met on May 8, 2006 and considered draft revisions to the Historical Resources Guidelines related to curation.

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest
None.

Ex parte communications
None.

Failure to visit sites for designation
None.

D. Staff Report

The newly appointed Planning Director, Bill Anderson, was introduced. He is looking forward to working with the HRB on the important issues related to historic preservation. There are several information items on this agenda including the Annual Preservation Awards. We also have a request by Ms. Marie Lia for the Board's support of a nomination of the Pickwick Hotel to the California Register, a short presentation by staff of the draft Historic Preservation Element of the General Plan update, and the findings and recommendations of the Draft Uptown Survey, presented by staff and the historic consultant. These items will be addressed before the Board's action items.

Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled 3 designation requests from the public on today's agenda; a 4th request was reviewed by staff and subsequently withdrawn by the property owner. Staff has received 3 new designation requests from members of the public since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that are waiting to be reviewed by staff to 66. Staff is currently reviewing 6 requests which were submitted in May and June 2005 for next month's meeting. We will continue to review and docket these voluntary designations as staff time allows.

E. Requests for Continuances

None.

ITEM 4 - INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Annual Awards for Excellence in Historic Preservation, awarded by the Historical Resources Board

Awards were presented by the Chair and Vice Chair with certificates presented by staff to those being honored. Recipients addressed the Board after receiving their awards. The following awards were presented.

Agency Award: Cabrillo Bridge Restoration (Cal Trans, Heritage Architecture, Melvyn Green & Associates, Erreca's Inc., C.K. Arts)

Architectural Rehabilitation Award: North Park Theatre (Arnold "Bud" Fischer, Lyric Opera San Diego, San Diego Redevelopment Agency, North Park Main Street, Council District 3)

Cultural Landscape Award: Organ Pavilion Lighting Restoration (City of San Diego Parks and Recreation Department, City of San Diego Engineering and Capital Projects Department. Heritage Architecture, LSW Engineers, Ace Electric, Eagle Restoration and Builders)

Archaeology Award: "A Letter from the Ocean Hotel" (San Diego Archaeological Center, ASM Affiliates)

Community History Award: San Diego Gravestone Project (Dr. Seth Mallios, David Caterino)

History Award: "San Diego: California's Cornerstone" (Dr. Iris Engstrand)

Architectural Restoration Award: 1245 Island Avenue (Ben Bunn, Chris Hulburt, Lee Hulburt, Linda Bunn, Bruce Coons)

Cultural Diversity Award: Downtown San Diego African-American Heritage Study (Mooney, Jones and Stokes, Centre City Development Corporation)

Individual Accomplishment Award: Modern San Diego (Keith York)

Preservation Advancement Award: Archival of Water Department Records (City of San Diego Water Department, City of San Diego Library Department).

B. Request for HRB Support of a Nomination of the Pickwick Hotel (HRB #682) to the California Register, request made by Attorney Marie Lia, representing the Owner,

Staff report by Cathy Winterrowd.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO SUPPORT THE REQUESTED NOMINATION OF THE PICKWICK HOTEL TO THE CALIFORNIA REGISTER AND DIRECT STAFF TO PREPARE CORRESPONDENCE FROM THE HRB CHAIR STATING THE BOARD'S SUPPORT.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

C. Draft Historic Preservation Element of the General Plan Update

Staff presented a brief summary of the Draft Historic Preservation Element of the City's General Plan Update. The Board took no action on this item.

D. Findings and Recommendations of the Draft Uptown Survey

Staff and the Consultant team of Ione Stiegler and Vonn Marie May presented the findings and recommendations of the Draft Uptown Survey. The Board took no action on this item.

ITEM 5 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- **ITEM 8 – Roy and Edith Rinehart House at 4195 Norfolk Terrace**
- **ITEM 9 – Biltmore Apartments at 1166 12th Avenue**
- **ITEM 10 -Lawrence Anderson Spec House #1 at 5183 Hastings Road**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE ITEMS 8, 9, AND 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – SANFORD B. MEYERS SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Kathleen Crawford, on behalf of Katalyst LLC, owner

Location: 1619 J Street and 371 16th Street (also known as 1601 J Street); East Village, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Single-story, asymmetrical, pyramidal-roofed Transitional vernacular cottage with Craftsman influences built C. 1906.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Sanford B. Meyers Spec House #1 located at 1619 J Street under HRB CRITERIA A and C as one of only three homes of a similar style remaining in East Village and as a representative example of working class, Transitional vernacular residential architecture during the third phase of development in East Village beginning in 1906 and ending in 1921. The house at 371 16th Street (also known as 1601 J Street), which is located on the same parcel, is not included in the designation and no action is required for this building.

Report Number: HRB-06-015

Staff report was given by Kelley Saunders.

Testimony Received:

In Support: Bruce Coons.

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Gary Mueser, Michael LaBarre, Brad Smith

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Curry can support Criterion A due to the property's association with urban history. Boardmember Sewell noted that the research report did not appropriately address the history of San Diego. Boardmember Marshall stated that he is currently working with the project architect on a different property and has no conflict with this designation request. Mr. Marshall stated that the key points are the date of construction of the building, the type of architecture and its integrity, and its location; this building is a rare type in this area, he will support designation

under both Criteria A and C, which would not necessarily result in preservation, but would require mitigation and a review process prior to demolition; the property retains integrity. Boardmember Emme stated that East Village is a fictional term and would prefer Sherman Heights West; I-5 created a finite resource west of the freeway, the house is rare and in very good condition, it is unique and worth saving. Boardmember Harrison stated he would support designation under both Criteria A and C.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE THE SANFORD B. MEYERS SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 1619 J STREET UNDER CRITERION A.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-1-0. Motion passes.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO DESIGNATE THE SANFORD B. MEYERS SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 1619 J STREET BASED ON STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER CRITERION C.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 8-1-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 7 – 2738 UPAS STREET – WITHDRAWN BY THE OWNER

ITEM 8 – ROY AND EDITH RINEHART HOUSE

Applicant: Ruth Alter, on behalf of Thomas and Karen Capp, owners

Location: 4195 Norfolk Terrace, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: The house is a 1929 Spanish Eclectic style one and two-story structure with stucco facades over wood framing and flat roofs as well as small sections of clay tile gable roofs, and rests on a concrete foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Roy and Edith Rinehart House located at 4195 Norfolk Terrace under HRB CRITERION C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic architecture. The staff recommendation does not include designation of the garage or entry walkway.

Report Number: HRB-06-020

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 9 – THE BILTMORE APARTMENTS

Applicant: Kathleen Crawford, on behalf of Dan Floit, owner

Location: 1166 12th Avenue, East Village, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: The building is a 1925 French Eclectic style three-story flat roofed structure with partial basement has brick masonry walls, two of which (facing the streets on this corner lot) are glazed brick; clay tile and asphalt shingle partial mansards at the flat roof; and a concrete foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate The Biltmore Apartments located at 1166 12th Avenue under HRB CRITERION C as a good example of the French Eclectic architectural style as it relates to a multi-unit use.

Report Number: HRB-06-021

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 10 – LAWRENCE ANDERSON SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Ron May, on behalf of Pamela Garrett and David May, owners

Location: 5183 Hastings Road, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3

Description: The house is a 1929 Spanish Eclectic style one-story house with stucco facades over wood framing, intersecting and overlapping clay tile gable roofs, and a concrete foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Lawrence Anderson Spec House #1 located at 5183 Hastings Road under HRB CRITERION C as a good example of Spanish Eclectic architecture. Staff recommends a follow-up motion to condition the Mills Act contract to require increased visibility of the front door.

Report Number: HRB-06-022

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCNEELY TO PLACE THE ABOVE ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND DESIGNATE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 10-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 11 – REDUCTION IN THE NUMBER OF HRB MEMBERS

Applicant: N/A

Location: City wide

Description: Proposed revisions to the San Diego Land Development Code to Reduce the Number of Historical Resources Board Members

Today's Action: Support or do not support the proposal.

Staff Recommendation: Support the Planning Department's proposal to reduce the number of Board members from 15 to 11, with a reduction from 8 to 6 in the required number for a quorum and number of votes to designate a historical resource.

Report Number: HRB-06-023

Staff report given by Cathy Winterrowd.

Testimony Received:

In Support: Ron May, Bruce Coons (under certain circumstances).

In Opposition: None.

Public testimony was closed.

Boardmember Emme agrees it is the right time to change the number of board members but has concerns with the slow recruitment to fill vacancies and with the unusual amount of conflicts. Boardmember Curry stated that the composition of the board is important as they are dealing with cultural issues related to community development. Ms. Curry does not agree that there is a strong argument for reducing the number of board members but the number is not as important as the composition and feels that the current board composition does not reflect diversity of cultures or the City's neighborhoods. Chairperson Schwartz suggested that a motion to support the reduction in number include language to encourage the Mayor's office and City Council to make every effort to comply with the statutory references referred to in the staff report regarding diversity on boards. Boardmember Sewell stated that it has always been difficult to fill HRB vacancies and that it makes sense to reduce the number. Ms. Sewell feels this board is very diverse and the Mayor and City Council have done an excellent job in providing minority representation. Boardmember Marshall stated he sees the logic in reducing the number when looking at the numbers state wide and wanted to remind everyone that board members are volunteers and that it is important to recognize that commitment. Boardmember Harrison agrees with the need for diversity and wants a broader perspective; would like more effort in finding HRB members; and feels there is no more work to staff a 15-member board than an 11-member board.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO ADOPT STAFF RECOMMENDATION REDUCING BOARD MEMBERS TO 11, INCLUDING REDUCING THE QUORUM TO 6 AND THE NUMBER OF VOTES NEEDED TO DESIGNATE TO 6.

Second by Boardmember Marshall. Vote: 6-3 (Curry, Harrison, Emme)-0. Motion passes.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Schwartz adjourned the meeting at 5:11 PM.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by calling the Department at 619-235-5200.