

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
DRAFT
MINUTES OF REGULAR SCHEDULED MEETING OF

July 27, 2006

COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM – 12TH FLOOR
CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Vice-Chairperson Burnett at 1:05 PM.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING

Vice-Chairperson	Laura Burnett	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Homer Delawie	Present
Boardmember	Otto Emme	Present
Boardmember	Don Harrison	Present
Boardmember	David Marshall	Present
Boardmember	Delores McNeely	Absent
Boardmember	Jerry Schaefer	Present
Boardmember	Marsha Sewell	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Deputy City Attorney	Nina Fain-Newman	Present

Staff to the Board in attendance: Diane Kane, Senior Planner
Mike Tudury, Senior Planner/Architect
Cathy Winterrowd, Senior Planner

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MAY 25, 2006

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO APPROVE THE MINUTES WITH A CORRECTION TO STAFF ATTENDANCE BY ADDING DIANE KANE'S NAME.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 7-0-1 (Delawie). Motion passes.

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

Notification of Absences

- Boardmembers Curry and McNeely notified staff that they were out of town and would not be able to attend the meeting.

Boardmember Comment:

- Boardmember Harrison requested, pending action by the Mayor to appoint a new Chairperson in the wake of Mr. Schwartz's resignation, that the Board ratify the proposal by the Vice-Chair and staff to fill the Chair and Vice-Chair positions.

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HARRISON TO RATIFY LAURA BURNETT AS THE HRB CHAIRPERSON AND JERRY SCHAEFER AS THE HRB VICE-CHAIRPERSON.

Second by Boardmember Silvas. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

- Boardmember Marshall announced that audio tours are now available in Balboa Park. Mr. Marshall also announced that the Cabrillo Bridge, Western Metal Building, and the Organ Pavilion had received Preservation Awards from the California Preservation Foundation.
- Boardmember Emme encouraged visiting the Theme Building at the Los Angeles Airport. It was designated a historical landmark in 1992 by the L.A. City Council and is a California icon.

B. Subcommittee Reports

The Design Assistance Subcommittee met on July 5, 2006 and considered revised plans for the designated property at 1745 Kearsarge Street in La Jolla in response to previous DAS

recommendations; proposed alterations to a John Lloyd Wright residence in La Jolla that is expected to come to the full Board for consideration of historical designation; tenant improvements at the Schiefer & Sons Building and Showley Brothers Candy Factory, both of which are part of the "Park at the Park" Padre Ballpark Master Plan; a deviation from the Design Guidelines and Criteria for a non-contributing structure in the Sherman Heights Historical District; and additional review of a proposed Master Plan update for the Salk Institute. The next regular DAS meeting will be on Wednesday, August 2, 2006 at 3 PM; there will be a special DAS meeting at the Salk Institute on Tuesday, August 1, 2006 at 4:00 PM to further review the proposed Master Plan.

The Policy Subcommittee did not meet in July. The next meeting will be on Monday, August 14, 2006 at 3 PM. Today's HRB meeting agenda incorrectly states that the Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on August 7th.

The Archaeology Subcommittee met on July 10, 2006 to accept additional comments and suggested revisions from the public on the proposed update of the Guidelines and to discuss the creation of archaeological districts and suggested district areas. The next meeting will be on Monday, September 11, 2006 at 4 PM..

C. Conflict of Interest Declarations

Conflicts of interest

Boardmember Marshall identified a conflict of interest on Item #6 for both 418 and 450 10th Avenue. Boardmember Schaefer identified a conflict of interest on Item #14 777 Beech Street/El Cortez. Boardmember Sewell requested advice from the Deputy City Attorney since she lives within 500 feet of Item #14 777 Beech Street/El Cortez. Attorney Nina Fain-Newman advised there was no conflict and a recusal was not required.

Ex parte communications

None.

Failure to visit sites for designation

None.

D. Staff Report

Last week the City Council approved the Planning Department request to reduce the size of the HRB to 11 members. The ordinance language returns to the Council next week for a second reading and would then become effective 30 days later, around the first of September. In addition, we are expecting reappointments and new Board appointments from the Mayor's office in early September, which means a newly constituted and fully seated Board should be in effect for the September Board meeting.

The City of San Diego was awarded a CLG grant in the 2005-2006 grant cycle by the State Office of Historic Preservation. The \$20,000 grant is for the preparation of a Context Statement

on Modernism in San Diego, 1935-1965. It will be used to prepare historical background information on the Modern Movement, its most significant practitioners and their most significant work. It will include property types, eligibility and integrity criteria to help in creating a citywide thematic historic district of properties worthy of designation for their association with the Modern Movement in San Diego. The grant match is being provided by the city in the form of staff time, and volunteer work from Bruce Coons, Angeles Liera, Marsha Sewell and others involved with the San Diego AIA Foundation and the SOHO Modern Committee.

Boardmembers will note that staff has scheduled 7 designation requests from the public on today's agenda. This still leaves 23 requests submitted in 2005 that we will bring to the Board during the next three months. In addition, there have been 40 designation requests from the public in 2006, including 8 requests since the last HRB meeting, bringing the total number of designation requests that are waiting to be reviewed by staff to 63..

E. Requests for Continuances

Staff received written requests for continuances from:

- Ron May on behalf of the property owners at 1845 Fort Stockton for a continuance of Item # 5 to the September 28, 2006 HRB meeting
- Sarai Johnson on behalf of the property owners at 3140 Third Avenue for a continuance of Item # 8 to the September 28, 2006 HRB meeting
- SOHO for a continuance of Item #14 to an unspecified date due to its association with the proposed Warehouse District.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SEWELL TO CONTINUE ITEM #5 AND ITEM #8, AT THE REQUESTS OF THE PROPERTY OWNERS, TO THE SEPTEMBER 28, 2006 HRB MEETING.

Second by Boardmember Emme. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

Item #14 was trailed to the August 24, 2006 HRB meeting due to the lack of a quorum.

ITEM 4 - - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

- **ITEM 7 – ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUST #3 at 4191 Stephens Street**
- **ITEM 9 – ADA BLACK/HERBERT MANN AND THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE at 7781 Hillside Drive**
- **ITEM 10 – MARION DELAFIELD STURGIS AND SAMUEL OTIS DAUCHY/WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON HOUSE at 4455 Hermosa Way**
- **ITEM 11 – DANIEL AND CLARA DEACON HOUSE at 3676 Eagle Street**
- **ITEM 12 – PERCY BENBOUGH/WILLIAM WHEELER HOUSE at 2174 Guy Street**
- **ITEM 13 – F. LISLE MORGAN SPEC HOUSE #1 at 7144 Monte Vista**

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE ITEMS 7, 9, 10, 11, 12, AND 13 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 5 – 1845 FORT STOCKTON DRIVE HOUSE (Continued from April 27, 2006)

Applicant: Ron May on behalf of the owner, Merilee Antrim and Richard Sinkin

Location: 1845 Fort Stockton Drive, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: Two-story Spanish Eclectic style with Pueblo influences residence built in 1924 by contractor Louis Dilley.

Today's Action: Designate under any established HRB Criteria (A through F) or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house at 1845 Fort Stockton Drive under any HRB Criteria due to modifications that significantly impact the original character and integrity of the building.

Report Number: HRB-06-014

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO CONTINUE ITEM #5, AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER, TO THE SEPTEMBER 28, 2006 HRB MEETING.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 6 – 418 10th AVENUE & 450 10th AVENUE (Trailed from June 22, 2006)

Applicant: Wendy Tinsley, on behalf of LodgeWorks, L.P.

Location: 418 and 450 10th Avenue, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: 418 10th Avenue is a utilitarian warehouse built in a rectangular plan of board form concrete and concrete bricks in 1927. 450 10th Avenue is a commercial building constructed in approximately 1949 of board form concrete and concrete brick with two original storefronts and an auto bay converted to a third storefront.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the buildings at 418 10th Avenue or 450 10th Avenue under any HRB criteria.

Report Number: HRB-06-032

THIS ITEM WAS TRAILED TO THE AUGUST 24, 2006 HRB MEETING DUE TO THE LACK OF A QUORUM. BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL DID NOT PARTICIPATE IN ANY DISCUSSIONS OR ACTIONS REGARDING THIS ITEM.

ITEM 7 – ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC HOUSE #3

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of the owner, Barbara Beaton

Location: 4191 Stephens Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a one story Craftsman style home built in 1920.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alexander Schreiber Spec House #3 under HRB Criterion C as a distinctive example of a late expression of the Craftsman style architecture, retaining good integrity, and under HRB Criterion D for the notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber.

Report Number: HRB-06-034

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 8 – 3140 THIRD AVENUE HOUSE

Applicant: Johnson & Johnson Architecture, on behalf of owners, Amy Kiger and David Traver,

Location: 3140 Third Avenue, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two story Craftsman style home built in 1910.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the house under any HRB Criteria, due to modifications which have compromised the architectural and historical integrity of the house.

Report Number: HRB-06-035

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO CONTINUE ITEM #8, AT THE REQUEST OF THE PROPERTY OWNER, TO THE SEPTEMBER 28, 2006 HRB MEETING.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 9 – ADA BLACK/HERBERT MANN AND THOMAS SHEPHERD HOUSE

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of the owner, Michael Heims

Location: 7781 Hillside Drive, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The house is a one and two story with basement stucco asymmetrical Spanish Eclectic style home built in 1927 and rests on a concrete foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ada Black/Herbert Mann and Thomas Shepherd House under HRB Criterion C, as an excellent example of the Spanish Eclectic architectural style, exhibiting many characteristics of the style in form, material, detail and feel, and HRB Criterion D, as the subject house is clearly representative of Master Architects Herbert Mann's and Thomas Shepherd's superior body of work.

Report Number: HRB-06-036

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA ND APROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 10 – MARION DELAFIELD STURGIS AND SAMUEL OTIS DAUCHY/WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON HOUSE

Applicant: Ron May, on behalf of owners, Gordon and Dahlia Hunt

Location: 4455 Hermosa Way, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two story over finished basement, Spanish Eclectic residence inspired by Beaux Arts design principles, constructed between 1923-1927.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Marion Delafield Sturgis and Samuel Otis Dauchy/William Templeton Johnson House under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of the early 20th century Spanish Eclectic architectural style, retaining excellent integrity, and HRB Criterion D as exemplary residential work of Master Architect William Templeton Johnson from the 1923-1927 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-06-037

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA ND APROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 11 – DANIEL AND CLARA DEACON HOUSE

Applicant: Ron May on behalf of owners, Martin Rosen and Bobbie Stephenson

Location: 3676 Eagle Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a single story, Craftsman style residence, built in 1921.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Daniel and Clara Deacon House under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the early 20th century Craftsman architectural style, retaining good integrity, from the 1921 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-06-038

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 12 – PERCY BENBOUGH/WILLIAM WHEELER HOUSE

Applicant: Marie Lia, on behalf of owners James Arabia and Tina Cross

Location: 2174 Guy Street, Uptown Community, Council District 2

Description: The house is a two-story Italian Renaissance Revival house built in 1926 and constructed of wood frame and brick on a concrete foundation.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Percy Benbough/William Wheeler House under HRB Criterion B for its association with prominent San Diegan and former Mayor Percy Benbough; HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Italian Renaissance Revival architecture; and HRB Criterion D as the work of established Master Architect William Wheeler.

Report Number: HRB-06-039

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERIA B, C AND D.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 13 – F. LISLE MORGAN SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Vonn Marie May, on behalf of owner Stephen M. Diamond

Location: 7144 Monte Vista, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: The house is a one story Spanish Eclectic style residence built in 1930.

Today's Action: Designate under one or more established HRB Criteria or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the F. Lisle Morgan Spec House #1 under HRB Criterion C as an excellent example of Spanish Eclectic architectural style, retaining a good degree of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-06-040

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARSHALL TO PLACE THIS ITEM ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND APPROVE PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE UNDER HRB CRITERION C.

Second by Boardmember Sewell. Vote: 8-0-0. Motion passes.

ITEM 14 777 BEECH STREET/EL CORTEZ

Applicant: Centre City Development Corporation

Location: 777 Beech Street, Centre City Community, Council District 2

Description: Review proposed project for compliance with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The specific Standards for Rehabilitation that apply to the proposed new structure are Standards 2, 9 and 10.

Today's Action: . Determine whether or not the proposed construction at 777 Beech Street meets the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent historically-designated El Cortez.

Staff Recommendation: . Find that the proposed 777 Beach Street project is consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with respect to the adjacent, historically designated El Cortez building, located at 702 Ash Street.

Report Number: HRB-06-042

THIS ITEM WAS TRAILED TO THE AUGUST 24, 2006 HRB MEETING DUE TO THE LACK OF A QUORUM.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Burnett adjourned the meeting at 1:31 PM.

NOTE: All Historical Resources Board meetings are tape recorded and kept on file with the City of San Diego Planning Department. Upon request, copies of the tapes can be obtained by calling the Department at 619-235-5200.