

DRAFT
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 18, 2011
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:05PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present <i>arrived at 1:35PM</i>
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR OCTOBER 27, 2011

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 27, 2011
MINUTES AS REVISED**

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 6-0-1
(*Baksh*)

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Curry notified staff she would not be in attendance; Boardmember Silvas informed staff he would be late.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ 2012 Meeting Dates Memo
- ✓ Draft Minutes for October
- ✓ Letters regarding Item #7 – 6210 Avenida Cresta
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- We would like to receive Boardmember input on specific training topics for the next calendar year. As you remember, the City Council appropriated \$3,000 from the Preservation Fund to help pay the costs of CLG training in 2012 and 2013. A request for training on integrity was made at the Policy Subcommittee meeting.
- Earlier this week, the City Council Committee on Land Use and Housing reviewed the status of a number of recommendations related to the permit review process for potentially historic properties, as well as, the current status of the Mills Act program. They also reviewed the proposed fee language for recovering penalties for unpermitted work involving historical resources and designating the Historic Preservation Fund as the appropriate placement of those penalties. As we continue to address the recommendations, we will bring issues to the Board for review and recommendations. Background materials can be found on the City Council Committee website.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, December 7, 2011. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, December 12, 2011. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, February 13, 2011.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 4 individual homeowner nominations and the Historical Plaques Workshop. There are 26 homeowner nominations in 2011 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 5 – LOUISE M. SEVERIN SPEC. HOUSE #2

ITEM 6 – ELMER AND IDA HALL HOUSE

ITEM 8 – JOHN R. AND FLORENCE PORTERFIELD BEARDSLEY HOUSE

Boardmember Berge pulled item 6 from the Consent Agenda

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 5 AND 8 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Seconded by Chair Lemmo

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – WORKSHOP ON HISTORICAL PLAQUES

In light of recent thefts, this workshop will be an opportunity for the Board to gather information on the current plaque program including materials and finishes, sizes and methods of attachment and to solicit recommendations from plaque vendors and historic property owners for changes to the program. It may be appropriate for the Board to refer the issues raised to the Policy Subcommittee. No other action on the part of the Board is being requested.

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge thinks the plaques should retain the City seal.

Boardmember Bethke wanted to know if other cities or national parks have had the same problem and if so how did they handle it.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – LOUISE M. SEVERIN SPEC. HOUSE #2

Applicant: Richard and Gail Nye

Location: 4970 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (**1269 2-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4970 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Louise M. Severin Spec. House #2 located at 4970 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-11-073

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – ELMER AND IDA HALL HOUSE

Applicant: Katrina Dudley represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2806 Gregory Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2806 Gregory Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Elmer and Ida Hall House located at 2806 Gregory Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1932 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-11-074

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Elyce Hoeve, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge had questions regarding the photos in the addendum, non-original modifications and the date of construction.

Boardmember Silvas arrived in time to participate in this item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – ELMER AND IDA HALL HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – 6210 AVENIDA CRESTA

Applicant: Michael and Trina Wahle represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 6210 Avenida Cresta, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1247 1-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 6210 Avenida Cresta as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 6210 Avenida Cresta under any designation criteria.

Report Number: HRB-11-069

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (Mark Lyon)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation; agrees there is a loss of integrity of the home, at the front, to the footprint, and to the details of the windows.

Boardmember Baksh is on the fence after reading the letters and getting more details on how the owner had worked with Staff over the years.

Boardmember Marrone thinks letter from Mike Tudury stating that Staff thought that the property could achieve designation is important. We need to look at criteria other than C or D, possibly significant under Criteria A and/or B. Surely the windows would not have been approved, so there was some disconnect between the owners and Staff.

Chair Lemmo mentioned that if a property owner is meeting with Staff and even going through DAS still is not a guarantee and does not bind the Board to designate; because there are so many other things that become involved. It is clear that this particular homeowner was trying to do what he/she could to further designation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports the Staff recommendation; however thinks there is enough detail left to support Criterion D. She is bothered by the changes to the footprint, as well as the changes to the landscape and hardscape.

Boardmember Bethke also supports Staff's recommendation. We deal with this issue a lot with DAS; residents have questions about how to change their home and it has not been designated yet. He understands the difficulty that the applicant is in, but ultimately it still needs to be significant to designate. There is not enough context proposed to support designation under Criteria A and B; not sufficient significance for Criterion D.

Boardmember Berge supports Staff, but may be able to support designation under Criterion A. The report needs better discussion of context and significance of tract to La Jolla / San Diego; report could be restructured to show why building is significant.

Boardmember Bethke finds it hard to see how an individual home portrays the significance of an entire subdivision; the home itself does not convey that significance.

Boardmember Silvas may support designation under Criterion A, as part of the sub-division but needs more information.

Boardmember Marrone has done research on Ulrich, may be significant under Criterion D.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO INDEFINITELY CONTINUE ITEM 7 – AVENIDA CRESTA TO ALLOW FOR ADDITIONAL RESEARCH ON CRITERION A, SHOWING THAT IT IS A SPECIAL RESOURCE WITHIN THE TRACT, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, AND WHY THE HOME IS SIGNIFICANT; AND CRITERION D FOR THE TRACT ARCHITECT.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – JOHN R. AND FLORENCE PORTERFIELD BEARDSLEY HOUSE

Applicant: Bruce and Alana Coons

Location: 3130 Shadowlawn Street, 92110, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3130 Shadowlawn Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John R. and Florence Porterfield Beardsley House located at 3130 Shadowlawn Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criterion E.

Report Number: HRB-11-075

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, January 26, 2012

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 2.25PM