**D R A F T**

# CITY OF SAN DIEGO
# HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
# MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 26, 2012
# 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
# COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
# SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

## CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:05PM

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Chairperson | John Lemmo | Present |
| Vice Chairperson | Gail Garbini | Present |
| 2nd Vice Chairperson | Linda Marrone | Present |
| Boardmember | Michael Baksh | Present *arrived at 1.07PM* |
| Boardmember | Priscilla Berge | Present |
| Boardmember | Alex Bethke | Present |
| Boardmember | Maria Curry | Present *arrived at 1:10PM* |
| Boardmember | Abel Silvas | Present |
| Boardmember | Ann Woods | Present |

Staff to the Board in Attendance
Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner
Antoinette Gibbs, Acting Senior Planner
Jeff Szymanski, Acting Senior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

## ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR NOVEMBER 18, 2011

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 18, 2011 MINUTES AS WRITTEN**

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

## ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Bruce Coons – Plaza de Panama Tour by SOHO

Dan Soderberg – Windemere Cottage Demolition

Catalima Preskill and Bob Marinaccio – Gaslamp Quarter Historical Foundation would like to be notified on any Gaslamp actions.

## ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

### A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Marrone notified staff she would need to leave the meeting at 4:15.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**
  - ✓ Agenda for Plaza de Panama site tour and workshop on February 8, 2012
  - ✓ Applicant's request for continuance for Item 7 – Annie Porter House
  - ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Marrone is concerned about the demolition of Windermere cottage and would like to see the Policy subcommittee review integrity thresholds as they pertain to homes that are a 100 years or older under Criterion C for architecture and Criterion A for cultural significance, with the understanding that these homes will undergo a lot of changes over the years, and review how the State Office of Historic Preservation reviews these homes.

Boardmember Berge asked if the demolition of Windemere Cottage violated CEQA.

## B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

  None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

  None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

  None

## C. STAFF REPORT

- The Mayor has appointed two new Boardmembers, Evelya Rivera and Tom Larimer. Ms. Rivera is a member at large and Mr. Larimer is a licensed architect. These appointments will be heard by the City Council on March 6, 2012.
- Reminder of the upcoming Plaza de Panama site tour and workshop on February 8, 2012 at 1:00pm. We will begin the tour at the east end of the Cabrillo Bridge and finish the tour at the Santa Fe Room of the Balboa Park Club where the Board will take public testimony. No action will be taken. The Draft EIR is out for public review. It may be viewed Plaza de Panama Committee website at www.balboapark.org. Agendas for this workshop are provided on the back table.
- Updated 2012 HRB Meeting handout available on back table, the November meeting date was changed to the fifth Thursday, November 29, 2012.
- The audio recordings of HRB meetings are now being posted to our website following the meetings. This will allow the public to listen to Board meetings without having to pay for a CD recording. It will also allow Boardmembers to listen to a continued item they may have missed prior to the next hearing.
- We have been continuing to work on enhancements and customizations for CHRID. Updates to the local designation documents, architectural styles and search functions have been completed.

Exporting data to excel spreadsheets and configurations for managing the Mills Act program are both in development.

- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, February 1, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, February 13, 2012. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, February 13, 2012. Please note: all subcommittee meetings are now being held in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services (City Operations Building) located at 1222 First Avenue, San Diego.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes an information item, 3 referrals from Development Services, including 1 continued item from a previous agenda; 4 individual homeowner nominations and the Annual Certified Local Government Report. There are 26 homeowner nominations in 2011 and 1 homeowner nomination in 2012 that have been submitted for designation.

**D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

Applicant has submitted a written request for a 60-day continuance for Item 7 – Annie Porter House

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO GRANT A 60-DAY CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 7 – ANNIE PORTER HOUSE**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

**ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 9 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #2
ITEM 10 – ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPECULATION HOUSE #5
ITEM 11 – T.M. AND LEONORA H. RUSSELL SPECULATION HOUSE NO.1
ITEM 12 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge pulled Item 9 from the consent agenda.

Boardmember Berge thinks that the stucco is inappropriate and is opposed to designation under Criterion C for Item 10.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 11 AND 12 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA**

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 UNDER CRITERION D PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON THE CONSENT AGENDA**

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON THE CONSENT AGENDA**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods Vote: 4-5-0 Motion Fails
*(Lemmo, Garbini, Bethke, Berge, Silvas)*

## INFORMATION ITEMS

### ITEM A – SAN YSIDRO HISTORIC SURVEY WORKSHOP

The historic consultant, Christina Dikas with Page and Turnbull, will update the Board on the status and results of the San Ysidro historic survey. No action on the part of the Board is being requested. For more information on the San Ysidro Context Statement and Survey, please visit our website at the link below: http://www.sandiego.gov/planning/programs/historical/sanysidrocp.shtml

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Silvas asked if special events, under Criterion A, would be included in the survey.

Boardmember Curry wanted to know if the railroad station and U.S. Customs office is included as they are historic, as well as the railroad as a linear resource and the border as a cultural resource. Need to look at the area as whole due to the importance of the activities that have occurred.

## ACTION ITEMS

### ITEM 5 – 1310 K STREET

**Continued from October 2011**

Applicant: Career Lofts –SD LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia
Location: 1310 K Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 4-B**)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1310 K Street as a historical resource.
Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1310 K Street under any designation criteria.
Report Number: Staff memo dated January 12, 2012 and HRB-11-065

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Burke Lia, Doug Austin (*Phil Andoniu, Perry Dealy*)

In Opposition: John Eisenhart (*Eva Thorn*), Bruce Coons

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Curry mentioned the need to look at industrial buildings differently from houses relative to aesthetics; building can be used as industrial or a warehouse. It has the characteristics of a light industrial building; integrity does not mean it has to look nice. We have to protect these resources as they are important to our history and history does not have to be beautiful. This building has all of the elements of integrity and is in good condition.

Boardmember Woods thought the addendum was really clear and agrees with Staff's recommendation. Not sure how they can justify designated under Criterion A.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Boardmember Woods and supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone wants to hear what other Boardmembers have to say.

Chair Lemmo agreed that the addendum was excellent and is glad that they sent it back for further information. He thinks that this is an interesting building, but does think that it reaches the level of distinction to merit designation. He supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice - Chair Garbini thinks that it is a good example of light industrial warehouse and has retained its integrity of architectural style and setting. It is still very close to railroad and development and redevelopment of the warehouse district. She supports designation.

Boardmember Bethke agrees that history doesn't have to be beautiful, but the statement of significance is still lacking. Not sure that this rises to the level of significance for designation, he supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge stated that the designated guidelines don't require a building to be distinguished or unique but that it does need to be important within its historic context and needs to be significant. Documentation supports the building as a significant resource; form is warehouse building type and function is light industrial use.

Boardmember Silvas reiterated his comments from the previous hearing "I think this is an important historical building."

Boardmember Berge wanted to add that this is a good example of the type of building with mixed uses that were allowed in this area of town by the City's first zoning ordinance, which is why it is significant.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – CHARLES T. WILLIS BLACKSMITHS SHOP UNDER CRITERION C AS A REPRESENTATIVE EXAMPLE OF THE MID-1920'S WAREHOUSE BUILDING TYPE WITH A LIGHT INDUSTRIAL USE OF SPACE THERE BY BEING A TYPE OF CONSTRUCTION. THE RESOURCE IS A VERY GOOD EXAMPLE OF THE TYPE OF BUILDINGS WITH MIXED USES THAT WERE ALLOWED IN THIS AREA OF TOWN BY THE CITY'S FIRST ZONING ORDINANCE IN 1923. THE RESOURCE RETAINS A VERY GOOD LEVEL OF INTEGRITY FROM ITS PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE CIRCA ITS 1925 CONSTRUCTION DATE. THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF ITS CONSTRUCTION TYPE IN BOTH FORM AND FUNCTION BY BEING UTILITARIAN FACILITY WITH FUNCTIONAL SPACES. IN PARTICULAR THE ONE-STORY BUILDING EXHIBITS A RECTANGULAR SHAPE**

**WITH A ROUNDED ROOF FRAMED WITH BOWSTRING TRUSSES FOR INTERIOR HEIGHT, AND VARIES OPENINGS FOR LIGHT AND ACCESS INCLUDING GARAGE BAYS TO THE INTERIOR. THE EXTERIOR IS CONCRETE BLOCK AND BRICK, WHICH AT THAT TIME WITH A CONCRETE FLOOR ADDED FIRE SAFETY. ARCHITECTURAL STYLISTIC INFLUENCES AS EXPECTED WERE SECONDARY; SUCH AS SIMPLIFIED NEO-CLASSICAL DETAILS IN THE BRICK MASONRY AT WINDOWS AND THE CORNER OF THE FRONT FAÇADE. THE EXTERIOR BRICK WALLS ALSO FORM A STEPPED PARAPET IN THE FRONT AND THESE BRICK WALLS SERVE AS A BACKGROUND FOR THE ORIGINAL SIGNAGE FOR THE BLACKSMITH SHOP, SHOWING ITS ORIGINAL FUNCTION. THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY THE INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT FROM THE CONSULTANT AND THE WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED DURING THE DESIGNATION HEARING TODAY.**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry — Vote: 5-4-0 — Motion Fails
*(Lemmo, Woods, Baksh, Bethke)*

**ITEM 6 – 741 F STREET**

Applicant: S L A-B R A LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia
Location: 741 F Street, 92101, Centre City Community, Council District 2 (**1289 3-B**)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 741 F Street as a historical resource.
Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 741 F Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.
Report Number: HRB-12-001

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Burke Lia, Lawrence Slayen

In Opposition: Bruce Coons

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Silvas likes the building and would like to see more of the changes that we are talking about; with the photographs he sees it looks pretty historic.

Boardmember Berge thinks this is an interesting building and retains form. She has problems with its integrity; the second story change is disturbing.

Boardmember Bethke mentioned that when reading the report he was very impressed with building itself and thought it had potential as resource, and then he got on the site and was presented with the fact that this was a garage and inherently does not have the integrity that it needs to have for historical significance and designation.

Vice - Chair Garbini does not think the changes to the storefronts are an issue, landmark that would be missed if lost.

Chair Lemmo loves the brickwork and the building, but the change to two stories was major and it does not reach the level of significance for designation.

Boardmember Marrone thinks it would be great to see adaptive re-use project with this building. It does have some of the changes with windows and being more of a storefront in the more recent years and agrees significance is the brick detailing. Original form is still there.

Boardmember Baksh thinks that the alterations are significant and it has lost integrity.

Boardmember Woods agrees with the previous four Boardmember comments.

Boardmember Curry thinks the alterations are reversible and we should not use the same standards that we use for houses. It should be preserved; use of brick and architecture is significant.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – 741 F STREET UNDER CRITERION C**

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini Vote: 4-5-0 Motion Fails
*(Lemmo, Woods, Baksh, Marrone, Bethke)*

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BETHKE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – ANDERSON FURNITURE HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS UNIQUE USE OF WORKMANSHIP IN BRICKWORK DETAILING IN AN INDUSTRIAL AND COMMERCIAL USE. DESPITE THE ADAPTIVE REUSE, THE BUILDING IS STILL RECOGNIZABLE FROM ITS ORIGINAL 1908 CONSTRUCTION.**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-3-0 Motion Passes
*(Lemmo, Woods, Baksh)*

**ITEM 7 – ANNIE PORTER HOUSE**
Applicant: Bankers Hill Property LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian
Location: 2126-30 Front Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1289 1-A**)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource.
Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
Staff Recommendation: Designate the Annie Porter House located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1895 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear additions consisting of an approx 144 square feet one story addition constructed c. 1921 with an approx 144 square feet second story addition above constructed at an unknown date.
Report Number: HRB-12-008

**Staff Report by Kelley Stanco**

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 60-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

**ITEM 8 – 7733 IVANHOE EAST AVENUE**
Applicant: Laurie C McGrath Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian
Location: 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 7733 Ivanhoe East Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-12-002

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (*Joe Strystk*)

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Curry thinks that there are a lot of changes and more visuals of what changes have occurred would help.

Boardmember Woods supports the Staff recommendation, does not feel that the integrity is there. The addition is very large and very visible from the street. Even if we just focus on the original bungalow with the enclosure of the porch and changing of the landscaping, it doesn't convey the feeling of a Craftsman bungalow any longer.

Boardmember Baksh agrees that the modifications are pretty significant, he supports the Staff recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone agreed that there have been changes, but it is over 100 years old. Could there be consideration taken because we did see a transition over architectural history where people were enclosing their porches as they just weren't needed as people used them more in the earlier years.

Chair Lemmo is on the fence, he likes the home.

Boardmember Garbini thinks that it retains the character of original structure, you still see the roofline and yes you can see where the newer construction is on it. Porches get enclosed over time. Wanted to know what the original siding on the building was.

Boardmember Bethke agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge thinks the enclosed porch and lack of certainty about siding is a problem. She cannot support designation today. It needs additional information and research; it has to be placed within its importance in La Jolla and the beach cottages.

Boardmember Silvas agrees that more visuals would help, as it has been significantly changed (windows in the back).

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – JASON AND JENNIE RUTHERFORD AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF C.1906 UNDER HRB CRITERION C INCLUDING, ONLY THE ORIGINAL PROPERTY CONSTRUCTED C.1906 AND NOT PORTIONS OF THE HOME CONSTRUCTED THEREAFTER BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDING:**

**THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE CRAFTSMAN COTTAGE STYLE AND RETAINS INTEGRITY FROM ITS PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE EXHIBITS WOOD-FRAME CONSTRUCTION; WOODEN WALL-CLAD MATERIAL; A LOW-PITCHED, HIPPED ROOF WITH EAVE OVERHANG; BRICK CHIMNEY; AND ORIGINAL DOUBLE-HUNG WINDOWS WITH DIAMOND PANES.**

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke Vote: 0-9-0 Motion Fails
*(Lemmo, Garbini, Curry, Woods, Baksh, Marrone, Bethke, Berge, Silvas)*

**ITEM 9 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #2**
Applicant: Marks Family Living Trust
Location: 3676 28th Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-D**)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3676 28th Street as a historical resource.
Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.
Staff Recommendation: Designate the David O. Dryden Spec. House #2 located at 3676 28th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1916 under HRB Criterion D. The 224 square-foot addition to the rear of the structure, constructed in 1989, is excluded from this designation.
Report Number: HRB-12-003

Staff Report by Jeff Oakley

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Gabriella Marks, Daniel Marks

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge had questions about the pergola.

Boardmember Bethke does not think it is individually significant.

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC. HOUSE #2 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 8-1-0 Motion Passes
*(Bethke)*

**ITEM 10 – ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPECULATION HOUSE #5**
Applicant: Kristina Devico represented by Allan Hazard & Janet O'Dea
Location: 4167 Palmetto Way, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-H**)
Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4167 Palmetto Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alexander Schreiber Speculation House #5 located at 4167 Palmetto Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1918 under HRB Criteria C and D. The 1982 detached garage and 1983 detached hobby shop, converted to an apartment in 2001, are excluded from this designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-004

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA UNDER CRITERION D ONLY

**ITEM 11 – T.M. AND LEONORA H. RUSSELL SPECULATION HOUSE NO.1**

Applicant: Robert and Alexa Waltz represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3141 Dale Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3141 Dale Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the T.M. and Leonora H. Russell Speculation House No.1 located at 3141 Dale Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the 1930s historic garage.

Report Number: HRB-12-006

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

**ITEM 12 – ANNUAL CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) REPORT**

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services Department

Location: Citywide

Description: The Historical Resources Board Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation, Mayor and City Council consistent with the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities and Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego City Council, or revise the Annual Report and forward as appropriate

Report Number: HRB-12-007

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE**: Thursday, February 23, 2012

**LOCATION**: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:15PM**