

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 28, 2013
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:08PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Assistant Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern
Sarah Vonesh, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR February 28, 2013

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE FEBRUARY 28, 2013 MINUTES AS CORRECTED

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas Vote: 7-0-2 Motion Passes
(Lemmo, Garbini)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Leslie Davis commented on the historical review of 337-41 Playa del Sur. The neighborhood and La Jolla Historical Society want a full review done by the HRB.

Donna Blackmond also commented on 337-41 Playa del Sur. She thinks Staff should take more time to investigate.

Dan Soderberg stated that there is great frustration from the community and questioned what happens with the "Over 45" input.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Curry and Baksh advised staff they would not be able to attend this meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The HRB designation of the Luscomb Building (HRB# 1047) located at 1797 San Diego Avenue was overturned by the City Council earlier this month. In addition, the appeal of the Lillian Lentell Cottages (HRB# 1062) at 7761 Eads Avenue and 7762 Bishops Lane is expected to be heard by the City Council in April.
- It is that time of year again to nominate your favorite historic preservation project, program or person for an award. Nominations are being accepted until Tuesday, April 2, 2013. Printed copies of the nomination form are available on the back table and can be completed electronically and submitted via the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic
- Those owners whose property was designated in 2012 or earlier are eligible to apply for a Mills Act agreement at this time. Those applications are due no later than April 2, 2013 to be considered this year and also can be found on the website at www.sandiego.gov/historic.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, April 3, 2013. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, April 11, 2013. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, May 13, 2013.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 4 individual homeowner nominations, including one continued from last month's agenda. There are 8 homeowner nominations in 2013 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Silvas asked why the Council overturned the designation of the Luscomb Building.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Request by the La Jolla Historical Society to continue Item 5 – Thomas and Margaret Turney House for 30 days

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 5 – THOMAS AND MARGARET TURNEY FOR 30 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER AND THE LA JOLLA HISTORICAL SOCIETY

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 6 – 4431 PALO VERDE TERRACE

Item 6 pulled by Boardmember Berge

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – THOMAS AND MAGARET TURNEY HOUSE

Applicant: Ramin Pourteymour Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 9805 Blackgold Road, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 1-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 9805 Blackgold Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Thomas and Margaret Turney House located at 9805 Blackgold Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1971-1978 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 13-008

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE LA JOLLA HISTORICAL SOCIETY

ITEM 6 – WARREN AND ELLEENE WRIGHT/JOHN MORTENSON HOUSE

Applicant: Richard Rementilla and Roger Neil Frank represented by IS Architecture.

Location: 4431 Palo Verde Terrace, 92115, College Area Community, Council District 9 (**1269 1-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4431 Palo Verde Terrace as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Warren and Elleene Wright/John Mortenson House located at 4431 Palo Verde Terrace as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1961 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the circa 1961-1965 partial rear deck enclosure and the 1974 lanai and bathroom addition at the southeast corner of the structure, totaling about 648 square feet.

Report Number: HRB 13-012

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge thinks the style “custom ranch” should include “organic geometric influence.” She questioned whether Mortenson was a master builder or designer; can’t support designation under Criterion D.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Mortenson as both a master builder and master designer.

Boardmember Woods supports designation under Criterion D.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff’s recommendation with the inclusion of “organic geometric influences.”

Boardmember Bethke thinks they need to consider this carefully; because there has been a tradition in the past of “name dropping.” He understands that they can’t expect a full thesis to designate a Master, but adequate analysis of how a building reflects the work of a Master is needed.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – WARREN AND ELLEENE WRIGHT/JOHN MORTENSON HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE INSERTION OF ORGANIC GEOMETRIC ARCHITECTURAL INFLUENCES IN THE RESOLUTION

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 8-0-1
(Garbini)

Motion Passes

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE UNDER CRITERION D PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE CHANGE OF MASTER BUILDER TO MASTER DESIGNER

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 7-1-1
(Rivera)(Garbini)

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – 4507 NEW HAMPSHIRE STREET

Applicant: Carol Neidenberg Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4507 New Hampshire Street, 92116, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 4-B)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4507 New Hampshire Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4507 New Hampshire Street under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 13-013

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ron May, Kiley Wallace, Carol Neidenberg (*Nan McGraw*), Paul Farris (*Alexandra Wallace*), Dan Soderberg, J.D. Abercrombie, Bret Lobner, Mark Koopman

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Rivera thinks this is a beautiful home but that it has been significantly altered. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods asked what columns on the porch were original.

Vice-Chair Garbini also asked for clarification on the columns. She supports designation under Criteria C and D. Porch was always partially enclosed. Door and front windows are not significant; does not detract.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Vice-Chair Garbini, inclined to support designation under Criteria C and D.

Boardmember Marrone also agrees with Vice-Chair Garbini. Enclosure is over 45 years old and is a historic addition to the house. Craftsman homes with porch enclosures deserve their own context. She supports designation under Criteria C and D.

Boardmember Larimer supports designation under Criteria C and D.

Boardmember Bethke is on the fence on Criterion C. There is no analysis related to Criterion D, can't support.

Boardmember Berge commented that no porch shown on the 1950 Sanborn. She cannot support designation of a Craftsman with fully enclosed porch, porch is critical to identifying Craftsman. She can support designation under Criterion D for the early work Bryans.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 UNDER CRITERION D AS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK OF EDWARD F. BRYANS WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1915 IN THE CRAFTSMAN STYLE

Seconded by Boardmember Garbini

Vote: 6-2-1

Motion Passes

(Bethke, Rivera)(Larimer)

ITEM 8 – 4639 ALABAMA STREET AND 4641 ALABAMA STREET

Applicant: Martin/Edmund Family Trust represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 4639 Alabama Street and 4641 Alabama Street, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4639-4641 Alabama Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4639 Alabama Street and 4641 Alabama Street under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 13-014

Staff Report by Sarah Vonesh

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Sarai Johnson (*Paul Johnson*), Mary Edmund

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge does not think the chimney alteration is an issue. Replacement windows are in original openings.

Boardmember Bethke doesn't mind the window replacement at the front, more concerned with the infill at the back. He supports designation.

Boardmember Larimer is on the fence. He is not comfortable with patterning of replacement windows, more Craftsman than Tudor.

Boardmember Marrone is not bothered by the window change. House captures Tudor and Craftsman styles.

Boardmember Silvas likes the house.

Chair Lemmo is on the fence, leaning toward Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini thinks it is nice to see this style before the Board. She is in favor of designation.

Boardmember Woods is on the fence, vinyl windows are particularly worrisome.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation. She questioned if they were basing possible designation solely on the brick entryway.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BERGE TO DESIGNATE THE ELMER AND KATHERINE MUHL HOUSE AT 4641 ALABAMA STREET UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF THE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE TUDOR REVIVAL STYLE ARCHITECTURE AND IT RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1926 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. IN PARTICULAR THE RESOURCE EXHIBITS A HIGH PITCH SIDE GABLE ROOF WITH A FRONT GABLE AND CLINKER BRICK STYLE ENTRY AND A CLINKER BRICK STYLE CHIMNEY, CLAPBOARD SIDING AND WOOD CASEMENT WINDOWS. THE FINDINGS ARE BASED ON THE STAFF REPORT, CONSULTANT REPORT, AND PUBLIC TESTIMONY HERE TODAY.

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 6-3-0

Motion Passes

(Larimer, Rivera, Woods)

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, April 25, 2013

LOCATION:

City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:32PM