



### **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

- **ABSENCES**

Chair Lemmo and Vice-Chair Garbini advised staff they would not be able to attend this meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Affidavit from the owners of Item 9 – 579 Elijo Street waiving the noticing requirement
- ✓ Owners response to the request for continuance for Item 9 – 579 Elijo Street
- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 9 – 579 Elijo Street
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 5 – 372 Fourth Avenue
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 8 – Kenneth Denton Commercial Building
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 12 – University Heights Water Storage and Pumping Station Historic District
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Berge attended a public presentation on National Registration listing of University Heights Water Storage and Pumping Station Historic District. It will not influence her decision.

#### **B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

#### **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

#### **C. STAFF REPORT**

- First, I want to congratulate our Board Secretary, Shannon Anthony, on her recent promotion to Legislative Recorder. I also would like to take a minute to acknowledge and thank Shannon for all her hard work and support she provides to Boardmembers and staff. She is a very important part of the historical resources section and works tirelessly behind-the-scenes to keep things running smoothly in preparation for our monthly meetings. In addition, Shannon often makes the all-important first impression on City customers via phone and in person and helps consultants with document retrieval, general questions, minutes, resolutions, and all sorts of other requests. We really appreciate all you do Shannon, thanks!
- Please join us next month for our celebration of historic preservation month with the Annual Awards ceremony on May 23<sup>rd</sup>.

- The DAS meeting for May has been canceled. The next Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be held on Monday, May 13, 2013.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 3 referrals from Development Services including one item continued from a previous agenda, 4 individual homeowner nominations, including 2 items continued from previous agendas, and 3 National Register Nominations. There are 9 homeowner nominations in 2013 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

#### **D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

SOHO is requesting a 60 day continuance for Item 9 – 579 San Elijo Street, the owner is opposed to the continuance.

##### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 9 – 579 SAN ELIJO STREET FOR 60 DAYS**

*Motion was withdrawn by Boardmember Berge*

#### **MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO CONTINUE ITEM 9 – 579 SAN ELIJO STREET FOR 60 DAYS**

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 3-6-0 Motion Fails  
(Woods, Larimer, Bethke, Berge, Baksh, Silvas)

La Jolla Historical Society is requesting a 60 day continuance for Item 13 – La Jolla Post Office

##### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER RIVERA TO CONTINUE ITEM 13 – LA JOLLA POST OFFICE FOR 30 DAYS**

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 5-4-0 Motion Passes  
(Woods, Larimer, Bethke, Berge)

Applicant for ITEM 5 – 372 Fourth Avenue requested a 60 day continuance due to new information they did not receive

##### **BOARD ACTION:**

#### **MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO CONTINUE ITEM 5 – 372 FOURTH AVENUE FOR 60 DAYS**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-3-0 Motion Passes  
(Rivera, Bethke, Larimer)

**ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 14 – WILLIAM AND EDITH POTTER SPEC HOUSE #1

BOARD ACTION:

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATION ITEM 14 – WILLIAM AND EDITH POTTER SPEC HOUSE #1 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

---

**ACTION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM 5 – 372 FOURTH AVENUE**

**Continued from February 2013**

Applicant: Williams Family Trust / Elizabeth W. Awes Separate Property Trust represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 372 Fourth Avenue, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 4-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 372 Fourth Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 372 Fourth Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: Staff memo dated April 11, 2013 and HRB 13-007

ITEM WAS CONTINUED FOR 60 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

**ITEM 6 – LOUIS AND CARMELITA FONTANEL HOUSE**

**Continued from January 2013**

Applicant: Lawrence Frank represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4243 Jackdaw Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4243 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Louis and Carmelita Fontanel House located at 4243 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the circa 1950's detached garage and guest house, the 300 square-foot addition at the southeast portion of the house constructed in 1959, as well as the 2011 east elevation addition.

Report Number: Staff memo dated April 11, 2013 and HRB 13-002

Staff Report by Sarah Vonesh

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ione Stiegler (*Marissa Feliciano*), Lawrence Frank

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Rivera appreciates the additional research and now supports designation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATION ITEM 6 – LOUIS AND CARMELITA FONTANEL HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 7 – THOMAS AND MAGARET TURNEY HOUSE**

**Continued from March 2013**

Applicant: Ramin Pourteymour Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 9805 Blackgold Road, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 1-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 9805 Blackgold Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Thomas and Margaret Turney House located at 9805 Blackgold Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1971-1978 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 13-008

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Don Schmidt, Vonn Marie May, Ione Stiegler, Diane Kane

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Rivera is not convinced that it meets Criterion C.

Boardmember Woods agrees that the roof jumps out at you, but the bones are there. It is a wonderful example of Organic Free-Form architecture, she supports designation.

Boardmember Baksh wishes the home was older otherwise supports designation.

Boardmember Curry mentioned that Chicano Park was also newer when designated. Significance and ability to convey Organic Free-Form architecture is intact.

Boardmember Larimer asked if the fascia has been replaced or covered. There has been no additional information, no change in opposition. The roof is 70-80% of what is visible and is too altered. Not of the land. Neither reversibility nor future development is a factor. He does not support designation.

Boardmember Bethke really likes the home and does not have any issues with the age or view from the public right of way. Character defining features are adversely altered; materials really are character defining features. It retains the skeleton, if reversed he could support.

Boardmember Silvas doesn't think age is the problem, integrity is i.e. roof color. If reversed he could also support designation.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Boardmembers Larimer and Bethke. Spirit of Organic Free-Form is to harmonize with nature. With the color and material changes it no longer conveys significance.

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone supports Staff's recommendation. Form, style and movement of the house are still intact.

Boardmember Curry stated it doesn't need to retain all seven aspects of integrity.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 - THOMAS AND MARGARET TURNEY HOUSE UNDER CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE WORK OF A MASTER KENDRICK BANKS KELLOGG**

Seconded by 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone                      Vote: 4-5-0                      Motion Fails  
*(Larimer, Silvas, Rivera, Berge, Bethke)*

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 - THOMAS AND MARGARET TURNEY HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods                      Vote: 4-5-0                      Motion Fails  
*(Larimer, Silvas, Rivera, Berge, Bethke)*

**ITEM 8 – KENNETH DENTON COMMERCIAL BUILDING**

Applicant: Winema Cichan LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1868-1890 Grand Avenue, 92109, Pacific Beach Community, Council District 2 (1248 6-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1868-1890 Grand Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Kenneth Denton Commercial Building located at 1868-1890 Grand Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1959 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-13-015

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ione Stiegler (*Marissa Feliciano, Diane Kane*)

In Opposition: William Demos, Marie Lia (*Marion Demos, Christina Frangos, Gus Demos*)

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge questioned why this building is individually significant. It is not significant because you can itemize individual features. She can't support designation.

Boardmember Silvas thanked staff for bringing items outside the norm.

Boardmember Bethke does not support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer does not support Staff's recommendation.

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone does not support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry mentioned that modest doesn't mean ineligible. Can be looked at under Criterion A as part of our social history, Criterion C has integrity and character defining features. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh does not support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods does not support Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera initially supported Staff's recommendation but is now on the fence. She appreciates looking at a different area. It is a unique landmark and is known by the community. She hopes that the air conditioning units could be worked out if designated.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – KENNETH DENTON COMMERCIAL BUILDING PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 2-7-0

Motion Fails

*(Larimer, Silvas, Rivera, Berge, Bethke, Woods, Baksh)*

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – KENNETH DENTON COMMERCIAL BUILDING UNDER CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF A COMMUNITY OR NEIGHBORHOOD HISTORICAL CULTURAL SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT**

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 2-7-0

Motion Fails

*(Larimer, Silvas, Rivera, Berge, Bethke, Woods, Baksh)*

**ITEM 9 – 579 SAN ELIJO STREET**

Applicant: Robert and Gillian Robinson represented by IS Architecture

Location: 579 San Elijo Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 4-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 579 San Elijo Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 579 San Elijo Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-13-016

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Ione Stiegler (*Marissa Feliciano, Diane Kane*), Vonn Marie May

In Opposition: Bruce Coons (*Ashley Christensen*)

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Rivera wants a continuance to allow SOHO time to provide additional information.

Boardmember Woods thinks the site and setting is spectacular and disagrees that the changes are not visible. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Staff's recommendation, there are too many changes.

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone would support continuance for more information under Criterion A. Lot size and prominence important, she always considered it a landmark. Thinks house has as many alterations as Staff has had approved on other properties.

Boardmember Larimer thinks the alterations provide a false sense of history. Criterion A is intriguing.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation. Needs to know why it is significant, not just because it is known. He is happy with the research that has been done. Integrity is an issue.

Boardmember Silvas is supportive of continuance for more information, finds it to be significant.

Boardmember Berge supports a continuance.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER RIVERA TO CONTINUE ITEM 9 – 579 SAN ELIJO STREET FOR 30 DAYS**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Passes

*(Woods, Larimer, Baksh)*

**ITEM 10 – CASE STUDY HOUSE 23A**

Applicant: Sarah Loe, Los Angeles Conservancy Modernism Committee

Owner: Katherine Bevash

Location: 2342 Rue de Anne, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 **(1227 7-H)**

Description: Review the National Register Nomination of Case Study House #23A

Today's Action: Review and make a recommendation on the National Register Nomination of Case Study House #23A

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the listing of Case Study House #23A located at 2342 Rue de Anne to the Office of Historic Preservation.

Report Number: HRB-13-017

Staff Report by Sarah Vonesh

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Bruce Coons, Don Schmidt, Heath Fox, Diane Kane

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge supports Staff recommendation

Boardmember Larimer mentioned that the purpose of case study was not realized as tract development and not influential on architecture at large. He does not support listing.

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY 2<sup>nd</sup> VICE CHAIRPERSON MARRONE TO RECOMMEND THE LISTING OF CASE STUDY HOUSE #23A PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-2-0

Motion Passes

*(Larimer, Silvas)*

**ITEM 11 – CASE STUDY HOUSE 23C**

Applicant: Sarah Loe, Los Angeles Conservancy Modernism Committee

Owner: Nancy and Joseph Manno

Location: 2329 Rue de Anne, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-H**)

Description: Review the National Register Nomination of Case Study House #23C

Today's Action: Review and make a recommendation on the National Register Nomination of Case Study House #23C

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the listing of Case Study House #23C located at 2329 Rue de Anne to the Office of Historic Preservation.

Report Number: HRB-13-018

Staff Report by Sarah Vonesh

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Bruce Coons, Don Schmidt, Heath Fox, Diane Kane

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods spoke to the importance of case study influence; maybe they were too modern and could not be financed easily.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY 2<sup>nd</sup> VICE CHAIRPERSON MARRONE TO RECOMMEND THE LISTING OF CASE STUDY HOUSE #23C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-2-0

Motion Passes

*(Larimer, Silvas)*

**ITEM 12 – UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS WATER STORAGE & PUMPING STATION HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Applicant: Alexander D. Bevil, North Park Historical Society

Owner: City of San Diego

Location: 2725 El Cajon Blvd., 92104 (*Block bounded by El Cajon Blvd, Oregon Street, Idaho Street and Howard Avenue*), Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 4-D**)

Description: Review the National Register Nomination

Today's Action: Review and make a recommendation on the National Register Nomination

Staff Recommendation: Recommend the listing of the University Heights Elevated Metal Water Tank, constructed in 1924, as a historic structure at a local level of significance under National Register Criteria C to the Office of Historic Preservation; and recommend that the proposed University Heights Water Storage and Pumping Station Historic District not be listed under any criteria, due to a lack of integrity and insufficient documentation to support the proposed boundary and period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-13-019

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Don Schmidt, Bruce Coons, Katherine Hon, Steve Hon

In Opposition: None

**Board Discussion:**

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chairperson Marrone supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Berge supports Staff's recommendation and agrees with Staff analysis on District.

**BOARD ACTION:**

**MOTION BY 2<sup>ND</sup> VICE CHAIRPERSON MARRONE TO RECOMMEND THE LISTING OF THE UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS ELEVATED METAL WATER TANK PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION**

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 13 – LA JOLLA POST OFFICE**

Applicant: United States Postal Service

Location: 1140 Wall Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1140 Wall Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the La Jolla Post Office located at 1140 Wall Street, a Works Progress Administration (WPA) era United States Post Office constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style and reflecting a special element in the development of the community, as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1935-1960 under HRB Criterion E. An interior element included in the designation is the public lobby mural, *Scenic View of the Village* (1935-1936), painted by Belle Baranceanu.

Report Number: HRB-13-020

