

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MAY 23, 2013
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

**••SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS ••
ANNUAL AWARDS FOR EXCELLENCE IN HISTORIC PRESERVATION
AWARDED BY THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD**

Board Hearing will begin after the conclusion of the Awards Ceremony

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:45PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present <i>left at 4:00PM</i>
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Assistant Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Sarah Vonesh, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR April 25, 2013

Minutes were not available

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• ABSENCES

Boardmember Bethke advised staff he would not be able to attend this meeting.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

- None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

- None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

- None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

Boardmember Larimer was not able to see Item 7 – 1410-1412 Lincoln Avenue

BOARD ACTION:

CHAIR LEMMO MADE A MOTION TO INVOKE THE WAIVER FOR BOARDMEMBER LARIMER

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 9-0-1
(Larimer)

Motion Passes

C. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

La Jolla Historical Society is requesting a 30 day continuance for Item 6 – La Jolla Post Office, owner is opposed to the continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO CONTINUE ITEM 13 – LA JOLLA POST OFFICE FOR 30 DAYS

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – SYLVAN AND FLORENCE YBARRA HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – SYLVAN AND FLORENCE YBARRA HOUSE ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 10-0-0

Motion Passes

***The owner would like staff to re-examine the name, they would like the home named the Mira Monte House.*

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – UPDATE ON NATIVE AMERICAN CONSULTATION

Staff update/status report on the issues raised by the HRB Archaeology Subcommittee and the Native American Heritage Commission relating to the City's Native American Consultation Process

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 579 SAN ELIJO STREET

Continued from April 2013

Applicant: Robert and Gillian Robinson represented by IS Architecture

Location: 579 San Elijo Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 4-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 579 San Elijo Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 579 San Elijo Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-13-016

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Marissa Feliciano

In Opposition: Jarvis Ross, Bruce Coons, Alana Coons, Jay Shumaker

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Rivera finds this to be a difficult decision, it is a unique home. The Board hasn't designated properties that were small with fewer modifications. She supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Woods supports both the consultant and staff reports.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation; too much integrity has been lost.

Boardmember Curry does not support Staff's recommendation. It still has character defining features of Colonial Revival architecture. The Board is too strict when evaluating alterations, need to look at how we evaluate changes that could be part of history. Location is very important, is an icon and point of reference for the community.

Chair Lemmo is not a fan of quantifying alterations. Scale and placement of site is amazing. There are significant alterations, but compatible with Colonial architecture. He supports designation under Criterion C.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designating as an estate garden under Criterion C. We don't have estate gardens here anymore, probably the only one in San Diego.

Boardmember Marrone feels the same as Vice-Chair Garbini and Chair Lemmo. Changes pale in comparison to some that she has seen on designated properties. It should be restored.

Boardmember Larimer mentioned that the consultant wanted to find it historic and couldn't. She held true to her values, takes that into strong consideration.

Boardmember Silvas is impressed with the house and phone system. The larger it is, the less he sees the alterations. He supports designation under any criteria.

Boardmember Berge is leaning towards designation under Criterion C. Wishes there were more information for Criterion A. She supports designation under Criterion C.

Vice-Chair Garbini thinks that site planning is really important. Building is focal point, but other aspects of site are significant. Importance of the site is its size.

Boardmember Rivera thinks that the decision to designate is precedent setting.

Chair Lemmo mentioned that there are few properties like this. Alterations are compatible.

Vice-Chair Garbini stated that no alterations equal a false sense of history, things change.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE 579 SAN ELIJO AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER CRITERION C AS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF THE COLONIAL REVIVAL STYLE WITH NEOCLASSICAL INFLUENCES AND AS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF AN ESTATE GARDEN FROM THE 1930'S

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-4-0

Motion Passes

(Rivera, Woods, Baksh, Larimer)

ITEM 6 – LA JOLLA POST OFFICE

Continued from April 2013

Applicant: United States Postal Service

Location: 1140 Wall Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1140 Wall Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the La Jolla Post Office located at 1140 Wall Street, a Works Progress Administration (WPA) era United States Post Office constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style and reflecting a special element in the development of the community, as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1935-1960 under HRB Criterion E. An interior element included in the designation is the public lobby mural, *Scenic View of the Village* (1935-1936), painted by Belle Baranceanu.

Report Number: Staff memo dated May 9, 2013 and HRB-13-020

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

ITEM CONTINUED FOR 30 DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE LA JOLLA HISTORICAL SOCIETY

ITEM 7 – 1410-1412 LINCOLN AVENUE

Applicant: Aghassi Family Trust 07-17-01 represented by Urbana Preservation & Planning

Location: 1410-1412 Lincoln Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 5-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1410-1412 Lincoln Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1410-1412 Lincoln Avenue under any HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-13-025

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge agrees with Staff and Consultant Report; excellent Historic Research Report.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

NO MOTION WAS MADE, ITEM WAS CLOSED

ITEM 8 – SYLVAN AND FLORENCE YBARRA HOUSE

Applicant: Christopher and Viki Woehler represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4234 Middlesex Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (1269 2-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4234 Middlesex Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Sylvan and Florence Ybarra House located at 4234 Middlesex Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. Designation excludes the rear 170 square foot addition from 1969 and the small garage extension from 1968.

Report Number: HRB-13-022

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – 4615 VISTA STREET

Applicant: Jonathan Brenner & Heather Beatty represented by Johnson and Johnson

Location: 4615 Vista Street, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (1269 3-H)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4615 Vista Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4615 Vista Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-13-023

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Sarai Johnson (Paul Johnson), Heather Beatty

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Rivera asked about the homes original stucco.

Boardmember Baksh would like to see stucco brought back before considering designation.

Boardmember Curry thinks the stucco needs to be brought back.

Chair Lemmo thinks the stucco needs to be restored, DAS would be helpful.

Vice-Chair Garbini thinks there are nice things about the house, but agrees with Chair Lemmo.

Boardmember Marrone thinks the stucco is the only issue, would otherwise support designation.

Boardmember Larimer thinks the stucco is an issue and they should go to DAS.

Boardmember Silvas is on the fence.

Boardmember Berge thinks stucco is key for Spanish architecture, should go to DAS.

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

ITEM 10 – BARRIO LOGAN HISTORIC SURVEY

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: Barrio Logan Community, Council District 8

Description: Review and consider the Barrio Logan Historical Resources Survey (Survey), the Historic Preservation Element of the Barrio Logan Community Plan update (HPE), and the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) related to Cultural/Historical Resources for the purposes of making a Recommendation on the adoption of the Survey, HPE and FEIR to the City Council.

Today's Action: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Survey, HPE, and FEIR or do not recommend adoption.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Barrio Logan Historical Resources Survey, the Historic Preservation Element of the Barrio Logan Community Plan update, and the Final Environmental Impact Report related to Cultural/Historical Resources.

Report Number: HRB-13-024

Staff Report by Cathy Winterrowd

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Georgette Gómez, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry stated that the survey is a tool to preserve the history of Barrio Logan. Tie to policies and more meetings; more outreach to the community is needed.

Boardmember Baksh thinks this is a valuable report, supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods enjoyed reading, supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera thinks that continued research is needed.

Boardmember Berge thinks the Historic Preservation Element is great. She would stress to the Council District that additional research is needed. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas is overwhelmed with the details, good foundation for future preservation. It was an excellent report.

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE BARRIO LOGAN HISTORICAL RESOURCES SURVEY, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT OF THE BARRIO LOGAN COMMUNITY PLAN UPDATE, AND THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT AS RELATED TO CULTURAL/HISTORICAL RESOURCES PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, June 27, 2013

LOCATION: City Administration Building
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:50PM