

DRAFT
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF DECEMBER 11, 2013
202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR
SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:10PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Absent
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Absent
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Cathy Winterrowd, Interim Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Junior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR July 25, 2013 and September 26, 2013

Minutes were not available

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Berge, Curry and Larimer notified Staff they would not be in attendance.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Request for Continuance for Items 10 and 11
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 5
- ✓ 2014 Meeting Dates Memo
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Silvas would like to see more properties that are not the norm.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The Owner for Items 10 and 11- 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive is requesting a continuance to the January 23, 2014 agenda for both the Local and California nominations. Staff is in support of the owners request to continue both items. The Applicants are opposed to any continuance

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEMS 10 AND 11 TO THE NEXT BOARD MEETING

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 7-1-0
(*Silvas*)

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #3

ITEM 8 – IVER LAWSON, JR. HOUSE

ITEM 9 – CHRISTIAN AND GERTRUDE BAER/DENNSTEDT COMPANY HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7, 8 AND 9 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ROBERT AND LILLIAN ORR HOUSE

Continued from October 2013

Applicant: Robert Lambert and Robin Felice represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 2382 Via Capri Court, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3114 Lawrence Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert and Lillian Orr House located at 2382 Via Capri Court as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1963 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 13-041

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Bill Lewis, Robin Felice, Scott Spencer, Bruce Coons, Paul Lim, Francoise Farron and Mr. and Mrs. Whalen

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Silvas is touched by the community support for the owners. Lewis broadened his thought on this.

Boardmember Bethke is on the fence. Property doesn't rise to designation level, it doesn't have the feeling. He is not sure what we are preserving.

Boardmember Marrone thinks that the most interesting façade is the rear, away from the public view. She does not support designation.

Vice-Chair Garbini mentioned that the style of architecture is high maintenance and may feel differently if it was better maintained. Firm is important and one of the only properties they built that was residential. The rear façade is dominant.

Chair Lemmo is intrigued by the "50 year project". He appreciates Staff bringing this to the Board, but doesn't support designation.

Boardmember Baksh was on the fence before, but now does not support designation.

Boardmember Woods likes this house. She agrees that the back is the primary façade, but likes the front as well. It is similar to the Case Study house.

Boardmember Rivera supports designation. Thanks the community, but supports Staff's recommendation. She questioned if Staff has ever not designated a property due to safety concerns.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER RIVERA TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – ROBERT AND LILLIAN ORR HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 2-6-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Silvas, Bethke, Baksh, Garbini, Marrone)

ITEM 6 – 2243 GUY STREET

Continued from October 2013

Applicant: Gary and Joy Spradling Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2243 Guy Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2243 Guy Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2243 Guy Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 13-051

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian and Gary Spradling

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Woods thinks this is a lovely house, but agrees with Staff's recommendation. Modifications are indistinguishable.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Boardmember Woods.

Chair Lemmo is not bothered by the move, but agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini isn't bothered by the move either. She is bothered by the Southwest corner modifications and the alterations of the roofline.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Vice-Chair Garbini. She wouldn't support the changes at DAS.

Boardmember Bethke supports Staff's recommendation; the whole massing has been impacted.

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – 2243 GUY STREET PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Bethke

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #3

Applicant: Robert M. McLeod Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 4019 Hawk Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4019 Hawk Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alberta Security Company/Martin V. Melhorn Spec House #3 located at 4019 Hawk Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1919 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the circa 1956 detached accessory structure at the rear of the property.

Report Number: HRB 13-054

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – IVER LAWSON, JR. HOUSE

Applicant: Stephanie Villette represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 3231 Front Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3231 Front Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Iver Lawson, Jr. House located at 3231 Front Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the small rear addition of about 56 square feet, and the modified detached rear accessory structure.

Report Number: HRB 13-055

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – CHRISTIAN AND GERTRUDE BAER/DENNSTEDT COMPANY HOUSE

Applicant: Skip Motsenbocker and Tanja Kern represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 4600 Kensington Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 3-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4600 Kensington Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Christian and Gertrude Baer/Dennstedt Company House located at 4600 Kensington Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1937 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear addition built in 1950.

Report Number: HRB 13-056

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – GEORGE AND MARION COTTRELL/CLIFF MAY HOUSE

Applicant: Diane Kane

Owner: Lookout LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 6-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Marion Cottrell/Cliff May House located at 7727-7729 and 7813 Lookout Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 13-057

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE JANUARY MEETING AT THE REQUEST OF THE OWNER

